PHOTOGRAPHS

PAPER COPIES OF COLOR TRANSPARENCIES

WRITTEN HISTORICAL AND DESCRIPTIVE DATA

REDUCED COPIES OF MEASURED DRAWINGS

FIELD RECORDS

HISTORIC AMERICAN LANDSCAPES SURVEY
National Park Service
U.S. Department of the Interior
1849 C Street NW
Washington, DC 20240-0001
Location: Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument, Littlefield vicinity, Mohave County, Arizona

Horse Valley Ranch is located on the Shivwits Plateau about 65 miles south of St. George, Utah, in township 31 north, range 11 west, section 6 (Gila and Salt River Meridian). Its geographic coordinates are latitude 36.118075, longitude -113.501831 (North American Datum of 1983). These coordinates represent the southwest corner of the ranch house.

Present Owner: Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument
National Park Service
Department of the Interior

Present Use: Vacant; preserved as a cultural and natural site

Significance: Horse Valley Ranch was the headquarters of Jonathan Deyo Waring’s Home Ranch grazing allotment, now known as Waring Ranch, a large cattle operation in the Arizona Strip on the Shivwits Plateau north of the Grand Canyon. Waring assembled the ranch between about 1925 and 1953 and operated it with the assistance of foremen and hired cowhands into the late 1960s. Horse Valley comprises a cabin, a barn, corrals, fences, and two stock tanks for watering cattle. The site was added to the National Register of Historic Places in 1984.

Historian: Michael R. Harrison

Project Information: Horse Valley Ranch, a component site of Waring Ranch, was documented by the Historic American Landscapes Survey of the Heritage Documentation Programs of the National Park Service. The principals involved were Richard O’Connor, Chief of Heritage Documentation Programs; Paul D. Dolinsky, Chief of the Historic American Landscapes Survey; and Jeff Bradybaugh, former Superintendent of Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument. The documentation was produced during the summer of 2010 by project supervisor Christopher Stevens, landscape architect, with Anne E. Kidd, architect; Alexander Matsov, architect; and R. Benjamin Lawrence, landscape architect intern. The large-format photography was completed by James Rosenthal. Jet Lowe created the aerial photography. The historical report was written by historian Michael R. Harrison in 2011.
Related Documentation: For detailed information on specific sites within Waring Ranch, see the following HALS documentation:

Waring Ranch, HALS AZ-3
Pine Valley, HALS AZ-3-B
Green Springs, HALS AZ-3-C
Spencer Camp, HALS AZ-3-D
Shanley Camp, HALS AZ-3-E
Dinner Pocket, HALS AZ-3-F

For additional context on historic ranching and economic activity within the boundaries of Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument, see:

Tassi Ranch and Springs, HALS AZ-2
Pine Ranch, HALS AZ-4
Grand Gulch Mine, HAER AZ-78
PART I. HISTORICAL INFORMATION

From the late 1920s until 1942, Horse Valley was the headquarters from which rancher J. D. Waring ran his ranch on the Kelly Point plateau north of the Grand Canyon. The history of the Horse Valley camp is given below. For a more complete discussion of the natural and historical context of the entire ranch, see the narrative overview in HALS No. AZ-3 (Waring Ranch).

Jonathan Deyo “Slim” Waring (1892–1982) was one of a number of ranchers who took advantage of changes made to the federal homesteading laws between 1909 and 1916 to secure a foothold on the Arizona Strip, a remote desert region north of the Grand Canyon. Born in New York state, Waring came to Arizona in 1912 and worked over the next few years as a stage driver, a miner and oiler at the Vulture Mine near Wickenburg, and as a hand at a ranch near Quartzsite. In the summer of 1916, he and two other men went to the Arizona Strip to try rounding up mustangs. This did not prove lucrative, and Waring found employment instead as a driver and ranch hand, working for or with ranchers Preston Nutter, Gordon L. “George” Weston, and William Shanley.1

From April 1918 to May 1919 Waring served in the U.S. Army during World War I. Upon his return, he settled at the southern end of Penn Valley, 5 miles north of Horse Valley, where he had purchased a cabin, well, corrals, and fences from Press Lamb. He sold these improvements to partner George Weston in 1925 and moved to another cabin he had purchased at Horse Valley.2

The log cabin at Horse Valley was probably built or started by William Shanley, the rancher also responsible for initial development at Dinner Pocket, Shanley Camp, Pine Valley, and other sites on the southern Shivwits Plateau.3 Federal surveyors who came through Horse Valley in 1922 found, however, that the cabin was now owned by a man named Garrett,

---


2 Accomazzo, Arizona National Ranch Histories, 83; Belshaw and Peplow, Historic Resources Study, 115; Land Entry Patent No. 1056185, July 26, 1932 [Gordon L. Weston], Land Entry Files, Records of the Bureau of Land Management (RG 49), National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C. (cited hereafter as NARA Land Entry Files); Waring’s Penn Valley cabin was located in section 7 of township 32 north, range 11 west. Field notes on T32N R11W are from the Bureau of Land Management’s General Land Office records, Book 3641, p. 50, but are quoted here from a summary document located in the Waring Ranch files, Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument headquarters, St. George, Utah.

3 Lake Mead NRA Cultural Resources Specialist, memo to Waring Ranch 106 files, Jan. 11, 1993, LAME.
who had also run a 4-mile-long fence around the edge of the surrounding section of public land.4

Waring moved to Horse Valley with the intention of homesteading it for stock raising. He lived in the original log cabin at first, but built a second house on the site in 1927 or 1928, apparently with the assistance of Lawrence Klein, who cut the logs. He lived there year-round except when away looking after his cattle. He received a homestead patent for 628.36 acres (all of section 6) at Horse Valley Ranch on September 18, 1928.5

At the same time Waring was proving up his homestead claim in Horse Valley, he colluded with George Howard Pemberton to acquire a second homestead in Pine Valley, 3-1/2 miles away. Pemberton applied for 320 acres in Pine Valley and filled all necessary proofs in 1931, but as soon as the government patented the land to him, he sold it to Waring. Homesteading land for another person was illegal, and a General Land Office investigation the next year determined that Pemberton had probably made false statements in his application and proofs, but no legal action was taken.6

In 1936, William Shanley quitclaimed his interest in the “Fence, Pasture, Tank, House and Corrall” at Horse Valley to Waring, although by this time Waring had owned the land for almost 8 years.7

Waring had a hand in improving and working other ranching sites on the southern Shivwits during the 1920s and 1930s. Through buying others’ improvements, filing for water rights, and buying tracts of land containing water as they came available, Waring gradually built up control of the grazing rights to the entire Kelly Point plateau, and Horse Valley became the headquarters for this large operation, which, by the mid 1960s, included 9,612.54 acres of deeded property within a 109,390-acre grazing allotment.8

---


5 Land Entry Patent No. 1019371, Sept. 18, 1928 [Jonathan D. Waring], NARA Land Entry Files; Belshaw and Peplow, Historic Resources Study, 115, 177; Lake Mead NRA Cultural Resources Specialist, memo to Waring Ranch 106 files, Jan. 11, 1993, LAME.

6 Land Entry Patent No. 1044610, Mar. 6, 1931 [George Howard Pemberton], NARA Land Entry Files.

7 Frederick L. Brown, Paiutes, Mormons, and Mercats: A History of Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument (National Park Service Pacific West Region Office, July 2009), 196; Quitclaim deed from William Shanley to J. D. Waring, Mar. 27, 1936, Waring file, BLM Offices, St. George, Utah.

Waring married Mary Vanderwalker in 1939 and soon expanded his operations onto a second ranch further to the west. He and his wife made Wildcat Ranch, 10 miles from Horse Valley, their new headquarters and home in 1942, and the cabin, barn, and corrals at their old headquarters became a line camp on Waring’s Kelly Point operation, although the Warings continued to stay there in the summertime.9

By the mid 1960s, Waring was the largest private landowner on the Strip, with 13,000 acres and two grazing allotments, Home Ranch—his operation on the Kelly Point plateau—and Wildcat / Parashant Well, his headquarters operation. Warring hired Norris “Doc” Brown, another area rancher, to run the Home Ranch allotment from 1949 to 1955. About 1957, he hired Fernard LeMoyne “Buster” Esplin as foreman at Wildcat. Both Brown and Esplin and their wives lived at Horse Valley for periods of time.10

As the Warings reduced their active involvement in ranching, the National Park Service (NPS) approached them about acquiring a substantial portion of their property. Since 1936, two-thirds of Waring’s Arizona Strip property, including all of his Home Ranch line camps, had lain within the boundaries of what was now called Lake Mead National Recreation Area. The creation of the recreation area did not alter Waring’s property or grazing rights, and the NPS recognized that he might in his retirement subdivide and sell off his lands, potentially leading to numerous private developments within the recreation area that would be costly for the government to acquire separately later.

The NPS first approached Waring in 1957, and the two parties explored both purchase and land-exchange possibilities. After a number of delays and setbacks, an agreement was reached, and Waring conveyed his Kelly Point property to the government in 1967–68, although he retained lifetime grazing rights on the land.11

PART II. PHYSICAL INFORMATION

A. Landscape character and descriptive summary

Horse Valley Ranch lies 2.2 miles east-northeast of Mount Dellenbaugh along the road south from Lake Flat onto the Kelly Point plateau. The site comprises a 19-acre clearing bordered on the west and south by ponderosa pine (Pinus ponderosa) forest and on the east and north by dense stands of pinyon pine (Pinus monophylla) and Utah juniper (Juniperus osteosperma)

9 Accomazzo, Arizona National Ranch Histories, 85; Belshaw and Peplow, Historic Resources Study, 114–15; Ben Bistline, interview by Milton Hokanson, Feb. 17, 2006, and Maud Brown, interview by idem, both Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument Oral History Collection, Val A. Browning Library Special Collections, Dixie State College, St. George, Utah.

10 Maud Brown interview; David Spencer “Spence” Esplin, interview by Milton Hokanson, Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument Oral History Collection.

11 Copies of the relevant warranty and exchange deeds for the purchase and exchange transactions are in LAME, folder “L1425, J. D. Waring (2 of 2) 4-6-66.” The same folder contains a copy of the quitclaim deed, Nov. 13, 1968, recorded in Mohave County Recorder Book 272, pp. 315–16.
trees. The ranch house, barn, and corrals stand at the northern end of the site, near a small earthen stock tank. Further to the southeast, a second, oblong stock tank fills the middle of the clearing. The whole site is bounded and subdivided into working zones by a variety of fence lines.

B. Character-defining features

1. Natural features
   a. Topography: Except for the man-made berms that create the site’s stock tanks, Horse Valley is generally flat, with a gentle slope to the southwest. The elevation at the corrals is about 6,200 feet. The silty loam appears less heavily littered with basalt rocks than other line camps within Waring Ranch due to the extensive earth moving that has been done to create the stock tanks here. Many rocks from clearing activities are deposited in an extensive scatter west of the northernmost stock tank.

   b. Vegetation: The central clearing at Horse Valley is carpeted with sideoats grama grass (*Bouteloua curtipendula*) interspersed with rabbitbrush (*Chrysothamnus nauseosus*) and big sagebrush (*Artemisia tridentata*). A dense field of big sagebrush begins at the clearing’s eastern fence line and leads into the adjacent pinyon-juniper forest. Ponderosa pine trees dominate the western camp’s western boundary.

   c. Water: The ranch site was developed alongside a wash that runs southeasterly from Lake Flat to Peter’s Pocket, about 2.5 miles away on the rim of Green Springs Canyon. This natural drainage, although dry most of the year, channels rainwater and seasonal runoff past the southwestern edge of the site.

2. Designed features
   a. Land use (spatial organization): Fences divide Horse Valley Ranch into four large zones, one forming a ranch core with domestic and service buildings and the others providing a areas to segregate and confine cattle. The service zone, at the north end of the site on either side of the entrance road, covers about 6 acres and contains the ranch house, barn, and northern stock tank. The second zone is just southeast of the first; it is L-shaped, covers about 7 acres, and contains the northern end of the second stock tank as well as an 880’ length of the wash. The third zone, nestled within the L of the second, covers 1.9 acres and contains the southern portion of the second tank. The fourth zone is a 3.4-acre triangular pasture northeast of the other three zones. The corrals were built at a corner where zones one, two, and four meet. Four additional fence lines radiate outward from the ranch core, one heading southeast, one east, one north, and one west. These define large pasturelands in the countryside surrounding Horse Valley and its water resources.

   b. Circulation: The road from Lake Flat divides into two tracks about 1/2 mile above the Horse Valley site. The north track runs directly through the camp, passing in turn the house, barn, corrals, and second stock tank. The south track runs through the woods west of the camp before rejoining the other track at the bottom of the clearing.
c. Views and vistas: The ranch house at Horse Valley looks out over the long vista of the open clearing at the heart of the site, but the trees that define the clearing block more extensive views out to the surrounding countryside.

d. Constructed water features: The site contains two earthen ponds, commonly referred to as tanks, for watering cattle. The northern one, which measures about 185’ x 145’, lies 130’ south-southwest of the ranch house. It catches rainwater but is also fed by occasional water flows from the adjacent wash, to which it is connected by a short artificial depression. This tank, given its modest size and its close proximity to the wash and to the ranch buildings, may be the original one built by Waring in 1926–27.12

The remaining tank, of unknown date, is created by a berm about 5’ to 8’ high. A shallow rise of earth with a cross fence running atop it separates the tank into two basins. When the water level is low, the tank appears as two distinct pools. When filled to capacity, it is a single pond about 550’ long and 130’ wide.13 Water from the neighboring wash is fed into the tank through a shallow channel.

The Warings drew water for household needs from the northern stock tank. They extended a plank into the water to step on, and dipped buckets in. Buster and Lola Esplin, who ran Waring’s ranches for him in the late 1950s and early 1960s, remembered that the Warings drank the tank water, but “We hauled in our own.”14

e. Buildings and structures:

Ranch house. Waring built the surviving 21’ x 29’ main cabin in 1927 or 1928 using pine logs set on a fieldstone foundation. The logs are now chinked with concrete. The house contains a living room, a kitchen, and a bedroom. Exterior doors are cut through the south and east walls into the living room and kitchen respectively. There are windows on all sides except the west, where a concrete hearth, brick and stone fireplace and chimney cover the interior surface of the wall. The cabin is insulated using corrugated cardboard (repurposed from packing boxes), and the ceilings were once made of flour sacks.15

The house’s main distinguishing feature is its “hog-trough” corners, where the log-ends at each corner of the building have been cut away and heavy planks of milled lumber nailed in place to create 90-degree concave corners. The logs in adjacent walls do not overlap each other at the corners in this type of construction, which is probably a western innovation. According to one study, hog-trough cornering is the second most common type of cornering found in log buildings in the upper Yukon.

---

12 Land Entry Patent No. 1019371.
13 A 1966 photograph shows these stock tanks nearly full; see Figure 3.
14 Lake Mead NRA Cultural Resources Specialist, memo to Waring Ranch 106 files, Jan. 11, 1993; Leslie Peterson, memo to Mary Waring, Nov. 12, 1992, both LAME.
15 Nolan, Appraisal of the J.D. Waring Ranch, 14; Western Farm Management Company, Appraisal Report, 19.
Valley, but examples, though rare, have been found scattered across the mountain west. The reason for its use here is unknown.\textsuperscript{16}

Park Service employees extensively stabilized the building in 1996 and 2001, work that included covering the windows and doors to prevent entry and repairing the roof.\textsuperscript{17}

\textit{Piles of logs from the demolished first cabin.} The remaining timbers from the original log cabin at Horse Valley sit in two piles to the south and west of the surviving ranch house. It was built in 1920 or 1924 and was about 15' x 15'. When no longer needed for residential use, it was converted into a feed shed. It was dismantled due to decay sometime between 1977 and 1982. Buster Esplin recalled that attempts to burn its salvaged logs as firewood were unsuccessful.\textsuperscript{18}

\textit{Barn.} The 27' x 15.5' barn stands 132' northeast of the ranch house. It was constructed in the mid 1930s, possibly by Tom Wakling, a partner of Waring’s who lived at Horse Valley with his wife Anne from ca. 1936–39. The barn is built of unchinked pine logs and has saddle-notched corners. It rests on log sills set directly on the ground. The roof is formed of corrugated metal sheets fastened directly to the timber purlins. The south wall, although divided visually into three bays by two supporting timbers, was originally completely open. Its easternmost bay was converted into an enclosed stall by the addition of log wall panels sometime after 1976; the door into the stall was reportedly reused from the (now demolished) original cabin.\textsuperscript{19}

\textit{Outhouse.} This single-seat outhouse lies along a fence line 159' northeast of the ranch house and 85' north of the barn. It is heavily constructed of logs with milled-lumber door, flooring, and bench, and corrugated sheet-metal roofing. It is supported by sill logs set onto rock foundations and measures 5' deep x 4' wide x 7' high.

\textit{Corrals.} Two roughly circular corrals sit adjacent to one another about 200' east of the ranch house. They are constructed of juniper-log pickets fastened together with wire. The larger corral is about 62' x 53'; the smaller about 39' in circumference. A

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{16} Terry G. Jordan, Jon T. Kilpinen, and Charles F. Gritzner, \textit{The Mountain West: Interpreting the Folk Landscape} (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), 76.
\item \textsuperscript{17} Photographs and planning documents relating to the stabilization of the cabin appear in folder “CRM 106, Horse Valley Ranch Stabilization Project,” in LAME.
\item \textsuperscript{19} Accomazzo, \textit{Arizona National Ranch Histories}, 84. Robbyn Jackson, memo to Regional Historical Architect, Oct. 2, 1992; Lake Mead NRA Cultural Resources Specialist, memo to Waring Ranch 106 files, Jan. 11, 1993; Leslie Peterson, memo to Mary Waring, Nov. 12, 1992, all LAME. No barn is mentioned in J. D. Waring’s homestead application and proofs.
\end{itemize}
rectangular area between the corrals connects them to a sloping loading chute and a ground-level branding chute, both made of milled lumber.

f. Small-scale features: The fences at Horse Valley are made of juniper poles strung with multiple lines of barbed wire. The fence that encloses the southern portion of the second stock tank uses woven-wire fencing.

Two bronze plaques cemented to basalt boulders on the north side of the access road, 90' north of the ranch house, memorialize Jonathan and Mary Waring. The one reads, “Jonathan Deyo Waring / SSGT US Army / World War I / Sep 16 1892 Jul 20 1982”. The other reads, “Mary V Waring / Pioneer Arizona Strip / Apr 10 1911 Jul 3 2001”.

g. Archeological sites: A number of Native American archeological sites probably associated with the Pueblo II period (AD 900–1150) appear in the immediate vicinity of Horse Valley, including a large pueblo and several stone structure remains. These sites are consistent with the extensive evidence of native occupation and use found throughout the Kelly Point plateau.²⁰

PART III. SOURCES OF INFORMATION

A. Primary Sources


Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument Oral History Collection. Val A. Browning Library Special Collections, Dixie State College, St. George, Utah.

Land Entry Files. Records of the Bureau of Land Management (RG 49). National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C.

Waring file. Bureau of Land Management offices, St. George, Utah.

Waring Ranch files. Grand Canyon-Parashant National Monument headquarters, St. George, Utah.

Waring land files (L1425). Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.

B. Maps


C. Secondary Sources


Figure 1. Horse Valley Ranch, 1966. View looking north-northeast. From left to right: the ranch house, the original cabin (in use as a feed shed), and the barn. From Patrick D. Nolan, *An Appraisal of the J.D. Waring Ranch located approximately 95 miles south of St. George, Utah, 1966*, Waring land files (L1425), Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.
Figure 2. Horse Valley Ranch, 1966. View looking northeast. The original cabin and the barn are at left; the corrals sit in the middle distance. From Patrick D. Nolan, *An Appraisal of the J.D. Waring Ranch located approximately 95 miles south of St. George, Utah, 1966*, Waring land files (L1425), Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.
Figure 3. Horse Valley Ranch, 1966. View looking southeast. The northern stock tank sits nearly full on the right; the second stock tank appears beyond the dividing fence. From Patrick D. Nolan, *An Appraisal of the J.D. Waring Ranch located approximately 95 miles south of St. George, Utah*, 1966, Waring land files (L1425), Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.
Figure 4. The ranch house at Horse Valley, 1966. View looking northwest. From Western Farm Management Company, *Appraisal Report of Waring Ranch, Mohave County, Arizona, for National Park Service*, [1966], Waring land files (L1425), Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.
Figure 5. The original cabin (in use as a feed shed), the barn, and the corrals, Horse Valley, 1966. View looking east. From Western Farm Management Company, *Appraisal Report of Waring Ranch, Mohave County, Arizona, for National Park Service*, [1966], Waring land files (L1425), Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.
Figure 6. The corrals at Horse Valley, 1966. View looking north. From Western Farm Management Company, *Appraisal Report of Waring Ranch, Mohave County, Arizona, for National Park Service*, [1966], Waring land files (L1425), Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.
Figure 7. The southern stock tank at Horse Valley, 1966. View looking northwest. The ranch house, original cabin, barn, and corrals appear in the background, left to right. From Western Farm Management Company, *Appraisal Report of Waring Ranch, Mohave County, Arizona, for National Park Service*, [1966], Waring land files (L1425), Lake Mead National Recreation Area headquarters, Boulder City, Nevada.