(INTERIM REPORT No. 3)

HISTORICAL RESEARCH ON THE LOCATION OF THE SAND CREEK MASSACRE SITE

By Lysa Wegman-French and Christine Whitacre
Historians, Intermountain Support Office-Denver

April 27, 1999

This report is a compilation of the historical research that we have found, to date, regarding the location of the Sand Creek Massacre site. Our scope of work limited our efforts to those archival resources in the State of Colorado. This report updates, but does not repeat nor supercede, the Interim Report No. 1, of September 1998, and No. 2 of January 1999. This is the final interim report in the series.

We have followed the format of Interim Report No. 2 by organizing the material into four basic categories:

1) Sources from people who were at the Sand Creek Massacre;
2) Sources from people who were at the site within 5 years after the Sand Creek Massacre;
3) Sources from people who were at the site before or up to 35 years (up to 1900) after the massacre; and
4) Post-1900 sources about the massacre site, and/or general background information.

As in Interim Report No. 2, we have subheadings within those categories. Thus the material in this report can be merged with the information in the previous report.

We would also like to note one correction to the second report. The “Sand Creek, Copies of Various Papers Relating to the Incident,” was prepared by the Kiowa County Historical Society, Eads, Colorado (not the Big Timbers Museum of Lamar, as was incorrectly noted in our last interim report).

We thank the many people who have provided assistance and information to us for this interim report. This includes George Crow, William Dawson, Lester Foulke, Carl Lovell, Todd Nelson, Phil Petersen, Kim J. Richards, Mae Root, Glenn Scott, and Andy Senti. Randy Nelson deserves special thanks for his dedication in looking up all the names of the members of the 3rd Colorado cavalry in the computerized National Union Catalog of Manuscript Collections.
SOURCES FROM PEOPLE WHO WERE AT THE SAND CREEK MASSACRE

DISTANCE AND DIRECTION TO THE SITE

General Direction

"About 8 o'clock the same the comd. again started with three days rations in saddle bags - marched all night in a northerly direction." E Co., 1st Regiment Col. Infy. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec., 1864. Record of Events.

"The exact site of the battle is about twelve miles northwest of Chivington, Colo." Morse H. Coffin, Rocky Mountain News, 11 December 1904.

"[The massacre took place] on Sand creek at a point about 200 miles southeast of Denver." James McNassar, Rocky Mountain News, 15 February 1893.

"... from Denver, [the massacre was] a distance of 250 miles." Chas. E. Clarke, Company B, 3rd Regiment, Colorado Volunteer Cavalry. Rocky Mountain News, 4 October 1876.

"The conflict occurred some fifty miles east of Denver, near a creek from which the fight derived its name, and only a short distance from the [Smoky Hill] road." Mr. Mahlin, "An Excursionist on Indians," Rocky Mountain News, 15 November 1867.

40 Miles

"After a march of forty miles we found a camp of Cheyenne and Arapahoe Indians..." Major Scott I. Anthony, 1st Cavalry of Colorado, Fort Lyon, 2 December 1864, in The Civil War CD-ROM of the War of the Rebellion.

The regiment rendezvoused at Fort Lyon, on the Arkansas... The Indians were on Sand Creek, forty miles away..." "The Chivington Massacre: Description of the Horrible Butchery of Indians by White Men in 1864, by a Participant in the Fight." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 4 August 1876.

[W]e came to Fort Lyon... Here were informed that if we made a forced march of forty miles or more to the north we would surprise a large camp of hostile Cheyenne and Arapahoe Indians." Chas. E. Clarke, "The Chivington Massacre: A Participant in the Battle Denies that it was a Massacre." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 15 September 1876.

40-45 Miles

"About daylight, having marched 40 miles the comd. came in sight of a large village of hostile Indians... about two miles distant at the south Bend of the Big Sandy... E Co., 1st Regiment Col. Infy. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec., 1864. Record of Events.
**45 Miles**

"Marched 45 miles that night and at day light arrived at a friendly village of Cheyenes [sic] and Arapahoe Indians ..." *D Co., 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry, Company Muster Roll for November and December 1864. Record of Events.*

"The company left Ft. Lyon C.T. at 8 o'clock on the night of Nov. 28 in company with Col. J.M. Chivington Brig. ... Marched 45 miles, arrived at Black Kettle's Cheyenne village of 95 lodges and Left Hand's Arapahoe village of 8 lodges ... *K Co., 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry, Company Muster Roll for November and December 1864. Record of Events.*

... we made a forced march that night for the Indian camp on Sand Creek about 45 miles away. ... From the peculiar position of the camp we saw it before coming upon it ... *Rocky Mountain News, January 26, 1881.*

**SITE DESCRIPTIONS**

**Different Names for Sand Creek and its Bends.**

"[H]ad an engagement with Indians Nov. 29/64 at South Bend Big Sandy C.T. in which the Indians were defeated." *C Co., 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry Company Muster Roll for November and December 1864. Record of Events.*

"Nov. 29/64 was engaged in the battle of Big Sandy." *H Co., 1st Regiment Col. Cav. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec. 1864. Record of Events.*

**Geography and Topographical Features of Massacre Site**

"At break of day, having marched during the night some thirty-six miles, we could see the Indian camp on the bank of Sand Creek, at a distance of four miles. Their main herd of ponies was grazing a mile off from us, and were quickly turned by a detachment ..." Chas. E. Clarke, *The Chivington Massacre: A Participant in the Battle Denies that it was a Massacre.* St. Louis Globe-Democrat 15 September 1876.

"About daylight ... the cmd. came in sight of a large village of hostile Indians ... about two miles distant at the south Bend of the Big Sandy. ... *E Co., 1st Regiment Col. Infy. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec., 1864. Record of Events.*

**LENGTH OF MASSACRE SITE**

"The dead Indians are strewn over about six miles." Major Scott I. Anthony, *1st Cavalry of Colorado, Fort Lyon, 2 December 1864, in The Civil War CD-ROM of the War of the Rebellion.*

**LOCATION OF CAVALRYMEN AND INDIANS**

"... the Co. H leading the attack upon the left under the command of James Olney 2nd Lt. 1st Cav. of Col." *H Co., 1st Regiment Col. Cav. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec. 1864. Record of Events.*
"The scattered Indians were pursued for several miles when being much fatigued & the ammunition nearly exhausted, the comd. returned to the battle field & encamped." E Co., 1st Regiment Col. Infy. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec., 1864. Record of Events.

"When Chivington's men approached the camp the first I saw was one company, by itself, approaching a few tepees at lower end of Cheyenne camp. I was talking with John Smith's two employees & they suggested I go out to meet these soldiers. I started down that way when this company dismounted and began firing on the tepees. I then ran & got away." Notes from Walter Camp interview with Edmund Guerrier.

"When the battle began, the cavalry went in on the east and west sides of the camp, forming two parties." Jacob Downing, The Denver Post, 31 December 1903.

DESCRIPTION OF THE RIFLE PITS AND THE CREEK BANK AREA(S)

"Firing immediately became general; the line of Indians was soon broken, they falling back to lines of rifle pits in the bed of Sand Creek, along the base of the bank, fighting stubbornly. Chas. E. Clarke, "The Chivington Massacre: A Participant in the Battle Denies that it was a Massacre." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 15 September 1876.

"There were over 200 dead Indians in one place in the bed of Sand Creek, where they had been killed by a charge of the Gray Horse Cavalry." "A Blast from the Bugler." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 15 September 1876.

"As soon as they rallied from the first surprise, many of the warriors quickly excavated pits in the sandy banks of the creek bottom. Using the pits as a covering for their bodies they fought their assailants for hours." Jacob Downing, The Denver Post, 31 December 1903.

"Old John Smith did not run. Jack Smith his son ran under the creek bank with a Cheyenne and after firing had been going on called out to the soldiers in English... There were a few Arap. in camp. Left Hand, Arap chief was killed there. There was another Arap Left Hand in battle of Washita." Notes from Walter Camp interview with Edmund Guerrier.

AMMUNITION (AND OTHER POSSIBLE ARCHEOLOGICAL ARTIFACTS)

"We had four twelve-pounders, and opened upon them with grape and canister." "The Chivington Massacre: Description of the Horrible Butchery of Indians by White Men in 1864, by a Participant in the Fight." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 4 August 1876.

[The Indians] "would repeatedly lead charges on us only to be shot down by the deadly ounce slugs fired from the muzzle-loading Austrian rifles we were armed with. We had no other arms; the Indians were armed with rifle, bow and arrow, and lance. Chas. E. Clarke, "The Chivington Massacre: A Participant in the Battle Denies that it was a Massacre." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 15 September 1876.

"A Howitzer was planted on the side of the hill to shell the camp, which was located in the creek bottom. Jacob Downing, The Denver Post, 31 December 1903.

"The Indians were armed with an assornment of carbines, revolvers and bows and arrows, many of the latter being used." Jacob Downing, The Denver Post, 31 December 1903.
THE ROUTE SOUTH, AFTER THE MASSACRE

"Night coming on, the pursuit of the flying Indians was of necessity abandoned, and my command encamped within sight of the field." Col. J. M. Chivington, "Massacre of the Cheyenne Indians," p. 49.

"[The action] lasted until 3 o'clock p.m. . . . The company was ordered back to join the baggage train, marched back 20 miles distance . . . Dec. 2 started down Big Sandy a distance of 35 miles to where it empties into the Arkansas River, [so a total of 55 miles from the massacre site to the mouth of the Big Sandy] then down the Arkansas a distance of 120 miles . . . Average distance travelled when marching 50 miles per day . . . " K Co., 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry, Company Muster Roll for November and December 1864. Record of Events.

"Dec. 1--This morning I went over the battle ground and saw the ground in places covered with men, women, and children. Camped 13 miles below on Sand Creek [intersection of Sand and Rush Creeks?]" Blake Diary, 1 December 1864.

"Remained in camp till Dec. 1st, then marched 40 miles down Big Sandy to the Arkansas, thence 100 miles down the Arkansas in pursuit of another band of hostile savages." E Co., 1st Regiment Col. Infy. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec., 1864. Record of Events.

GENERAL

"Attention! Indian Fighters. Having been authorized by the Governor to raise a company of 100 day U.S. Vol Cavalry! For immediate service against hostile Indians . . . Pay and Rations the same as other U.S. Volunteer Cavalry. Parties furnishing their own horses will receive 40 cents per day . . . The Company will also be entitled to all horses and other plunder taken from the Indians." "Attention Indian Fighters" poster. August 13, 1864.

"Reaching Fort Lyon at noon on the 28th, we went into camp, with order to prepare food to carry in haversacks for three days march, as the command would move at eight o'clock without transportation. Here began the work of preparing food in the midst of a great windstorm that raged like a tornado. As a consequence of this state of affairs, some provisions were prepared and some were unprepared. [George A. Wells], "On the Plains," The Miner's Register (Central City, CO), 31 December 1864.

"We have had considerable trouble with Indians this fall. The day you wrote I was present at a Massacre of three hundred Indians mostly women and Children. It was a horrible scene and I would not let my Company fire. They were friendly and some of our soldiers were in their Camp at the time trading . . . It was a Regiment of 100 days men who accomplished the noble deed. Some of the Indians fought when they saw no chance of escape." Silas Soule to his mother, 18 December 1864 from Fort Lyon, Silas Soule Letters, transcribed, Denver Public Library Western History Department.

"I spent New Year's day on the battle ground counting dead Indians. There were not as many killed as was reported. There was not more than one hundred and thirty killed, but most of them were women and children and all of them scalped. I hope the authorities at Washington will investigate the killing of those Indians. I think they will be apt to hoist some of our high officials. I would not fire on the Indians with my Co. and the Col. said he would have me cashiered, but he
is out of the service before me and I think I stand better than he does in regard to his great Indian fight." Silas Soule to his mother, 8 January 1865 from Fort Lyon, Silas Soule Letters, transcribed, Denver Public Library Western History Department.

"After the battle, I walked about the camp and its environs with Dr. Caleb S. Burdsall, surgeon of the Third regiment, and we counted 509 Indians dead on the field." Jacob Downing, The Denver Post, 31 December 1903.

"When they were near the Indian camp they waited for night and made a forced march to suprise [sic] the Indians at day break. They surrounded the camp and the cannon was discharged as a signal to assault the Indians." Drake, W. F. "Drake Gives Details about Indian Fights." typescript. No date. No newspaper [Contents refer to a November 27 item in the Star-Journal, probably the Pueblo Star-Journal, which began publication in 1901.] George Baxter Collection. Colorado Historical Society.

"About a month after the massacre took place viz; the latter part of December 1864 in pursuance of a special order from the Head Quarters Military District of the Upper Arkansas, I was directed to return and assume command of Fort Lyon . . . I visited the field of slaughter which was still covered with the ghastly remains of the victims." Wynkoop, Edward W. The Tall Chief: The Unfinished Autobiography of Edward W. Wynkoop, 1856-1866.
SOURCES FROM PEOPLE WHO WERE AT THE SITE BEFORE OR UP TO 35 YEARS (UP TO 1900) AFTER THE MASSACRE

"W.A. Alcorn operated the stage station, at Swift City [in 1887] ... He was located on the brink of the hill on the west side of Big Sandy Creek ... The station was located just south of the junction of Rush Creek and Big Sandy ... Just north of the old Alcorn stage stand, was located a stone stockade, that was built during the Fort Lyon days of Indian troubles, and north of this, a few years later the late Henry Frederick ... filed on a claim which he subsequently proved up. Col. Chivington on the memorial night that he tracked and pursued the band of Indians, to the Chivington battleground, 10 miles north of Chivington, had left his wagons and camp equipment, near this point, in the Rush Creek bottom, with instructions not to abandon the mules and wagons, no matter what happened. The Colonel informed us that he proceeded with his company and Indian guides north to the Indian camp some 12 to 14 miles, which was reached just before daylight and was attacked. As soon as the firing was heard the drivers and guards, mounted mules and made for the battle ground, disregarding his orders." Frost Liggett. "Pioneers and Idiosyncrasies of People I Have Known in Kiowa County." Kiowa County Press, 29 March 1940.

[T]here was a town located about seven miles south of Chivington, on Section 11-20-46, by the name of Swift City. Unidentified source, possibly newspaper article transcription.

In the late 1880s area ranchers worked together during spring round-ups. "On reaching old Fort Lyon they divided again, divisions working up both sides of the Big Sandy to the mouth of Rush Creek and to Kiowa Lakes. They met again at the Chivington battle grounds where they again split — one bunch going to the head of Rush Creek and the other working up the Big Sandy to Kit Carson and up Eureka Creek to the Big Springs." George Baxter. "Prowers County: Past to Present," part XXXIX. Newspaper series. George Baxter Collection. Colorado Historical Society. This description is similar to that in Goff and McCaffree's Century in the Saddle. See Interim Report No. 2, page 38.
POST-1900 SOURCES ABOUT THE MASSACRE SITE, AND/OR GENERAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION

The following information is presented in chronological order.

1876
In 1876, W.H. Sears lived at old Fort Lyon while working as a cowboy for the Moore & Powers [Powers?] cattle firm of Las Animas, and his reminiscences provide an interesting description of the fort at that time. He also notes that during this time: "I had a negro cowboy on the ranch as a helper. He had just finished five-year enlistment in the United States Cavalry." *Gen W. H. Sears, Notes From a Cowboy's Diary* (Lawrence, Kansas: no publisher, no date).

1881
Chivington started from Fort Lyon "for the Indian village on Sandy, thirty miles distant . . ."
*History of the Arkansas Valley, Colorado, page 839.*

1939
"When conditions became intolerable, Uncle Perry [O.H.P. Baxter], who had a commission from the Civil War as a captain, organized the Colorado volunteers that went with Col. Chivington to a spot along Sand Creek, near the present town of Chivington, where a tribe of 650 Indians were camped. Taking them by surprise, they massacred the entire tribe including many women and children." George Baxter "Prowers County: Past to Present," part XII. *Newspaper series. George Baxter Collection. Colorado Historical Society.*

1940
When planning the route of the Missouri Pacific Railroad, one proposed route was "by way of the old Col. Chivington battle ground, some ten or twelve miles north of where [the town of ] Chivington is now located." Frost Liggett, "Pioneers and Idiosyncrasies of People I Have Known in Kiowa County," *Kiowa County Press, 5 January 1940.*

1960
The famous Sand Creek Battle of November 29, 1864 took place about twelve miles north of Chivington. . . . This old battleground is a popular place to hunt arrowheads and other Indian relics. Old muskets, cannonballs, cooking utensils, grinding stones, etc., have been found. There are many splendid collections of arrowheads in the county." Lillian Herzog, "History of Kiowa County."

1963
Dick Root, a long-time resident of the town of Chivington and dedicated arrowhead collector, was interviewed by a newspaper reporter in 1963. "Actually, Root says, the battlefield is located some two miles north of where the stone marker would indicate. He said it wasn't until some scholars called on him to lead them on a souvenir hunt that he learned of the battle field's actual location. He learned only after the visitors had found an old bullet. To show their appreciation, they gave Root a map depicting the actual physical layout of the Indian camp and the battle ground. Root said after receiving the map they moved further north in their search for relics and that it proved to be a "mother lode." The skeletons, beads, scrapers, lance and arrow points, stone drills, and the countless bullets were discovered." C.V. Mills, "Root Museum Holds Proof of Sandy Massacre." *Lamar Tri-State Daily News 23 February 1963.*
NOTE: The above material generally consists of direct quotations organized according to subject or date. The following material is organized by the archival source or topic.

Collecting in area
Many people have collected artifacts in Kiowa and Cheyenne counties. We talked with some of them, and relevant notes are included here.

- One family used to go to the "sand blows" in the 1930s and 50s. They found few arrowheads in the area of the Sand Creek massacre monument, and found most of their artifacts on land approximately 1-2 miles north. However, they did find a half-rotted leather bullet pouch with bullets in it in the field farther north of the Dawson bend. Members of this family recalled that during these dust storms, the fields were blown smooth - "like a road" - and the family would look for artifacts in these areas. They also saw lots of neighbors in the fields, also collecting artifacts. During the "blows," family members recalled that they could identify fire hearths as black patches of ground where the earth had burned. However, they did not remember seeing a large burned area, like the burned village site. In general, the family was primarily interested in stone arrowheads, although they would also pick up metal arrowheads.

- One collector went to the Dawson bend area "time and time again." On the site he found a) copper shells, i.e. empty cartridge case and rim fire; b) only one stone arrow head, which was almost clear with 3 brown stripes through it; c) round balls, perhaps 54-58 caliber, misshapen; d) 2 or 3 big bullets, long, bigger than 54-58 cal. He remembers the bluff to the south of the Dawson bend used to be higher and steeper. It has partially collapsed and slumped. There had been a trail that went to the south, which he used to be able to see more clearly than now.

- Another collector found a thumb scraper on the Dawson property, sometime after 1958.

- One resident of Lamar recalled that his father and uncle were long-time collectors in the area of the Sand Creek massacre, and did most of their collecting approximately one mile north of the marker. They collected during the "blows" of the 1930s, when the topsoil blew off and the "artifacts would just glitter on the surface," making them easy to find and collect. According to this resident, the blows were "pretty much over" by 1937-38, when the vegetation and soil were becoming re-established.

- The same resident also recalled that another major collection site frequented by his father was a "large camp south of Chivington." This site is directly east of Queen (Neeskah) Reservoir, on Sand Creek. He did not believe that this was the Sand Creek Massacre site, but another long-time Indian encampment. This resident recalls going to this site as a child with his father, where they picked up numerous artifacts, including pottery shards.

- One local resident and his family members - who live near the Dawson and Bowen properties - believe that the massacre took place on the Dawson property. According to this resident, the bluff on Dawson's property - just north of the stone marker - "is the same bluff that my grandpa collected from." According to this resident, his grandfather had an extensive collection of arrowheads, bullets, and cartridges; the collection has since been sold. The artifacts were collected in the 1930s, 40s, and 50s, "after a blow."

- One elderly resident recalls visiting the Dawson property during the 1930s to collect artifacts. He was accompanied by several men - who were then in their 50s and 60s - who told him
that Black Kettle's village site was in the center of Section 30, T17S, R45W, just south of Sand Creek (which runs in an east-west direction at that point).

Baumbach map
(See Interim Report No. 1 for additional information.) John Baumbach (pronounced Baumbaugh) lived in Section 8 T17S R45W. Lester Foulke—a long-time resident of Cheyenne Wells who knew Baumbach—dismisses the accuracy of the section lines and creek path in the Baumbach map. He believes it would have been difficult to find exactly where the section lines were at the time that Baumbach drew the map. He doesn't think brass caps were placed to mark section corners, and there were no fences then to mark section lines. *Lester Foulkes interview*

Upper Water Valley/New Chicago

"New Chicago was located about two miles north of Water Valley and only lasted one summer, having died with the frost of 1887." Water Valley was located "about seven miles northeast of Chivington and five miles northwest of Brandon." *Kiowa County and its Towns: A Short Story of Their Ups and Downs.* Kiowa County Press 26 January 1917.

"The Missouri Pacific Railroad was conducting surveys for a line crossing Big Sandy Creek, and made three survey routes: one... near the old Col. Chivington Battleground, which was 'Upper Water Valley' or as Mr. Wilmeth insisted on calling it, 'New Chicago'...." *Frost Liggett, "Pioneers" Kiowa County Press, 30 June 1941.*

Edward F. Madden granted warranty deeds for six lots in Upper Water Valley in the southeast quarter of Section 14, T17S, R46W. *Land Records, Kiowa County Abstract Company.* Land records for adjoining sections have not been researched; the town site may have extended into either section 13 or 23.

Water Valley

[The geographic area of] Watervalley first got its name from the old Watervalley Town that was built on the corners of Sections 4, 5, 8 and 9, Twp. 18, Range 45 before a railroad was here. Afterward the town was moved to the railroad and the name was applied to the land extending from the railroad to near the old Double S ranch. *Reagan, M.F. "Fruit in Water Valley." Kiowa County Press 15 April 1927.*

"Nigger Charlie's" beef corral

A 1908 *Denver Post* article indicated that a local man, "Paul," believed that the massacre site was near "Nigger Charlie's beef corral." We have not found any other references to that name nor to any African-Americans in the area. A settler named Charles Jenkins did patent a homestead claim in February 1891 in section 24, T17S R46W. We have not yet been able to confirm his race. Jenkins was referred to as "Charley." He did have a corral in 1883. However, in 1887 the only livestock he owned was horses; he did not own cattle at that time. He did work part-time as a cowboy for two ranchers. At this time we do not know how long he lived in the area. *U.S. Department of the Interior, General Land Office. Records on Claims to Public Land. Section 24, T17S R46W. National Archives, Washington D.C.*

Mr. Dawson was told that "Charlie's beef corral" was about 1-1/2 miles west of Dawson's property/bend. That property has an old windmill and there had been a shack there. *Dawson interview.*

Chuck Bowen has stated that a Charles Gibson was an early settler who homesteaded on the Bowen property. However, these homestead records have not been researched. *Bowen interview.*
George Bent/George Hyde Maps
In Interim Report No. 2, we discussed the several maps drawn by George Bent. In that
discussion, we identified one of the maps as Map A (Site Map) and noted that there seemed to be
three variations of this map. We have since discovered that one of these three site maps – the
map that showed the spring – is actually an altered map. Author John Moore had traced the Bent
map in the Norlin Library, University of Colorado. While the tracing is mostly faithful to the
original, there are minor differences that make it discernable from the original. Mr. Moore took
that tracing to the Dawson property, and wrote notes on his copy while on the site. One of those
notes was an "X" with the label "spring" next to it. Mr. Moore gave the annotated copy to Mr.
Bill Dawson, who later gave a copy to aerial archeologist Tom Baker. Not realizing that the extra
"spring" label had been added later, Mr. Baker printed that version of the map on page 36 in his
report, "Aerial Archaeology at Sand Creek." Thus, the location of a spring on this map was not
the work of Bent, but was an inadvertent addition.

Walter Camp Sketch map
A sketch map is in the collection of Walter Camp at Indiana University. The map appears to be
drawn by Camp, to assist him in his research on the area from the Arkansas River north to the
Republican River. While individual elements seem to be accurate, the larger features seem to be
incorrectly placed in relation to each other. The drawing shows the Missouri Pacific Railroad,
and accurately marks the town of Chivington near the intersection of that railroad and Sand
Creek. The drawing shows both Sand Creek and Rush Creek in approximately accurate relation
to each other. However, the sketch places the junction of those two creeks north of the railroad
and the town of Chivington, while that junction is actually south of the town and the railroad. In
another example, the map correctly shows the South Fork of the Republican River, the Smoky
Hill River, and the Kansas/Union Pacific railroad roughly paralleling each other on the east side
of the map. However, the sketch shows these three features too far south in relation to Sand and
Rush creeks. The most intriguing aspect of the map is a circle drawn between the two creeks.
Based on the configuration of the creeks, it appears that this circle is in the vicinity of the
Cheyenne/Kiowa county line, just south of the "north" bend. The meaning of this circle is not
known. Walter Camp Collection.

Bonsall Map/Greenwood's Camp
On Lt. Bonsall's map, he identifies a camp as "Greenwood's Camp." We have not found any
other information about this camp, nor have we positively identified Greenwood. There are a few
possibilities. During treaty negotiations in 1865, Little Raven said, "... some of the Indians
objected to signing the treaty of 1851. After a long time there was another change of
administration, Greenwood was sent to them. We did not understand him." Christopher B.
Gerboth, who edited The Tall Chief: The Unfinished Autobiography of Edward W. Wynkoop,
1856-1866, states that at the Sand Creek Massacre, "upon observing the approach of the soldiers,
Blake Kettle, the head chief, ran up to the top of his lodge an American flag, which had been
presented to him some years before by Commissioner Greenwood."

In addition, there was a Col. W.H. Greenwood who was an army engineer in Army of the
Cumberland during the Civil War. After the war he became Chief of the Kansas Pacific Surveys
to the Pacific, which ran a line through Cheyenne Wells and Kit Carson, north and east of the
Big Sandy. W.H. Greenwood then became active in the Denver and Rio Grande Railway. U.S.
Department of the Interior, Office of Indian Affairs, "Documents Relating to the Negotiation of Ratified and
Unratified Treaties with Various Indian Tribes;" and History of the Arkansas Valley, Colorado.
Skirmish near Sand Creek on August 11, 1864:
In a report about a skirmish with an unnamed group of Indians in 1864, Second Lt. Joseph A. Cramer described the route his detachment took while chasing the band. "I started from this post . . . proceeding down the river a distance of four or five miles and took a due north course for three miles, and there came in sight a band of Indians . . . going in a northeast direction. I immediately gave chase, and after a race of fifteen or twenty miles I came up with them . . . . We advanced, driving them and following them four miles . . . . We were then twenty-five miles from the post . . . . we went over on Sand Creek for water, which we found in abundance; then followed on for twenty miles farther . . . . Went into camp on Sand Creek at an Indian crossing, where from 100 to 150 had crossed but an hour or two before we arrived, their trail leading southeast. Joseph A. Cramer, Second Lt. Company G, First Cavalry of Colorado, to Major E.W. Wynkoop, from Fort Lyon, 12 August 1864. In the Civil War CD-ROM of the War of the Rebellion.

Hafen Map
In 1924, Dr. LeRoy Hafen, historian of the Colorado Historical Society, produced a map showing battlefields in Colorado. On this map he placed the "Sand Creek Battle" in Cheyenne County, near the "north bend." It is not clear why, 26 years later, Dr. Hafen was instrumental in having a roadside sign for the massacre placed near the Dawson property, in Kiowa County. "Map of Early Trails, Forts and Battlefields of Colorado," Municipal Facts Magazine.

Transcription differences in documents:
We have found a number of transcription discrepancies among three government documents: the "Sand Creek Massacre," the "Massacre of Cheyenne Indians," and the War of the Rebellion. For example, the first two documents' copies of Chivington's letter from the field on 29 November 1864, indicated that he wrote from "Cheyenne Country" while the last publication used the term "Cheyenne County." Also, in First Lt. Clark Dunn's report on the engagement, the War of the Rebellion version states that he traveled forty miles from Fort Lyon to the Indian camp, while the "Massacre of Cheyenne Indians" version omits that phrase. A third example is in Major Scott Anthony's report of December 1, 1864, in which the War of the Rebellion version states that after destroying the camp, the command "pushed rapidly in a southerly direction," while the "Massacre of Cheyenne Indians" indicates they moved in a southeasterly direction. Because none of the examples that we found were critical pieces of evidence, we did not pursue finding copies of the handwritten documents to verify which versions were accurate. However, future researchers should be aware of the possibility of transcription errors.
APPENDIX

The following transcriptions are from the handwritten reports that five companies submitted ca. January 1865. Excerpts have been quoted in the report above.


C Co., 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry Company Muster Roll for November and December 1864, stationed at Camp Weld, Colorado Territory. Record of Events:
"Left Camp Wheeler C. T. Nov. 20/64. Marched 280 miles had an engagement with Indians Nov. 29/64 at South Bend Big Sandy C.T. in which the Indians were defeated. Returned to Camp Wheeler C. T. Dec. 20/64. Distance traveled in all seven hundred miles. Left Camp Wheeler C. T. Dec 29/64. Arrived at Camp Weld C.T. Distance traveled forty miles."

D Co., 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry, Company Muster Roll for November and December 1864, stationed at Fort Lyon, C.T. Record of Events:
"On 28th Nov. Co. was ordered to join Col. Chivington command consisting of ten companies of 3rd Cav. Of Col. (100 days men) and five companies of 1st Cav. Of Col. Marched 45 miles that night and at day light arrived at a friendly village of Cheyenes [sic] and Arapahoe Indians consisting of 108 lodges containing from 400 to 500 Indians mostly women and children, was immediately [sic] ordered into action which lasted until 2 o’clock P.M. Killing and scalping from 100 to 125 Indians a very large majority of which were women and children. Col. Chivington’s command lost ten men killed & forty (40) wounded. Loss in my company one horse wounded."

E Co., 1st Regiment Col. Infty. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec., 1864, shows station of company Camp Fillmore C.T. Record of Events:
"Pursuant to S.O. No. 3, Hqrs. [Qtrs?] Dist. Of Col. in the field dated Nov. 23 64, the Co. under comd of Lt. Clark Dunn 1st Cavly [?] of Col. left Camp Fillmore on the 25 of Nov 64. Marched 30 miles that day and joined the Column in the field under comd. of Col. Chivington. The Co. forming a portion of a Battalion of 1st Cav of Col. Under comd. Of Lt. Wilson proceeded thence to Fort Lyon, 70 miles distant. Arrived at that place on the 28th of Nov. About 8 o’clock the same day the comd. again started with three days rations in saddle bags - marched all night in a northerly direction. About daylight, having marched 40 miles the comd. came in sight of a large village of hostile Indians, Cheyennes & X? [See note below.] numbering about 1000, about two miles distant at the south Bend of the Big Sandy. Lt. Wilson with Battalion composed of Cos. C, E & H, 1st Cav. Of Col. commenced the engagement, attacking the town from the X side [see note below]. The engagement soon became general & lasted till about 3 o’clock p.m. when the savages were completely routed & nearly annihilated, leaving more than half their number dead in the field. The scattered Indians were pursued for several miles when being much fatigued & the ammunition nearly exhausted, the comd. returned to the battle field & encamped. Remained in camp till Dec. 1st, then marched 40 miles down Big Sandy to the Arkansas, thence 100 miles down the Arkansas in pursuit of another band of hostile savages. Being unable to overtake them & not in condition to render further pursuit available the Co. returned to Camp Fillmore, 200 miles up the Arkansas River, at which place they arrived Dec. 14/64, having lost on the expedition two men wounded in battle --
Illegible on Roll" [This 4-word note was written 8 lines below the other text, in a different style of handwriting and using a different type of pen. It thus was apparently not written by the copyist W.O. [?] Roe). See note in bibliography.]

H Co., 1st Regiment Col. Cav. Company Muster Roll for Nov. & Dec. 1864, shows station of company Camp Robbins C.T. Record of Events:
Nov 10 1864 this Co. H left Camp Robbins C.T. to join Col. Geo. L Shoup in the field. Joined his command marched a distance of 300 miles to Fort Lyons C.T. Nov. 29/64 was engaged in the battle of Big Sandy the Co. H leading the attack upon the left under the command of James Olney 2nd Lt. 1st Cav. of Col. Marched after leaving Fort Lyons until returning a distance of 240 miles from there to this camp a distance of 300 miles. Total of miles 840.

K Co., 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry, Company Muster Roll for November and December 1864, stationed at Fort Lyon C.T. Record of Events:
"The company left Ft. Lyon C.T. at 8 o'clock on the night of Nov. 28 in company with Col. J.M. Chivington Brig. consisting of 10 companies of 3rd Regt. Col. Cav., 100 day men, a detachment of 3 companies of the 1st Regt. Col. Cav. Ft. Lyon Batta. Marched 45 miles, arrived at Black Kettle's Cheyenne village of 95 lodges and Left Hand's Arapahoe village of 8 lodges containing in all from 450 to 500 Indians _____ [partly? faintly?] mostly women and children. We were immediately ordered into action, which lasted until 3 o'clock p.m. resulting in a loss on our side of 10 men killed and 40 wounded; with a loss to the Indians of from 125 to 150 (a very large majority of which were women and children) and about 500 horses, mules, & ponies. The company was ordered back to join the baggage train, marched back 20 miles distance, travelled 65 miles without rest. Company "K" lost 1 man (attached) killed & 1 man wounded 2 horses killed and 1 abandoned. Dec. 2 started down Big Sandy a distance of 35 miles to where it empties into the Arkansas River, then down the Arkansas a distance of 120 miles, and then returned to Ft. Lyon where we arrived Dec. 11. Average distance travelled when marching 50 miles per day Company almost destitute of horse equipage & none to be had at this post."
SOURCES CONSULTED


Baxter, George. Baxter Collection. Colorado Historical Society. Baxter came to Prowers County in the 1870s. His uncle, O.H.P. Baxter, was a participant in the Sand Creek Massacre. His scrapbooks contain extensive information about ranching in the area, including the Holley and S.S. ranches, which were in the Chivington area. Includes the 80-part series written by James R. Corning, based on interviews with Baxter, published in the Lamar Daily Sparks in 1939.


"A Blast from the Bugler." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 15 September 1876. (See also first two items in series under "The Chivington Massacre" and under Chas. E. Clarke.

Bowen, Charles. Interview with Christine Whitacre, 22 April 1999, Bowen property, Chivington vicinity, Colorado.

Camp, Walter M. Collection. Lilly Library, Indiana University, Bloomington. (Includes handwritten notes from a Camp interview with Edmund Guerrier in box 4, and a sketch map of the Arkansas River/Sand Creek area.)


"The Chivington Massacre: Description of the Horrible Butchery of Indians by White Men in 1864, by a Participant in the Fight." St. Louis Globe-Democrat, 4 August 1876. (Based on an interview with an unnamed man who was a bugler with Company G, 1st Colorado Cavalry. William Cummins, Hosea Harlan and John R. Young are identified as buglers for that company on a list prepared by Donald Carlisle of 1st Colorado Volunteers. See also a response under Chas. E. Clarke, and a counter response under "A Blast from the Bugler.")

"The Chivington Massacre: A Participant in the Battle Denies that it was a Massacre." Rocky Mountain News, October 4, 1876.

Clarke, Chas. E. "The Chivington Massacre: A Participant in the Battle Denies that it was a Massacre." St. Louis Globe-Democrat 15 September 1876. (Clarke was a private in Company B, 3rd Regiment Colorado Volunteer Cavalry. The same article also appeared as a reprint in the Rocky Mountain News, 4 October 1876. See also original article under "The Chivington Massacre" and a response under "A Blast from the Bugler.")

Civil War CD-ROM. Carmel: Guild Press of Indiana, 1997. This CD contains the text of several Civil War books, including The War of the Rebellion.


Colorado Springs Telegraph/Gazette. January 12 and 19, February 2 and 9, March 1, 22, 29 and 30, April 5 and 19, May 3, and November 8, 1884, and May 6, 1886. These articles deal primarily with Chivington's life and real estate transactions in the Colorado Springs area. Nothing specifically on the location of the massacre.

Cruter, George, photographer. "Filming the . . ." Empire Magazine 7 April 1968. (An award winning documentary film about the massacre was filmed east of Denver.)

Crow, George. Interview with authors, 3 February 1999, Eads, Colorado.


Dawson, William F. Interviews by authors, Fall 1998 and 4 February 1999, Chivington vicinity, Colorado.


Dennis, C.E. "Bill." Interview with authors, Hartmann, Colorado, 11 March 1999.
The Denver Post. 31 December 1903. Special edition on Colorado history; nothing specifically on the location of the Sand Creek Massacre.

Dixon, William. Correspondence. Manuscript Collection, Western History Department, Denver Public Library. Nothing specifically on the location of the Sand Creek Massacre.

"Documents on the Sand Creek Massacre." Archives of the West. Internet address: www.pbs.org/weta/thewest/wpages/wpgs640/sandcrk.htm (Includes text of editorials and testimony of witnesses.)

Doolittle Collection. Colorado Historical Society. Nothing was directly relevant to the search at hand.


"Field Notes of the Survey of the Cheyenne and Arapahoe Reservation made under contract with Gov. John Evans of the date of November 28th 1862 by John Pierce, Surveyor." Volume 1. National Archives, Record Group 75, Entry 313.


Foulke, Lester. Interview by authors, 1 February 1999, Cheyenne Wells, Colorado.


Gardiner, Dorothy. "What Really Did Happen at the Sand Creek Raid?" [Rocky Mountain News] [ca. 1947]. (Discusses the massacre and its aftermath.)


"Heard in the Lobbies About Town." Rocky Mountain News, February 15, 1893. This column includes a reminiscence by Colonel James McNassar, who recalls that the Sand Creek Massacre took place on Thanksgiving day, 1864.


Hurd, C.W. "The Chivington Massacre (Sand Creek Battle)." In The Historical Encyclopedia of Colorado. Thomas S. Chamblin, ed. Limited edition. [no place]: Colorado Historical Association, 1960. Also printed in Boggsville: Cradle of the Colorado Cattle Industry. [no place]: Boggsville Committee, pub; Bent County Democrat, printer, [no date]. An excerpt was reprinted as a pamphlet: "The Chivington Massacre: A Brief History." [no place]: Eads Chamber of Commerce, pub.; Kiowa County Press, [printer], [no date].

Hurd, C.W. "Fort Lyon has Long Colorful History of Indian Warfare and Santa Fe Trail Development; was Original Fort Wise." Star Journal 15 February 1948. (A history of the fort, including a brief reference to the sand Creek massacre and its repercussions.)


"Kiowa County and Its Towns: A Short Story of Their Ups and Downs." Kiowa County Press, 26 January 1917.


Liggett, Frost. "Pioneers and Idiosyncrasies of People I Have Known in Kiowa County." Kiowa County Press, 5 January 1940; 29 March 1940; and 20 June 1941.
Linville, Leslie. *Visiting Historic Sites on the Central Hi-Plains*. Osborne, Kansas: Osborne County Farmer, 1979. Describes site with marker. "The sand hills where Indians hid are park-marked with holes dug by relic hunters who are still hunting for artifacts. Many have been found in past years, but the ground has been pretty well cleaned for, though I have been there on several occasions, I have never found anything that relates to those times."

Lovell, Carl. Interview by authors, 1 February 1999, Cheyenne Wells, Colorado.


"Reds Massacred on Sand Creek." *The Denver Post*, 31 December 1903.


Root, Mae. Interview by authors, 5 February 1999, Lamar, Colorado.

"Sand Creek: The Battles as Viewed in the Light of Truth and History, Wht a Participant Says of the Guide and Commander." *Leadville Daily Chronicle*, 13 February 1879. States that "Alexander Safely and not Autobias" was the scout who discovered the location of the Indian camp, "and, who assisted by William Bent and James Beckwith, acted as guide to the troops from Ft. Lyon."

"Sand Creek Massacre." *Order of the Indian Wars Membership Memo* (March/April 1994) pages 6-7. (Article reprints George Bent's and Little Bear's accounts, using bold type to highlight phrases related to the geographical setting.)

"Sand Creek Site of a 'Massacre.'" *Rocky Mountain News*, 28 July 1963, page 24. (Recounts history, describes location of the Colorado Historical Society marker and the stone marker, and indicates that the site is "about nine miles northeast of what is now the Missouri Pacific station on Big Sandy Creek.")
Soule, Silas S. Soule Letters. Transcribed, Denver Public Library, Western History Department.

State Engineer’s Office. State of Colorado. "Amended and Further Statement Concerning the Canal of The Arkansas River Land, Reservoir and Canal Company," August 5, 1889. State Engineer Records, Denver, Colorado. This statement claims "two sites for reservoirs lying on the route of the canal," the King Reservoir and the Queen Reservoir. Other records in the State Engineer’s office indicate that the appropriation date for the Nee Sopa ("Sweet Water"), Nee Gronda, NeeNoshee, and Nee Skah ("Queens") Reservoirs was 1 August 1896.


Steinelt, Alvin. History of Agriculture in Colorado, 1858-1926. Fort Collins: State Agricultural College, 1926. ("The Sand Creek fight took place November 29, 1864, the spot being on Big Sandy, about ten miles north of the present town of Chivington, in Kiowa County.")


Stevens, Flora Ellice (Bishop). Reminiscence (1903). Western History Department, Denver Public Library. In this 1903 reminiscence, Flora Bishop Stevens recounts her childhood in Denver during the time of the Sand Creek Massacre. Nothing specifically on the location of the massacre, other than to note that it took place in Kiowa County.


Taylor, Ralph C. "Colorful Colorado: Turbulent Years on Colorado Plains." Pueblo Star-Journal and Sunday Chieftain 24 November 1968. ("Forty miles above its mouth and the same distance north of Fort Lyon, Sand Creek makes a big bend, with a bed 200 yards across and fringed with bluffs. It was in the sandy bottom where the Indians were camped..." Note similar statement in Baker and Hafen.)

Thom, William B. Letters (1910, 1915, and 1943). Western History Department, Denver Public Library. In our last interim report, we included an excerpt from a letter by O.H.P. Baxter to William B. Thom, dated 30 May 1915 and printed in the New York Times that stated that the massacre took place "about six miles north from where the town or station of Chivington now is." We have since learned that the Thom papers are at the Western History Department, Denver Public Library, and include the original Baxter letter. According to his letters, William Thom made an effort to verify the location of the massacre and contacted veterans of that engagement. It appears that Baxter may have been the only person to provide him with specific locational information.

The Trail. Volume I, Nos. 5, 6, and 12; Volume II, Nos. 10 and 12; Volume III, Nos. 4 and 12; Volume IV; No. 1; Volume VIII, Nos. 4 and 12; Volume XV, No. 3; and Volume XX, No. 5. Nothing specifically on the location of the Sand Creek Massacre site.


U.S. Department of the Interior. Office of Indian Affairs. "Documents Relating to the Negotiation of Ratified and Unratified Treaties with Various Indian Tribes." National Archives and Record Center, Denver. Record Group 75. Microfilm publication T494, Roll 7. Includes a transcript of the negotiations for the Treaty of 1865 with the Cheyennes and Arapahoes. A table lists victims' names, condition after Sand Creek, property lost at Sand Creek, etc.


U.S. War Department. Adjutant General's Office. 1st Regiment Colorado Cavalry. "Record of Events." National Archives and Record Center, Denver. Record Group 94. "Compiled Records Showing Service of Military Units in Volunteer Union Organizations." Microfilm publication M594, roll 4. (The introduction to the microfilm publication explains that the compilation of records of service was conducted under the direction of the Record and Pension Division of the War Department, beginning in 1890. "The abstracts were made from the original muster rolls and returns in the custody of the War Department and from rolls borrowed from the Second Auditor of the Treasury. The abstracts made from the original records were verified by a separate operation of comparison, and great care was taken to ensure that the abstracts were accurate. . . . Many of the cards contain abstracts of the record of events information as found in original muster rolls and returns.")


Vigil, Karen. "Campbell: Sand Creek Not a Battle." Pueblo Chieftain 28 November 1994. (Campbell's great-grandmother was at Sand Creek.)


Vigil, Karen. "Indians Want Site Preserved." Pueblo Chieftain 28 November 1994. (Indicates that the tribes publish their history of the massacre in their newspaper.)

Ware, Eugene F. The Indian War of 1864. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1960. Reprint of Crane & Company 1911 edition. (A member of the Seventh Iowa Cavalry, Ware based this book on his daily journal and letters. His second-hand account of the Sand Creek action is critical of the Indians. Includes a clear statement on the organization of the military’s Department of Kansas.)

“Washita and Sand Creek Compared.” Rocky Mountain News, 29 December 1868.

