ERRATA
ETHNOGRAPHIC OVERVIEW AND ASSESSMENT OF
CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK

1. The beginning page of the TABLE OF CONTENTS should read "i" instead of "I".

2. On page i of the TABLE OF CONTENTS under "CHAPTER V: CONSIDERATIONS FOR MANAGEMENT APPROACHES AND FURTHER STUDY":
   - After "A. MANAGEMENT CONTEXT," change "61" to "60."
   - After "B. POSSIBLE OPTIONS FOR MANAGEMENT," change "61" to "60."
   - After "C. ITEMS FOR FURTHER STUDY," change "64" to "63."
   - After "REFERENCES CITED," change "67" to "66."
   - After "SELECTED ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY," change "77" to "75."
   - Note that "APPENDICES" begin following page 177.


4. Page 71, insert two references:

   National Park Service

   National Park Service

5. Page 103, delete in its entirety the bibliographic citation and annotation pertinent to:

   National Park Service, Southwest Regional Office.
   1987 Resources Management Plan: Archeological Section. Draft...
ETHNOGRAPHIC OVERVIEW AND ASSESSMENT OF CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK

Adolph M. Greenberg, Ph.D.
Ethnographer
Miami University
Oxford, Ohio

September 12, 1996

National Park Service
Contract: 1443PX700092963
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments iii

CHAPTER I:  INTRODUCTION

A. STUDY ISSUES AND NONTECHNICAL SUMMARY OF THE REPORT 1

CHAPTER II:  MESCALERO APACHE ASSOCIATION WITH THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS: DOCUMENTARY SOURCES

A. ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESEARCH 8
B. ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH 9
C. APACHE ADAPTATIONS IN THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS 11
D. APACHE ADAPTATIONS OUTSIDE OF MOUNTAINOUS AREAS 15
E. PLACE NAMES, SACRED LOCALES, AND SPIRITUAL ACTIVITY FIELDS 19
F. RECENT MESCALERO USE OF THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS 22

CHAPTER III:  ETHNOGRAPHIC ASSESSMENT OF TIGUA ASSOCIATION WITH THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS

A. INTRODUCTION 25
B. TIGUA ADAPTATIONS: CULTURE HISTORY AND GROUP IDENTITY 26
C. TIGUA ADAPTATIONS: LAND USE AND RESOURCES 31
D. TIGUA ADAPTATIONS: HUNTING AND GATHERING 35
E. TIGUA ADAPTATIONS: SACRED LANDS AND SACRED PRACTICES 40
F. TIGUA ADAPTATIONS: THE GUADALUPE SALT BASIN 52

CHAPTER IV:  ON-SITE CONSULTATION WITH THE TIGUA TRIBE OF YSLETA DEL SUR PUEBLO 57

CHAPTER V:  CONSIDERATIONS FOR MANAGEMENT APPROACHES AND FURTHER STUDY

A. MANAGEMENT CONTEXT 61
B. POSSIBLE OPTIONS FOR MANAGEMENT 61
C. ITEMS FOR FURTHER STUDY 64

REFERENCES CITED 67
SELECTED ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 77

APPENDICES:

A: PROJECT ACTIVITIES AND SCOPE OF WORK
B: TIGUA PLANT LIST: ANNOTATED
C: PLACES AND RESOURCES THAT REQUIRE SPECIAL TREATMENT
D: DISCUSSION OF METHODOLOGIES AND RESEARCH FINDINGS
# TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONT'D)

## APPENDICES (CONT'D):

### E. MEMORANDA ON TRIBAL CONTACTS

#### MAPS:
1. TIGUA PLACE NAMES 37
2. ESTIMATED EXTENT OF TIGUA TERRITORY 43

#### LISTS:
1. TIGUA PLACE NAMES 38

#### FIGURES:
1. SURFACE FEATURES IN CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK 2
2. MESCAL PIT 4
3. MESCALERO MESCAL COLLECTING IN THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS 23
4. YSLETA DEL SUR PUEBLO 30
5. ROCK FORMATION AT HUECO TANKS 32
6. GUADALUPE SALT BASIN 55
7. TIGUA CONSULTATION WITH CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK STAFF 58
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The contractor acknowledges the National Park Service’s generous support and assistance for this project. In particular, Superintendent Frank Deckert and the staff of Carlsbad Caverns National Park were enormously helpful in providing on-site support and needed information throughout the project. Mr. Ed Natay, Chief, Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office, was very supportive and offered sound advice at critical junctures. Mr. Tom Diamond, Attorney for the Tigua Tribe, gave the contractor complete access to his substantial archive on the Tigua and Apache. The contractor would also like to thank Mr. Nicholas Houser for his assistance in providing substantial ethnobiographical documentation on the Tigua. Mr. Mark Rosacker of Living Desert State Park provided the contractor with important ethnographic contacts and commentary. The results of an ethnobotanical study of Tigua culture undertaken by Ms. Shannon Gray, Miami University Botany graduate student, added meaningful dimensions to an understanding of Tigua ethnographic resources and cultural landscape. Mr. Adam Simcock, graduate assistant in the Institute of Environmental Sciences at Miami University, assisted the contractor in the development of land use maps. Ms. Edith Morgan, another graduate assistant, provided important work in the compilation of bibliographic sources. Thanks also go to former Miami University students, Ms. Suellyn Shupe, Ms. Marit Munson, Ms. Jessica Kugel, and Mr. Steve Adam for the research briefs they provided. Ms. Rhonda Barnes, also a graduate assistant in Miami University’s Institute Environmental Science, was an invaluable resource for logistical support. The staffs of Miami University’s Office of Applied Technologies were instrumental in the production of the final report.

The contractor acknowledges Mr. Fred Peso, Mescalero Tribal Official, for his willingness to meet with the contractor and Mr. Natay despite heavy demands on his time. Finally, this researcher expresses his gratitude to the Tigua people for their generosity, kindness, and patience they have shown during the course of this endeavor.
I. INTRODUCTION

A. Introduction: Study Issues and Nontechnical Summary of the Report

The National Park Service (NPS) is committed to the planning and implementation of programs that protect the cultural and natural resources of Carlsbad Caverns National Park in an effective, culturally informed manner. To help park managers evaluate requests for access to resources, assess potential environmental impacts of park use on the natural and cultural resources and to recognize the impacts on traditional cultural systems of park use or non-use, an ethnographic overview and assessment was conducted to identify those contemporary peoples who have traditional associations with the cultural and natural resources of this park.

According to NPS-28 (Cultural Resource Management Guideline), an ethnographic overview and assessment represents an initial comprehensive background study of types, uses, and users of ethnographic resources. Existing information should be reviewed and new data needs identified. The overview reviews and summarizes existing ethnographic data for people and resources associated with parks; the assessment evaluates them and identifies data gaps (NPS-28 1994:174).

This ethnographic overview and assessment was conducted under contract/order number 1443PX700092963 by Adolph M. Greenberg, Ph.D., applied ethnographer. George Esber, Ph.D., Southwest Regional Ethnographer served as the C.O.T.R. until he left the service on 8/93. Ed Natay, Chief, Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office is the current C.O.T. R. for this project.

A Presidential Proclamation in 1923 set aside 720 acres as Carlsbad Cave National Monument. Fundamental to the establishment of the monument was protection of a cave "of extraordinary proportions and of unusual beauty." In 1930, the monument was enlarged by approximately 10,000 acres, and its official designation became Carlsbad Caverns National Park. Its boundaries were again expanded in 1939 to total some 40,000 acres. In 1963, the boundaries were again adjusted to the 46,766 acres that defines the park's administrative boundaries today. Three Presidential Proclamations and Executive Orders and three congressional acts have authorized and stipulated the park's present size. Along with the current National...
FIGURE 1: SURFACE FEATURES IN CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK
Park Service Management Policies (1988), these executive and legislative mandates require that the park be managed so as to preserve all natural features, including caves, rock formations, plants, animals, and archaeological/historical resources, while simultaneously providing, through appropriate facilities and services, for the safe and enjoyable use of the park by visitors (Statement For Management, January 1993). A master plan developed for the park in 1975 was tied to the joint administration of the park with Guadalupe Mountains National Park and ultimately was judged too general and out-of-date. A new General Management Plan was authorized in 1992.

One of the areas pegged for consideration in the task directive for the Carlsbad Caverns National Park General Management Plan was the management of cultural resources. There are 50 rare, dark zone Guadalupe Mountains/Archaic style color pictographs thus far identified in Slaughter Canyon Cave (dark zone pictographs are thus labeled because they exist in a location not reached by sunlight, and require artificial light to view them). Non-cave cultural resources include over 125 identified archaeological sites. Included in these is a rock shelter site which has been placed on the National Register of Historic Places. The walls of this site contain 7 layers of polychrome pictographs (red, yellow, orange, white, and black). The full significance of this site and other areas have yet to be determined and this fact, in combination with the adverse impact of human activities and natural deterioration, resulted in the need to protect archaeological resources and develop interpretative programs that reflect ethnographic information about traditional uses of the park by Indian people.

There is substantial historic documentation that the Mescalero Apaches lived in and regularly used the resources of the Guadalupe Mountains during the 1700's and 1800's, including the area encompassed today by Carlsbad Caverns National Park. Apache interest in these lands and associated resources continues today, as evidenced in recent reports of Mescalero use of the area for religious purposes. However, no ethnographic overview and assessment of their traditional and continuing association with the resources of the park including significant natural and cultural areas, traditional use areas, sacred sites and locales, access trails, and access needs has been undertaken to date. The meaning and importance of specific locales and resources in Carlsbad Caverns National Park to the Mescalero and other
FIGURE 2: MESCAL PIT
contemporary American Indian communities remains at the level of ethnohistorical and historical documentation. For the most part, such documentation does not contain Indian commentary or narratives on the meaning of the Guadalupe Mountains to their people. Oral commentary revealed through ethnographic interviews and observations can inform National Park Service management of those areas that may require special attention or protection by park management regimes. Moreover, the establishment of ongoing consultations with those affected Indian communities hold the potential to enhance not only the management of Carlsbad Caverns National Park, but also its interpretative story. Thus, a major component of this study was establishing a consultation relationship with the Mescalero. The present day Mescalero Reservation is located in south central New Mexico, approximately 100 miles to the northwest of the Park.

A thorough review of the ethnographic literature and archival sources was completed for this contract. Meetings were held with the staff of Carlsbad Caverns National Park to discuss the scope of work, seek their advice, and ascertain their needs. Throughout the duration of the project, Superintendent Deckert was appraised of the status of the research (see Appendix A for detailed discussion of project activities). Research revealed two prominent traditional associations with the Guadalupe Mountains and adjacent lands: the Mescalero Apache and Tigua Tribe of Ysleta Del Sur Pueblo.

Overall, the approach used in this report was to include references to previously published material on Apache association with the Guadalupe Mountains region. The same can be said of the Tigua material with the notable exception that ethnographic interviews and an on-site visit were accomplished with the Tigua Tribe. The activities of these two cultural groups involved connections to the mountains and/or adjacent areas, some of which now include National Park Service lands and the rest outside of what are now park boundaries. As a consequence, the scope of the project's inquiry was broadened to include these adjacent areas. This was done to provide the necessary context for understanding the traditional associations of the Apache and Tigua to the lands now encompassed by and adjacent to the park.

Official contact was not established with the Mescalero Tribal Government until March 15, 1994 when Mr. Natay and the contractor met with Mr. Fred Peso, Vice-President of the Tribe. Mr. Peso was amenable to the project, and felt it desirable
that the Mescalero Tribe participate as they have a deep seated, continuing interested in the Guadalupe Mountains. However, before the project could be considered by the tribal council, the scope of the project along with its implications for the tribe would have to be discussed in the tribe's Cultural Affairs and Museum Committees. Mr. Natay and the contractor were told that the tribe would be in contact with either Mr. Natay or the contractor. In June of 1994, a video letter introducing the project, park staff, and the park was produced by the contractor and sent to the tribe. Also, at that time, the project was extended for another year. Having not been contacted by the Mescalero Tribe throughout the rest of that year, the contractor and Mr. Natay (1/95) agreed that the project be concluded. As a consequence, this project did not involve any official ethnographic interviews or on-site visits to the park involving representatives of the Mescalero Tribe. Therefore, there are noticeable and critical gaps in the existing data base. The discussion of Mescalero association with and traditional use of the park is based solely on existing written reports. These reports reveal the centrality of the Guadalupe Mountains to Mescalero cultural tradition, although much of this material is of a general nature thereby lacking the kind of specificity which would precisely tie the Mescalero Apache to a specific locale in the Park. Moreover, because there were no Mescalero commentaries collected on specific areas of the park, no additional attempt was made, beyond what has already been documented, to detail or map Mescalero place names and sacred sites or speculate about the meaning of specific locales to the Mescalero. A general discussion of the nature of Apache adaptations to the natural and political environment is included.

Preliminary discussions with the park service staff at Guadalupe Mountains National Park revealed some speculation about an on-going Tigua presence in the general vicinity of the Guadalupes. Consequently, the Tigua Tribe of Ysleta Del Sur Pueblo in El Paso was also contacted. Subsequent discussions, documentary research, ethnographic interviews, and an on-site consultation visit to the park revealed the extent of Tigua links to the lands now under National Park Service administration and those lands immediately adjacent to the Park. Ethnographic interviews with the Tigua revealed a long-term association with the west slope of Guadalupe Mountains, including the salt basin, gypsum dunes, and specific plant resources, and a less specific one to Carlsbad Caverns National Park lands. The contractor and Superintendent Deckert conferred periodically during the course of the project over General Management Plan consultation with the Tigua (see Appendix A).
Recommendations include a discussion of the establishment of a consultation relationship with the Mescalero Tribe, continue the consultation relationship established with the Tigua Tribe including responding to Tigua concerns regarding protection of and tourist access to a remote pictograph site, and contacting the Piro-Manso-Tiwa Indian Tribe of the Pueblo of San Juan de Guadalupe, Las Cruces, New Mexico for possible future consultation. Further study issues regarding other groups which may have connections to Carlsbad Caverns National Park include the Chiricahua and Jicarilla Apache, White Mountain Apache, Kiowa-Apache, San Carlos Apache, Comanche, Kiowa, Zia Pueblo, Zuni Pueblo and Isleta Pueblo are discussed as well (see Appendix E for description of the status of Carlsbad Caverns National Park's on-going consultation with these groups).
II. MESCALERO APACHE ASSOCIATION WITH THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS: DOCUMENTARY SOURCES

A. Archaeological Research

The archaeological evidence for Apache presence in the study area is thin due in large measure to a subsistence technology heavily dependent on hunting and gathering with dispersed, mobile populations. Clifton (1992) suggests, following the arguments of other archaeologists, that the Guadalupe Mountains were abandoned sometime after A.D. 1400 and reoccupied by Apachean groups sometime after 1541. However, he offers the caveat that abandonment is more apparent than real because hunting and gathering with dispersed populations and lack of intrusive pottery would create an erroneous impression of abandonment. In addition, Seymour (1995) notes that a singular problem in Apache archaeology is the fact that the Apache were making very energetic efforts not be found during the later part of their history.

Several sites are suspected of being Apachean, but none have been recorded or definitely documented within the park although Katz and Katz (1974:59) report that a multiple midden site (41CU140) also containing a modern hearth, and a possible structure located in the high country of the Guadalupe Mountains National Park is purported by local residents to have been occupied by Mescalero as late as 1911. No historical artifacts were found, but charcoal in several of the midden rings seemed fresh. A small number of Apachean shards were collected at lower altitudes (Warren in P. Katz 1978). Pratt Cave in the mouth of McKittrick Canyon at Guadalupe Mountains National Park is thought to represent the occupation by the Mescalero in this portion of the Park. North into New Mexico, Fulgam (1988) has described a site which was concluded to be Apachean. Along similar lines, early reports, existing tradition, and contemporary use confirm the collection of mescal by the Apache as a primary staple, and abandoned mescal pits often identified as midden rings found in abundance in Carlsbad Caverns National Park have been associated with Apaches and earlier groups (Castetter and Bell 1938:33 cited in Steely 1990:6). Clifton (1992:10) makes the following observation: “It has been my experience that without radiocarbon dates, distinctive rock art, or metal artifacts, Apache sites are indistinguishable from earlier archaeological sites.” In discussing Guadalupe high country sites, Steely (1990:7) contends that since “Mescalero Apaches have traditionally used the Guadalupe range to obtain sotol, agave and
other subsistence items...it is here concluded that the structural remains of these sites are the remains of Apachean groups."

Much of the problem resides in Apachean cultural practices which limit the amount of artifactual assemblages on sites. Since the arrival of the Apache to the region has not been dated with any degree of certitude, diagnostic artifacts are weak, indicating either previous inhabitants or Apache. Another reason is that the material culture of the Apache was limited due to the demands of a mobile lifestyle (see Buskirk 1986 for discussion). Opler’s (1987) informants indicated that few Apache would manufacture flint projectile points, preferring instead to reuse those left at the numerous sites of earlier inhabitants in the region. Finally, Apachean cultural practices centered on death including the removing of material goods of the deceased and the razing of structures must be a contributing factor to the paucity of Mescalero sites.

B. Ethnographic Research

The Apache presence in those parts of the Guadalupe Mountains now encompassed by Carlsbad National Park and Guadalupe Mountains National Park is well documented by other approaches. Most importantly, Apache oral tradition reveals the Guadalupe Mountains as a central focus in creation stories, curing practices, and as homelands. To the Mescalero, the Guadalupe Mountains are part of what Farrer (1994:2) calls the “mythic present”:

What mainstream Americans consider to have happened long ago, if it happened at all, is real and present during everyday life on reservations. There is a co-presence of events in which the Warrior Twins engaged and those taking place around a dinner table; this is the mythic present. Both the Long Ago and the Now are present together in thought, song, narrative, everyday life, and certainly in religious and ritual life.

Thus, resources now managed by the National Park Service Carlsbad Caverns National Park play a central role in the on-going instruction by elders of the young regarding beliefs, history, and practices. On-site and off-site Mescalero involvement in the Guadalupe Mountains discussed later in this report, substantiates
the importance of "narratives anchored to park localities" (NPS-28 1994:10).

There is a substantial body of historical, ethnohistorical, and ethnographic publications on all aspects of Mescalero culture and culture history, and these also provide evidence for Mescalero settlement in and use of the entire Guadalupe range. While most historical references are often vague and nonspecific, usually referring to the "Apaches in the Guadalupes," the sheer number of references to the Guadalupe Mountains as the Mescalero homelands during the 1700's and 1800's is significant. The U.S. Army engaged in several military sorties against the Mescaleros in the area, a few of these occurring within the present boundaries of the parks (Thrapp 1967). While there are some specific references to sites, the evidence for Apache presence in the area is often given without much specificity, though references to an encampment was occasionally documented. A man interviewed in 1981 at Dog Canyon who had lived in the Guadalupe Mountains for 70 years made the following observation:

You know, the Indians had been in here (Dog Canyon?). They moved them out of here, they told me, in 1912. When I came in 1913 they had moved them out and put them on the reservation. When I first came there were a lot of the old Teepees still standing. Some of the hides were still there. You know, up in Texas there is springs and over in McKittrick Canyon there is a running river, and up there in that high country there were still a lot of their old maple teepee poles with the hides still on them. There were lots bone and deer heads scattered everywhere, but there were very few deer. You could pick up arrowheads just anywhere.

I don't know how they managed to move them wild Indians out of these mountains. I've often wondered how they did it. I've never seen an Indian up in here since I have been here (Warren 1981 emphasis mine).

Many of the statements, however, were made by military officials and hence are as expected biased.

No attempt here has been made to produce a reconstructed general ethnography of the cultural practices of the Mescalero as this has already been done by Schroeder
(1959;1960), Bender (1960), Basehart (1971;1974), Opler (1941;1983a; 1983b) and Farrer (1991). Basehart (1974) notably, has collected several specific Mescalero place names for the area (see below) and has sketched in detail the specific features of biotic communities exploited by the Apache. What follows is a focused discussion on selected aspects of Mescalero connections to the Guadalupes.

C. Apache Adaptations in the Guadalupe Mountains

Ethnohistorians have asserted that major portions of the southwestern United States were held by Athapaskan-speaking peoples. These groups include the Mescalero, Jicarilla, Navajo, Lipan, Kiowa-Apache, Chiricahua, and Western Apache groups. Their distribution covers portions of Arizona, New Mexico, Texas, and Mexico, and includes small parts of Oklahoma, Utah, and Colorado. While such a broadcast blanket speaks to general areas that were settled and used by Athapaskans, this region represented considerable cultural diversity displayed by many different communities.

The biological and physical features of this area generally includes mountainous zones, river valleys, and plains, with elevations ranging from 2800 to approximately 9,000 feet. The cultural adaptations devised by each community living in this large area focused on selected resources available within specific niches occupied by each. Thus it is possible to identify habitats that offered the resource availability that each of these ethnic communities preferred and chose to settle around. For some, the mountainous elevations with their corresponding plant and animal resources provided the inventory needed for their way of life. Others chose the plains adaptations with a dependence on bison, while for still others, the river valleys and their bottomlands offered the opportunities for farming and community life.

Although some areas were used exclusively by its inhabitants, other territories were subject to multiple users with a variety of intentions. Settlement areas were held exclusively, although subject to trespass and violation through raiding and warfare. Other regions were used on an occasional basis, such as for hunting, collecting, trade, and travel.

All of these factors suggest that specific locales need to be identified as to the
environmental resources available, the peoples who used these sites, and the kinds of uses to which they were put. As specific locations are identified within the greater southwest of the United States, their users and kinds of uses become the keys to understanding the ethnohistory for that area.

Mescalero territory is described as including parts of southeastern New Mexico and southwestern Texas between the Rio Grande and Pecos Rivers with some overlapping of territories on each side of the river valleys (Opler 1983:419). The Lipan Apache were more plains oriented and came to occupy the southern portion of this area and parts of Mexico. The Chiricahua were to the west of the Rio Grande in southwestern New Mexico, southeastern Arizona, and south of those two states in northern Mexico. Although groups of Indians, perhaps Apache, were observed by Castano de Sosa in 1590 near the present day city of Carlsbad, New Mexico (Fitzgerald 1983), it was not until after 1700 did the Spanish specifically identify the Mescalero and Lipan as Apache groups living east of the Rio Grande (Griffen 1988a:4). Today, descendants of these three groups are resident on the Mescalero Indian Reservation in New Mexico.

The Spanish notes recorded by Cortes in 1799 provided early evidence of the Mescalero habitat.

The Mescalero Nation inhabits the mountains adjacent to the Pecos River, on either side, extending south to the mountains that constitute the top of the Bolsom de Mapimi and ending in that area on the right of the Rio Grande (John 1989:52).

Most likely, the fact that Apacheans are believed to have entered the southwest via the Plains is significant. As a result of competition with Comanches, who held an advantage by virtue of their travel on horseback, the Apaches were forced to retreat (Griffen 1988a). This fact may hold the key to why it is that mountainous areas with difficult access became the places of preference for the lifestyle that emerged. In addition, the fact that mountains, particularly the Guadalupes, contained many areas of great religious significance probably reinforced the Mescalero settlement-subsistence strategy which was to develop.
Although the broad areas described identify the range of the Mescalero Apache, their uses in the areas are tied more specifically to their cultural lifestyle and the resources that were used as part of those adaptations. Primarily hunters and gatherers, the Mescalero, in southeastern New Mexico and in west Texas, depended upon deer, elk, and bighorn sheep that were found in the higher elevations along with mescal and acorns (Opler 1983a; 1983b). Early documents indicate that the Mescalero were not pressed to be agriculturalists until yielding to Spanish influences (John 1989:60).

For access to these resources, Apaches held to mountainous areas for their encampments where, in addition to the defensive posture that was offered, hunting was favored along with the collection of mescal at the higher altitudes. Cortes noted:

They always judge it more fitting - and choose with good reason - to locate their living sites among very rugged hills and mountains; and consider themselves better or worse situated according to the greater or lesser difficulty of access to their chosen sites (John 1989:57).

Opler concluded:

Spanish expeditions penetrated the Sacramento Mountains, the Organ Mountains, and the Sierra Blanca Range to attempt to dislodge Mescalero encampments. Because they favored mountain retreats and were less frequently found in an exposed position on the plains, Croix considered the Mescalero a more formidable foe for his soldiers than the Lipan (1983a:420).

Early records kept by the Spanish revealed the fact that Apache settlements were to be found in the mountain ranges. Writing in 1799, Jose Cortes noted:

...the rancherias always occupied the steepest canyons in the mountains, surrounded by the most difficult passes for approaching the site where they are located. That site is chosen, as a general rule, adjacent to the greatest heights in order to command the surrounding valleys and plains (John 1989:65).
In the ravines of the same mountains the men seek large and small game, extending their hunts to the adjoining plains. When they have what they need, they carry it back to the rancherias... (John 1989:58).

Many reasons have been mentioned why the aforesaid nomadic nations move their encampments from one location to another. They are further obliged to make these moves by another need, which arises when they see that their current location the necessary food for them and grazing for their horses are becoming scarce. They also consider that they have found some places to be better than others according to the seasons of the year. But these changes of location occur without leaving the mountain ranges that they recognize as their territory (John 1989:62).

Regarding raiding, Cortes had this to say:

When the expedition is concluded and the booty is divided up- in which distribution it is not uncommon for dangerous disputes to arise, to be settled by the law of the strongest - those from each group return to their respective district and those from each rancheria to their favorite mountains, without suffering interference from anyone (John 1989:72).

It is interesting to note here that Lieutenant Cortes’ observations correspond very closely (perhaps too much so) to those made by Lieutenant Colonel Cordero (Matson n.d.) three years previously.

There is, in short, widespread agreement among scholars that the Apache were mountain people and that their subsistence patterns were centered around the resources available in those higher elevations, both of the game hunted and the plant resources collected (Opler 1983). Ethnobotanical analysis of Mescalero subsistence reveals a substantial plant inventory, one which could not have developed unless there had been long-term occupancy of the area where these species are found (Castetter and Opler 1936).

This view is reinforced by later military reports on Mescalero activities during the American period. According to Bender (1960:1), the southern Apaches were composed of two groups during the American period: the Gila who occupied those
lands west of the Rio Grande, and the Mescaleros east of the river in the White and Sacramento Mountains. The Mescalero were said to number between 600 to 800 divided into five bands by the early 1850's. One of the principal groups called Agua Nuevo were led by Mateo and Venancia and occupied the area around Dog Canyon. Further south, in the heart of the Guadalupes, 80 Mescalero lodges were observed in 1853 (Bender 1960:2). In 1854, Major John S. Simonson sent his mounted riflemen and the Texas mounted militia to scour the deserts west of the Davis Mountains in an effort to keep the Mescalero off balance and drive them into New Mexico. He discovered the extent of the Mescalero resistance and failed to dislodge various groups of them from the Davis Mountains, Guadalupe Mountains, and the Big Bend area.

As the army was intent on removing the Mescalero from the Guadalupes in order to protect travelers and mail on the San Antonio-El Paso road, military sorties against the Apache were commonplace. In May and June of 1858, Lieutenant William Hazen led a detachment from Fort Davis to the Guadalupe Mountains and destroyed a Mescalero camp there. There were many such incursions into Mescalero territory. Opler (1970) compiled a summary of Texas locations where Lipan and Mescalero were found during the period from 1820-1884. Of particular interest is the fact that there are 41 references to Mescalero association with the Guadalupes many of which describe “camps,” “house sites,” and “rancherias with 75 lodges.” Captain McCleave and troops encountered about 500 Mescalero at the Gateway Pass of Dog Canyon and defeated them (Opler 1950: 14). In 1869 and 1870, Mescalero reported in rancherias of 25 to 50 wickiups in canyons on the south side of the mountains. During that same time period, the army reported a recently abandoned camp well stocked with thousands of pounds of Mescal, buffalo and beef hides, deer, antelope and other skins and other items, abandoned rancherias in the Delaware Creek region and an abandoned rancheria with an estimated population of 400-500 in the lower Guadalupes (probably Delawares)(Bender 1960). Thus not only are there references to the military chasing the Apaches into the Guadalupes, but importantly, there are references to Apache settlements.

D. Apache Adaptations Outside of Mountainous Areas

What about ethnohistorical documentation of Apache activities away from the mountains? Activities around river valleys and bottomlands are documented, but
references to Apache presence in these areas are of a different nature. In 1786, Spanish policy called for the formation of peace establishments for Apaches in an effort to bring Apaches under Spanish control (Griffen 1988:14). For example:

After 1790 some Apache rancherias began years of regular contact with Hispanics. The Spanish peace establishments lasted in essence until 1831 and hence afforded some forty years of more or less tranquil interaction between Apaches and Hispanics. Many Apaches learned new things and adapted to the Hispanic presence, and no doubt routinely acquired food and other resources that enhanced their influence with their relatives still in the hinterland. After the Apaches at peace abandoned their presidios in 1831, Mexicans urged the Apaches to live again more or less in the earlier fashion of the Colonial peace establishments - in 1842 to 1844, in the early 1850's, and in 1857, the year before the Janos Presidio was abandoned (Griffen 1988a:15).

The peace establishments drew Apaches into areas along the Rio Grande where they lived intermittently, drawing upon Spanish rations and leaving these rancherias when the ration supply was inadequate. There are frequent references to Apaches settled at the peace establishments as well as to Apaches traveling to El Paso in search of peace (Griffen 1988a, 1988b). None of these references to Apaches in this region indicate their having settlements in the region other than those associated with the peace establishments.

The Apache presence outside of their mountain settlements was heavily regulated and spelled out in peace agreements, first by the Spanish and later by the Mexican government. The Spanish, after recognizing that military force was not cost effective, instituted a policy of distributing rations to the Apaches who remained peaceful within the peace establishments (Griffen 1988b:10-12).

The Mexican policies of the 1830's and 40's spelled out the terms of agreement with and the treatment of Apaches. This is significant in terms of the safety zone that was available for Apaches held under restriction versus those who continued the pattern of raiding Spanish, Indian and Mexican rancherias. Excerpts of that policy reflect the terms of agreement:
Apaches would be tied to a geographical area...or to specific presidios as their peace establishments...Apaches were obligated to help the Mexicans against hostile Indians, other Apaches such as Mescaleros, members of their own tribe, or Comanches, assisting the Mexican troops as auxiliaries and scouts. In the 1842 period, they were to give Mexican authorities notice of all movements of hostiles they learned of, and some warriors were to remain at all times at their respective presidios to be ready to assist Mexican forces.

Apaches at peace would have to obtain prior permission from frontier military commanders for all travel, usually beyond a minimum of thirty miles (ten leagues), for visiting, hunting or changing residence.

formal peace legalized trade between Apaches and Mexicans. A series of towns - El Paso, San Elizario el Viejo, Vada de Piedra, El Norte, and Colonia de San Carlos - were open to Mimbrenos in 1838.

Apaches were obligated to turn all their livestock over to Mexican authorities for marking with the special government peace-establishment brand. The animals, including those recently acquired by raiding, would then be returned to the Apaches for them to sell or otherwise dispose of as they wished (Griffen 1988b: 192-193).

At an earlier time, the Mexican authorities were requiring that stolen livestock be returned, but by 1838, the Mexican policy offered in effect, to launder the livestock for Apaches so long as they would comply with other terms of the peace establishments.

The effect of the policy, then, was to make any rancheria outside of the peace settlements vulnerable to attack. In contrast, therefore, Apache mountain settlements in the Guadalupe Mountains and elsewhere had to remain far more defensible and more secure in an otherwise hostile environment.

There appeared to be a clear distinction at this time between Apache communities living at the peace establishments and those living in the “hinterland” or “backcountry”:
It appears that as long as some Apaches were at the peace reserves and receiving more or less regular allotments, others in the hinterlands remained relatively peaceful. It is not unlikely, given the Apache social organization of small, family-based rancherias, that members of the non-administered population in the backcountry received some of the rationed goods through the distribution network of kinship reciprocity (Griffen 1988b:11).

Exactly where in the hinterland or backcountry these rancherias were is not completely clear, although traditionally used areas were known to be in the mountains with especially heavy use of the Guadalupe Mountains in both Texas and New Mexico. Evidence of Apache settlements outside of mountainous habitats and outside of the peace settlements has not been documented.

Otherwise, the Apache presence in the area of west Texas during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries centered around raiding as the significant and widespread activity used by the Apaches for obtaining livestock and other resources through attacks on Mexican and other Indian communities. Spanish settlements along the Rio Grande at Ysleta, Socorro, and San Elizario were particularly subject to raids for livestock as grazing lands along the river were exploited.

Numerous references to Apaches throughout the area are non-specific in the sense that they only identify that Apaches or an Apache was in a particular place at a particular point in time. That documentation does not distinguish the purpose or reasons why individuals were present. A detailed examination of the compilations of Mescalero “locations” by Opler (1970) and Ray (1974) reveals a large number of references to Apaches throughout west Texas, but apart from those notations for mountain locales, the documentation does not distinguish the purpose or reasons why individuals were present. When the data are viewed within the context of historical events, it becomes apparent that the Apache presence in the region outside of mountainous areas, particularly the Guadalupes, should be related to their purpose at the time. Clearly, evidence for Apache settlements is well established for the Guadalupes, and the significance of Mescalero presence in these mountains would confirm their centrality in Mescalero tradition even if there were not additional evidence. Numerous reports from the El Paso region mention that Apache “raiders” came from or returned to the Guadalupe Mountains (Winfrey and Day 1966:IV:92-93). The Apache presence outside of the mountain ranges is
limited to communities known through the peace establishments first under the
countl of the Spanish, and later the Mexicans. Other Apache appearances in the
areas outside of the Guadalupe and other mountain ranges were for the purpose of
conducting livestock raids which, upon completion, were followed by a retreat-an
oft cited observation-into the mountain settlements. Beyond this level of certainty,
Mescalero Apache uses of the areas away from the mountains remain speculative.

E. Place Names, Sacred Locales, and Spiritual Activity Fields

The whole Guadalupe Range encompasses many specific locales where the Apaches
camped, engaged in subsistence pursuits, and practiced their religion. The
mountains are central to Apache culture and contained many sites considered sacred
to the Mescalero. Specific sites including mountain peaks, caves, and springs are
integral to the Mescalero creation story being considered places of great power.
Springs located near a cave opening seem to hold special significance (Carmichael
to Bodnar 1990). Caves and springs represent physical links to the
spiritual/metaphysical realm (Bodnar 1990); a kind of threshold to the other world.
Caves, therefore, were used by healers and those seeking shamanistic power from
the other side. According to one Mescalero interviewed by Bodnar (1990), chanting
and drumming could be heard inside caves by the Apache.

Basehart (1974) identifies areas in the Guadalupes that are “special” places to the
tribe including sacred sites, boundary markers, camp sites, and nuclear areas. The
Mescalero Apache Dictionary (1982) also provides some critical place name data.
Place names are important in identifying and assessing the significance and
parameters of areas integral to a group’s culture, a kind of “claiming by naming,”
and those Mescalero place names reported in the literature tend to aggregate around
the Guadalupe and Sacramento ranges. Referring to the “mountain homeland” of
the Mescalero, Basehart’s interviews with Mescalero elders revealed the existence
of several sacred peaks: “These holy mountains were pre-eminent sources of
supernatural power, and were approached with respect and prayer by all
Mescaleros” (Basehart 1974:61). Teshiti (“Rock Nose”) refers to Guadalupe
Peak, a pre-eminent sacred mountain to the Mescalero and nuclear center (Basehart
1974:69-70). One of Basehart’s informants noted:

...older people “think a lot of the mountain as being a holy
people go to the mountain and raise their hand up to the mountain and pray for all good things: that no sickness will come to them and that the good luck will be with them; with all their faith they put into praying while at the mountain seem so they get their wish” (Basehart 1974:70).

Basehart also reports that there is a special cave in the mountain where both men and women could secure supernatural power if they “demonstrated sufficient hardihood to withstand a series of ordeals” (Basehart 1974:70). The importance of the site is affirmed by the presence of some Mescalero at the mountain throughout the year. Bodnar (1990) learned from David Carmichael that a specific cave in the Guadalupes is a focus of regular pilgrimage by groups of Mescalero because it was there that the Mountain Spirits “miraculously revealed themselves to a group of Mescaleros who were left behind at a cave when they could no longer travel with the main group.” While this observation was collaborated by the ethnographer in conversation with Mark Rosacker of Living Desert State Park (Rosacker 1994), Ellen Bigrope of the Mescalero Cultural Center told Carlsbad Caverns National Park Curator Jeff Denny the same story, but noted its occurrence in a cave near Deming, New Mexico (Deckert 1995).

Opler (1941:269;271) had one of this informants recount a supernatural experience associated with Guadalupe Peak:

My father is a shaman. He got his ceremony when he was a young man. It was this way. You know that Guadalupe Mountain over there. It is a religious mountain, a holy mountain. My father say that this place is the home of the Mountain People. He says a spirit came to him and told him to go into that mountain. Someone talked to him, but he did not see anyone. It was outside the mountain that something, or someone, told him to enter. That was the first time anything had spoken to him: he was getting his first power.

My father called the mountain the “Holy Mountain.” He says that he gets messages from these people whenever he holds his ceremony. When he wants to know how to cure a man, they come and tell him.

A Mescalero medicine woman reported to Bodnar that El Capitan was a special
place and was visited annually by the Mescalero. She revealed a story about a group of Mescalero who came to visit the peak:

The people wanted to camp and build a fire below the mountain but were told by the ranger that they could not do this. She said that when night came the people looked up high on top of the mountain and there they saw a beautiful blazing bonfire. She said that this was an example of “special things” that happen to her people on their homeland and that events like these were like “blessings” (Bodnar 1990).

Basehart (1974:70) lists a number of other areas in the Guadalupes which were noted by his informants as special places. Tudogat?ine (“hidden water”) a spring located on the east side of the escarpment where it was reported that Mexican soldiers attacked a large Mescalero camp during a puberty ceremony. Two Mountain Spirit dancers were killed, including Jianatsa (Cadete) an important leader. West of this site, tunadil?kuse (“coughing springs”) was located, so named because of the noise it made as water percolated to the surface. Tsedelka?tundli (“on top of rock water flows”), iyanenailitsal?ye (“cattle water at a dripping spring”), and tsehajo?a (“he rolled a rock out of the ground”) were all sites found in the Guadalupe range noted as important by Basehart’s informants. At tsehajo?a, according to these informants, a bear digging for ants rolled a large rock from the ground which tipped over and crushed a bear. The Indians later found the skeleton under the rock. Tsedeskis (“mountain gap”) was located “somewhere in the Guadalupes.” Tc?agukijo (“forked cap”) presumably a well-known landmark whereby the peaks of the Guadalupe said to resemble a cap with two points, “like an army cap.” Tale?o?a (“a standing cedar”) a camp site in the western side of the Guadalupes where a spring exists next to a cedar tree. Nangodaszei (“pointed sidewise”) apparently referring to Capitan Peak as a sacred locale. While Basehart (1970:73) indicates there is “no evidence that Mescalero sought supernatural power there,” Bodnar’s consultant, noted above, indicates otherwise. Okadz?e?ka (“a stand of bamboo plants”) refers to the Guadalupe Salt Flats or Salinas. Gostahanagunt?i (“hidden gulch”) which Basehart refers to as Sitting Bull Falls, a site used as a short-term camping place with water. Reportedly, a Mescalero camp was attacked by a U.S. Army force there.

Maska?kanendla (“where two poles and hoop are leaning against a rock”) is a site on the south side of Guadalupe Peak. The term refers to the aboriginal gambling
game played with a hoop and poles. \textit{Se-hika} ("white sand") apparently generic term for many of the white gypsum sand dunes in the area including those on the western edge of the Guadalupe escarpment. \textit{Jadnst?udebiga} ("home of the bat") referring to the big cave at Carlsbad Caverns nearby which the Mescalero camped when hunting antelope. The Mescalero were very familiar with the natural entrance as noted by the place name: "bats 'come out of the cave so thick it looks like smoke coming out of a hole'" (Basehart 1974:74). Bodnar (1990) was told a story about an Apache who was hurt and lost in the mountains being rescued by "bat" who carried him off to safety on the Pecos River. Finding no other Apache there, the Bat took the man towards the Northwest to his group on the Rio Penansco.

F. Recent Mescalero Use of the Guadalupe Mountains

While the Mescalero were involuntarily removed from the region in the late 19th century, it should be noted that they never strictly "abandoned" the area. They continue to visit specific locales in both parks, and the special places of the Mescalero which are now under National Park Service jurisdiction are ever present in Apache narratives. Park resources and landscape may play central roles in traditional beliefs and practices. During an official meeting with a Mescalero Tribal official, it was forcefully stated that the Guadalupe Mountains continue to be very important to the Apache people: "There are many areas in those mountains we have always considered sacred."

A preliminary review of ranger reports reveals cases where there were sightings of Mescalero visitors often in small groups gathering agave and sotol in the Guadalupe Mountains. Others report visits to a remote pictograph site in Carlsbad Caverns National Park (Crisman 1993; Rosacker 1994). Reisch (1994) reported that in the early 1970's a medicine woman and others held ceremony at Pine Springs Campground which involved chanting to Guadalupe Peak. In the mid 1970's, a bus from Mescalero carrying about 20 people came to Guadalupe Mountains National Park to hold a ceremony at Guadalupe Springs and were granted permission to do so by the then current Park Superintendent. In 1988 a Mescalero woman
FIGURE 3: MESCALERO MESCUAL COLLECTING IN THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS
now living in California came into the Dog Canyon Ranger Station at the Park seeking directions. Apparently she was to meet with tribal members to be initiated into a clan (?) group on Guadalupe Ridge just outside of the park (Reisch 1994). Mark Rosacker of Living Desert reports that the Mescalero still collect water from Guadalupe Springs annually and some women visit it for several hours.

These modest reports are instructive in that they add additional testimony to a continuing interest of the Mescalero in the area. Some Mescalero have found a venue to continue their association with the area through the annual Mescal Roast held in May at Living Desert State Park in Carlsbad, New Mexico. The relationship between those Mescalero participating in the Roast and the staff at Living Desert apparently is very solid and sustained. Each year, traditional Apache counselors come to the park prior to the roast to supervise the harvest of the agave plants and lighting of the fire in the mescal pit. The Mescalero have blessed the grounds of the park and perform Mountain Spirit Dances during the event. The staff of Living Desert have made mescal collecting sites available to the Mescalero. These sites are primarily on Bureau of Land Management lands, as well as some private lands, near the Park.

The contractor had the opportunity to join one of these agave collecting sorties. While official contact with the tribal government had not been made at that time, the contractor was able to observe Mescalero counselors instructing several youths in the cultural practices associated with mescal collecting on-site in the Guadalupe Mountains. The importance of the Guadalupe Mountains as a locale for this and other Mescalero interests is apparent.
III. ETHNOGRAPHIC ASSESSMENT OF TIGUA ASSOCIATION WITH THE GUADALUPE MOUNTAINS

A. Introduction

The Tigua Tribe of Ysleta del Sur Pueblo have a traditional association with the Guadalupe Mountains based on two lines of inquiry. First, the Tigua Tribe as it is constituted today represents several cultural traditions including Manso, Suma (Jumano), Piro, and Tigua. As there is reason to believe that at least some of these diverse cultural roots particularly Manso and Suma (Jumano) were evidenced in the Guadalupe Mountains area, the Tigua connection is supported from both an archaeological and ethnohistorical standpoint. Secondly, the Tigua have been collecting salt from the Guadalupe Salt Basin for several hundred years. This is supported by archival documentation and oral tradition which reveal Tigua use of the red and white sand dunes located on the western slope of the Guadalupe Mountains, medicinal and ceremonial plant collecting in the mountains some of which occurred in Guadalupe Mountains and Carlsbad Caverns National Parks, reports of hunting sorties to the south and east of the Guadalupees, and the historic use of Tigua Indians as scouts for the Texas Rangers and U.S. Army in their actions against the Apache. The mountains partly encompassed by the Park are assuredly Mescalero homelands, but the Tigua do have a presence in the surrounding area and occasional use of mountain resources. While not as important to the Tigua cultural landscape as other areas such as the Hueco Mountains, these areas are part of the Tigua inventory of ethnographic resources.

Because of their relationship with Spanish, Mexican, and United States authorities through the years, Tigua identity as Indian outside of the pueblo and later outside of the barrio indio in El Paso was not readily apparent. The U.S. military did refer to them as “pueblo Indian scouts,” but yet for most others they were simply Mexicans. A Tigua elder, in recounting the story of the Tigua battle with the Kiowa Comanches (?) at Hueco Tanks, had this to say:

When our people came down here to hunt, the Kiowa Comanches thought they were Mexicans, because of the way we used to dress in cotton. And they started a battle with one another (Greenberg 1993).
In reference to the pictograph at Hueco Tanks depicting the Tigua in the battle, the elder indicates:

It looks like a man with a hat. Like I said earlier, the Kiowa Comanche thought we were Mexicans and that's how they would signify us because our people used to dress in cotton, cotton clothes. And they thought they were Mexicans (Greenberg 1993).

To most Anglos coming into contact with Tigua outside of Ysleta, they were Mexicans and were often referred to as such. Most certainly the references to the owners (salineros) of wagon trains from the El Paso area collecting salt at Guadalupe salt basin were of this nature. The Apaches, as mountain people having a refuge in the Guadalupes, however, were in conflict with the Spanish, Mexicans, and Americans: in essence being viewed as the quintessential hostiles. It is no accident therefore that there exists substantially more documentation for Apache activities and little, apart from an oral tradition, for the Tigua.

B. Tigua Adaptations: Culture History and Group Identity

The Tigua are descendants of the Tiwa of Isleta Pueblo, New Mexico, and pueblos of the Saline Province including the Tiwa pueblos of Quarai, Chilili, Tajique, and Tompiro-speaking pueblos of Abo, Las Humanas (Gran Quivera) and Tabira. Tigua oral tradition contains references to Quarai (Houser 1970) and Gran Quivera (Greenberg 1993) as a traditional homeland. Bandelier's ethnographic research in the 1880's reports a Tigua tradition of ancestry the same as that of the people of Senecu del Sur: "They claim to have come from the Manzano, that is, from that place and Cuarray, probably also from Chilili and Tajique" (Bandelier 1970:164). Schroeder (1964:249) has argued for a Piro and Tompiro content for the Saline pueblos. Hewett (1943:153) stated that "...when the people of Isleta del Sur, just below El Paso, are asked whence their forefathers came, many of them pointed to the north in reply saying 'from Quarai'."

Hodge (1907:625, 803) notes that Senecu del Sur contained settlers from Piro pueblos to the north and Tiguas from the pueblos south of Albuquerque, New
Mexico. In addition, Hodge notes patterns of intermarriage between the inhabitants of Ysleta del Sur (Tigua) and the Mansos of El Paso del Norte. According to McLaughlin (1962:6,13, 20, 21,25, 26,33,34) Piro from Senecu residing in the Manso mission of Nuestra Senora de Guadalupe and Indians from Abo are represented in pre-1680 church records. Hughes (1935:313,314,323) reports that pre-1680 church records of Nuestra Senora de Guadalupe indicate the baptisms of “eight hundred and thirty Mansos—if the Indians whose tribal affiliation was not given were Manso—sixty two Piros, seventeen Sumas, ten Tanos, five Apaches, and four Jumanos.” While Bandelier believed the Manso in El Paso del Norte had pueblo origins and that the Piro “make the same pottery as the Mansos” (Lange and Riley 1970:163), Houser has argued (1994:100) for Manso adoption of pueblo cultural traits through intermarriage and cohabitation with Piro, Tigua, and other Pueblo groups. No doubt the Manso were influenced by their new found neighbors, however, it should be noted that Beckett and Corbett (1992), arguing for an El Paso Phase of Jornada Mogollon ancestry for the Manso, believe the Manso had lived in permanent agriculturally-based adobe village sites and had shifted circa 1350-1450 A.D. to a more mobile rancheria settlement type based on hunting and gathering. This would suggest the retention of a few pueblo like traits from the past along with an infusion of additional elements from new occupants of El Paso del Norte.

Subsequent to the 1680 relocation to the El Paso area, the Tigua have intermarried with Piros (Socorro and Senecu del Sur) and with Manso and Suma Indians. Archaeological research and historical records indicate that the Manso were the original inhabitants of the El Paso area (and Las Cruces-Mesilla Valley area). The Suma hunted and gathered in the region south of El Paso del Norte. However, the lands which the Manso and Suma occupied and exploited were probably much greater in extent then has previously been argued. Moreover, arguments made some years ago by Forbes (1957, 1959, 1960) and Opler (1983a) that the Suma and Manso were true linguistic and cultural Athapaskans (Apachean) has been effectively refuted by Naylor (1981) and Beckett and Corbett (1992). It may be argued, as Hickerson (1994) has, that the Suma and Manso were part of the Jumano cultural designation, the latter being Tanoan-speaking with a long established range in the southern plains:

...the Jumanos spoke a Tanoan language were probably affiliated with the Tiwa subfamily. Manso and Suma are like Jumano, long extinct, and their languages are unrecorded; however, it now appears that they
were part of the same grouping. With these inclusions, the Tanoan bloc inhabited much of New Mexico, the valley of the Rio del Norte at least as far south as La Junta, and the deserts of northern Chihuahua as far west as Casas Grandes. In addition, the territories occupied by the Jumano bloc extended east of Rio del Norte and the Pecos to include the Llano Estacado and the upper valley of the Rio Colorado of Texas. Thus, the total area which can be ascribed to the late prehistoric, pre-Apachean Tanoans was far greater than the holdings of the remnant Tanoan groups of recent history (Hickerson 1994:221).

If Hickerson is correct, then the zone of exploitation of at least some of the antecedent groups comprising Tigua cultural tradition, was much greater than previously understood and places Tigua traditional activities in the Guadalupe Mountains area including those lands now under National Park Service administration at Carlsbad Caverns National Park. An archaeological site on private lands south of Guadalupe Mountains National Park identified to Katz and Katz (1974:28) as a prehistoric El Paso Phase of Jornado Mogollon site is interesting in this regard. Steely (1990:10) states: "It appears that these portions of the region were either utilized by groups that traded for pottery while continuing their hunting and gathering lifestyle, or that these areas were utilized intermittently by peoples that resided at the small villages that are present along the Middle Pecos, in the El Paso area, or other areas with evidence of sedentism."

The Tigua clearly amalgamated with Sumas, Mansos, and Piro after 1680. Prior to that time, the El Paso was a meeting point for several cultural groups. Hughes comment on the non-Manso Indians who joined the Guadalupe Mission community prior to 1680 is worth quoting here:

While the mission was primarily for the Mansos, the names of Sumas, Jumanos, Piros, Tanos, and Apaches appear in the records. The Sumas were close neighbors of the Mansos, and the wild Apache tribes infested the surrounding country. The Jumanos apparently dwelt farther away to the east; but according to a note in the records there were present in El Paso in 1670 many Indians from the Jumano pueblos. The Piros appear to have come chiefly from the pueblos of Senecu, although some were registered from the pueblo of Abo, from the pueblo of Galisteo, and from San Antonio de la Isleta. In 1678
and 1671 there were a number of Indians from Abo at El Paso. The original home of the Tanos is not indicated; doubtless, like the Piros, they came from the interior of New Mexico. The presence of this heterogeneous body of Indians at Guadalupe de Paso points to the importance of the place as a vantage ground for Spanish occupation, and helps to explain in part the difficulty in later years of holding the Indians under restraint (Hughes 1935:314).

Although we may never be able to disentangle this group identity problem, it would appear with a degree of certitude that Tiguas, Tompiro, and Piro Indians from the north had relocated to the Pass prior to 1680 and intermarried with already resident Manso and Suma peoples. Of these groups, the Tigua tribe survived and represents an amalgamation of several cultural threads. In addition, the Tigua look to the various pictographs and settlement sites in the mountains as physical evidence of their ancestral possession of these lands. This is not an unusual event because similar movements and amalgamations have been noted for other pueblos (see Eggan 1979; Sando 1992). Given this history, it is also not surprising that the Tigua have in their narratives indicated differing (although closely geographically spaced) origins points i.e., Quarai, Gran Quivera, and Isleta although the general area of origin, Saline Province, is the same. Nor is the story of emergence from a sipapu at Hueco Tanks contrary to this history. All the contemporary pueblos have such understandings, and it is logical to assume the same with those “abandoned” i.e., Piro, Tompiro, and Manso. This does not represent an erosion or deterioration of traditional belief, but reflect Tigua history. Of singular importance is that these diverse traditions, subsistence patterns, and knowledge of ecology have been woven into the fabric of Tigua culture. As such, the tribe is, in fact, the unofficial repositors of the traditions of several now extinct cultural groups. Therefore, those lands which were part of the immediate territory of the Suma (Jumano), Manso, and Piro groups including the riverine environment, neighboring sandhills, and mountain ranges including the Guadalupes are part of Tigua cultural tradition. Thus when the Tigua Tribe speaks of ancestral use they are speaking not only for the Tigua cultural component, but also for those traditions that became a part of Tigua Tribe over time.
FIGURE 4: YSLETA DEL SUR PUEBLO
C. Tigua Adaptations: Land Use and Resources

Tigua interest in and use of the lands outside their approximately 36 square mile Spanish land grant area reflect a substantial and tenaciously held oral tradition based on rights of ancestral possession, continuous, repetitive and patterned use, sacred, ceremonial locales, and legendary exploits of defense of their territory against outsiders. Tigua cognitive maps of these lands consist of the following areas: the grant lands, the Rio Grande River, the Hueco Mountains and Tanks; the Sandhills ranging from the Franklin Mountains to the Hueco Mountains and across the rimrock connecting the Huecos to the Finlay Mountains; the salt lakes and red and white sand dunes located on the western side of Guadalupe Peak; and a more generalized, wide-ranging area encompassing the Davis, Chisos, Quitman, Sierra Blanca, Sierra Viejo and Guadalupe ranges to the Pecos. A Tigua elder put it this way: “All these mountains and hills [sand] were Tigua. This was Tigua land and it was taken from us” (Greenberg 1993).

The pueblo Indians, who had been forced to relocate with the Spanish during the 1680 exodus from New Mexico, found themselves in an environment and climate which mirrored those in their homelands to the north. For the Tigua people, the greater El Paso region contained a riverine environment with a good fishery and abundant waterfowl, and plenty of rich alluvium soils in the Lower Valley floodplain. While this area has high agricultural potential, without irrigation, cyclical periodicities in the amount of water carried by the river affected fertility and productivity. Beyond, the valley floor, the Tigua and other relocated Indians found bosque or densely-thicketed areas along the river and desert grasslands and sandhills throughout the valley and beyond to the north, south and east. Mountains to the north and east also provided natural areas which recapitulated those in their New Mexican homelands.

Apart from the agricultural productivity of the flood plain, the Tularosa and Hueco Bolsons, situated east of El Paso, contained arid basins and salt deposits, important for native subsistence hunting, foraging, and some dry farming activities. In addition, there were limited salt deposits found in the playas of old river oxbows of the Lower Valley.

While they are able to conceptually distinguish the Ysleta Grant boundary from
FIGURE 5: ROCK FORMATION AT HUECO TANKS
other areas of importance to them, Tigua land use practices, including agricultural pursuits, animal husbandry, hunting, gathering and fishing, the collection of medicinal and utilitarian plants, and visits to sacred areas with associated ritual, did not recognize grant boundaries as limiting their movement. For example, during the Spanish period, public or external travel had to be approved by the local official. The right of external travel could have restricted important Tigua subsistence travel practices. Marc Simmons, historian of the Spanish Colonial era, made the following comment upon the travel restriction which, in practice, was often ignored by the Pueblo Indians:

It was also observed that Indians were forbidden to leave their villages without proper license from either the local justicia, or in his absence, the friar or parish priest. In spite of this, Indians commonly were forsaking their villages to wander afar (Simmons 1965:306).

In addition, Rick Hendricks referenced a successful complaint of the Ysleta Indians of November 1791 regarding a local priest's authority to prohibit their hunting trips:

On behalf of the Indians of Ysleta, (Antonio) Paez petitions for the removal of Father Duenas, who has prevented them from holding ceremonial dances and going hunting when they choose. They request that Father Bermejo, who ministered to them for a year, be named to replace Duenas. Duenas was subsequently ordered to return to the headquarters of the custody and deemed not fit to serve in Ysleta (Hendricks 1992:116).

A comment made to this researcher by a Tigua consultant during a trip to the Salt Lakes near the Guadalupe Mountains exemplifies the Pueblo position with regard to distances traveled for subsistence and religious purposes:

I don't know if you're aware that when the Native Americans need something special, we don't mind traveling the distance to get that part [plant] we need for our ceremony. [If] we have to go 300 miles, 400 miles to get the necessary stuff for our special ceremonies that we really need to do ourselves, to keep the
It is important to note here that while pueblo peoples are most noted for intensive agricultural practices, extensive use for food, medicines, and religious purposes of areas outside those farmed was neither opportunistic nor expedient, but rather an integral component of their cultures. The maintenance of a comprehensive ceremonial system and world view required this (see Eggan 1979:224-235 for discussion). Virtually every aspect of Tigua subsistence required mutual planning and cooperation under the umbrella of a traditional tribal organization built along kinship and religious lines. It is also of interest to point out that the Salinas pueblos of New Mexico, abandoned during historic times and from which the Tigua are descended, practiced dry farming in combination with hunting and gathering—a subsistence strategy at variance with other Rio Grande pueblos (see Schroeder 1979:236-254 for discussion). It is also evident that pueblo ecology cannot be conceived on the model of Spanish, Mexican, or American political-legal conceptions of community.

The sacredness of land to Pueblo Indians is amply documented in the ethnographic literature. For Native Americans, rivers, springs, mountains, and salt deposits possess special or sacred properties wherever they are found. Under these circumstances, the development of a special relationship to the land was not difficult for the refugee population. In addition, the great similarities existing between the El Paso area and the former homelands of the Tigua and Piro settler groups greatly facilitated their adaptation to the El Paso District. This bond to local features of the environment and whole biotic communities became firmly entrenched over the years with permanent and continued settlement. The rich tribal cultural traditions of the Tigua which include many references to regional sites and areas obviously did not develop overnight, but rather as the result of the consolidation of custom on site through enduring occupancy and economic activity. In this regard, intermarriage between Tigua and Piro settlers with Manso and Suma Indians, who already had developed ancient, sacred relationships with the region, provided an additional basis for Tigua affinity to the land.
D. Tigua Adaptations: Hunting and Gathering

Much of our understanding of Tigua hunting and gathering activity outside the grant area is based on an oral tradition which includes the sacred aspects of subsistence activity, and an intensive knowledge of biotic communities. There are some documents which report on Tigua hunting and gathering in the latter part of the 19th and early 20th centuries. Given what we know of New Mexico pueblosan subsistence activity outside of agriculture, the level of knowledge revealed in Tigua narratives is not surprising.

The primary hunting and gathering zone of the Tigua was over 200 miles long and extended from the Franklin Mountains on the west to the Hueco and Finlay Mountains on the east. It included the various sandhills mentioned by the Tigua. Areas east of the Rimrock Escarpment to the Diablo Plateau and south to Sierra Blanca, Sierra Vieja, and east to the Chisos Mountains were also noted in the narratives. As noted above, the Guadalupe Salt Basin and located immediately west of the Guadalupe Mountains is also an area well known to the Tigua (Greenberg 1993).

The sandhills ranging east of the Franklin Mountains, moving north of the pueblo (Palo Clavado and Loma de Tigua), and extending east and southeast of Ysleta over the rimrock escarpment and encompassing a large part of the Hueco Mountains into the Diablo Plateau represents another area considered sacred and oft-mentioned by the Tigua. In this context, the sandhills represented the location of the communal rabbit-hunt (Shiaito).

The Tigua either singly or in small groups hunted mule deer, whitetail deer, bear, pronghorn antelope, javelinas, mountain sheep, turkey, quail, duck, geese, jackrabbits, cottontail rabbits, and squirrels. Most hunting occurred in the winter, during slack time in agricultural activity and was carried out by individuals or in small groups who travelled to favored hunting sites. The remains of house (hunting camp) sites in the Huecos are mentioned in Tigua narratives (Greenberg 1993). Gerald (1970:59) described the area where the Tigua traditionally hunted for deer as being:

...found east and southeast of Ysleta ranging from Cerro Alto Mountain, which is located a mile or so to the northeast of
Hueco Tanks, to Small Station, on the Southern Pacific railroad immediately south of the Finley Mountains.

Gerald also mentioned several place names given him by the Tigua as camping and/or hunting sites (Gerald 1970:60/see Map 1 on page 37 for Tigua Place Names/a numerical key is located on page 38). Some buffalo hunting sorties involved long trips lasting up to three or four weeks, and extended to the Davis Range and into the Peco River Valley (Fewkes 1902:61). Based on our knowledge of plains-pueblo regional economic adaptations, it is likely that this was a seasonal activity (Levine 1991:157). It is possible that one of the antecedent cultures in the El Paso area—either Manso, Jumano (Suma), or Piro—could have provided the basis for this tradition (Hickerson 1994:XXVII; Wilcox 1991:154). Buffalo and antelope hunting expeditions to the eastern plains were a fairly common activity among puebloan communities as were elk and deer hunts following the harvesting season (Sando 1992:38). Regarding bison hunting, Joe Sando (1992:38) has this to say:

This fact causes some merriment among the elders, because the younger generation does not realize that their people knew the buffalo, hunted them, used them, and adopted the Buffalo Dance. Often they ask, "How did we get the buffalo?" Again and again the explanation is made that distances meant relatively little to a people whose neighbors and friends were hundreds of miles away, and that the chance for a buffalo hunt was a lure enough for anyone.

Fewkes' report of Tigua bison hunting is congruent with this tradition, especially when Tigua origins in pueblos adjacent to the eastern plains are considered. Antelope were hunted by groups on horseback while deer were hunted by individuals who went out in hunting parties which often stayed out for several days (Gerald 1970:59). Miller and O'Leary (1992) report the presence of antelope remains in an 18th century Jacal excavated in 1992. Natividad Carmago noted that there were "lots of deer at Cierro Hueco and at Pecos" (Houser 1966). Between Sierra Blanca and Van Horn, where the Tigua engagement with the Apache occurred, sites known as La Limpias and La Abuja were mentioned as old hunting camps (Houser 1966; Greenberg 1993). This familiarity with the area perhaps accounts for the aforementioned use of Tigua as military scouts in the campaigns against the Apache. This area is still frequented today by the Tigua on deer hunting.
LIST 1: TIGUA PLACE NAMES

TIGUA
Within Grant Area
1 Acequia Abones
2 Acequia de La Dura
3 Acequia de La Vieja de Ysleta
4 Acequia de Los Indios
5 Acequia de Los Padillas
6 Acequia de Los Piros (later Socorro de Acequia)
7 Acequia de Ragadillo
8 Acequia del Bosque
9 Acequia Madre de Ysleta
10 Arroyo Veronica
11 Loma de Tigua
12 Palo Clavado
13 Sierra Palona

Outside Grant Area

Hueco Mountains
14 Agua de Tortula
15 Agua del Gato
16 Agua La Concha
17 Canyon Ancho
18 Cerra de Los Padres
19 Comanche Cave
20 Cuchillo de Mabuelo
21 El Cuchillo de Favian Granillo
22 Hueco Tanks
23 Hunting shelter camp on east side of Hueco Tanks (location of names of Tigua Indians)
24 La Cueva de Beatriz Guerra
25 La Destendida
26 La Mina de Los Padres
27 La Zapateria de Jose Tolino
28 Los Cosedores
29 Pow Wow Canyon
30 Rock shelter on east entrance of Hueco Tanks basin (two names of Tigua Indians)
31 Shipapu Cave
32 Sierra Alto or Sero Colorado
33 Sierra de los Padres
34 Sun House
35 Tres Ojos
36 Tres Tinajas
37 Unnamed camp (old Davis Ranch house)

The Rimrock
38 Tapo de Borrego

Sierra Blanca area
39 Sierra Blanca
40 Small Station camp

Sandhills
41 La Casa de Piedra
42 La Loma de Barro
43 La Loma Virgin
44 Sabinas Site
45 Sierra de La Flohua

Rio Grande
46 Ojo Caliente

Sierra Vieja
47 La Abuja
48 La Limpias
49 Sierra Vieja

Guadalupe Mountains
50 Salinas de Guadalupe
51 Arena Blanca

Sierra Diablo Mountains
52 Sierra Diablo

Van Horn Mountains
53 Van Horn
Great herds of antelope then roved over those plains, and we hunted them every year as soon as the cold season began; they, and the deer that were plentiful in the foothills, furnished us with meat through winter, and plenty of buckskin. But now, all that is gone; and when the hunting season comes around, all we can do is to sigh and seek consolation in our memories (Phillips 1931:8).

A letter from Henry L. Dexter, dated June 5, 1858, Ysleta, describes the game in the area as follows:

My family has increased by two antelopes. At this time of year we have hundreds of them in every little hamlet, tamed. And next month we will have plenty of the white deer. How gentle they become (Dexter 1858).

Women often accompanied the men on these hunting trips to maintain the camps, dress out the kills, and jerk the meat. A Tigua elder related the following family hunting and gathering trip by wagon to the east of Ysleta circa 1900:

We went to the mountain in the summer. We went in wagons with four horses. It was very heavy [the wagon] and once could get stuck. The Tiguas that went were Fernando Colmenero and my uncle, Mariano, and three girls. Only one family went. Others didn't go because it was far and the roads were made of dirt. We went in April. We came back three weeks later. We came [back] for the fiestas. It took four days and we rested and ate when the horses got tired. On the way back we brought back plants. The men hunted deer, squirrels or rabbits. May was the last time we went, a long time ago, about twenty years ago when the chief, Mariano Colmenero, died. We had a small place near the edge of the mountain. My uncle Mariano made the place. We passed through Hueco Tanks. The ranchers never told us not to enter their land. We dried the meat. Tasejo means dried meat. La Sierra de la Flohua [sandhill site near
Hueco Tanks] made noises. The Indians [probably abuelo] made noises as if they were hammering. Mariano said this. We got our water from the Herman's ranch (Houser 1966).

In the sandhills east of the pueblo (grant and external to grant lands), rabbit hunts were held and well documented in Tigua narratives. These were communal in nature:

For the communal hunt, it was customary for a number of men to erect a wire net fence and then to drive the rabbits into the enclosure and kill them with wooden clubs called koas, or other weapons. The women, upon seeing a man with a rabbit, ran to him with a deep-fried bread called sopapilla or with fritters or tortillas to exchange for the rabbit, at which time they sang out "howii" (Gerald 1970:59).

Fewkes (1902:61) provided the first ethnographic description of the Tigua communal rabbit hunt. Joe Sando (1992:38), the noted historian from Jemez pueblo, reports that: “Pueblo communities held rabbit hunts sponsored by the war captains, and these often occurred before a feast day, after European contact.” Beckett and Corbett (1992) provide a detailed description of the Tigua rabbit hunt in their monograph on the Tortuga community. Faunal species exploited by the Tigua number 21.

Hunting was never the sole reason for trips as gathering of plants for subsistence, medicinal, ceremonial, and utilitarian purposes was done extensively. It should be noted here that the Tigua use over 80 different plants with 33 different plant families represented (Gray 1995:62; see Appendix B for complete annotated listing).

E. Tigua Adaptations: Sacred Lands and Sacred Practices

To the Tigua, the sacredness of the lands they utilized for their livelihood is revealed in part by the abuelo or Grandfather entity (or more properly complex, since it involves abuelito, San Antonio and Gran Espiritu) which refers to a
paternalistic protector of life. The Katchina-like mask pictographs found most notably in the Hueco Mountains are considered representations of the *abuelo* as a living supernatural figure. A Tigua consultant states:

Most of us we....the traditional people that are here, we always think about the grandfathers [abuelo] because the grandfathers, the elders are the ones that taught us everything we know. They are the ones that are going to be waiting for us when we go to the great beyond, showing us already the way to get there because they are there already. So we always pray to the grandfathers. When I open up a prayer, I always pray to the grandfathers...when one dies we always go towards the sun, and that's where all the grandfathers are at. And they'll be waiting for us to show us the way (Greenberg 1993).

The *abuelos* are considered living entities residing in the mountains (*el awelo de la sierra*; Houser 1966) and who reveal themselves to the Tigua during times of duress. An elderly woman described the *abuelo* this way:

He is the father of all good Indians. He comes when the Indians do not behave and live according to the rules they used to have like St. Anthony's Day. Also if they don't obey the cacique. Then the *abuelo* gets mad. I heard him once when I was ten years old...it was during a fiesta on December 24th. He just goes here and there peeking about. No one sees him but you can hear him cry out and yell, but he never comes near. He does not let himself be seen. He yells on purpose so that the people will hear him. My father used to tell me that a cacique who didn't follow the rules went hunting one day in the sandhills and the *abuelo* got him out there and he appeared to him as a whirlwind and the whirlwind got him and wanted to take him to the mountain where he lived. That was because he didn't follow the rules, my father said (Houser 1966).

Most contacts with *abuelos*, however, take place in the mountains (Greenberg 1993). According to anthropologist Thomas Green (1974:144-45), the *abuelo* is interchangeable with the Great Spirit, regarded in the abstract as an entity who
maintains cosmic order and also as an entity who acts on the everyday world of the living, a kind of "unmoved mover." The centrality of the abuelo to pueblo belief and cosmovision is another component the Tigua view that the Hueco Mountains in particular and all mountains in general are sacred. They are places of power, prayer, and offering. Every visit to specific sites in the mountains is accompanied by prayer and offerings left on site, usually consisting of sabinas (cedar) incense, corn husk cigarettes, and corn meal (Greenberg 1993). Naming ceremonies are held there as well and illustrated by one elder's experience:

In 1991 my grandchild came from Sacramento and that's where, I went up there [Hueco Mountains] and we spent the night up there and I gave him his name up there. It's like, you're given an Indian name. That's the way you do it. You go up there and wait for dawn, and when the first sunlight comes up, the first thing you see or you imagine at that time, that's the name that's given to whoever you're going to give a name to (Greenberg 1993).

Although the Tigua no longer control these areas (Map 2), they retain a deep-seated interest in mountain ranges, particularly, the Huecos as a cornerstone of their religion. While the Abuelo Dance is no longer performed, discontinuance of performance does not necessarily mean a cessation of belief as the abuelos and their abode in the mountains are integral parts of the Tigua mythic present.

Puebloan beliefs acknowledge a spiritual life which is part of a person's ongoing life cycle. The tradition of religious belief determines a person's relation with the natural world and other humans. Continuity in a harmonious relationship with the world is the cornerstone of a culture which has no word that translates as religion. Pablo Silvas in an interview with Thomas Green reveals a body of religious beliefs:

We don't believe too much on the padres. We believe on God and our Gran Spirit and things like that, but we don't believe on the padres. Because the padres or whatever they was on that time, you know, they kill a lot of our people when they came through to stole our gold, or whatever we got. That's what they came here for, you see, because we got to believe in something,
Map 2: Estimated Extent of Tigua Territory
based on ancestral possession, defense, and use
but these padres that's why they, uh, nobody believes too much on them. Well, lot of people believe too much on the padres, but I believe alright, whenever, what they say, because they talk pretty good, but no, some things is not true, you see.

Gran Espiritu. Yeah, that's what we believe you see. We believe on, uh, on the moon, on the sun, on the land, on the water, on all those, you see, because the sun they give us light to walk on the daytime, to work, to make our living, to plant, and the water give us the life because we can drink it, we can cook, we can do everything with it, and we believe on that, you see, and, uh, we believe on God alright, because we know that we got a God, one God that help us. We got our Santos, you see, like we got 'em on the church. Okay, we believe on San Antonio, you see. He is our, he's our Santito that we believe a lot on. We ask him something and pray for him and he do it, when we, uh, ask for something, you see, he do it pretty good. We know, because, well, I think it because we believe. That's why, that's why we make promise to him, you see, and we'll do it, we'll do our promise when we made a promise to San Antonio. That'll [he will] help us a lot. And, uh, that's what we believe on.

But Espiritu Grande is our god we got, you see. We got another god, the Indian's God. We got a god we believe on him and he is alive. And, uh, we used to see him and he is alive. And, uh, we do something right on our tribe, they have [he has] come, he came many, many years ago, you see. They came through here, you see, when they make things they ain't supposed to do, and maybe the way we go here with these people that they are jealous and things like that, maybe someday he come and put us straight like the way we got to be. You know, maybe, someday he will be here with us, because he is alive. They [he?] never die.

When I was working on Hueco, we'll, we'll see some things like that, We believe, and I believe. I believe and nobody gonna make me, because I believe on him, and my family believe on him, and my family believe, because I'll tell him [them] the way they are, you see, and they got to believe. Don't care they are Catholics, or whatever religion we are, we got to believe on our things we got. And the way I believe too, you see, because we are Indians, and we are born Indians, and we gonna die
Indians and we gonna buried over there and we gonna be Indians (Green 1974:139-40; emphasis Green).

The importance of the natural order, the guardianship of the Great Spirit, and reverence for life is the foundation of much of Tigua beliefs. The ways of humans are integrated into the ways of nature. This is a belief system in which the relationship to non-humans aspects of the environment is of a socioethical sort. The spirit world includes all Tigua, living and dead, plus non-human "persons" including plants and animals and inanimate forces. These non-human persons live in societies like humans and hence the Tigua world consists of congeries of societies; each non-human society living in the world on an equal footing with the Tigua. Hence, relations between the Tigua and these other societies is not one of domination or control, but rather are exemplified by constraint, respect, courteousness, and diplomacy. It is no accident, therefore, that the Tigua have a respect for the natural world that involves a kind of reciprocity, taboos with regard to hunting and gathering, and make offerings to the spirits of those species hunted or collected. Clearly, the presence of the sacred locations mentioned elsewhere in this report are explained by this belief system. Areas where hunting and gathering has occurred—included here is knowledge of the presence of past activity by past Indians, the spirits of those Indians, and the spirits of those non-human persons hunted or gathered by the Tigua—tend to be sacred locations.

The Tigua belief in the sacredness of life is revealed in the following comment by an unidentified informant to Green (1974:141):

Just like the Chief, he don't believe on killing or, not even a fly. If you go to his house and try, you know he's got a lotta cockroaches, try to kill the cockroaches, you better not do it. Like he said, "It's a human," I mean "they're little animals, they got a right to live on this world."

Green (1974:141) relates the following story involving a Tigua elder.:

One day a few of the young Tigua saw a large spider which had built its web under one of the rough wooden benches that line the courtyard of the Tigua museum. Miguel Pedraza watched their efforts to drive it out and kill it. He told me, "I don't like to see them do that. I don't like to see killing. Even a spider like that has got a right to live. He's put here for
some reason.” He, unlike many of his people, doesn't hunt, but even those who do regard such needless killing, even of vermin, as a violation of Tigua beliefs.

A Tigua consultant made the following observation regarding Tigua reverence for life and reciprocity to this researcher:

...the Indian religion and the legends I mean goes many, many, many years back, you know. In going back to some of those caves, some of those drawings you know, symbolic that they went there to be in touch, not by their self but to mother nature. And you know mother nature provides lot of energy for the Indian people. I mean you know we pick plants from the area but we also turn them back [give back something]. I mean we don't take uh, just because we take a stake or whatever just to make something but it means to us a way of praying and the ways of doing things. It's not just that we want a stick to make a cane or whatever but it's, to us it's important. Every little plant on the area or rock, we use it for a purpose. We use, like some of the pictographs are drawn with the amalgre. The amalgre means like very strong religion, it goes way back, very special (Greenberg 1993).

Many of the rituals associated with hunting and gathering were individualized:

We have to bless it in a way because we're taking something from mother earth and we've got to leave something for them. You know we don't just take it and say, “This is mine now.” We do our thing, we return something for them, in exchange you know for [what] we taken. It's the same way when we go deer hunting, we take ourselves something to leave there for our grandfather [abuelo] that lives on the mountains. We got a saying that the grandfather lives on the mountains. Not just particular [to] that area, but He's all over. He can become anything. That's why our respect is for any kind of animal. I mean, might be a bird that's around you that we know who it is. We look at him and he's, you know, he's let us know that he's around. If we do something that we shouldn't be doing, he'll punish us one way or another (Greenberg 1993).

Usually, offerings are left at the location of subsistence activity or at sacred sites:
...we always carry our pouch, you know. We [give to] our grandfather, you know. We bless them with what we got. The corn. It could be corn or mesquite flour or other items he likes. You know, it's not just...we do it on a term that we do that...they [other people] don't know that we left something there...I don't think they understand that we take a piece of earth, we leave something. You know, it could...it's proof of things that we live, you know, we take something for the purpose of our lives, everyday lives (Tigua consultant to Greenberg 1993).

Cornmeal was tossed in the four cardinal directions to bring good luck or rain, and crystals, made of “red and green” rocks, were also worn for luck (Houser 1966). Another ritual was stuffing a deer's mouth with cornmeal as an offering (Houser 1966). One woman said that it “was a rule to put cornmeal in the mouths of the dead rabbits and deer” (Houser 1966). Corn meal, perhaps wild variety, was tossed in the four cardinal directions to bring good luck to hunters or for rain (Houser 1966). Fewkes (1902) reported that rabbits were sprinkled with a sacred corn meal (tluka). Deer blood was drunk to make one strong: “blood of the deer is good for the heart. You put it in the glass of water and before breakfast you drink it” (Houser 1966).

The smoking of a corn husk cigarette (Macuchi) brought luck to a hunter: “my father used to take cigarettes and puff smoke to the four directions” (Houser 1966). Cigarettes were carried in the form of a cross as a protection against witches (Houser 1966).

The mountain lion is associated with the cardinal direction of north. This is a belief carried over from Isleta del Norte and is found in other pueblos (Dozier 1970:206). Moreover, the mountain lion is viewed as a guardian or protector, particularly with respect to the hunt (Parsons 1939:188). Hence, an elderly Tigua woman reported that her uncle Mariano said “it was bad luck to kill the mountain lion” (Houser 1966). Another Tigua reported to Houser that “The lion is the friend of the Indian. The lion kills only if it is provoked or is hungry. Once there was a lion trapped that couldn't get up and my grandfather took out the thorn and the lion licked his hand” (Houser 1966). Green (1974:138-39) heard this story from a Tigua two decades ago:

...one day his son, Ray, was leaving the house with his rifle. He asked,
“Where are you going?” Ray answered, “I'm going lion hunting.” At this time Pablo said, “No, you're no. You're not going to kill no lion. Go and put that rifle up.” Pablo stated that no real Indian will kill a lion. When questioned on this point he stated that this was because a lion will not harm a human being, however, other animals that are harmless to man are hunted by the Tigua. When this was pointed out, he countered that the tradition of not killing lions was a superstition (belief would be equivalent, since “superstition” was used without negative connotation) common to the Pueblo Indians.

While Green does not connect this belief to any cosmology, it is consistent with White's (1942:283) description of the rich mythology associated with pueblo hunting:

Certain animals are designed to be used by man; these are the game animals. Other animals live by “killing their food” [the predators]; they are the ones who “have the power” to kill the game animals. If human beings wish to be successful hunters, they must secure power from the beasts of prey.

One consultant suggested that bears were in a special category, but could not offer any explanation (Greenberg 1993). Finally, the “paisano” or road-runner was considered special to the Tigua because, “it kills snakes” (Houser 1966). There are probably other animal associations held by the Tigua, but these have not been revealed by the extant research.

There was much ritual associated with the communal rabbit hunts in the sandhills. Pablo Silvas reported that there were chants or song sung before a hunt (Houser 1966). Jose Trinidad Granillo said that the war captain used to make a fire to gather the people to hunt rabbits (Houser 1966). According to one elder, the rabbit hunts were usually undertaken in late fall (perhaps to track the rabbits easier), and because “it was easier to store the rabbits” during the winter months (Greenberg 1994). Rabbits were dressed, a piece of greasewood (a preservative and tenderizer noted elsewhere in this report) inserted in the chest cavity, and the rabbits were hung outside. In addition, it was taboo to hunt rabbits in the spring because “they were pregnant” and had “worms” and to hunt them at that time would show disrespect for the animal's spirit (Greenberg 1994). A Tigua hunter describes the hunt thusly:
The war captain and the cacique would get together and go out to Loma Paloma [in the grant area] build the fire. The men would then go with women following. Then the men would get mesquite or tornillo sticks, like a boomerang and formed a cerco or fence near Arroyo de la Veronica [or any other sandhill] and went up there. The cacique would bless the sticks and the men for a good hunt. They would smoke a cigarette [Macuchi] in common for good luck, to clean themselves, and make harmony not jealousy. Then, they would make crazy noises to scare the rabbits. Who ever gets it [rabbit] holds it up and shout something like “Chilihee”, “a rabbit for the chili.” The women would shout “it's mine, its mine” and give a turnover or sopapilla to the hunter. On return they would do a dance called “Baile de la Olla” promoting harmony (Greenberg 1994; emphasis Greenberg).

Isidoro Ortega said that “some went on horseback” and when “smoke appeared the people knew there was going to be a rabbit hunt” (Houser 1966). Corn meal was fed to rabbits as an offering to appease the spirit of the animal (Houser 1966). Prayer sticks made out of corncobs sharpened on one end and adorned with feathers (eagle, hawk, turkey, or parrot [from Mexico]) were commonly left after any hunting activity (Houser 1966). It is clear that the Tigua belief system and associated behavior reflected a well defined view of animals as vital aspects of the natural environment and as integral spirits in Tigua life. Consequently, the fact that ritual to appease animal's spirit and maintain harmony was an essential part of Tigua dealings with their environment is not surprising.

F. Tigua Adaptations: The Guadalupe Mountains

Oral tradition reveals the Guadalupe Mountains area as a component of Tigua cultural practices for several hundred years. While the Guadalupes were never viewed in the same special way the Hueco Mountains were, they nevertheless were pegged by consultants as one area which contains culturally-defined resources of some importance to the Tigua. One consultant indicated that “Hueco Tanks is most important to us, but many of the plants we need for ceremonies come from the Guadalupes” (Greenberg 1993). This was obviously a sensitive area as the consultant would not expand on his comment. There appears to be a clear distinction between Tigua territory (an area which the Tigua claim they possessed
ancestrally, used for subsistence purposes, and defended) and a broader area which was used by the Tigua and other tribes (see Map 2 on page 43). The Guadalupe Mountains including the Carlsbad Caverns area and the Big Bend region would fit into the latter category.

Buffalo hunts to the Pecos River often took the Tigua past the Guadalupes and likely afforded an opportunity to gather food and medicinal plants. Pinon nuts were collected in the mountains, along with sotol and mescal hearts (Greenberg 1993; Lone Star 1883). Pine nuts were consumed locally and also sold commercially. Sotol and mescal hearts were roasted as a food. Consultants report that mesquite beans (Prosopis sp.), the prickly pear cactus fruit and tunas (Opuntia sp.), cholla cactus (Opuntia imbrieata), and walnuts (Juglans sp.) (Greenberg 1993; Gray 1995).

The Guadalupes are known by the Tigua to contain plants used for medicinal purposes as well. This is an important point because the Tigua “doctored” themselves and as such relied on their environment for medicines. Chamizo (Atriplex canescens), or four-wing saltbush, was found in the mountains and used as a treatment for bad colds (22-C Deposition: 1970), or burned and put on cuts to heal without scars (Gray 1995; Greenberg 1993). Estafiate (Artemisia ludoviciana), a type of sage, was noted by one consultant as being found in the Guadalupes (although more often collected in Hueco Tanks) and used for unspecified medicinal purposes (Greenberg 1993; Truhill 1992; Gray 1995). One Tigua says it “smells like shit.” Manzanilla was collected from the mountains to be used for stomach troubles (22-C Deposition: 1970) and for cramps (Gray 1994).

Sangre de Cristo (Jatropha dioica) gathered in the Guadalupe Mountains was brewed as a tea for the treatment of cancer and heart problems (Greenberg 1993). Sabinas, or common cedar (Juniperus sp.), was collected at Hueco Tanks or at the Sabinas Site (north end of sandhills) and was used in many ceremoniial activities as an incense offering (Gray 1995; Greenberg 1993; Truhill 1992). A Tigua consultant noted the presence of sabinas at Guadalupes, but made no statement as to whether it was collected. Sage noted above as a medicinal was also used as an offering (Gray 1995; Greenberg 1993; Truhill 1992). Wild tobacco (Nicotiana sp.) has been collected in the Guadalupe Mountains with the Rattlesnake Springs area of Carlsbad Caverns National Park mentioned by consultants. Longstreet's journal of reconnaissance in the Guadalupe Mountains reports the existence of small salt lake
near the springs. Incidentally, the Big Bend area was another tobacco collecting site mentioned by the Tigua. Tobacco was essential for making the corn husk cigarettes (macuchi) used to smoke the Tombe, for good luck, as offering, and to "make meetings official" (Houser 1966; Gray 1995; Greenberg 1993). Gerald (1970:8) noted:

"Other raw materials collected from areas far removed from Ysleta included almagre, the red ocher face paint, that is collected in the Hueco Mountains and at Los Cozedores, salt, formerly collected from the Salt Flats south of the Guadalupe Mountains, and gypsum sand which is still collected in the White Sands area and burned for use as plaster--some modern houses in Ysleta have been plastered with material from this source."

While salt collecting is treated under a separate heading in this report, it should be noted here that the Tigua indicate an excellent source for gypsum was found in the area on the western escarpment of the Guadalupe Mountains (Greenberg 1993). It may be that the white sands area noted by Gerald above may in fact be the deposits at Guadalupe Mountains. This is the Tigua view with one consultant noting that the Guadalupe dunes were more desirable given their close location to mountains and the salt flats.

The mineral used in the making of red face paint (almagre or magria) was probably collected at sites in the foothills of the Hueco Mountains and near other mountain ranges including the Guadalupe. It should be noted here that a piece of worked almagre found on the west slope of the Guadalupe Mountains near the gypsum sand dunes and part of the museum collection at Guadalupe Mountains National Park was identified by the Tigua and is subject to repatriation under The Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act of 1990.

Wood (lena) was cut, hauled, and used for cooking and building. Fray Rafael Benavides reported in 1801: "The timber is cottonwood, and no other is used for the handicrafts unless they got pine or excellent cedar very far from here in the mountains which they call Sacramento, 70 leagues more or less to the north" (Jenkins 1989:57). There are no precise locations given by Benavides and Tigua consultants could not provide additional comment.
G. Tigua Adaptations: The Guadalupe Salt Basin

The Tigua have a tradition of collecting salt from several major salt deposits in the area. Salt has been used by pueblo Indians for food preservation, use for seasoning and as a trade item. There is archaeological evidence to suggest salt collecting from the Saline Province in the Estancia Valley of New Mexico; the San Andres Salinas in southern New Mexico; and possibly the Guadalupe Salt Lakes (Gerald 1970:62 see quote above)

Several elders remember collecting salt from the Guadalupe Salt Basin. According to one man.: “Back then [it] was very important for our people to have a place where they can gather salt, medicinal plants” (Greenberg 1994). Another remembers going there when there was a full moon so as not to get caught by ranchers or farmers: “We used to be careful when to go and you know, uh, hide away from farmers or ranchers that owned the area” (Greenberg 1994). He noted that the Tigua always performed “ceremonies” after they were finish collecting the salt to appease or give thanks to the abuelo, but often could not do so because they had to leave quickly (Greenberg 1994). Yet another Tigua said that: “I remember my grandpa went and I used to go with him. That was sometime in the eighties up to eighty-four” (Wright 1993:143). One elder had this to say:

My dad and I took several trips when I was young and when I became an adult over to the salt flats [Guadalupe]. He used to tell me stories of when he was younger, before I was born, that they used to go out there and gather salt for their own use. They used salt for consumption and for tanning. There were different....I can't remember, but there was different things that they used to gather salt for. They used to bring blocks of salt from up there.

We used to walk along the flats there and talk quite a bit and squat down and taste it. It was just something, I never took part in it. I used to go up there but I never did fetching any of the salt like myself. But he did and so did my grandfathers.

...they could only go twice a year. It used to take 'em maybe a week or so to get up there. It used to be a venture going up there. Two, three days going up there. Three, four days coming back. It might have to be [when
they went] during the autumn or spring because of the heat and extreme cold. It used to be very cold back then, I guess, colder than now. And they didn't have the protection that people can get now.

My father did, how would you say, very exclusive [prayers] because I was very young, and he did used to so some praying [at the salt flats].

...it had to be something sacred because he never brought me to it. He used to do it [pray] all by himself.

...he'd say, “Wait for me right here, I'll be right back.” Of course I'd be out there picking on the salt, running around and back and mostly hunting for lizards with a sling shot. I was very young at the time. I remember Pablo, Pablo Silvas used to go over there. I don't know [what others] used to go over there. Cause they used to go with my dad. My dad used to have an old Model A or T (Greenberg 1993).

He also remembers taking others to the salt flats (Greenberg 1993). He says that while the Tigua use to sell some of the salt, most of it was distributed to the community. Most informants indicate that it was used as a preservative and in white wash. One consultant indicated that the Tigua were aware of the white gypsum dunes adjacent to the salt flats and collected gypsum sand to eventually mix with clay to produce white pottery (Greenberg 1993). As noted in another section of this report, medicinal plants were also collected during these trips to the Guadalupe Mountains area. An elder described it this way:

They always gathered. I even go up there now and get some of those medicinal plants. We have a plant called Ohaseh [unidentified]. It's like a tea, little leaves, and you brew it. It tastes uh...a little hot like it's got chili in it. But it's very soothing for your stomach. And I always have a jar full of it at home, and I'm kind'a running low on it so I'm gonna have to.... The last time I was at Hueco Tanks I looked for some and couldn't find any (Greenberg 1994).

Another man said that “...all those herbs that are found over at the Guadalupes are real medicine, real strong...the wood there in the Guadalupes is really good for medicine. The mesquite that grows around the Guadalupes is real medicine. It is a
good cure for cancer” (Greenberg 1994).

In an interview of June 17, 1966, with Nicholas Houser, Pablo Silvas said “The salt was ours” (Houser 1966). He also indicated that the Mexicans and Tiguas fought for it, but the Anglos took it. Silvas stated that the Tigua gave salt to poor families and that what was left was sold (Houser 1966). He further stated that plenty of salt was necessary for the tanning process, and it was also used in the making of drums (Houser 1966).

There is another dimension to Tigua narratives regarding salt usage and access to the Guadalupe salt flats. In 1931, J. N. Phillips, a Tigua descendant, recorded an account given him by Manuel Ortega (then 100 years old) in which the Tigua received a further grant of land (in addition to the Ysleta Grant) from the Spanish Crown as an award for the capture of a raiding party of Comanches. This grant extended from the Ysleta Grant to the Hueco Mountains and included the Guadalupe salt flats (Phillips 1931). Apparently, the pueblo Indians had returned from a pottery trading trip to Carrizal when they encountered a group of presidial soldiers who had deserted from fear of loss of some Comanche captives. The Tiguas persuaded the soldiers to return to the presidio on the condition that the Tiguas would capture at least an equal number of hostile Comanches to make up for the loss. Subsequently, the Tigua succeeded in recapturing more than double the number of Comanches that had escape their captives. According to Manuel Ortega:

Shortly afterwards, in recognition of this singular service, the government granted the Ysleta Indians for their own use and enjoyment all these plains that lie north of the valley, including everything from the edge of the mesa to beyond Cerro Alto. We enjoyed the ownership of those plains and mountains for many years; we lost them, however, when I was yet a young man. The title papers had passed successively from one chief to another, until “El Chapo” Alvino Marquez succeeded to the chiefship; he received the papers from his predecessor, but, upon his death the papers could not be found. Our neighbors soon learned of the loss, and, denying our ownership, gradually usurped our right. We protested for a long time, but finally becoming convinced that the government record had also disappeared, we ceased our claim and resigned ourselves to the loss (Phillips 1931:7-8).
FIGURE 6: GUADALUPE SALT BASIN
Nicholas Houser, who has researched this topic intensively, believes that this grant was either an additional grant or a special license for land northeast of Ysleta (Houser 1994). To Houser, it was made sometime after the relocation of San Elizario Presidio near Tiburcios in 1780, and before the termination of Spanish rule in 1821. Alvino Marquez was listed as cacique in 1841 having likely succeeded Juan Ascencio Marquez as chief (Houser 1994). Houser further argues that this claim may have been asserted by Louis Cardis, a Texas State Representative, who in 1876 or 1877, desired to invoke the Tigua claim to the Guadalupe Salt Basin. In addition, the alleged grant may have been the basis for the La Prieta Grant pursued by attorney John P. Randolph in 1892 (Houser 1994). Other than the Phillips document, there is not, at this time, any additional verification of this grant.

It is clear that the Tigua have used and have had an interest in the Guadalupe salt flats at least since the latter part of the 17th century. The Tigua were adversely affected by the 1877 Salt War, and did indeed protest attempts to privatize the salt flats. Sonnichsen's informants identified three to four Tigua Indians who traveled to Austin or Washington D.C. (location uncertain) to claim the Guadalupe salt lakes. This occurred either before (1876) the outbreak of the Salt War or during it (1877) (Houser 1994).
IV. ON-SITE CONSULTATIONS WITH THE TIGUA TRIBE OF YSLETA DEL SUR PUEBLO

On June 17, 1993, five members of the Tigua Tribal Council, the project contractor, park superintendent Deckert and two rangers traveled by horseback to a remote rock shelter containing pictographs. This site was identified by the Tigua, during previous discussion and the viewing of a video recording the contractor made previously of the site, as a location of interest. The polychrome pictograph panels contained some features which apparently were familiar to the Tigua. Once at the site, the Tigua representatives climbed to the overhang with the contractor. Park staff remained at the canyon floor. After the climb to the site, the contractor left the Tigua alone to carry out a ceremony. Afterwards, the Tigua called the contractor and park staff representatives up to the site.

The Tigua identified one pictograph as an abuelo and puebloan, similar to one found at Hueco Tanks State Park in Texas. There were other features which the Tigua said indicated the site was a “special place of powerful medicine,” but they did not elaborate other than to point out that there were a number of medicinal plants located nearby. One consultant remarked that his people appreciated the opportunity to visit the site, and it was observed that this elder used some of the time spent at the site to instruct younger members of the council. It was also pointed out the Tigua that some of the pictographs were probably Apachean and that the Mescalero Tribe should be contacted.

On the morning of June 18, the tribal representative met with some of the Carlsbad Caverns National Park staff in the office of Superintendent Deckert. The Tigua representatives again reiterated their appreciation of the opportunity to be consulted with and stated that the pueblo would welcome further consultations. Superintendent Deckert affirmed the National Park Service's position to do likewise. A Tigua elder remarked that the Tigua should not be viewed as a threat to park resources and would work with the park staff when necessary.

The contractor held a focused group discussion with the tribal representatives later that evening. It was made clear to the contractor that the Tigua found their initial experience with the National Park Service a substantial improvement over
FIGURE 7: TIGUA CONSULTATION WITH CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK STAFF
the contentiousness that has characterized their relationships with the Texas Parks and Wildlife staff at Hueco Tanks State Park. It was the position of the Tigua Tribal Council representatives that the rock shelter they visited be closed to the public. They also indicated a desire to be consulted with regarding any change in the status of the site (it was noted that future contacts be made through the Office of the Governor/see Chapter V. for further discussion). Finally, the Tigua said they would welcome any opportunity to assist, with the exception of sensitive areas, in the interpretative story of Carlsbad Caverns National Park
V. CONSIDERATIONS FOR MANAGEMENT APPROACHES AND FURTHER STUDY

A. Management Context

There is a considerable wealth of cultural resources found in Carlsbad Caverns National Park. A large portion of these currently exist in the form of over 120 archaeological sites, many of which have yet to be surveyed. One of the objectives of this study was to provide an ethnographic context for the park's cultural resources including cultural and natural areas of special significance to those communities who have a traditional association with the area. Moreover, traditional use areas, locations of sacred sites, species and objects, access trails and the identification of access needs by and for Indian communities for purposes of traditional, ceremonial, or subsistence use were also study objectives. Such information provides an important, often missing cultural context for park resources, management, and interpretation. It also aids park managers in the evaluation of requests for resource access, potential environmental impacts of park use of resources, and impacts on traditional cultural systems (i.e. Indian communities) of park management guidelines and mandates. Without an ethnographic component, the goals of National Park Service mandates manage resources in a culturally-informed manner are hampered.

B. Possible Options for Management

1) Establish a consultation relationship, perhaps via a memorandum of understanding, between Carlsbad Caverns National Park and the Mescalero Apache Tribe.

This ethnographic overview and assessment reveals the centrality of the Guadalupe Mountains to the Mescalero Apache Tribe. While the evidence for Mescalero traditional association with those lands now under the administration of the park is incontrovertible, Mescalero Tribal input into management concerns is missing. The National Park Service may want to pursue the initiative established by this project by considering how to establish a consultation relationship with the tribe. The Mescalero Tribal Vice-President, Mr. Fred Peso, speaking on behalf of the Tribe has indicated the Tribe's interest and has referred the project to the appropriate committees for deliberation before discussion can
be held at the Tribal Council level. The fact that this contractor has not been contacted further by the Tribe should not be construed as disinterest on the part of the Mescalero Apache Tribe. Recent meetings of representatives of all of the Apache nations to deal with NAGPRA (Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act, 1990) concerns and attended by some National Park Service staff may bode well for future consultations.

If an agreement, perhaps in the form of a memorandum of understanding, can be worked out, it may be possible, with the concurrence of the Mescalero Tribe, to have specific tribal members identified by the tribe with whom the staff of Carlsbad Caverns National Park can consult with on various issues of mutual concern. Moreover, the establishment of regularly scheduled briefings involving both parties is also another possible outcome of a consultation relationship.

**Rationale**

The existing historic and ethnographic documentation reviewed and discussed in this report reveal a very clear picture of the centrality of the Guadalupe Mountains to Mescalero Apache cultural tradition. What is missing from this considerable body of information is any substantive Apache narratives about their relationships to the Guadalupe Mountains. While this information provides a basis for understanding some of the relationships obtaining between the Mescalero and those resources now under the auspices of National Park Service management, it does not provide the necessary or even sufficient data base upon which to develop programs or projects that are responsive to or reflect contemporary Mescalero concerns. For example, the current place name data exist without a context or specificity as regards physical boundaries. If some place names refer to sacred sites, then as sacred resources, these areas can have spiritual impacts that extend beyond their obvious physical boundaries. That is, they may be a focus or center of a “spiritual activity field” (NPS-28 1994:169). Similarly, specific culturally-defined access points or viewing areas for rock shelters or the Big Cave entrance may exist, but are elusive to cultural outsiders. The meaning of some of the pictographs in the park may be known to the Mescalero as maps leading to important places or as ceremonial instructions. The meaning of these places cannot be deciphered by cultural outsiders such as archaeologists or rock art specialists. The protection of these areas along with what interpretative story is associated with specific
pictograph panels requires Mescalero consultation.

Such consultation may also reveal the parameters of information the Mescalero would deem suitable or unsuitable for the public domain. The precise meaning of the numerous sacred locales and special places to the Mescalero may never be revealed as they may be too private for tribal members to discuss. Even with ethnographic interviews, the tribe may choose not to reveal areas or the meanings associated with those sites already identified. It is important to note here that the sacred locales and place names currently identified and listed in scholarly publications were revealed to researchers under what may have been unspecified auspices. Hence, while one individual may have identified sacred sites, that individual whether Mescalero or a cultural outsider may not be reflecting the current tribal government's mandates on sensitive cultural information. In short, the existing documentation is not tied to current Mescalero narratives approved by the tribal government. A consultation relationship with the Mescalero Tribe could provide a venue for Indian people to speak to their understanding of their historic occupancy of the Guadalupes. The ebb and flow of Mescalero culture history in their own words would add meaningful dimensions to the existing information on specific locales, access points and trails, and the meaning of these areas to Mescalero cultural tradition. Moreover, Mescalero input is essential if the commitment of the National Park Service to plan and implement programs that protect the cultural and natural resources at Carlsbad Caverns National Park in a culturally informed manner is to be fully realized.

2) The National Park Service may want to examine ways to continue and formalize further the consultation relationship established with the Tigua Tribe of Ysleta Del Sur Pueblo.

The Tigua Tribe of Ysleta Del Sur Pueblo has a traditional association with the lands and resources found in and adjacent to Carlsbad Caverns National Park. The ethnographic data, however, reveal a more peripheral relationship for the Tigua compared to the centrality of the Guadalupe Mountains to Apache cultural tradition. The Tigua Tribe did formally agree to participate in the project and welcomes additional opportunities to consult with the National Park Service. It is noted here that this process is underway with the General Management Plan review meetings with the Tigua (see Appendix A).
Rationale

The on-site consultation with representatives of the Tigua Tribal Council produced a request by the Tigua that they be consulted with regarding any management plans pertaining to the rock shelter site they visited during their consultation. This site was viewed as a sensitive locale which merits special attention. In particular, the Tigua representatives noted an interest in protection issues and tourist access to the site. The Tigua Tribal Council representatives who visited Carlsbad Caverns National Park were unanimous in their suggestion that the area be closed to the public (the recent removal of the site from USGS maps is noted in this regard). Council representatives noted also that the tribe's access to the site may be an important agenda item in future consultations. In addition, as Carlsbad Caverns National Park's interpretative story is broadened to include adjacent areas, Tigua consultation will be indispensable.

3) The National Park Service may want to consider ways to involve the Piro-Manso-Tiwa Indian Tribe of San Juan de Guadalupe in future consultations regarding Guadalupe Mountains National Park.

It was recently brought to the attention of the contractor that the Piro-Manso-Tiwa Tribe of the Pueblo of San Juan de Guadalupe, Las Cruces, New Mexico is involved in a consultation relationship concerning traditional cultural properties at Salinas Pueblo Mission National Monument. The tribe has requested information on their history and ancestry as it relates to that park unit. In addition, the tribe has indicated an interest in meeting with the park management staff at Carlsbad Caverns National Park (see Appendix E). As this community claims a relationship to Mogollon cultures, it may have additional insight into the cultural resources of Carlsbad Caverns National Park.

C. Items for Further Study

While this project has ascertained that the Mescalero Apache and Tigua Tribe of Ysleta Del Sur Pueblo were the principle users of the Guadalupe Mountains, there remain gaps in the current data base on these groups which require further study to fill. In addition, there are other groups which probably have some traditional
connections to the study area, but with whom contact was not possible given the progress of the existing contract.

Consultation with the Mescalero Tribe may provide significant information on precise identification of sacred and other special locations (if so desired by the tribe), recommendations for protection and access, access routes, conditions of access, identification of natural resources viewed as cultural resources by the tribe (Mescal is an example), and access to these resources. Areas such as Rattlesnake Springs and the Big Cave require Mescalero commentary. Further consultation with the Mescalero may also reveal the existence of other Apache groups having a traditional association with the Guadalupe Mountains.

While most pictographs in the Guadalupe region have been attributed to Archaic Tradition, Apache influences must certainly be there. Schaafsma (1975), for example, identifies two historic pictograph sites in Guadalupe Mountains National Park of horse and rider as probably Mescalero (rabbit-ear headress). Moreover, Schaafsma (1975:124) suggests that the hourglass design found at most sites in the Guadalupe Mountains to be of Apache origins, symbolizing Child-Of-The-Water, a major Mescalero mythological hero. It certainly would be instructive to have Mescalero commentary on pictograph sites including the dark zone pictographs in Slaughter Canyon Cave, and the newly “discovered” C-76. Consultation should clarify which sites are definitely Mescalero and how they could be managed in a culturally-informed manner.

It would also be instructive to ascertain Indian perceptions of Carlsbad Caverns National Park and the management of its natural and cultural resources. Perhaps the reason why there are so few recent reports of Indian visitation to areas in the park is that as the National Park Service developed facilities and trails and typical tourist visitation has increased, those Mescalero, for example, seeking to visit sacred locales may have found it an increasingly unattractive option irrespective of low backcountry visitation by tourists. Admittedly this is speculative, but it is an area that this contractor believes merits further study and consultation with Indian people.

Further consultation with the Tigua may substantiate the frequency of exploitation of the resources of the Guadalupe mountain range. It may be that Tigua use of the resources in the mountains increased during the late 19th century with Apache
removal. The Tigua finding themselves less likely to be attacked by the Apache were able to increase their use of the area. However, the use of Tigua as scouts for the military through the 19th century makes that argument even more speculative. The Tigua were hired as scouts because of their familiar with the environment of west Texas and the experience they had in dealing with the Apache. The fact that scalp dances were held upon the return of the Tigua scouts to the pueblo indicates that in the Tigua view their work with the military was an attempt to defend their traditional lands and/or resources.

Finally, the existence of other groups who may have associations with the Guadalupe Mountains may be revealed in further study. To this end, Carlsbad Caverns National Park has during the past year been in contact with the Chiricahua and Jicarilla Apache, the Kiowa-Apache, Kiowa, White Mountain Apache, San Carlos Apache, Isleta Pueblo, Zia Pueblo, Zuni Pueblo and the Comanche Tribe. All of these groups have indicated a cultural and historical affiliation with the Guadalupe Mountains and the southeast New Mexico region (via communication with the park curator). Summaries for these and other contacts are included in Appendix E. As these consultations proceed, a more complete picture of the ethnography of Carlsbad Caverns National Park will be revealed.
REFERENCES CITED

Bandelier, Adolph F.A.
    edited by annotated by Charles H. Lange and Carroll L. Riley.
    Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.

Basehart, Harry W.
1974 "Mescalero Apache Subsistence Patterns and Socio-Political
    Organization," *In Apache Indians*, vol. 12. Indian Claims

Beckett, Patrick H. and Terry L. Corbett
1992 *The Manso Indians*. COAS Publishing and Research, Las Cruces,
    New Mexico.

Bender, Averam B.
    on file at Guadalupe Mountains National Park.

Bodnar, Russell
1990 "Mescalero Apaches and the Guadalupe Mountains." November
    17 Memorandum to Interpretation Staff, Carlsbad Caverns National

Buskirk, Winfred
1986 *The Western Apache, Living with the Land before 1950*. Norman:
    University of Oklahoma Press.

Carmichael, David L.
1990 "Patterns of Residential Mobility and Sedentism in the Jornada
    Mogollon Area," reprinted from: *Perspectives on Southwestern
    pp. 122-134.
Castetter, Edward F. and Willis H. Bell

Clifton, Don

Crisman, Bobby
1993 Ranger Reports. Carlsbad Caverns National Park.

Deckert, Frank
1995 "Comments on Carlsbad Caverns National Park Ethnographic Assessment and Overview Draft Report."

Dexter, Henry Larson
1858 Dexter Papers, written by Henry Larson Dexter, typed transcribed copies by Mrs. A. Liebson, (loaned from W.H. Timmons).

Dexter Papers
1854-1868 Dexter Papers, written by Henry Larson Dexter, typed transcribed copies by Mrs. A. Liebson, (photocopy loaned by W.H. Timmons).

Dozier, Edward P.

Eggan, Fred
Farrer, Claire R.


Fitzgerald, G.X., ed.

Forbes, Jack D.

1959  "Unknown Athapaskans: The Identification of the Jano, Jocome, Manso, Suma and Other Indian Tribes of the Southwest to 1680," *Ethnohistory,* vol. 6, pp. 97-159.


Fulgam, Tommy R.

Gerald, Rex E.


Gray, Shannon
Green, Thomas

Greenberg, Adolph M.
1993 Field notes. Ysleta del Sur Pueblo.

Griffen, William B.

Hendricks, Rick

Hewett, Edgar L.
1943 Mission Monuments of New Mexico, Handbook of Archaeological History, Albuquerque, New Mexico.

Hickerson, Nancy Parrott
1994 The Jumanos, Hunters and Traders of the South Plains, University of Texas, Austin.

Hodge, Frederick Webb
Houser, Nicholas P.
1966-1994 Interviews, oral history tapes and notes.


Hughes, Anne E.

Jenkins, Myra Ellen

Katz, Paul R.

Katz, Susanna R. and Paul R.
1974 An Inventory and Interpretation of Prehistoric Resources in Guadalupe Mountains National Park, Texas. U.S. National Park Service, Contract #CX700030203. Follow up to Texas Tech field school survey. Katz’s survey 35% of park lands. With previous study, 70 percent surveyed at end of Katz’s contract.
Lange, Charles H. And Carroll L. Riley
Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.

Levine, Frances
1991 "Economic Perspectives on the Comanchero Trade." In Farmers,
Tucson: The University of Arizona Press.

Lone Star
2.

"Three Pueblo Indians are going around the city selling Pinon Nuts"].

Matson, Daniel S.
n.d. "Cordero's Description of the Apache - 1796." Translated by

McLaughlin, Walter V., Jr.
University of New Mexico, M.A. Thesis, Albuquerque.

Mescalero Apache Tribe

National Park Service

Naylor, Thomas H.
1981 "Athapaskans They Weren't: The Suma Rebels Executed at
Casas Grandes in 1685." In The Protohistoric Period in the North
American Southwest, A.D. 1450-1700, ed. David R. Wilcox and W.
Bruce Masse, Anthropological Research, no. 24, pp. 275-281. Tempe:
Arizona State University.
Opler, Morris Edward


Parsons, E.C.

Phillips, John
1931 "History of Ysleta, Texas," August, [typed unpublished manuscript; secured copy from Grace Long; photocopy in: American History Center, Austin, Texas].

Ray, Verne F.

Reisch, Roger
1994 Personal Communication.

Rosacker, Mark
1994 Personal Communication.
Sando, Joe S.  

Schaafsma, Polly  
1975 *Rock Art in New Mexico.* Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press.

Schroeder, Albert H.  


Seymour, Deni J.  

Simmons, Marc  

Steely, James H.  
1990 "McKittrick Canyon Archeological District, Guadalupe Mountains National Park, Culberson County, Texas." Austin: Texas Historical Commission.

73
Thrapp, Dan L.

Truhill, Robert
1992 Interview with Tigua elder.

Warren, Colquitt.

White, L.A.

Wilcox, David R.

Wright, Bill
SELECTED ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

Anonymous

A complete mix of information, this folder contains newspaper articles and portions of books (most of which are not labeled as to source) concerning the use of mescal. Includes information on first mescal roast at Living Desert State Park, but not specific locations of traditional gathering.

Atwater, Elizabeth V.

This material was gathered of presentation to the Indian Claims Commission in the suit filed by the Jicarilla Apache Tribe against the United States, Docket 22. The journals of early Spanish explorers, soldiers, and priests are quoted extensively to document the territory occupied by the Apache at the time of the entrada.
Bandelier, Adolph F. A.

The author, in his introduction, gives an account of his travels throughout the Southwest and Mexico with good descriptions of the geographical features that he encountered. The rest of the two volume report outlines the ethnographic condition of the Indian tribes during the period of the Spanish entrada, the sixteenth century, and then goes on to describe in great detail the characteristics of the tribes at the time of the report. There are copious and detailed footnotes throughout the report, and many references are made to previous explorers' and ethnographers' reports.

Banks, Kimball

Banks' discussion of a cultural ecological model for settlement in the Salt Basin is generally not very helpful, although he does provide a decent overview of the natural history of the Salt Basin.
Bartlett, John Russell


Bartlett who explored the listed regions in 1850-1853, describes the route through the Guadalupes to El Paso, including a detailed discussion of Hueco Tanks and the rock paintings there.

Bartlett Papers: Mexican Boundary Commission, (microfilm UTEP, MF 497 r.10; Vol. X), Notes from handwritten report: November 11, Monday, “Camp at Salt Lake, near Guadalupe Mt. Ponds near the camp contain wild duck. Shot a couple before breakfast.” On the way to Cornudas, “The soil is very barren, and in many places was covered with saline incrustations” (page 61). (Page 63) November 12, down steep mountain side in the Hueco Mts. on the way to Hueco Tanks. Had to chain the wheels (for brakes coming down the pass). Reached “Waco Tanks.” “There were holes and polls in the many [?] rocks where the water collects itself” (page 64). November 5, El Paso. “Rode to El Paso called on Senor Conde y [and] Padre Ortiz, after which rode through the town.” November 23, Saturday. Crossed the rive to El Paso and met the Bishop [of Durango] in his full robes. “I attended the old church at El Paso.” “...Formerly contained some choice painting by Marello [must be Murillo] but that Col. Doniphan has plundered the church and cut these beautiful pictures from their frames and taken away. What a sacrifice!” November 15, Monday. Rode to the town on horseback [El Paso] “Met a party of 15 Pueblo Indians [must be Mansos of El Paso del Norte], marching in to the town [?] Fantastic [?] [serapes?] - the men were chiefly [?] dressed [?] after the fashion of the Mexicans. The women all wore black.
serapes [?], coming just below the knees with a white muslin mantle on their heads...” [he then describes the dance of these Indians in front of the old church and that their dance was monotonous]. January 26, Wednesday [page 91] rained all day. “A party of 20 or 30 Pueblo Indians from Senecu stopped here on their way to a rabbit hunt. They looked more like Mexicans than Indians.” (Page 97:) April 14th, rode into El Paso to visit the Indian [?] Fair (page 97).

Basehart, Harry W.

Excellent source for Mescalero adaptations to natural environment. Provides much useful information on ethnobotany and ethnozoology of Mescalero. Important source of place name data right down to the minute and second.

Beckes, M.R. and J.M. Adovasio

The authors briefly discuss the relationship between the Archaic Hueco Phase and the following Jornada Mogollon. They conclude that Lehmer (1948) is wrong in connecting the two; instead, they support Wheat’s (1955) claim that the Jornada derives from the Big Bend Archaic.

Beckett, Patrick H. and Terry L. Corbett

Excellent study of Manso prehistory and cultural characteristics.
Beckett, Patrick H., and Regge N. Wiseman, eds.  

The majority of the articles in this edited volume are pertinent to the project, most commonly because they provide an overview of the area’s prehistory and previous work done in the region.

Bender, Averam B.  

A rather random collection of excerpts from this manuscript contains detailed information about Apache raiding movements but does not seem to include any useful specifics. Most references simply place the Mescalero in the Guadalupe Mountains.

Berlandier, Jean Louis  

This book is about an 1830’s Spanish Military view of the Indians at this time, and their ideas of how the Indians lived and what they valued.

Bilbo, M.J. and K. Sutherland  

The authors describe the Pine Springs Canyon site, one which they place into an Archaic Big Bend style that encompasses a large area of Southwestern Texas and Norther Chihuahua.

79
Bilbo, Michael and Barbara
n.d. "Slaughter Canyon (New) Cave Pictograph Site, Carlsbad Caverns."

Discusses paintings in Slaughter Canyon Cave and compares them to many other sites, including Hueco Tanks, Painted Grotto, and others mentioned only by name. Disappointingly short on citations of sites mentioned.

Bodnar, Russell

This short memo, intended to increase park personnel awareness of Guadalupe’s sacred nature, is fairly general but does echo information found elsewhere (see Boyer nd). It also includes an anecdote about lack of access for the Mescalero to Guadalupe Mountain.

Bolton, Herbert E

Bolton uses original accounts of Spanish explores to describe the location of the Jumanos in Texas. The information is similar to that in Dunn (1911).

Bourke, John G.

This article examines the various costumes, paraphernalia, and ceremonies of the Apache medicine men. Little pertinent information.
Boyer, Ruth M.


Mostly concerned with the folktale character Bat, this folder contains two pages from another work (Basehart 1960?) that has extensive valuable information on place names and use/importance of areas.

Brethauer, Douglas P.


Brethauer discusses the prehistoric uses of mesquite in the Jornada area including a quote about Apache use of mesquite. He provides a good general discussion of the Hueco Phase, Hueco-to-Mesilla Transition, the Mesilla Phase, Dona Ana Phase, and El Paso Phase.

Broaddus, J. Morgan


This article thoroughly discusses the early historic use of the Salt Flats, including general locations of Mescalero Apache, until the end of the Salt War of 1877-78. Beyond this time period, Broaddus does not go into great depth.
Brook, Vernon R.

This article suggests that El Paso Phase village settlements in the bolson were based on clan or family relationships. Brook only offers scant evidence, though, hoping to spark more research on the hypothesis. Little useful information is included, other than possibly a discussion of steps or altars in El Paso Phase rooms.

Brook, V.R. and J.W. Green

A short piece by the El Paso Archaeological Society, this article consists mostly of examples of site record forms. It contains no useful information about rock art sites.

Burnet, R.M.

This article describes Slaughter Canyon (New) Cave at Carlsbad in flowery language. Although it scarcely describes the pictographs in the cave, it does provide a good feel for the cave's topography.

Buskirk, Winfred

Excellent source for understanding Apache adaptations to the natural environment. While primarily focusing on the Western Apache, the model of adaptation works well for the eastern groups.
Carmichael, David L.

Good discussion of settlement patterns in prehistoric period.

Castetter, Edward F. and Willis H. Bell

Indispensable source for information on agave use by Indian communities.

Clark, J.W., Jr.

One of the most complete descriptions of pictographs in the Guadalupe Mountains, this article provides strong data on six sites. Clark does a lot of comparison between the sites he discusses and those recorded by Jackson (1938) and Kirkland & Newcomb (1967) in the area.
Clifton, Don

Clifton provides specific descriptions of 26 sites found during survey of park boundaries. Of the greatest use is his summary of past work on the cultural chronology of the park and short history of archaeological excavation. He also includes a short description of the park's natural history.

Conkling, Roscoe P. and Margaret B. Conkling

This detailed history of the Butterfield Overland provides descriptions of the location and significance of the route, which included stops at Pine Springs, the Guadalupe Mts., and Hueco Tanks, as well as areas in between. The authors also include pertinent quotes from early explorers' journals. Unfortunately, much of their text is uncited, making it difficult to follow up on interesting portions.

Davis, John V. and Kay S. Toness

Using Kirkland's 1939 paintings as a basis for comparison, the authors inventoried Hueco Tanks pictographs, noting damage to previously recorded sites and documenting new pictographs.
Dozier, Edward P.

Good overview of pueblo adaptations.

Eggan, Fred

Also excellent introduction to pueblo society and culture.

El Paso County Records
1873 Tays 1873 Survey Book, Archives Building, El Paso County, 1882-1885 "El Paso County Records, San Elizario & Socorro, 1864-1890" [Ysleta is also included] (Microfilm UTEP, MF 510 r.1).

[Note: Tigua Indians have been identified in the reports of the Incorporation of Ysleta; there are several references to irrigation in the Ysleta reports. For example, see page 31: Senobio Granillo [identified Tigua Indian] on April 21, 1882 is fined $2.00 for failing to show respect to the Alcalde Mayor de las Aguas [official in charge of irrigation] because he [Granillo] became fatigued [lazy] in his work [related to irrigation work]. The fine was judged by the Mayor of the Incorporation, Anastacio Guerra, Mayor de la Corporacion de Ysleta. There are other similar fines given to Ysleta residents who became fatigued while doing their work. Ysidro Duran [identified Tigua Indian] was also fined two pesos for the same reason (page 40, October 5, 1882). Blas Colemero [Tigua Indian] was fined one peso on March 27, 1885 by Pablo Romero, Mayor of the Incorporation of Ysleta for violating the law of the incorporation by using irrigation water for his field without permission (page 131). Other fines by the Incorporation of Ysleta were apparently for]
not maintaining property the livestock "corral" [on the page the name of the person is given, with the notation corral and then the amount of the fine]. This type of fine included some possible and identified Tigua Indians [Nicolas Padilla, Senobia Perea, Rafael Duran; Magdaleno Marques, Tigua Indian; Juan Olguin, Casimiro Madrid; page 50]. Page 121, Cornelio Duran [possible Tigua Indian] received a seven pesos fine for being in a fight with Felipe Gonzales on Dec. 1, 1884.

El Paso Herald
1887 "El Paso County Tax Delinquent List," April 18 (this includes information that the appointed surveyors, Cameli & Randolph will some have a complete map of the corporation made).

"The following action was filed in the U.S. Court for the western district of Texas to-day." Your petitioners the pueblo of Cenecu, a pueblo situate and established in the state of Chihuahua, in the republic of Mexico, by virtue of, and under the laws of Spain, which pueblo for the purpose of this action will be styled the plaintiff complaining of: Ynocente Lucero, Juan Gongora, Clemente Lucero, A. Duran, Padre de Palmar, J. Lowenstein, C. Telles, B. Alderete, P. Perea, E. Duran, R. Olgin [sic, Olguín], P. Romero, A. Apodaca, C. Garcia, Jose Luna, ---Babbett, M. Telles, I.G. Gaal, p. Walsh, Y. Duran, J. Barela, P. Padilla, P. Apodaca, Jose Apodaca, W.H. Smith, Jus.Tibbetts, J.W. Lowries, J. M. Gonzales, Revs Apodaca, A. Abalos, Nick Madrid, J. Romero, F. Martin, David Martin, C. Hopf, P. Morales, E. Morales, E. Mendoza, S. Gonzales, G. Lucero, F.[?] Mayer, J. Garcia, P. Yergoin, J.R. Currie, B.H. Davis, residents of the county of El Paso, A. Pumphery, resident of Sonoma county, California: W.W. Williams of the same state; C.N. Olds, resident of Ohio: Mrs. C.W. St. Johns of Texas and J.M. Flores of Chihuahua, were the owners of a tract of land, beginning at a stake on the Rio Grande 1500
varas due south of the western edge of Ysleta." —
"Messrs. Crosby & Edwards, Merchant, Teel & Wilcox, are attorneys for Plaintiff". (photocopy in file), Page 4, col. 2, El Paso, Texas.

1891 "An Immense Suit." (Citizens of San Elizario and Socorro Want Their Land) Mar. 5, page 1. [note: this article concerns the La Prieta Grant; part of legal description was from northeast corner of the Ysleta Town Tract; easterly thirty leagues to El Capitan; photocopy in file]. "Over One Million Dollars Involved — Purchasers from the Texas and Pacific Made the Defendants" (subtitle).

"Yesterday afternoon, one of the largest suits ever brought in this county, was filed in the clerk's office of the United States court by the towns of San Elizario and Socorro against Chas J. Canda, Simon P. Drake and Frederick P. Olcott, for the possession of land held by them in what is known as La Prieta Grant". — "Beginning at a pile of rock on a hill called 'Lomo [sic] San Juan di [sic] La Cruz', which is the northeast corner of the Ysleta Town tract; thence easterly thirty leagues to a pile of rock on the highest point of a mountain called 'El Capitan de Guadalupe', thence south twenty leagues to a monument of stone on a high platform called 'Sierra la Mesa'; hence westerly thirteen leagues to a monument in Sierra Blanca built by Don Jose Lerma; thence west with the line of Don Jose Lerma eight leagues to the beginning corner of said Don Jose Lerma's lands on Alamo on the left bank of the Rio Grande, thence up the Rio Grande to the place of beginning, which land is reasonably worth one million dollars". Townsend & Larrazolo, W.B. Brack & H.H. Niel, Attorneys for Plaintiff." — "La Prieta grant was granted by the king of Spain to the pueblos of Socorro and San Elizario in the early part of the century. This grant was afterwards recognized by Mexico upon acquiring freedom. The land has been occupied and claimed since that time by these towns, but the grant has never been
recognized the state of Texas. The land in question is a portion of the Texas & Pacific reservation, located by certificates issued by the state to this road. The railroad sold these lands to the defendants. All the alternate sections are state school lands, and the state is not joined in the suits, as it cannot be used except by special act of the legislature. The contention of the plaintiffs is that the title to the land is protected by the treaty between the United States and Mexico of February 28th, 1848. Nearly all the Mexican grants along the Rio Grande have been recognized by the government of the United States, and the outcome of this suit will be awaited with interest throughout the state". March 5, 1891, page 1, El Paso, Texas.

1909 June 25 "To Investigate La Prieta Grant" (title). "Texas State Land Commissioner Searching for Old Mexico Records" (subtitle). 

El Paso Herald, p. 11, col. 7.

"J.F. Robinson State Land Commissioner, left this morning for Chihuahua, where he will go over the records in search of a grant which it is claimed was made in the Spanish days and known as La Prieta grant, involving 1,400,000 acres of land in the valley embracing the towns of Socorro, Ysleta and San Elizario". [new paragraph:] "From time to time the county clerk has received deeds for record involving lands in this section and it is the general belief that a great swindle has been worked on unsuspecting ones. But a little over a week ago, a deed was received by the county clerk, but there is no such property on record. He has gone so far as to have circular letters printed to send to those who had purchase property in that mythical grant, for such it is so far as the Texas records go to show". [new paragraph:] "Mr. Robinson looked for the records at Juarez but could find no record to indicate that any such grant as that claimed had ever been made and now he has gone to Chihuahua and if
necessary will proceed to the city of Mexico, where he will look over the federal records".


"Major Eugene Van Patten, received a telegram from Washington, D.C. today stating that the Secretary had refused to allow a hearing in the case of Eugene Van Patten vs. Nathan Boyd. This has been a long fought case extending over a period of nearly 5 years". "The decision gives the verdict to Van Patten". July 19, 1909, Page 1, Cols: 5-6.


The will of Sigmund Neustadt of Canada, Drake and Neustadt, owners of the T.P. Surveys, consisting of millions of acres of lands in the lower part of El Paso County, worth from $5 an acre to $40 an acre, has been filed with the county clerk". The will was made on January 4, 1900. [Houser note: could this by the T.P. RR which line ran through the region on the Lower Valley and is mentioned elsewhere in another article of the period?].

1909 July 24 "Record of Spanish Throne may be Search for La Prieta Title" (title of article). p. 8, cols. 5-6.

"Although they have searched diligently through Mexico records for some trace of a land grant in El Paso County known as La Prieta, presumably without success, as they are still at it, State Land Commissioner J.I. Robison [sic: Robinson] and W.H. Marsh of Tyler, Texas, who represents private interests, will continue their work in Juarez before records of Spanish Kings are searched". Investigators examined archives in Chihuahua City, Torreon, Guadalajara, Zacatecas and Mexico City. "At Guadalajara a book was found with many titles as far
back as 1607. This book covered titles up to 1678". "Mr. Robison [sic] states that the congressional records at Chihuahua are now being searched under the direction of governor Creel and that either himself or Mr. Marsh will return to Mexico after looking further through the records in Juarez". "Mr. Marsh, while accompanying the state land commissioner, has served in the legislature and represents private interests in the so called La Prieta grants, Mr. Robison [sic] says". Robison [sic] may take this matter up with Senator Culberson in Washington, D.C. and may request the ambassador of Spain to search records in that country.

Fabry, Judith

Basic history of park from administrative standpoint. Does not contain reference to Mescalero use of park lands before advent of Guadalupe Mountains National Park and after. Interesting to note that comment on Mescalero contemporary plant collecting is put under natural resource issues rather than cultural ones.

Farrer, Claire R.


Both books are splendid discussions of Apache world view through the words of the people themselves. Compiled by an ethnographer who has had a long term relationship with the Mescalero tribe. Two of the best works available.
Fitzgerald, G.X., ed.  

Anthology dealing with Jornada Mogollon site in Guadalupe Mountains National Park. Some information on native use and occupancy (p.13).

Forbes, Jack D.  

1959 "Unknown Athapaskans: The Identification of the Jano, Jocome, Manso, Suma and Other Indian Tribes of the Southwest to 1680." Ethnohistory 6, pp. 97-159.


All three works deal with group identity issues and provide basis discussion of Suma, Manso, and Jumano affiliation.

Forrestal, Peter P.  

Fray Alonso de Benavides wrote this memorial while establishing the mission at the Indian Pueblo of Jemez from 1626-1629. He writes not only about the Puebloans at Jemez but also about other Puebloans as well as the Apache, Manso, and other tribes which he encountered.
Freehling, Michael.
1976 *Hueco Tanks State Historical Park, El Paso County, Texas.*
[Austin, TX?]: Texas System of Natural Laboratories, Inc.

This short paper was published as part of a series identifying and describing natural labs in Texas. It includes as much quantitative data describing the park (i.e., plant and animal species, weather, geology, etc.) as was known in 1976.

Gebhard, D.

Gebhard describes a site near Ruidoso, New Mexico, which he attributes to the Mescalero. However, Schaafsma (1975) gives evidence that throws doubt on the site's authenticity.


This short description of Painted Grotto lacks the detail of Schaafsma (1975). Gebhard does include some interesting interpretation of the paintings, but once again Schaafsma disputes his ideas.

Gerald, Rex E.


Excellent source for Tigua ethnography by scholar who had a long term association with the tribe. Indispensable source.
Grant, Campbell

Although rather outdated, this book is a good introduction to rock art research throughout the United States. It mentions paintings in Texas and New Mexico very briefly.

Gray, Shannon

Recent research on Tigua ethnobotany. Excellent source.

Green, Thomas

Doctoral dissertation based on research into Tigua search for federal acknowledgment. Excellent source for information on Tigua world view.

Green, J.W.

Green describes a site located in the Franklin Mts to the west of the study area, tying step-like geometrics at the canyon to those from Hueco Tanks. Not terribly useful.


An article in which Green documents a site west of the study area. Again, he ties fairly generic designs ("snakes" and zigzags) to those at Hueco Tanks.

This description of a site near Last Chance Canyon to the west of Carlsbad includes cross-references of design elements that Kirkland & Newcomb (1967) have recorded. Most of the similarities are between simple elements, though, and do not seem significant.

**Griffen, William B.**


Splendid research into peace settlements. A must for anyone attempting to understand Apache settlements and movements during historic period.

**Gunnerson, Dolores A.**


This article examines archaeological evidence and Spanish documents in an effort to establish a date for Athabaskan arrival in the Southwest at 1525. Little usefulness.

**Hackett, Charles W.**

1911 "The Revolt of the Pueblo Indians of New Mexico in 1680." *The Quarterly of the Texas State Historical Association.* XI(2), pp. 93-147.

An in-depth attempt to use original documents to clear up misconceptions of the Pueblo revolt, this article includes information on the populations of each pueblo and their participation in the revolt. Helpful only pertaining to the revolt (nothing terribly specific about Tigua).

A two volume work, this set was written after the original autos, or legal documents were discovered in Mexico early in this century. The author has written a two hundred page background and introduction that is a clear and comprehensive history of the revolt and the reconquest. The rest of the set is made up of translations of the autos, proclamations, and military musters of the Spanish and declarations taken from both friendly and captive Indians.

Hendricks, Rick

Good discussion of El Paso missions and affiliated groups.

Henry, Robert D.

Henry (from El Paso) and 3 other climbers knowingly climbed in area closed because of pictographs. Someone [who?] escorted them to park headquarters and turned them in. Texas game warden threatened them with fine and/or jail, but let them go with a warning. Asks climbers to not violate the rules at Hueco Tanks, so that the climbing community can continue using it.
Hester, Black, Steele, Olive, Fox, Reinhard, and Bement.  
1989 From the Gulf to the Rio Grande: Human Adaptation in Central, South, and Lower Pecos Texas. Center for Archeological Research at the University of Texas at San Antonio, Texas A and M University, and Arkansas Archeological Survey.

Focuses on Lipan Apache, Comanche, Tonkawa, Karankawa, and Coahuiltecan populations and locations during different time periods.

Hester, Thomas R.  

Study of the intrusive groups: Tonkawa, Lipan Apache, and Comanche. The discussion on Lipan culture in historical perspective is of some use.

Hickerson, Nancy Parrott  

Thorough discussion of the Jumano as a tribal appellation applied to a whole host of groups identified in the historic literature. Excellent work.
Houser, Nicholas P.


Both works provide comprehensive overview of Tigua land use practices. Indispensable work from long time Tigua researcher.

Jackson, A.T.

This early work on Texas pictographs is a jumble of information on individual sites, including those in Culberson, Hudspeth, and El Paso Counties. Jackson also groups together design elements from many different sites, creating tables of plants, projectile points, European influences, etc., as represented across Texas.

Jelks, Edward B.

An Article by W. W. Newcomb, Jr. "The Indian Tribes of Texas." A little outdated from 1960 to 1995. Gives good description of what archeologists and ethnologists were doing during this time period.
Jenkins, Myra Ellen

Good overview discussion of Ysleta del Sur Pueblo.

Katz, Paul R.

A discussion of an archaeological survey of the "high country" of Guadalupe Mountains National Park which provides data on specific sites, proposed cultural chronologies for the region, and a rock art site already well-described by Clark (1974).

Katz, Susanna R. And Paul R.

Follow up to Texas Tech field school survey. Katz’s survey 35% of park lands. With previous study, 70 percent surveyed at end of Katz’s contract.

Katz, Paul R. and Susanna R.

This summary discusses Texas Tech's 1974 field school, which concentrated on sites at the mouth of Pine Canyon. The article does not contain much useful information, as the only detailed descriptions are of the excavated sites.

Katz and Katz describe the prehistoric resources located an interdisciplinary survey of portions of the Salt Basin and the Guadalupe Mountains high country. Most of this information seems to be well summarized in the authors' later work.


This article consists of an excellent overview of previous research in Guadalupe Mountains National Park, the physical environment in the park, and typical sites found in the area.

Kegley, George


This paper concentrates primarily on the excavation of Hueco Tanks Village (41EP2) and, although it does include a rather confusing area overview, Kegley (1980) is generally more helpful.
A more detailed version of Kegley (1979), this report provides an in-depth (though rather confusing) description of the various cultural phases.

Kirkland, F. and W.W. Newcomb, Jr.

Although this book contains no information about pictographs of the Guadalupe Mountains region, it has a rather lengthy description, based strictly on morphology, of the Hueco Tanks paintings. Almost all of the paintings are illustrated, so this book may be useful in comparing paintings with those of other regions.

Laitner, Bill

This oral history interview rambles considerably, dealing with the history of European settlers in the Guadalupes. Glover mentions salt collection for cattle at Salt Flats.

Landers, Clara

Discusses the life of Noel Kincaid, who lived for many years in Dog Canyon.
Leslie, Robert H.


Leslie provides an extensive background of the research done regarding the Jornada Mogollon slightly east of Guadalupe Mountains National Park, including a good summary of the cultural chronology. Leslie proposes an extension of the Jornada Mogollon further to the east than it had been before (to include the SE corner of New Mexico from the Pecos River eastward; i.e., from the eastern edge of the Carlsbad/ Guadalupe area to the eastern NM border).

Lynn, Warren M.

1976 Archeological Testing at the Northeast Sewage Treatment Plant, El Paso County, Texas. Austin, TX: Texas Historical Commission.

This short report provides a general description of the archaeological history of the El Paso region, but contains little to no details other than those referring to the sites discussed. The sites are generally not significant.

Marshall, Michael P.


A loosely written narrative, this article discusses the trail used by the Spanish while heading north through New Mexico. It includes one mention of the location of the Piro, Perillo Apache, and Xila.
Martin, Thomas J.

Although this article does not appear immediately applicable to this project, it provides a thorough description of the mineral and rock resources of the region, including the degree to which each was utilized.

McKittrick, James E., et al.
n.d. "Correspondence and Notes on the Naming of McKittrick Canyon." Folder on file at Guadalupe Mountains National Park.

A folder covering almost 30 years of correspondence about the origin of the McKittrick places names at Guadalupe. Not very helpful.

Melcher, Howard

A dramatic description of the Dance of the Mountain Gods, this article adds nothing to the project.

Messenger, Phyllis Mauch, ed.

Deals mostly with the collection and trafficking of art (especially MesoAmerican) internationally.
Minter, Alan H.
1969 "The Tigua Indians of the Pueblo de Ysleta del Sur, El Paso County, Texas." West Texas Historical Association Year Book XLV, pp. 30-44.

This article places state and federal responsibilities (and pertinent laws) to the Tigua in a historical context. An excellent summary of the state of Texas' attitude towards Indians in general and the Tigua specifically.

Mooney, James

This article recounts the Jicarilla Apache genesis story of the creation of the earth and the birth of Naye-nayesxu ni, the son of the Sun and White-bead Woman. His many exploits in killing monsters and saving both his people and the Pueblo people is described.

National Park Service, Southwest Regional Office.

This section focuses on plans for an intensive survey of the total park, which would include site specific dates as well as plans for site data recovery. The data expected to be gathered by this project would help gain a better prehistoric perspective.


Although this document does offer a brief background on the Mimbres culture and its relation to the Casas Grandes culture, it does not seem pertinent for this study.
Naylor, Thomas H.

Dispels contention of Forbes and Opler that the Suma were Athapaskan (Apache).

Nelson, Jean Ware

Using both these studies and the myths and tales of the Jicarilla, this work pieces together their history and the areas of their traditional occupation. Their interwoven associations with the other Plains cultures, the Athapaskans, and the Puebloan cultures are examined, as is the Spanish opinion of the Apache. Kinship practices, agriculture, hunting, and linguistic practices are examined. Only use is for comparative purposes with other Apache groups.

Newcomb, W.W.


Although they seem rather outdated, this book and article do discuss the Jumanos at length.
Opler, Morris Edward


This volume contains over one hundred myths and tales covering topics such as the creation and emergence of the Jicarillas, the origin of the Hactcin ceremony, stories about rain and agriculture, the origin of games and artifacts, and the hunting ritual.


This is one of two volumes by the author that describe aboriginal Jicarilla culture.


Classic ethnography of the Apache from the Dean of Apache ethnographers.


Comprehensive listed of Lipan and Mescalero "locations." Provided without context.


Excellent discussion of Apache ethnography and archaeology.

Good overview of literature pertaining to Mescalero ethnography and good starting point for research.

Parsons, E.C.

A classic discussion of all aspects of Pueblo religious beliefs.

Phillips, John
1931 "History of Ysleta, Texas," August, [typed unpublished manuscript; secured copy from Grace Long; photocopy in: American History Center, Austin, Texas].

Brief history of Ysleta with some interesting Tigua narratives.

Prescott and Webb, ed.

Information about Kiowa and Kiowa-Apache Indians. there is also information on Indian Creek Texas, and Indian relations during the colonial period, Indian relations with the Republic of Texas, and Indian relations after statehood.

Prichard, Nancy
1991 "Hueco Tanks--Did the plan work?" Rock and Ice, vol. 43, pp. 8-10.

Suggests that others worried about access look at Hueco Tanks as an example.
Ray, Verne F.

Excellent listing of Apache locations in Texas with annotation. Good source along with Opler (1970) for analysis of movements and homelands.

Richardson, Rupert N.

Discusses Comanches origins the area between the Yellowstone and Platte Rivers, movement into the southern plains and contact/conflict with the Apaches.

Sando, Joe S.

Splendid discussion of puebloan beliefs and adaptations. Note his discussion of salt pilgrimages, buffalo hunts, and extensive land use by pueblo Indians.

Schaafsma, Polly
1975 Rock Art in New Mexico. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press.

This book has a lengthy section on the chronology of rock art styles in New Mexico, including the Jornada Style sites of Painted Grotto and Last Chance Canyon. Some historic Guadalupe Mountains sites are also discussed.
1980 Indian Rock Art of the Southwest. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico.

Native American petroglyphs and pictographs dating from 2,000 B.C. to the beginning of this century are examined in this volume. Included are rock art examples from the southwestern United States and northern Mexico. The author identifies regional styles and attempts to interpret the meanings of the designs from various sites as well as the function of rock art in the lives of the peoples who created it. The book contains many illustrations in color and black and white, and a number of maps and diagrammatic charts are also included.

Schaafsma, Polly and Curtis F. Schaafsma

In this article, the authors discuss the origin of the Kachina cult through an analysis of the distribution of various designs in different styles of rock art. They find that the archaeologically-derived history of the cult differs from the ethnographic record.

Schroeder, Albert H.

Detailed historical discussion of Apache relationships with other groups. Very little here of sound ethnographic nature.
Unpublished report submitted to the U.S. Department of Justice, Santa Fe.

Detailed largely historical discussion of the Mescalero. Some ethnographic material.


Good source for information on Saline Pueblos and group identity issues.

Schroeder, Albert H. and Dan S. Matson

This is a translation of de Sosa's journal of his journey up the Rio Grande River in 1590-1591. The purpose of the expedition was to establish a colony in what is now New Mexico. The book contains an extensive description of the Puebloan cultures, especially that at Pecos. It is unique in that it contains the only contemporary account of the southern pueblos.

Seymour, Deni J.

Interesting and provocative discussion the "on the lam" theory of Apache movements and resulting inconspicuousness of Apache sites.
Shafer, Harry J.
1986 *Ancient Texans: Rock Art and Lifeways Along the Lower Pecos.*
San Antonio: Texas Monthly Press.

Shafer's book, designed for a general audience, contains many beautiful pictures of lower Pecos River area rock paintings, as well as a general archaeological description of the region. Unfortunately, much of the book is either speculative, fictionalized, or not properly cited.

Smith, Ruth D.

Smith describes the process of collecting and roasting mescal heads, but does not provide any specific locations in which this was done.

Spicer, Edward H.

Examines the impact of Spain, Mexico and the United States on the Indians of the Southwest during the period 1533 to 1960 A.D. Excellent source.

Stickney, Teddy.

This short article covers the history of several groups, including the Jumano, briefly and unsatisfactorily.
Stoffle, R.W., et al.

This article describes the process of ranking plants numerically in order to determine their significance. The authors then add that the method may be of little use unless it corresponds to real differential use of the resources, seemingly implying that their method does not really show anything of value to a researcher.

Stoffle, R.W. and M. J. Evans

Stoffle and Evans discuss American Indian responses to projects involving development of traditional lands, defining two categories of responses: holistic conservation and cultural triage. The authors outline goals and tasks of cultural resource study that would allow Native Americans the most input into development projects.

Stoffle, R.W., et al.

An attempt to sort out American Indian Religious Freedom Act's influence on social impact assessments, this early paper provides a rough methodology for working with Native Americans. The key points in this article are expanded upon in Stoffle and Evans' 1990 work.
Near the meeting of the Devil's, Pecos, and Rio Grande Rivers is one of the largest concentrations of Indian pictographs in North America. There are over 350 sites.

Outlines the regulations requiring Texas Conservation Passports for park admission and the use of the backcountry permit.

A description of the Mescalero puberty ceremony and the Mountain Gods ceremony.

This description of various Apache skirmishes and battles with the Spanish does not shed any light on specific locations of the Mescalero.

The author has gathered together Spanish documents that relate to the history of eastern New Mexico to 1778. Many of them relate information about the relations of the Plains Indians with both the Spanish and the Puebloan peoples. The historical introduction to this volume provides a good background for the documents that follow.


The text examines the territory of the Jicarilla Apache during the time of Spanish control of the American southwest.

Tiller, Veronica E. Velarde


A main theme of the book is to explain how the Federal government's policies created a guardian-dependency relationship in relations between the Apaches and their overseers.
Toness, Kay S. and M. Hill

Although this article deals solely with a now well-known set of paintings from Hueco Tanks, it includes a figure of the masks of Hueco Tanks as compiled from Kirkland and Newcomb. This figure may be helpful in comparing paintings at Hueco with other areas.

Turpin, Solveig A.

This short article discusses the more recent rock paintings of the lower Pecos River area, speculating in a general manner.

United States Indian Claims Commission

These volumes contain the hearing transcripts of the Indian Claims Commission in a suit brought against the United States by the Kiowa, Commanche and Apache tribes, Docket 32. There is also a brief chapter on the historical and population information for the claimant tribes.
Van Roekel, Gertrude B.

This book is primarily concerned with the story of the Jicarilla Apache tribe after they were moved to the reservation in Dulce, New Mexico. Of little use except for comparative purposes.

Walters, Evelyn and Rose Mary Rogers
1975 "Notes on Presence of Indians of Historic Period in Pecos County and Iraan, Texas Area," In Transactions of the Tenth Regional Archeological Symposium for Southeastern New Mexico and Western Texas. South Plains Archeological Society, pp. 89-100.

This article has non-specific information about several Indian groups (especially the Jumanos) but simply confirms information from Dunn (1911) and Bolton (1911) without adding much new knowledge.

Warren, Colquitt

This oral history interview is not very informative for project purposes, but Hughes does mention collecting salt from Crow Flat for cattle.

Warren, Karen J.

Includes a listing of sorts of rationales/arguments concerning ownership of cultural property.
Wells, Michael, and Katrina Brandon  

Discusses the involvement of local peoples from a pragmatic, business-oriented perspective. Includes a list (helpful) of the five forms of participation.

Whalen, Michael E.  
1977 "Settlement Patterns of the Eastern Hueco Bolson."  
*Anthropological Paper*, no. 4, University of Texas at El Paso.

Whalen provides an in-depth look at the El Paso and Mesilla Phases in the Hueco Bolson. He also includes a good (although biased?) summary of the location of various Native American groups at different time periods.

Wheat, Joe Ben  

Although this paper covers the current (1955) state of Mogollon research, including the influences of Hohokam, Anasazi, and Mogollon on each other, it almost completely ignores the Jornada Branch, beyond acknowledging its existence.

White, Douglas A.  
1987 *Environment, Communication, and Recreational Conflicts.*  
Master's thesis, University of Texas at Austin.

Vast majority deals with bolting ethics w/in climbing community to the minutest detail, although he does mention that differing perspectives on conflict create communication difficulties between the groups involved--rather ironic, as the only groups that he considers are recreation managers and recreational users.
Wimberley, Mark

Despite his rather odd title, Wimberley provides a good, very broad archaeological background to what he terms the Mogollon area, without getting overly hung-up about the various terms and specific dates associated with cultural chronologies.

Wiseman, Regge N. and Patrick H. Beckett

A series of comments by the organizers of the Jornada Conference, this provides a concise summary of past research on the area, as well as pointing out questions that were raised in the course of the conference.

Wright, Bill

Coffee table book with excellent photos and good overview of Tigua history.
APPENDIX A: PROJECT ACTIVITIES AND SCOPE OF WORK

CONTENTS:

1. DISCUSSION OF PROJECT ACTIVITIES
2. STATEMENT FROM TIGUA TRIBE
3. MEMORANDA ON CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK GENERAL MANAGEMENT PLAN
4. PROJECT SCOPE OF WORK
The ethnographic assessment began in November 1992 with a preliminary literature search and review. In addition, Dr. George Esber, Southwest Regional Ethnographer and C.O.T.R. for the project until July 1993, was contacted to discuss parameters of the project along with a research protocol. Dr. Morris Opler, Professor Emeritus, University of Oklahoma was contacted also to discuss existing ethnographic materials on the Apache. Dr. Opler is well known for his work with the Apache and has published substantially in the area. Dr. Esber suggested that I also contact Mr. Tom Diamond, lawyer for the Tigua Tribe of Ysleta del Sur Pueblo in El Paso and an individual knowledgeable about the history of human activities in the Guadalupe Mountains, to discuss the project and ascertain what published materials he had in hand. A meeting date was set for a consultation with Mr. Diamond in January, 1993. Dr. Esber also was able to arrange a meeting with the staff of Carlsbad Caverns National Park in January, 1993. On Monday, January 4, I met with Mr. Diamond in his El Paso office. He alerted me to the fact that he had archived on microfilm some 20,000 plus pages of documentation on Apache and Tigua Indian prehistory, history, and ethnography. He said the archives would be made available to me upon request. On January 8, 1993, Dr. Esber and I met with the park staff to discuss the scope of work, and introduce ourselves to the staff. Questions, concerns, and comments were voiced by the park staff during the meeting. It was noted that the Mescalero Tribe has had a long-term presence in the area and that the park contained many specific sites of probable significance to the tribe. It was at the January 7 with the staff of Guadalupe Mountains National Park that we were alerted to the fact that the Tigua Tribe has had a fairly continuous involvement with the Guadalupe salt flats and surrounding area. This information suggested that contact be made with the Tigua Tribe as per the scope of work. Shortly thereafter, I contacted Mr. Diamond and informed him that it was the park service’s understanding that the Tigua had been collecting salt in the area, perhaps using other resources, and may be interested in the project. He said that he would set up a meeting with the Tigua Tribal Council for me to present them with the scope of work and discuss their potential participation in the ethnographic assessment.
On March 8, 1993, I met with Ysleta Governor Julian Granillo, Lieutenant Governor Manny Silvas, and War Captain, Marty Silvas and Tom Diamond to discuss the project, including ethical concerns, the role of cultural consultants, and an on-site visitation. That meeting was productive and the Tigua approved my proceeding with the interviewing, but they would take my request for a Tigua on-site visit before the Tribal council. I visited a Tigua sacred site at Hueco Tanks State Park accompanied by a former governor, Miguel Pedraza. Later that week I met with Superintendent Deckert. I reviewed NPS records on archaeological sites found in the Park. I also contacted Mark Rosacker of Living Desert State Park to discuss Mescalero association with the area, particularly their involvement with Living Desert.

The regional office assumed the lead in contacting the Mescalero regarding the project as the National Park Service was seeking to contact the tribe about other projects. Phone calls were made and letters sent to the Mescalero Tribal President, Wendell Chino. Subsequently, Mr. Fred Peso, Vice-President of the Mescalero Tribe, was identified by President Chino’s office as the Mescalero contact. Responsibility for contacting the Mescalero was then turned over to me. Further correspondence via phone calls to Mr. Peso’s office throughout remainder of 1993 failed to establish a meeting time.

From mid May through June 1993, I was on-site at Guadalupe Mountains National Park. I investigated numerous archaeological and historic sites in Carlsbad Caverns National Park and met with park staff and local residents from the surrounding area. In addition, I videotaped selected aspects of the parks including the collections. This videotape footage was to be used to aid my contact with Ysleta del Sur.

On June 1, I accompanied Mr. Rosacker and several members of the Mescalero Tribe to a Parsons Ranch to collect mescal for the Mescal Roast at Living Desert. At that time, I was able to speak to some of the Mescalero, but purely in an unofficial capacity and none of the information revealed at that time is contained in this report. From June 4 through June 16, I met with all 8 Tigua tribal council members and 11 additional elders. Where feasible the videotape footage was shown and commentary invited. In addition, interviews were done with several tribal elders.
The Tigua Tribal Council met in closed session on June 8 to discuss an on-site consultation at Carlsbad Caverns and Guadalupe Mountains National Parks. Shortly thereafter, I was notified by the Lieutenant Governor that the council had agreed through a resolution to further consultation at the parks. All eight councilors planned to attend, but only 5 were able to make the June 17-18 trip. The Tigua indicated their desire to visit a selected pictograph site. It should be noted here that this trip also involved a Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act consultation which is detailed in my professional services report to the National Park Service dated 22 June, 1993. On June 17, the Tigua representatives, this contractor, Superintendent Deckert and two rangers made a trip on horseback to a pictograph site. On June 18, a meeting was held with the staff of Carlsbad Caverns National Park. A post-trip focused group involving the contractor and the Tigua was held in order to record their comments on the visit.

On January 3, 1994, I made a courtesy visit to Superintendent Deckert to provide him with an update on the project. I informed him that the efforts to establish official contact with the Mescalero Tribe were on-going. I also noted that the production of a video letter earmarked for the Mescalero was being considered as yet another venue to establish contact.

On January 3, 1994, I met with Mr. Diamond in El Paso to pick up additional microfilmed archives on the Tigua and Mescalero. Later that same day, I met with various, newly elected Tigua council members at Ysleta del Sur Pueblo. An update on the project was provided to them.

After the planned June 1993 meeting with Mr. Peso, the designated Mescalero contact was postponed and subsequent phone calls were unproductive, I decided that I would travel to Mescalero to see if I could get things moving. This was discussed with Mr. Natay beforehand as well as the possibility of producing a video letter on the project and affected parks for the Mescalero. I met with Mr. Chino’s administrative assistant, and she referred me to Ms. Evelyn Lathan, Director of the Mescalero Cultural Center. I subsequently met with Ms. Lathan and discussed the scope of work at length. She was favorably disposed towards the project and saw many benefits to Mescalero participation. I left a scope of work with her with the understanding that she would take it to Mr. Peso who, incidentally, happened to be President of the Mescalero Museum Association.

On January 6, I met with Mr. Natay at the regional office in Santa Fe to apprise him
of my activities at Mescalero. At that time, it was agreed that a videoletter should be produced and sent to the Mescalero Tribe. On February 10, I finally was successful in reaching Mr. Peso by phone. He suggested that I send him a scope of work with an accompanying letter discussing the logistics of the project which I did. A meeting date was also established.

Mr. Natay and I met with Mr. Peso on March 15 at Mescalero, New Mexico. The scope of work for the project was described by Mr. Natay and myself along with some discussion of repatriation issues. Mr. Peso was amenable to the presentation and felt it desirable that the Mescalero participate. However, before the project could be considered by the tribal council, the scope of the project along with its implications for the tribe would have to be discussed in the tribe’s Cultural Affairs and Museum Committees. We were told that Mr. Burl Kanseya, Chair of the Cultural Affairs Committee, would be in contact with me and that I should not try contacting him.

In June, I sent the videoletter to the Mescalero Tribe. Having not been contacted by Mr. Kanseya, I requested and was granted a years extension on the project. The rest of 1994 was devoted to collecting new information on the Tigua’s historic involvement with the Guadalupe Mountains. I sent another researcher to Austin and San Antonio to review documentation and produce a report on his findings. Discussions with Mr. Natay in January of 1995 led to the decision that the project be concluded.
MEMORANDUM

TO: Dr. Adolph Greenberg

FROM: Elias Torrez, Tribal Governor

DATE: September 4, 1996

RE: Tigua Tribal Participation in NPS Projects

The Tigua Tribe of Ysleta del Sur Pueblo reaffirms its 1993 decision to participate in the U.S. National Park Service Ethnographic Assessment and Overview of Carlsbad Caverns and Guadalupe Mountains National Parks. The Tribe will continue to work with Dr. Adolph Greenberg, the ethnographic contractor, until the projects are completed.
Dear Mr. Peso:

I am writing to you now because we have not yet been able to schedule our planned meeting, and because I will be taking a temporary leave, which puts off a possible meeting time even further.

In a previous letter, I explained briefly, the nature of the new Applied Ethnography Program in the Southwest Regional Office of the National Park Service. We retain our commitment to the development of consultations with tribes who are interested in establishing such a relationship.

Currently, we have a contract with Adolph Greenberg to contact communities who may have an interest in advising us about their resource needs for Guadalupe Mountains National Park and Carlsbad Caverns National Park. We are aware of Mescalero resources in these parks and are asking Mr. Greenberg to contact you directly regarding your interest in advising and maintaining a consulting relationship with these two parks. This will include, but will not be limited to issues of repatriation.

If you have questions or concerns about this matter, you may contact Mr. Ed Natay, Chief, Office of American Indian Programs at (505) 988-6896.

Sincerely,

George Esber
Regional Ethnographer
Southwest Region

cc:
President Wendell Chino
Mr. Adolph Greenberg
Mr. Wendell Chino, President
Mescalero Apache Tribe
P.O. Box 158
Mescalero, New Mexico 88340

Dear President Chino:

On March 15, 1992, we received word from Mr. Burl Kanseah that, for the time being, the Mescalero Apache Tribe had decided not to participate in the National Park Service’s Warm Springs Special Resource Study. The Fort Sill Warm Springs Apache people did agree to work with a new Contractor, Ms. Susan Lobo, to provide information about the importance of the Warm Springs area to the descendants living in Oklahoma. We enclose a copy of her draft for your information and we will also send a copy to Mr. Burl Kanseah.

In another matter, we would like to meet with you sometime in the near future to explain a new program in the Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Region of the National Park Service. Through this program, we are seeking advice from traditionally associated peoples about how best to manage the resources in our parks. We would like to discuss with the Mescalero Apache Tribe, your interest in advising us in these matters.

The National Park units in New Mexico that might be of interest to the Mescalero Apache people include Carlsbad Caverns National Park, Pecos National Historical Park, and White Sands National Monument. Parks of likely interest to your people in Texas include Guadalupe Mountains National Park, Fort Davis National Historic Site, and possibly others.

We will contact you in the near future to determine your level of interest in discussing Mescalero concerns regarding the management of resources in these parks.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Ed Natay
Chief, Office of American Indian Programs, SWR

Enclosure
February 21, 1994

Mr. Fred Peso, Vice-President
Mescalero Apache Tribe
P.O. Box 227
Mescalero, NM 88340

Dear Vice-President Peso:

This is a follow-up to our February 10, 1994 phone conversation. I am under contract to the National Park Service to identify those communities that are traditionally associated with Carlsbad Caverns and Guadalupe Mountains National Parks. As noted in previous correspondence, the Park Service is aware of Mescalero resources in these parks. Consequently, I am trying to identify your interest in advising the park service regarding the management of the cultural and natural resources at Carlsbad and Guadalupe. In addition, the National Park Service is committed to establishing and maintaining a consulting relationship with the Mescalero so that resources in those parks are managed in a way that reflects Mescalero interests.

I have enclosed a copy of the scope of work for the project as well as some of the previous correspondence. If the Mescalero Tribe chooses to participate, the project will entail interviews with Mescalero consultants (consultants will be compensated at 15.00 an hour) and an on-site visit (all expenses covered by me) to the parks. I plan on being in Mescalero on Tuesday the 15th of March and perhaps we can meet at that time if it is suitable and convenient for you. Mr. Ed Natay, Chief, Office of American Indian Programs at the National Park Service’s regional office in Santa Fe would also like to attend. If you have questions or concerns about this matter, you may contact me at 513 523-6576 or 513 529-2628.

Sincerely,

Adolph M. Greenberg
Ethnographic Contractor
June 2, 1994

Dear President Chino:

We are contacting you to provide you with an update on the General Management Plan/Environmental Impact Statement for Carlsbad Caverns National Park.

To begin, a new team captain, Mary Riddle, has been assigned to complete the project. Allen Hagood, the previous team captain, has changed jobs. Mary is located at Petroglyph National Monument in Albuquerque.

The plan is now in a very rough draft stage and the team writing the document will be spending the next few months editing it, preparing maps, putting it through NPS review and finally printing it for public review. At this time it is scheduled to be released to the public in March, 1995.

This plan has identified new visitor and park facility locations, and developed alternative ways for park visitors to experience the park while at the same time protecting our cultural and natural resources. The plan also identifies a preferred alternative as well as two others. At this time the General Management Plan/Environmental Impact Statement is scheduled for release to the public in March 1995.

Before releasing this document we would like to meet with you to discuss the actions that have been proposed in the plan. We are requesting this meeting to ensure that the actions proposed will not negatively affect ethnographic resources that have cultural affinity to members of your tribe, and so that we can meet the intent of legislation, regulations and NPS policy addressing the need to consult with Native American Indian communities and groups potentially affected by federal actions.

If you are agreeable, we would like to schedule a meeting either the second or third week in July, or anytime during the month of August. Myself, Mary Riddle and Diane Rhodes (the Cultural Resource Specialist on the team) would be attending the meeting. We would be happy to meet with you either in Mescalero or at the park.

As you are aware, we have contracted with Adolph Greenberg to conduct an ethnographic survey with you. If appropriate and agreeable to you, he would like to attend the meeting as well to discuss the ethnographic survey work.
I can be reached at 505/785-2251 or you may write me at the above address. Mary Riddle can be reached at 505/766-8375, Petroglyph National Monument, 123 4th St. SW Room 101, Albuquerque, NM 87102. Please contact me with a date and time that we can meet. By copy of this letter we are also notifying the Cultural Preservation Committee for your tribe.

Sincerely,

Frank Deckert
Superintendent

cc: Berle Kanseah, Chairman, Cultural Affairs Committee
cc: Ed Natay, Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office, National Park Service

bcc: Adolph Greenberg, 13 Tamara Court Oxford, OH 45056
     Mary Riddle, PETR
Honorable Elias Torrez  
Pueblo de la Ysleta del Sur  
P.O. Box 17579  
Ysleta Station  
El Paso, Texas 79917  

Dear Governor Torrez:

We are writing to give you an update on the General Management Plan/Environmental Impact Statement for Carlsbad Caverns National Park.

Allen Hagood, the previous team captain for the project, has moved onto a new job. Mary Riddle has been assigned as the new team captain to finish the project. She is located at Petroglyph National Monument in Albuquerque.

The plan is now in a very rough draft stage and the team writing the document will be spending the next few months editing it, preparing maps, putting it through NPS review and finally printing it for public review.

This plan has identified new visitor and park facility locations, and developed alternative ways for park visitors to experience the park while at the same time protecting our cultural and natural resources. The plan also identifies a preferred alternative as well as two other alternatives. At this time the General Management Plan/Environmental Impact Statement is scheduled for release to the public in March 1995.

Although the alternatives have been developed and a preferred alternative identified, there is still an opportunity to make changes. The viewpoint of the Ysleta del Sur is needed to insure that this plan will address your concerns and that it will not negatively affect ethnographic resources that have cultural affinity to members of your tribe. It is also critical that you be a part of the decision making process in our planning effort for Carlsbad Caverns National Park.
If you are agreeable, we would like to meet with you either the second or third week in July, or anytime during the month of August. Myself, Mary Riddle and Diane Rhodes (the Cultural Resource Specialist on the team) would be attending the meeting. We would be happy to meet with you either in El Paso or at the park.

I can be reached at 505/785-2232 or you may write me at the above address. Mary Riddle can be reached at 505/766-8375, Petroglyph National Monument, 123 4th St. SW Room 101, Albuquerque, NM 87102. Please contact me with a date and time that we can meet.

Sincerely,

Frank Deckert
Superintendent

cc:
Ed Natay, Chief, Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office, National Park Service

bcc:
Adolph Greenberg, 13 Tamara Court, Oxford, OH 45056
Mary Riddle, PETR
Wendell Chino, President
Mescalero Apache Tribe
P. O. Box 176
Mescalero, New Mexico 88340

Dear President Chino:

We are writing to give you an update on the General Management Plan/Environmental Impact Statement for Carlsbad Caverns National Park.

To begin, a new team captain, Mary Riddle, has been assigned to complete the project. Allen Hagood, the previous team captain, has changed jobs. Mary is located at Petroglyph National Monument in Albuquerque.

The plan is now in a very rough draft stage and the team writing the document will be spending the next few months editing it, preparing maps, putting it through NPS review and finally printing it for public review.

This plan has identified new visitor and park facility locations, and developed alternative ways for park visitors to experience the park while at the same time protecting cultural and natural resources. The plan also identifies a preferred alternative as well as two other alternatives. At this time the General Management Plan/Environmental Impact Statement is scheduled for release to the public in March 1995.

Although the alternatives have been developed and a preferred alternative identified, there is still an opportunity to make changes. The viewpoint of the Mescalero Apache is needed to insure that this plan will address your concerns and that it will not negatively affect ethnographic resources that have cultural affinity to members of your tribe. It is also critical that you be a part of the decision making process in our planning effort for Carlsbad Caverns National Park.
If you are agreeable, we would like to meet with you either the second or third week in July, or anytime during the month of August. Myself, Mary Riddle and Diane Rhodes (the Cultural Resource Specialist on the team) would be attending the meeting. We would be happy to meet with you either in Mescalero or at the park.

I can be reached at 505/785-2232 or you may write me at the above address. Mary Riddle can be reached at 505/766-8375, Petroglyph National Monument, 123 4th St. SW Room 101, Albuquerque, NM 87102. Please contact me with a date and time that we can meet. By copy of this letter we are also notifying the Cultural Preservation Committee for your tribe.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Frank J. Deckert
Superintendent

cc:
Berle Kanseah, Chairperson, Cultural Preservation Committee
Ed Natay, Chief, Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office, National Park Service

bcc:
Adolph Greenberg, 13 Tamara Court, Oxford, OH 45056
Mary Riddle, PETR
Honorable Elias Torrez
119 S. Old Pueblo
P.O. Box 17579
El Paso, Texas 70917

Dear Governor Torrez:

Thank you for arranging the meeting with you and the Tigua Council on November 15. Also, Ed Natay and I would like to thank you for your hospitality, including the tour of the casino and gift shop after the meeting.

As I said at the meeting, if you have any other questions or comments about the draft General Management Plan alternatives for Carlsbad Caverns National Park, please give me a call anytime.

I believe we have made a good start in establishing a consultation relationship between the park and the Tigua. In the future, if we are considering any planning efforts or projects that might have an effect on ethnographic resources, we will notify your office and seek your input.

Enclosed, as you requested, are copies of some articles about Painted Grotto. Please let me know if you would like to visit the site.

Sincerely,

Frank J. Deckert
Superintendent

cc w/enc
Mary Riddle, DSC
Ed Natay

cc w/o enc
Dolph Greenberg
SCOPE OF WORK

ETHNOGRAPHIC OVERVIEW AND ASSESSMENT

CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK

INTRODUCTION

The National Park Service is committed to plan and implement programs that protect cultural and natural resources in an effective, culturally informed manner. This practice will respond to the concerns of contemporary peoples who have traditional associations with the cultural and natural resources of parks. The accomplishment of this goal requires the analysis of ethnographic information about contemporary peoples with traditional ties to specific parks.

Ethnographic information will help managers to evaluate requests for access to resources, to assess potential environmental impacts of park use on the natural and cultural resources and to recognize the impacts on traditional cultural systems of park use or non-use. Knowledge about the traditional forms and varieties of resource uses is essential to achieving this goal. It will help to assess potential impacts that traditional uses may have on the resources and the effects that park programs may have upon traditional subsistence activities, religious practices, and other features of contemporary systems. These data will help planners formulate development proposals and alternatives, and help managers understand native resource management regimes as well as to identify sacred geographic or landscape features that require special treatment. This study will provide information through the review of readily available sources and from ethnographic field research. These data will contribute to an Ethnographic Resources Inventory.

BACKGROUND

At one time, both Carlsbad Caverns National Park and Guadalupe Mountains National Park were under the same superintendency in the National Park Service. They are now two separate administrative units but MAY BE linked together for study because both parks are centrally situated in the traditional use area of the Mescalero Apaches who are the primary peoples to be contacted for the study. Proposals should address separately, work and costs for Carlsbad Caverns National Park with a SECOND OPTION TO BID for work and costs to include Guadalupe Mountains National Park. The second option is contingent upon the availability of FY 1993 funding. THE CONTRACTOR MUST AGREE TO COMPLETE BOTH OPTIONS SHOULD FUNDING BE AVAILABLE.

Carlsbad Cave National Monument was established in 1923 when, by Presidential Proclamation, 720 acres were set aside for the protection of a cave “of extraordinary proportions and of unusual beauty.” It became Carlsbad Caverns National Park in 1930 and was enlarged to approximately 10,000 acres, and was expanded again in 1939 to a total of about 40,000 acres. The boundaries were adjusted in 1963 to the area that defines the park today.

Among the many American Indian cultural resources contained in the park are midden rings, mescal pits, pictographs, and sacred sites. The dates of use begin with very early cultural materials associated with extinct fauna to sites used by contemporary Mescalero peoples.
GENERAL STATEMENT OF WORK

Study Objectives

The proposed Ethnographic Assessment focuses on the traditional relationships of contemporary ethnic communities to the resources of the Carlsbad Caverns National Park. This study will provide a description of the traditional relationships of the Mescalero Tribe of New Mexico, and of any other groups identified through the literature search. It will describe the historical basis for relationships between communities and resources on park lands, and an evaluation of the traditional cultural and natural resources of Carlsbad Caverns National Park that are used and valued. Resources that have legendary and ceremonial significance require special consideration.

Based on a thorough review of the ethnographic literature, relevant published and archival documents, ethnographic interviews and on-site visits as feasible, the Contractor shall identify the resource users among contemporary American Indian and other ethnic groups and the resource needs and uses that derive from traditional cultural patterns. Pertinent data gaps made apparent by this review will be specifically identified. The additional studies needed to fill those gaps shall be identified for possible future research.

Some of the specific concerns that should be addressed include the identification of natural and cultural areas of special significance, of traditional use areas, of locales containing sacred sites, species and objects, the locations of access trails and the definition of access needs for traditional, ceremonial or subsistence needs. Researchers should determine if there are times when areas of the parks may need to be closed to the public because of religious or ceremonial needs.

The Park Service seeks information about the degree and kind of involvement each community prefers to have with Park management. The Park Service wishes to be advised of views on the management and excavation of archaeological sites, site stabilization, protection, the management and curation of collections, interpretation, the display of objects and the photographing of resources. The Park Service also desires information about place names of special resources within the Carlsbad Caverns National Park, the appropriateness of using those names for public purposes, and views on possible special uses of the Parks by other peoples including touring visitors.

The peoples to be contacted include the Mescalero tribe and descendant communities of other traditional users identified through the literature search. Researchers should initiate contacts with Indian communities through tribal councils to obtain the participation of elders and community leaders. The Contractor is also encouraged to employ ethnic community members as part of the research team whenever possible.

DESCRIPTION OF WORK TO BE PERFORMED

1. Document Research

   a. The Contractor will review the legislation, cooperative agreements and other formal bases for relationships between contemporary ethnic groups and the resources of the Park.

   b. The Contractor will review published and readily available unpublished ethnographic documents to provide the most complete picture possible of traditionally associated contemporary ethnic group needs for resources in the Carlsbad Caverns National Park, the cultural values assigned to the full range of
park resources, and the traditional bases for use and ascription of value. Use of the resources for subsistence, legendary and religious purposes will be emphasized. Key literature that elucidates traditional world view in relation to the resources should be noted.

2. Ethnographic Field Research

a. Interviews with National Park Service personnel at the Carlsbad Caverns National Park, other researchers most recently working in the region, and in the Southwest Regional Office to supplement data from documentary research regarding relationships between the park and concerned ethnic groups.

b. Contacts will be made with the ethnic communities that may have an interest in the resources of the Carlsbad Caverns National Park. Ethnographic interviews will be conducted with key consultants from the Mescalero Reservation and with other traditionally associated communities identified through the literature search. On-site visits will be arranged in conjunction with interviews when it is necessary to locate areas of significance and to elaborate on the data base developed in the documentary research.

c. For ethnic communities having an interest in the resources of the Carlsbad Caverns National Parks, information should be collected relative to their desires for maintaining a consultation relationship with the Carlsbad Caverns National Parks and the nature of the relationship they wish to maintain. Specific information that can will facilitate a consultation process is desired.

PRODUCTS REQUIRED

A comprehensive report on the results of this study is required. It shall include:

1. An introductory discussion and description of the study issues.

2. A non-technical summary of the report (following the introduction not to exceed ten percent of the total number of pages). It should be written in a style that is readable by park personnel without training in anthropology and to ethnic groups who contribute information to the report.

3. A narrative that includes, but is not limited to, a description of relationships between contemporary Mescaleros and any other ethnic groups, and the resources of the Carlsbad Caverns National Park, the general locale and type of resources that contemporary people value and use, the kinds of uses, the basis for the relationships, and traditional bases for the uses and values.

4. A discussion and description of existing and potential management issues as seen from both the Park Service and concerned ethnic communities, together with recommendations for management approaches to active ethnographic issues. Descriptions of desired consultation processes should be included.

5. A concluding discussion which evaluates the study findings, the methodology, and the adequacy of the existing data base; the discussion should include recommendations for further study.

6. An annotated ethnographic bibliography of the major published and readily accessible unpublished sources that bear upon relationships between the resources of the Carlsbad Caverns National Park and associated ethnic communities. The most current ethnographic and related materials will be included.
7. An Appendix for each of the following:

a. A listing of places and resources that require special treatment, along with a map (scale 1:24000) showing specific locations for non-sensitive areas but only general locations for sensitive areas where confidentiality is a concern to ethnic communities. The Park Service will provide the maps.

b. A discussion of the methodologies used and the findings from the research and analytic stages. This shall also include:

1) A list of the criteria used to select individual participants

2) Ethnographic interview guides

3) A list of names and addresses of all persons consulted. The list should include a brief description of the consultant's community roles, e.g. former council member, religious elder, etc. ONLY THE NAMES AND ADDRESSES OF CONSULTANTS WHO CONSENT TO BEING INDIVIDUALLY IDENTIFIED SHOULD BE INCLUDED. OTHERWISE, THEIR IDENTITY SHALL BE GIVEN BY A CODE NAME WITH THE LIST OF CODE NAMES TO BE RETAINED BY THE CONTRACTOR AND HELD IN CONFIDENCE.

4) Data on the total number of interviewees and the approximate number of hours or days spent in personal contact with consultants

5) Brief summaries of the interviews and consultations (these may be in field-note form)

6) List of Tribal individuals who are knowledgeable of local cultural systems, and who have an interest in being considered for future consultations by the management of each Carlsbad Caverns National Park.

7) A list of resources that should be considered for nomination to the National Register of Historic Places as ethnographic resources with traditional value. Community agreement should be reached, or arrangements should be made for obtaining agreement (pursuant to National Register Bulletin 38, Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Traditional Cultural Properties) about submitting nominations to the National Register.

The study shall conform to standard scholarly and National Park Service standards regarding ethnographic research and writing and should be in the format of the American Anthropologist.

REPORTS AND TIME FRAMES

Starting from the date that a contract is executed, the following tasks must be completed according to the times indicated.

1. Research Design and Budget (Time allotted = 1 month)

Within 30 days of the contract award, the Contractor shall provide the Key National Park Service
officials with a draft of the research design. Included with the draft research design shall be a rough cost breakdown. Research must begin at the end of this month.

2. Library and Field Research (Time allotted = 2 1/2 months).

Within 105 days of the contract award, research for this project shall be completed. During this time period, the contractor will engage in library and archival research, meetings with park staff, and on-site visits and ethnographic interviews with associated ethnic communities. Brief monthly progress reports (1-2 pages) summarizing activities and findings will be submitted to the Park Service during this phase of the project.

3. Data analysis and report writing (Time allocated = 1 1/2 months).

Within 150 days of the contract award, the analysis of information recovered and a draft report will be completed. At the end of this period, the Contractor shall provide 10 copies of the draft report to the Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office, for review and comment. The Contractor shall also provide the Service with a mailing list of three external persons qualified to review the draft. The Park Service will distribute copies for review to include: key Indian group representatives; the key Park Service Officials, the Senior Anthropologist in the National Park Service, Washington Office; the park Superintendents, and others deemed necessary by the National Park Service. The distribution of this report will be restricted and under the control of the Ethnographer, Office of American Indian Program, National Park Service.

4. Review period (Time allocated = 1 month).

Within 180 days of the contract award, the Park Service will return review comments.

During this month, the National Park Service shall review and provide comments on the draft report. At the end of this review period, comments will be given to the Contractor for preparation of the final report.

5. Preparation of the final report (Time allotted = 1 month).

Within 210 days of the contract award, the final report project must be completed. Following receipt of comments on the draft report, the Contractor shall prepare the final report. All comments and recommendations for modification that are submitted by the reviewers must be incorporated in the final report or must be otherwise addressed.

At the end of this month, thirty-hard copies of the final report must be delivered to the National Park Service, Southwest Region, Office of American Indian Programs.

OTHER REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

Any portions of the report that require confidential treatment should be presented in a separate supplement that will receive restricted review and distribution in accord with agreements of confidentiality.
The final report should be written in non-technical language suitable for NPS planning, interpretation, and resource management programs. It shall be completed on an IBM compatible computer, on Word Perfect 5.1 software. A floppy disk with the final report file shall be submitted along with hard copies of the final report and shall be the sole property of the NPS.

A completed National Technical Information Service (NTIS) report documentation form—Optional Form 272, available from the NPS—shall be submitted with the final report. Religious and sensitive material shall not be revealed in the NTIS report. Three copies of this report shall be delivered to the Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office, one copy of which shall be unbound and contain the original prints of any photographs used as illustrations. This report shall meet the same standards as required in the draft report.

Photographs and maps shall be labelled and logged. Photographic prints shall be mounted and negatives shall be placed in curation quality sleeves. All documents, maps, photographs, audio and video tapes, and other project documentation, including interview transcriptions and questionnaires, shall be provided to the Park Service.

PAYMENT SCHEDULE

A contract will be awarded as a Firm Fixed Price. The Contractor shall submit itemized invoices with progress payments not to exceed one-third the total authorized amount with payments being made according to the following schedule:

- **Payment 1** One-third to be paid 30 days after execution of the contract and upon receipt of the accepted research design;
- **Payment 2** One-third to be paid upon submission and acceptance of the draft report;
- **Payment 3** Final payment to be made upon submission and acceptance of the final report and all deliverables.

AMERICAN INDIAN CONSIDERATIONS

1. The Contractor will establish and maintain communication with Indian communities involved with the study and discuss drafts of the interim and final reports with them.

2. Verbal interim and final presentations of findings in non-technical language will be made to the Tribes that contribute to the data base.

3. The Contractor may not use descriptions of the specific uses and locations of sacred resources in scientific publications or presentations, or otherwise make the information public in any way without explicit permission from the National Park Service and the affected tribe(s).

4. Original field notes will be retained by the researcher.

5. Only the names and addresses of consultants who wish to be identified will be used. Otherwise, the Contractor shall use code names and be responsible for keeping the code. The Contractor will describe the consultant’s role or position in community, being careful not to give information
regarding specific identity.

6. The Contractor will not include direct quotes from any American Indian in the narrative unless the identity of the Indian consultant is kept confidential and indicated only with a code name. Should an American Indian insist on being directly quoted, he or she must be told the potential effects of being identified, and be requested to sign a release form.

7. The Contractor will be familiar with NPS policies and guidelines on Ethnography and American Indians, all of which will be provided.

PERSONNEL STANDARDS

The Contractor shall be an applied cultural anthropologist with experience in applied ethnography and with a Ph.D or the equivalent as reflected in a publication and professional activity record. The record must demonstrate experience in the independent design and implementation of cultural anthropological field projects involving contemporary peoples; experience in applied anthropology and collaborative studies involving Native Americans; and the demonstrated ability to carry ethnographic research to completion as evidenced by timely completion of projects and reports, published papers, and conference presentations.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

National Park Service support for this project shall be acknowledged in any publications or presentations based on data accumulated during the study. Copies of publications and transcriptions of presentations based on the data shall be provided to the Southwest Regional Office, Chief, Office of American Indian Programs; the Washington Office (WASO), Senior Anthropologist, Division of Anthropology; and the affected tribes.

If the report is authored by someone other than the project Contractor, the cover and title page shall bear the inscription "Prepared Under the Supervision of (Name), Contractor". The title page of the report shall bear an appropriate inscription indicating the source of funds used to conduct the work and the project contract number.

SECOND OPTION TO BID

Pending availability of Fiscal Year 1993 funding, the project may be expanded to include Guadalupe Mountains National Park. This park involves the same literature search and same contacts as with peoples identified for Carlsbad Caverns National Park, but includes additional site visits. THE CONTRACTOR MUST AGREE TO COMPLETE BOTH OPTIONS SHOULD FUNDING BE AVAILABLE.

BACKGROUND: Guadalupe Mountains National Park

Guadalupe Mountains National Park is located in western Texas just south of the New Mexico border and a few miles from Carlsbad Caverns National Park, although the entrances of the two parks are 45 miles from one another. The park was authorized in 1966 to preserve an area of "outstanding geological values together with other natural values of great significance." In 1988, some 10,000 acres containing unusual dune formations were added to expand the park to almost 86,500 acres.
In another dimension, the Guadalupe Mountains are central in traditional Mescalero Apache territory where Indian communities lived until removed in the latter part of the nineteenth century. Numerous cultural sites including middens and midden rings have been identified through archaeological survey, many of which are mescal roasting pits. Local residents reported that Apaches lived at one site until 1911. Before the Mescaleros, other peoples left evidence of their presence, some of which dates as early as 11,000 years ago. The present day Mescalero Reservation is located in south central New Mexico, about 100 miles to the northwest of Carlsbad Caverns and Guadalupe Mountains National Parks.

STATEMENT OF WORK

The study objectives remain as described for Carlsbad Caverns National Park, but under this bidding option, must also include information germane to the cultural and natural resources of Guadalupe Mountains National Park.

TIME FRAMES (under Option 2)

1. Research Design and Budget (Time allotted = 1 month)

Within 30 days of the contract award, the Contractor shall provide the Key National Park Service officials with a draft of the research design. Included with the draft research design shall be a rough cost breakdown. Research must begin at the end of this month.

2. Library and Field Research (Time allotted = 6 months).

Within 210 days of the contract award, research for this project shall be completed. During this time period, the contractor will engage in library and archival research, meetings with park staff, and on-site visits and ethnographic interviews with associated ethnic communities. Brief monthly progress reports (1-2 pages) summarizing activities and findings will be submitted to the Park Service during this phase of the project.

3. Data analysis and report writing (Time allocated = 2 months).

Within 270 days of the contract award, the analysis of information recovered and a draft report will be completed. At the end of this period, the Contractor shall provide 10 copies of the draft report to the Office of American Indian Programs, Southwest Regional Office, for review and comment. The Contractor shall also provide the Service with a mailing list of three external persons qualified to review the draft. The Park Service will distribute copies for review to include: key Indian group representatives; the key Park Service Officials, the Senior Anthropologist in the National Park Service, Washington Office; the park Superintendents, and others deemed necessary by the National Park Service. The distribution of this report will be restricted and under the control of the Ethnographer, Office of American Indian Program, National Park Service.

4. Review period (Time allocated = 1 1/2 month).

Within 315 days of the contract award, the Park Service will return review comments.

During this month, the National Park Service shall review and provide comments on the draft
report. At the end of this review period, comments will be given to the Contractor for preparation of the final report.

5. Preparation of the final report (Time allotted = 1 month).

Within 345 days of the contract award, the final report project must be completed. Following receipt of comments on the draft report, the Contractor shall prepare the final report. All comments and recommendations for modification that are submitted by the reviewers must be incorporated in the final report or must be otherwise addressed.

At the end of this month, thirty hard copies of the final report must be delivered to the National Park Service, Southwest Region, Office of American Indian Programs.

CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION

The Contractor will be expected to participate in a pre-work conference on procedures, National Park Service policies and guidelines, and to discuss the project and Park Service expectations.

Contracting Officer’s Technical Representative for this contract:

George Esber, SWRO Ethnographer
Office of American Indian Programs
National Park Service
P.O. Box 728
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87504-0728

Tel: 505-988-6777
APPENDIX B: TIGUA PLANT LIST/ANNOTATED (SOURCE: GRAY 1995)

CONTENTS:

1. ANNOTATED PLANT LIST
2. PLANT FAMILIES
ASCLEPIAS: "Evidence suggests that agricultural crops such as corn and peaches played a dominant role and were supplemented by wild foods such as Opuntia, Chenopodium, and possibly Prosopis pubescens (screwbean). A lot of corn pieces and peach pits, pinon, pigweed, mesquite, cheno-ams, Cycloma, Asclepias, and charred Brassicaceae were found as well. "Overall, the artifact assemblage more closely resembles prehistoric Native American settlements in the area than later Mexican or historic Period settlements (Ysleta Clinic Site#, 22c)."

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area

ALAMO WOOD (Populus wislizenii): Also known as Valley Cottonwood or Aspen. Ceremonial tribal drums, or "tombe," were made out of this wood, probably Valley Cottonwood not Aspen (Populus tremuloides), which is also called "Alamo Wood," was used. Adela Granillo and Natividad Camargo, in a 1966 Houser interview, said that the tribal drum used at tribal dances that were held in Zaragosa at that time was made of "alamo wood," and had skins wrapped over the ends. According to Hewett (1945), it was common in Isleta del Norte to eat the catkins of P. wislizenii. In a deposition in dockett 22C, Pablo Carbajal states that the Tigua use "cottnonwood" for firewood. Sabina Fuentes is noted as having stated that the "tombe," or ceremonial drum of the Manso was made of alamo wood (Houser 1966).

- Grows in the Rio Grande Valley

ALBACAR (Ocimum basilicum): Also known as Basil. It is a medicinal and a seasoning. Margarita Carbajal, in a 1966 interview with N. P. Houser, said that "albaqur" is an herb used for medicine by the Tigua. In 1994 Basil was used as a seasoning in many of the St. Anthony's day Feast dishes in Ysleta del Sur.

- Ciudad Juarez

ALFALFA (Medicago sativa): Miguel Pedraza, in a land claim deposition, states that the Tigua at one time planted plant corn, beans, wheat, alfalfa, chilies (Dockett 22C).

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area
AMARANTH (*Amaranthus* spp.): Also known as Pigweed. "Evidence suggests that agricultural crops such as corn and peaches played a dominant role and were supplemented by wild foods such as *Opuntia*, *Chenopodium*, and possibly *Prosopis pubescens* (screwbean). A lot of corn pieces and peach pits, pinon, pigweed, mesquite, cheno-ams, *Cycloma*, *Asclepias*, and charred Brassicaceae were found as well. "Overall, the artifact assemblage more closely resembles prehistoric Native American settlements in the area than later Mexican or historic Period settlements (Ysleta Clinic Site#, 22c)."

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area

ANIS ESTRELLA (*Illicium* spp.): Also known as Star Anise. It is a medicinal that can be bought at most El Paso grocery stores or in Ciudad Juarez. It can also be grown. During the 1994 field season, at least three informants kept the dried herbal matter and capsules to make a tea with.

- Ciudad Juarez

ANISE (*Pimpinella anisum*): It is used in the "biscochos" for the St. Anthony's Day Feast at Ysleta del Sur, it is used as a flavoring agent in other traditional foods as well. It can be bought in the old market of Ciudad Juarez.

- Ciudad Juarez

APPLES (*Malus* spp.): According to *Margarita Carbajal*, "Oh, yes, they had many apple trees, grapes, peaches, pears, Manzanas de San Juan, Winter Apples, apricots, pears...", in August and October (Houser 1966). Fray Manuel de San Juan Nepomuceno y Trigo states in his journal, "This one, called la Isleta (Ysleta del Sur), is two leagues from the...mission of Zenecu. The Indians of this mission have their gardens adorned with beautiful grapevines, peach trees, apple trees, and good vegetables..." (Gerald 1974).

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area

APRICOTS (*Prunus* spp.): According to *Margarita Carbajal*, "Oh, yes, they (Tigua) had many apple trees, grapes, peaches, pears, Manzanas de San Juan, Winter Apples, apricots, pears...", in August and October (Houser 1966).

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area
AZAFRAN (*Carthamus tinctorius*): It is also known as Mexican Saffron. In 1994, one informant used the flowers as a spice in many of the St. Anthony’s Day feast dishes. Miguel Pedraza, in a deposition, (Dockett 22C) lists azafran as a medicinal for sunburn and for measles.

- Ciudad Juarez

BAMBOO (*Phragmites australis*): Also known as River Cane. **Pablo Carbajal**, in his 22C deposition, said that this plant was used to make “martas” for fishing. One 1994 informant said that “martas” are a kind of trap. **Jose Trinidad Granillo**, in his 22C deposition, said that he used “martas,” made out of “bamboo plants” to fish. A 1994 informant said that the vertical poles used to build Jacals (old adobe homes) were “bamboo.” **Margarita Carbajal**, in a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, said that “reeds” from the river were used for basket materials.

- Rio Grande River

BEANS (*Phaseolus* spp.): All informants ate beans, mainly store bought pintos, and there is a lot of literature (old documents, etc.) that mention beans being grown by the Tigua. **Miguel Pedraza** stated that the Tigua planted corn, beans, wheat, alfalfa, chilies (Dockett 22C). **Herminia Silvas**, in her Dockett 22C deposition, said that the Tigua fixed, for food, “Boiled rice and beans with squash, fried potatoes, and boiled.” In a deposition from Dockett 22C, **Ramona Paiz** stated, “They (the Tiguas) would plant and sow chili and beans,” for a living.

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area
- Wild plants may grow outside of the Grant Area

CALABAZAS (*Cucurbita* spp.): Also known as squash or zucchini. Cucurbits are eaten often, and were once grown by the Tigua. **Herminia Silvas**, in her Dockett 22C deposition, stated that the Tigua fixed, for food, “Boiled rice and beans with squash, fried potatoes, and boiled.” According to **Jose Trinidad Granillo** in a deposition in Dockett 22C, “We made pon and panados. They cooked roasting ears, yams, calvasas (calabazas), or squash, or pumpkin.” **Ramona Paiz**, in a Dockett 22C deposition, said that she used to cook in an outdoor oven, a “cosedor,” “We would cook sweet potatoes (one 1994 informant said that the color of these depended upon the soil that they were grown in), pumpkins, cook meat in there, and also bread.” These “outdoor ovens” are adobe, beehive-shaped structures, called hornos.
•Found in Grant Area

CHOLLA (Opuntia spp.): A food resource that is collected in the mountains (Greenberg 1994).

•mountains

CHUCHUPATE (Ligusticum porteri): In a 1966 taped interview with Nicholas P. Houser, Margarita Herrera Montoya stated, "Chuchupate is another one (medicinal). They used to cook it and boil it. It is for colds."

•Collecting site and growth range unknown

CORALILLO (Arctostaphylos uva-ursi): Also known as manzanita. Margarita Carbajal stated that "coralillo" is a Tigua herbal remedy, it is mixed with water (Houser 1966). Also according to Margarita Carbajal, "...when you become frightened, there was an herb named 'coral' and it was good when mixed with water (Houser 1966)."

•Growth range would extend into the mountains

CONTRA YERBA (Kallstroemia spp.): Margarita Carbajal stated that Contra Yerba is a Tigua medicinal (Houser 1966).

•mountains

CORN (Zea maiz): Jose Trinidad Granillo described "Tezvino," in Dockett 22C, as being a drink made out of corn. "It's a refreshing drink, they put sugar sometimes to sweeten it." Granillo also explained how it was made, "They made a seed bed and carried a toe sack or a sack or something over it, which they kept wet. And when the corn sprouted up, they would take this off and rake the corn out and use it to make Tezvino." Granillo also said that the ceremonial drum is fed with corn (meal or pollen?), and that "We made pon and panados. They cooked roasting ears, yams, calvasas (calavasas), or squash, or pumpkin." One 1994 informant said that "pulque" is really potent, and that pulque is a drink made out of corn that is fermented in a goat skin. But this may not be different from tsevino. Bloom (1938) saw blue corn in the homes of Tigua at Ysleta. Ramona Paiz, in Dockett 22C, said cornsilk was used for doll hair. One of the things used during prayer at Hueco Tanks are cigarettes. According to one informant, "Our people, when they roll cigarettes, they roll them with corn husk, and this is what it is" (Truhill interview). Another 1994 informant said that Tigua still get blue corn from the Hopis for
ceremonial purposes because they think it is better for ceremonial purposes than other corn. In 1994, "Indian corn" was described as being smaller than the sweet corn that can be bought in the grocery store, and it was said that some type of corn grows wild at Hueco Tanks. Miguel Pedraza stated that the Tigua planted corn, beans, wheat, alfalfa, chilies (Dockett 22C). In a 1966 interview Miguel and Guadalupe Padilla said that cornmeal was put into the mouths of dead deer and rabbits after a hunt, and that cornmeal is ceremonially offered to the four directions (Houser 1966). In another 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, Isidoro Ortega made this statement, "I grew my corn and that is where I got this interesting corn. This corn is called 'maize indio' or 'maize apache.' We didn't grow it any more for lack of water. I save this, I have saved this for 10 years. This corn is proper for tsevino." Margarita Carbajal stated, "They had big harvests and hoards of corn. It was very beautiful. They used to raise a lot of wheat, corn, pumpkins (Houser 1966)."

Margarita Carbajal also said that the Tigua ate a thin bread that was made from maize, and that the Tigua spread garlic on it before they ate it.

- Wild type grows at Hueco Tanks
- Found within the Tigua Grant Area

COTTON (Gossypium hirsutum); Found documentation saying "Piro and Tiguez" used to grow this (Carter 1945). I believe that this is a native variety to the southwest.

- Used to be found within the Tigua Grant Area

CYCLOMA: "Evidence suggests that agricultural crops such as corn and peaches played a dominant role and were supplemented by wild foods such as Opuntia, Chenopodium, and possibly Prosopis pubescens (screwbean). A lot of corn pieces and peach pits, pinon, pigweed, mesquite, cheno-ams, Cycloma, Asclepias, and charred Brassicaceae were found as well. "Overall, the artifact assemblage more closely resembles prehistoric Native American settlements in the area than later Mexican or historic Period settlements (Ysleta Clinic Site#, 22c)."

- Found within Tigua Grant Area

DULE (UNKNOWN): One 1994 informant said that wedding baskets are made from "dule, jara, or yucca." Yucca being the strongest basket material (personal communication).

- Collecting site and growth range unknown
ENSENDIERA (UNKNOWN): According to one 1994 informant, this is a plant used to treat stomach problems. 
• Collecting site and growing range unknown

ESCOBA DE LA VIBORA (Gutierrezia sarothrae): Also known as Snakeweed or Snakebroom. One 1994 informant said that it is a medicinal used for a cold or a fever, you serve it in the form of a tea. "It makes you sweat." In her deposition to Tom Diamond Ramona Paiz mentions that "rattlesnake weed" was used by the Tigua to bathe in. Trinidad Granillo (Dockett 22C) stated that it was good for rheumatism and for headaches. "Yerba la Vibora," according to Miguel Pedraza (Dockett 22C), is for coughs. 
• Hueco Tanks and sandhills

ESTA FIATE (Artemisia spp.): Also known as Wormwood. One 1994 informant said that it, "Smells like shit," and is a medicinal collected at Hueco Tanks. 
• Hueco Tanks

FATIMAS (UNKNOWN): Juanita Appodaca remembered baskets being made of "fatimas" in an interview (Houser 1966). 
• Collecting site and growth range unknown

FLORA MIMBRA (Chilopsis linearis): Also known as "Mimbre" or "Desert Willow." One 1994 informant described "Mimbre," "It has a purple flower and grows in the desert." It was a popular medicinal; if someone is congested, boil the flowers in water and make them drink the resulting tea. In a taped interview, Ramona Paiz stated, "mimbre" is used to treat bad colds. "The flower is cooked and you drink it. The flower is bloomed in the summer. It is dried, used as a medicinal, is found in arroyos. Mariano Colemenero used to get the plants. He knew more (Houser 1966)." According to Sabina Fuentes, in a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, varras, carried by the leaders of the dances, are made from sticks of mimbre wood from the Rio Grande. 
• Hueco Tanks and the Rio Grande River

FLOR SAUCO (Sambucus mexicana or racemosa): One 1994 informant said to boil the flowers of Flor Sauco to treat congestion. It is a shrub with umbels of small yellow flowers. Several of these trees grow in yards in Ysleta del Sur. "Flor de Salco,"
According to Jose Trinidad Granillo, is used to treat colds. "Sauco," says Miguel Pedraza (Dockett 22C), is for coughs. Several times something called "Salso" was mentioned, it seems to be another reference to "Sauco."

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area

GOURDS (*Cucurbita* spp.): At least 3 different Tigua categories for cucurbits is known. A wild one grows along the road to Hueco Tanks (*Cucurbita moschata?*) and can be used for a laundry detergent, a long handled type of gourd is known to be for water dippers, and another type of gourd is used to make ceremonial rattles. According to a 1966 interview with Miguel and Guadalupe Padilla, some kind of gourd spoon was used to smooth out pottery (Houser 1966). "Guajes" is a term used for gourds that can be used as water bottles or spoons and rattles made out of gourds are also called guajes. Jose Trinidad Granillo called ceremonial gourd rattles "guajes." Margarita Carbajal said that Isidora Piarote (who was 30 years of age in 1860 census) used a piece of clay to smooth coiled pottery pieces, and Pablo Silvas said the same thing about Nestora Piarote Granillo (age 11 in 1860 census) (Hedrick 1971).

- Hueco Tanks

GRAPEVINE (*Vitis vinifera*): Grapes were grown at the missions and wine was made for the missionaries from the fruit. According to Margarita Carbajal, "Oh, yes, they (the Tigua) had many apple trees, grapes, peaches, pears, Manzanas de San Juan, Winter Apples, apricots, pears...," in August and October (Houser 1966). Fray Manuel de San Juan Nepomuceno y Trigo states in his journal, "This one, called la Isleta, is two leagues from the....mission of Zenecu. The Indians of this mission have their gardens adorned with beautiful grapevines, peach trees, apple trees, and good vegetables..." (Gerald 1974).

- Found within Tigua Grant Area

HACKBERRY (*Celtis* spp.): This plant is sometimes referred to as "palo duro" in the literature. The berries are eaten in the Rio Grande Valley (Hewett 1945). Hackberries were collected from Sierra Alto (Greenberg 1994). Mountain Mahogany (*Cercocarpus montanus*), is also referred to as palo duro in the literature.

- Rio Grande Valley
- Sierra Alto, mountains
HARRA (*Salix* spp.): Also known as "willow" or "Jarita." *Herminia Silvas* said (in her Dockett 22C deposition) that the Tigua lived in houses made of "willow." *Jose Trinidad Granillo* said in his statement in Dockett 22C that the flower of the willow was used to ease a cough. *Ramona Paiz*, Dockett 22C, said the Tigua used willow from, "the river," for arrows. A 1994 informant stated, "Even to make our shading, in making our shading, on top of where we dance. On the dancing area, we use a certain thing we call harra in the Rio Grande (R. Truhill interview)." In a June 22, 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, *Margarita Carbajal* remembered women making baskets "de jarra." One 1994 informant stated that harra was a material used to make traditional wedding baskets (personal communication).

• *Rio Grande River*

HEDIONAILA (*Larrea tridentata*): Also known as Greasewood or Wame. *Herminia Silvas* stated in her deposition that firewood and greasewood were collected from the sandhills (Dockett 22C). Greasewood is repeatedly mentioned as a fuel wood but mesquite seems to be preferred. *Herminia Silvas* also stated that greasewood was used for rheumatism, "or for your feet." GUAMA: Was called greasewood, a fuel for the hornos, by *Jose Trinidad Granillo* (Dockett 22C). In an interview with Truhill (1992) one informant stated, "They used to get, what they call gupmi, greasewood branches. They used to place the branches in a dome and pack it with mud and clay. And after that they would burn the wood inside and that was their oven." One 1994 informant said that he knew of old people who stuffed greasewood into rabbits because it acts like a preservative and a tenderizer (personal communication). He said that the meat, "wouldn't turn white" and that the rabbits hung in a row for "weeks" without spoiling. One 1994 informant kept bunches of the stuff hanging in their home, to ward off bad spirits and because it smelled good. In a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, *Margarita Herrera Montoya* states, "La Hediondilla is another one (medicinal plant). My father used to bathe in it for rheumatism. He would cook it and when the water was real hot he would take a bath in it."

• *Sandhills*

HEGANDIZA (UNKNOWN): According to one 1994 informant this is a plant used for "medicine."

• Collecting site and growth range unknown
JALAPENOS (Capsicum spp.): According to one informant, you can crush jalapenos and spread them on the back to treat someone who is suffering from hemroides.
• Found within Tigua Grant Area

LECHUGUILA (Agave lechuguilla): Margarita Carbajal said that Isidora Piarote painted unfired pottery pieces with brushes made from "pounding lechuguilla leaves and removing the ribbons" (1971 Hedrick).
• Sandhills and mountains

LEMO (Cymbopogon citratus): Also known as Te de Limon or Lemon Grass. In 1994 one informant had some of what they called "lemo" hanging, dried, in their carport. They said that it blooms in early September.
• Found in Tigua Grant Area

MANZANAS DE SAN JUAN (UNKNOWN): According to Margarita Carbajal, "Oh, yes, they had many apple trees, grapes, peaches, pears, Manzanas de San Juan, Winter Apples, apricots, pears...," in August and October (Houser 1966).
• Found within Tigua Grant Area

MANZANILLA (Matricaria spp.): Also known as chamomile. One 1994 informant said that it "grows in the mountains" and is often drunk in tea. "Chamamillo," peppermint and mint, are often brewed together in a tea to treat cramps (personal observation 1994). "Manseumilla" was said by Herminia Silvas to be used to relieve babies with stomach trouble.
• Mountains

MASTRANSO (Mentha rotundifolia): Also known as Apple Mint. Margarita Carbajal mentions "mastranza" as being used as a Tigua herbal remedy (Houser 1966).
• Collecting site and growth range unknown

MESCAL (Agave spp.): Juanita Appodaca, in a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, said that her father used to cook mescal while he was away on hunting trips. Sotol and Mescal hearts were collected in the mountains and roasted as a food (Greenberg 1994).
• Mountains
MESQUITE (*Prosopis* spp.): One 1994 informant described three different kinds of mesquite, a "sweet," a less sweet form and a sour flavored mesquite (personal communication 1994). The "sweet" type was collected at Hueco Tanks. A meal is made of ground mesquite beans and corn, it tastes almost like peanut butter and is eaten either loose by the handful or cooked into a hot gruel called "atole" (personal communication 1994). It is made thick like a porridge or watery as a drink according to individual preference. Atole is still prepared today by some families, and mesquite wood is still used as fuel for hornos. One 1994 informant said that mesquite is a much better fuelwood than greasewood because it produces less smoke and gives a preferred flavor (personal communication 1994). They also assert that the flavor changes with the type of mesquite that you use, this particular individual uses a specific kind of mesquite wood. A Tigua man regularly collects mesquite wood in his truck and delivers it to where the Tigua still have hornos in Ysleta (personal communication 1994). According to the deposition of Vicente Roybal, he hunted with bows made of tornillo and arrows made of mesquite. Ramona Paiz specifically burnt mesquite roots for cooking. In her deposition for a land claim case Ramona Paiz described the making of atole, "We would cook the mesquite beans, and then we would put them in a tub and we would shred it, and then we would put it through a sieve and strain the mesquite beans, the meaty part of it, and we would let the juice go on out through a sieve." Herminia Silvas said that atole was a drink and that you could put sugar or brown sugar over the cooked mesquite beans (Dockett 22C deposition). She collected her beans from Hueco Tanks. Miguel Pedraza (Dockett 22C) mentions that "beans" were smashed to make atole. Pablo Carbajal (Dockett 22C) said that people hunt rabbits with a mesquite throwing stick. In a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, Mes Enrique Paiz states, "Mesquite you can find any time of the year. You can use it for an infection in the stomach. The doctors don't know too much about infection in the stomach that's why the Indians got to use this plant. You drink this before breakfast. You boil it by itself and make it thin with just a drop or two because it is bitter. You drink it...the water. Almost all the Indians gather these plants. They don't save any because they know they can always find it when they need it. My father used to save them in paper bags." The mesquite that grows around the Guadalupe mountains is said to be a good cure for cancer (Greenberg 1994).
• Hueco Tanks
• Sandhills

MORAS (UNKNOWN): Ramona Paiz, in a 1966 taped interview with Nicholas P. Houser, stated, "Moras are good for the bed bugs and were put under the beds. The roots are used for this purpose. The roots are very thick and very deep." One 1994 informant told me that they had this plant growing in their yard, they also said that "moras" were "like blackberries" (personal communication 1994).

• Found within Tigua Grant Area

NOGALES: Means "nuts." Ines Mayese, in a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, mentions "nogales.

• Found within Tigua Grant Area

OAK (Quercus sp.): Is collected at Hueco Tanks and used in the construction of implements and as firewood (personal observation 1994; Greenberg 1994).

• Hueco Tanks

OCOTILLO: JS Fouqueria splendens. Pablo Carbajal (Dockett 22C) said that this was used to treat gonorrhea and that Mariano Colmenero collected medicinals such as this and chamizo from the "sandhills and the mountains." One 1994 informant said that "Ocotillo" is a cactus that is hollow on the inside.

• Sandhills and mountains

OHASEH (UNKNOWN): "We have a plant called Ohaseh. It's like a tea, little leaves, and you brew it. It tastes uh...a little hot like it's got chili in it. But it's very soothing for your stomach. And I always have a jar full of it at home, and I'm kind'a running low on it so I'm gonna have to...The last time I was at Hueco Tanks I looked for some and couldn't find any (Greenberg 1994)."

• Hueco Tanks, Guadalupe Mountains

OJATE (UNKNOWN): Same as "Ohaseh"? In a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, Concha stated, "'Ojate' (a plant) was used so that the person could inhale the vapors..."

• Collecting site and growth range unknown
ONIONS (Allium sp.): One informant said that there are a lot of wild onions near Sierra Alto that come out in April and are used for cooking and for medicine (personal communication 1994).

• near Sierra Alto, in Hueco Mountains

PALM (Yucca elata): According to Enrique Paiz, the Tigua used to treat snakebite with "palm" (Houser 1966). Juanita Appodaca said that baskets were made of "palmas" (Houser 1966). Margarita Carbajal mentions "palmas" as a Tigua medicinal (Houser 1966). In a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, Sabino Fuentes said, "We also made crosses (to carry into the mission). Out of 'palma'."

• Found in Tigua Grant Area

PARGAY (UNKNOWN): Jose Trinidad Granillo mentioned this as a medicinal for the stomach in a deposition for Dockett 22C, but a 1994 informant said that this word did not make sense, he knew "Trini" very well and has never heard this word.

• Collecting site and growth range unknown

PEACHES: Miguel Pedrosa, in an interview, remembered that the Tiguas used to fill their wagons with "watermelon, peaches, etc.," and go to the El Paso market to sell them (Houser 1966). According to Margarita Carbajal, "Oh, yes, they had many apple trees, grapes, peaches, pears, Manzanas de San Juan, Winter Apples, apricots, pears..." in August and October (Houser 1966). Fray Manuel de San Juan Nepomuceno y Trigo states in his journal, "This one, called la Isleta (Ysleta del Sur), is two leagues from the...mission of Senecu (Zenecu). The Indians of this mission have their gardens adorned with beautiful grapevines, peach trees, apple trees, and good vegetables..." (Gerald 1974).

• Found within Tigua Grant Area

PEAR TREE (Prunus persica): According to Margarita Carbajal, "Oh, yes, they had many apple trees, grapes, peaches, pears, Manzanas de San Juan, Winter Apples, apricots, pears...," in August and October (Houser 1966).

• Found within Tigua Grant Area

PECAN TREE (Carya pecan): Pecan trees grow all around the pueblo area, especially in areas close to the Rio Grande River. The pecans are eaten by the Tigua, and some Tigua have their own stands of pecans (personal communication 1994).
PINON (*Pinus* spp.): According to Isidoro Ortega, pinon nuts were brought to feasts at Las Cruces, by other pueblo peoples, for the Tigua. “Pinon nuts were collected in the mountains...pine nuts were consumed locally and also sold commercially (Greenberg 1994).

POLEO (*Mentha* spp.): A medicinal used by the Tigua, usually prepared in a tea and then drunk (personal communication 1994).

POMEGRANATES (*Punica* spp.): One informant said that the skins of the pomegratae fruit are used for medicine. Another informant said that they liked to eat the fruit (personal communication 1994).

POPOTILLO (*Ephedra torreyana*): Also known as Mormon Tea. This may also be the "Pipotillo" mentioned by John Roth, in an unpublished manuscript. Miguel Pedraza says that this plant has been traditionally used for kidney trouble. At least one informant on the pueblo was not familiar with this term at all, but this same informant was familiar with a plant that, "has yellow flowers and helps with kidney infections, it is also drunk as a tea for urine problems." Herminia Silvas stated that Popotillo is a wood "used for the stomach, and also for the nerves" (Dockett 22C deposition). *From unpublished manuscript of John Roth: "Mexican Tea (E. trifurca), with leaves more than a quarter inch long, grows on sand west of Guadalupe Peak. A tea treated jaundice, constipation, snakebites, venereal diseases, kidney problems and stomachaches. Liquid from the boiled plant made a red dye. Also called Long-leaf Tea-bush and Long-leaf or Dessert Joint-fir. Trifurca refers to the three-forked branches. He also mentions a E. nevadensis var. aspera for kidney trouble.*
POTATO (Solanum spp.): According to one 1994 informant potatoes are used to treat measles (personal communication 1994). A potato is sliced into rounds and secured to the forehead and around the circumference of the skull with a bandana. At the same time tomatoes are sliced and pressed on both sides of the throat. Several people in the community, during the 1994 field season, remembered this tradition. Herminia Silvas, in her Dockett 22C deposition, said that the Tigua, "Boiled rice and beans with squash, fried potatoes, and boiled," for a meal.

- Found within Tigua Grant Area

PRICKLY PEAR (Opuntia spp.): A food resource collected in the mountains (Greenberg 1994; personal observation 1994).

- Mountains and Hueco Tanks

QUELITES (Brassica spp.): Also known as mustards. The young shoots of this plant were eaten (personal communication 1994).

- Found within the Tigua Grant Area

RUDA (Thalictrum spp.): Also known as Ruda de la Sierra. One informant stated that "ruda" was a medicinal. For ear infections or earaches (personal communication 1994).

- Collecting site and growth range unknown

SABINAS (Juniperus spp.): Also known as Cedar or Juniper. One informant, in an interview with Truhill (1992), stated, "They use that (sabinas) in the ceremonies, in the old days, this is in the very old days, they would get the trees, and use them in the ceremony, itself. This also, they would get the leaves of it to burn them, to cleanse themselves...They would cut the whole tree. They would take it down, carry them to the reservation. We used to carry them...they only needed two trees (for a whole year)...After that they would use them in cleansing ceremonies. When they went in to cleanse themselves with the smoke, they were using the smoke itself, or just keep it until they used it up...like incense. To cleanse everything...they do it (collect the trees) about a week before the ceremony." This same informant could not remember the ceremony that this was done for, "Like, that ceremony was forgotten. I don't remember what the date was, or anything. Because a lot of them are dances. A lot of them are ceremonies, always have an end to them. We have one that we used to dance when one of our chiefs went to war, and when
he came back, the ceremony finished. They would do it as a prayer for certain things."
Another 1994 informant periodically collects greenery from Juniper out at Hueco Tanks (personal observation 1994). Also, SEE "taskate."
  • Sandhills
  • Hueco Tanks

SAGE (Salvia spp.): An informant stated, in The Sun House at Hueco Tanks, "See we have people offering here. There's sage here" (Truhill 1992). There is a green sage and a silver sage, the green sage, according to Hewett (1945), grows in the lowlands near villages along the Rio Grande.
  • Found within the Tigua Grant Area

SANGRE DE CRISTO (Jatropha dioica): One informant from the 1994 field season stated that Sangre de Cristo was used for "medicine" (personal communication 1994). Greenberg (1994) states, "Sangre de Cristo was gathered in the Guadalupe Mountains and at Indian Hot Springs (near Fort Quitman) and was brewed as a tea for the treatment of cancer and heart problems.
  • Guadalupe Mountains

SUCEGA (unknown): According to Ramona Paiz, the leaves of this plant were used for indigestion (Dockett 22C depositions).
  • Collecting site and growth range unknown

SOTOL (Dasylirion leiophyllum): In a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, Sabino Fuentes states, "Each person had a bunch of taskate. And also carrying in his hand some sotol...." Sotol and Mescal hearts were collected in the mountains and roasted as a food (Greenberg 1994).
  • Mountains

SUNFLOWER (Helianthus spp.): One informant collected sunflowers along highway 62 on their way back from Hueco Tanks. They put them in a big gallon jar (the flowers), let the jar sit in the sun for a while, then turned the jar upside down on his grandon's head and held it there until the air bubbles stopped rising to the top (personal observation 1994). He said that he did this to treat "sun sickness." This same informant said that the tea is good for headaches as well, and that sunflowers are used to see if people are suffering from sunstroke; you boil the sunflower in
water, put some into a glass with the water, and set it on the ailing person's head. If the liquid bubbles the person is suffering from sunstroke.

•Sandhills

TASKATE (UNKNOWN): In a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, Sabino Fuentes states, "Each person had a bunch of taskate. And also carrying in his hand some sotol. A taskate was the trunk of a small bush or tree...they brought it from the mountains. We used to make coronas (crowns)...we put them on our hats. It was taskate. The leaves were used. As the people met we would also take a drink. Then we went to the church and leave the corona and the small branch...to the Virgin and we prayed." One 1994 informant said that they did not recognize the term "taskate," but that sabina is used for the purpose described above (personal communication 1994).

•Collection site and growth area unknown

TOBACCO (*Nicotiana trigonophylla*): Also known as Desert Tobacco. During 1994 one informant said that tobacco was collected from Big Bend (Chichos Mountain), they would say that they were collecting "lena," which is wood, if anyone asked them what they were doing. This, "covered their tracks," (Greenberg 1994; Gray 1994). This same informant said that wild Tobacco could also be gotten from Rattlesnake Springs in the Guadalupe Mountains near Carlsbad. They stressed that the Tobacco used to smoke the drum must be wild, non-processed tobacco (personal communication 1994). At one point I was told that wild tobacco did not grow around Ysleta but that the Tigua get it from up north, around Mesa Verde, for ceremonies. The informant said that the *Nicotiana* spp. from up there is really strong and potent.

•Big Bend, Chichas Mountain
•Rattlesnake Springs in Guadalupe Mountains near Carlsbad.

TOMATO (*Solanum* spp.): One informant, during the 1994 field season, stated that tomatoes are eaten to cool a person down when they are too hot (personal communication 1994). The same informant, among others, remember using tomatoes to treat measles as well (See potatoes).

•Found within the Tigua Grant Area

TORNILLO (*Prosopis pubescens*): Also known as Screwbean. One informant said that people traditionally made arrows out of it
(personal communication 1994). It is also known as a medicinal; it is ground and mixed with rattlesnake fat, then is poured into the infected ear (personal communication 1994). According to the deposition of Vicente Roybal, he hunted with bows made of tornillo and arrows made of mesquite (Dockett 22C). According to Jose Trinidad Granillo, then cacique, bows for hunting were made of "panao," mesquite, or tornillo (Dockett 22C). Pablo Carbajal (Dockett 22C) apparently made both bows and arrows from the wood of tornillo. He also mentioned that tornillo "thread" was used to sew buckskin with (Cockett 22C). One informant stated, "...in making our bow and arrows, we use a certain kind of mesquite, they call it Tornillo. And it's still being used today," for ceremonial purposes (Truhill, 1992). Tornillo beans can also be used to make a thick drink called "atole" (See also mesquite)(Greenberg 1994).

*along the Rio Grande
* sandhills

TORRITOS (UNKNOWN): Mes Enrique Paiz, in a 1966 interview with Nicholas P. Houser, said, "Torritos are used to cure stomach aches and all kinds of aches. You can use it for cramps and you also drink it. Only you drink it before eating breakfast. You can save it in a bottle afterwards. One can find it in the sandhills. You can find this plant the season around. Only in the summertime it is a green plant and in the winter time it is dry. The best time to find it is in the summertime." One 1994 informant said that torritos is used to treat appendicitis, that the seeds are put into a tea (personal communication 1994; Greenberg 1994).

* sandhills

TROMPILLO (Solanum elaeagnifolium): One 1994 informant stated that trompillo is used to separate milk (Put it in with the whey when making the asadero, or curds and whey). It has a yellow flower and "grows anywhere" (personal communication 1994).

* John Roth, unpublished manuscript: "The fruit sap is a rennet used by Pima Indians and Mexicans in the curdling of milk to make cheese. The fruit is edible when cooked and is a laxative. A flower tea was drunk to cure coughs."

* sandhills

VERDOLAGAS (Portulaca spp.): Also known as Purslane. It is possibly Portulaca oleracea, P. mundula, or P. retusa. According to Hewett, "At Isleta (del norte) purslane is gathered in large
quantities and slowly dried in an oven, then stored and used as greens during the winter. The Acomas and Lagunas cook it with meat and eat it like spinach" (Hewett 1945). During the summer of 1994, while visiting Ysleta del Sur, I witnessed one informant suspending what they called "verdolagas" (leaves and shoots) in paper lunch bags with holes cut in the like a luminaria. In this way the verdolagas was dried for later use. The bags had been infested with bugs by the end of the summer, however (personal observation 1994). An additional informant had some canned verdolagas in their cupboard that we prepared for lunch one day. The canned greens were poured out into a saucepan and cooked with some onion, green chili, and a small amount of chorizo sausage. Very good. The informant said that this plant used to grow all along the borders of the cotton fields where they grew up. Some specimens were collect along the Rio Grande, the bank is a disturbed area similar to what the edges of Mexican and Pueblo gardens and irrigation ditches would be like. This seems to be an ideal habitat for verdolagas (personal observation 1994). One informant said that there are "two kinds," the ones with long, lanceolate leaves taste good, the kind with "round leaves" are "bad." This same informant said that the plant is "from the desert" (personal communication 1994).

-sandhills

WALNUT (*Juglans microcarpa*): Can be collected for food at Hueco Tanks and in the mountains (personal communication 1994).

-Hueco Tanks and mountains

WAX PLANT (UNKNOWN): One informant stated that along the river that runs near Fort Quitman there is a site called "Ojo Caliente" (Indian Hot Springs) where the Tigua collected a plant that was used to make a kind of wax (Greenberg 1994).

-river near Fort Quitman

WHEAT (*Triticum* spp.): Miguel Pedraza stated that the Tigua planted corn, beans, wheat, alfalfa, chilies (deposition in Dockett 22C).

-Found within Tigua Grant Area

WINTER APPLES (UNKNOWN): According to Margarita Carbajal, "Oh, yes, they had many apple trees, grapes, peaches, pears, Manzanas de San Juan, Winter Apples, apricots, pears...," in August and October (Houser 1966).
YAM (UNKNOWN): According to Jose Trinidad Granillo, in Dockett 22C, "They (Tigua) cooked roasting ears, yams, calvasas (calavasas), or squash, or pumpkin." Ramona Paiz stated in Dockett 22C, "We would cook sweet potatoes (one 1994 informant said that the color of these depended upon the soil that they were grown in), pumpkins, cook meat in there (an horno), and also bread."

YERBA BUENO (Mentha spicata): Also known as Spearmint. It is one of the most widely mentioned herbaceous plants on the reservation. It is a well known medicinal, used to settle the stomach by drinking a tea made from it, and "for when kids can’t sleep and cramps (menstral cramps)" (personal communication). Herminia Silvas called said that this was an herb drink for children (Dockett 22C deposition). Miguel Pedraza (Dockett 22C) states simply, "for stomach trouble." This plant should not be confused with other members of the mint family that are used by the Tigua as well (POLEO). The mint growing in one informant's yard is a stronger mint than commercial mint and others grown in the Tigua Community. It has smaller leaves and is shorter and grows wild at Hueco Tanks. According to Margarita Herrera Montoya, in a taped interview with Nicholas P. Houser (1966), "Also yerba buena and poleo (are medicinal plants). They look alike, but they are completely different.

YERBA DEL MANSO (Anemopsis californica): According to Margarita Herrera Montoya, in a taped interview with Nicholas P. Houser (1966), "...yerba del manso is used for wounds, it is found up here in the mountains...it looked something like a jara and is a tall gray plant and is used if one cuts himself or if there is an infection."

YUCCA (Yucca glauca): One 1994 informant said that the leaves were traditionally shredded by pounding the fiber of the leaves until the individual elements came loose. This product was then used as a paintbrush so that fine lines could be made on pottery (personal communication 1994). This same informant said that wedding baskets were also made from yucca fibers, and that in
fact yucca fibers produced the strongest basket relative to other plant materials used for this purpose (personal communication 1994). I was not able to discern whether the informant differentiated between Yucca glauca, Y. baccata, and Y. elata.

Other names for Yucca include soapweed, datil, palmilla ancha and amole. Hewett describes several pueblo uses for yucca plants. Among them the making of a lather for washing by soaking the roots of the plant in cold water, rubbing them together afterward to produce a lather, then picking out the fiber. The lather was apparently used by some pueblos in ceremonies to represent clouds. (Hewett 1945) Rope and a twine is also known to have been made out of yucca by southwestern Native American cultures. The leaves were boiled, "for a short time," and then the fibers were removed for the cord. (Hewett 1945)

• Found within the Tigua Grant Area
• sandhills and mountains
TIGUA PLANTS: Listed by Plant Family

ANGIOSPERMS:

Amaranthaceae

*Amaranthus* spp.  
Amaranth

Asclepiadaceae

*Asclepias* spp. OR *Hoya carnosa*  
(Possibly *A. linaria* Cav.)  
Asclepias

Bignoniaceae

*Chilopsis linearis* (Cav.) Sweet  
Fior Mimbra

Brassicaceae

*Brassica* spp.  
Quelites

Cactaceae

*Opuntia* spp.  
(Possibly *O. streptacantha, O. robusta,*  
*or O. ficus-indica* if no spines.)  
*Opuntia imbricata* (Ham) DC  
Prickly Pear

Caprifoliaceae

*Sambucus* spp.  
Flor Sauco

Chenopodiaceae

*Atriplex canescens* (Pursh) Nutt.  
*Chenopodium ambrosioides* L.  
Chamizo

Compositae

*Carthamus tinctorius*  
*Artemisia ludoviciana* Nutt. or  
*A. filifolia* L.  
*Matricaria matricari*  
*Guiterrezia sarothra*  
*Helianthus annuus* L.  
Azafra

Cucurbitaceae

*Cucurbita pepo* L.?  
(Possibly some are *C. moschata.*)  
*Cucurbita* spp.  
Calabazas

*Citrus lanatus*  
Watermelon

Ericaceae
Arctostaphylos uva-ursi  
(Possibly A. pungens.)

Euphorbiaceae  
*Jatropha dioica*

Fagaceae  
*Quercus* spp.

Fouquieriaceae  
*Fouquieria splendens*

Gramineae (Poaceae)  
*Cymbopogon citratus*  
*Phragmites australis*  
*Triticum* spp.  
*Zea mays*

Illiciaceae  
*Illicium* spp.

Juglandaceae  
*Carva pecan*  
*Juglans* spp.

Labiatae (Lamiaceae)  
*Mentha rotundifolia*  
*Mentha spicata*  
*Mentha* spp.  
*Ocimum basilicum*  
*Salvia* spp.

Leguminosae (Fabaceae)  
*Medicago sativa*  
*Phaseolus* spp.  
*Prosopis glandulosa*  
*Prosopis pubescens*

Liliaceae  
*Agave* spp.  
*Agave lechuguilla*  
*Allium* spp.  
*Dasylirion leiophyllum*  
*Yucca* spp.  
*Yucca elata*

Malvaceae  
*Gossypium hopii*

Portulacaceae  
*Portulaca* spp.

Coralillo
Sangre de Cristo
Oak
Ocotillo
Lemo
River Cane
Wheat
Corn
Anis Estrella
Pecan Tree
Walnut
Mastranso
Yerba Buena
Poleo
Albacar or Basil
Sage
Alfalfa
Beans
Mesquite
Tornillo
Mescal
Lecheguilla
Wild Onion
Sotol
Yucca
Palm
Cotton
Verdolagas
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Common Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Punicaceae</td>
<td><em>Punica granatum</em> L.</td>
<td>Pomegranate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ranunculaceae</td>
<td><em>Thalictrum</em> spp.</td>
<td>Ruda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosaceae</td>
<td><em>Malus</em> spp.</td>
<td>Apple Trees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Prunus persica</em></td>
<td>Peach Trees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Prunus</em> spp.</td>
<td>Apricot Trees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Pyrus</em> spp.</td>
<td>Pear Trees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rutaceae</td>
<td><em>Citrus limon</em></td>
<td>Lemon Tree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salicaceae</td>
<td><em>Populus</em> spp.</td>
<td>Alamo Wood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Populus</em> spp.</td>
<td>Cottonwood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Salix</em> spp.</td>
<td>Harra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sauraceae</td>
<td><em>Anemopsis californica</em></td>
<td>Yerba del Manso</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solanaceae</td>
<td><em>Capsicum</em> spp.</td>
<td>Chilies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Capsicum</em> spp.</td>
<td>Jalapeno</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Nicotiana</em> spp.</td>
<td>Wild Tobacco</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Solanum elaeagnifolium</em></td>
<td>Trompillo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Solanum</em> spp.</td>
<td>Tomato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Solanum</em> spp.</td>
<td>Potato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulmaceae</td>
<td><em>Celtis</em> spp.</td>
<td>Hackberry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Umbelliferae</td>
<td><em>Ligusticum porteri</em></td>
<td>Chuchupate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Pimpinella anisum</em></td>
<td>Anise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vitaceae</td>
<td><em>Vitis vinifera</em></td>
<td>Grapevine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zygophyllaceae</td>
<td><em>Kallstroemia</em> spp.</td>
<td>Contrayerba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Lorrea tridentata</em></td>
<td>Hediondilla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GYMNOSPERMS:</td>
<td>Cupressaceae</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Juniperus monosperma</em> (Engelmann) Sargent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sabinas or Cedar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(Possibly *J. deppeana* Steudel var. *deppeana*; if near water, could be a *Taxodium* spp.)

Gnetophyta

*Ephedra* spp.

Pinaceae

*Pinus* spp.
APPENDIX C: PLACES AND RESOURCES THAT REQUIRE SPECIAL TREATMENT
1. **PICTOGRAPH SITE** (IDENTITY AND LOCATION OF THIS SITE IS SENSITIVE AND HENCE REMAINS CONFIDENTIAL. FURTHER INQUIRIES SHOULD BE MADE TO THE OFFICE OF THE SUPERINTENDENT, CARLSBAD CAVERNS NATIONAL PARK.)

Tigua tribal representatives indicated the special nature of this site and were able to identify some of the pictographs. No substantive commentary was provided by them regarding meaning. In addition, the Tigua noted the presence of Apache pictographs. Tribal council members who were on-site identified a concern for the area via protection and access issues. They were also unanimous in their opinion that the site be closed to the public (see Chapter V.). In this regard, the park has removed this site as a visitor use area in the interest of protection. It is apparent that further consultation with the Tigua Tribe will be necessary in order to gain more specific understandings among interested parties and perhaps reach agreement on appropriate protection and access strategies. Moreover, further consultation may reveal the parameters of the site as regards sensitivity.

It is essential that the Mescalero Tribe be involved in any discussion regarding this and other sites in the park. Areas that require special treatment in a culturally-appropriate and responsive manner will be made manifest if and when consultation with the Mescalero Tribe proceeds.
APPENDIX D: DISCUSSION OF METHODOLOGIES AND RESEARCH FINDINGS

CONTENTS:

1. LIST OF THE CRITERIA USED TO SELECT INDIVIDUAL PARTICIPANTS
2. ETHNOGRAPHIC INTERVIEW GUIDES
3. CONSULTANTS
4. INTERVIEW DATA: NUMBER AND TIME
5. BRIEF SUMMARIES OF THE INTERVIEWS AND CONSULTATIONS
6. LIST OF KNOWLEDGEABLE TRIBAL INDIVIDUALS AS INTERESTED IN FUTURE CONSULTATIONS
7. LIST OF RESOURCES FOR NOMINATION TO THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES AS ETHNOGRAPHIC RESOURCES WITH TRADITIONAL VALUE
8. SECULAR/TRADITIONAL OFFICES OR POSITIONS WITHIN TIGUA TRIBE
9. INTERVIEW CONSENT FORM
10. INTERVIEW GUIDE
11. SELECTED INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS
1) LIST OF THE CRITERIA USED TO SELECT INDIVIDUAL PARTICIPANTS

The contractor worked through the Tigua Tribal Council on an inter-governmental basis throughout the project. The Tigua Tribal Council identified any of the then current members as consultants. In addition, several other potential consultants were identified by the council membership. What followed was essentially a “snowball” or network sampling of consultants. In large measure, those identified proved to be invaluable in providing relevant information for the project as they were all considered elders and knowledgeable. See attached consent form.

2) ETHNOGRAPHIC INTERVIEW GUIDES

The interview process was guided by open-ended questions or themes which consultants were asked to comment on or “talk about.” See attached interview guide.

3) CONSULTANTS

Code A: Former Governor, Alguacil, Council Member
Code B: Cacique
Code C: Council Member, Mayordomo, Advisor to Cacique
Code D: War Captain, Council Member
Code E: Former Governor, Lieutenant Governor, Advisor to Cacique
Code F: Elder
Code G: Elder
Code H: Elder
Code I: Elder, Council Member
Code J: Governor
Code K: Elder

There were numerous other individuals with whom I spoke, but those noted above (all reside in Ysleta Del Sur Pueblo) were my main consultants.

4) INTERVIEW DATA: NUMBER AND TIME

In terms of what may be called formal interviews, the consultants listed in item 3 were all subject to interview. An estimated total of 70 days were spent in personal contact with consultants.
5) BRIEF SUMMARIES OF THE INTERVIEWS AND CONSULTATIONS

See interview guide, Chapter 4 (p. 57) and selected interviews attached.

6) LIST OF KNOWLEDGEABLE TRIBAL INDIVIDUALS AS INTERESTED IN FUTURE CONSULTATIONS

At the request of the Tigua Tribal Council, all future consultations must first proceed through the Governor's Office (915-859-7913).

7) LIST OF RESOURCES FOR NOMINATION TO THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES AS ETHNOGRAPHIC RESOURCES WITH TRADITIONAL VALUE

None at this time. Future consultations with the Tigua and other associated groups may reveal such resources.
8. SECULAR/TRADITIONAL OFFICES OR POSITIONS WITHIN TIGUA TRIBE

Cacique (spiritual lifetime leader aloof from daily and mundane affairs of the pueblo, venerated and venerates all life)

War Captain (to direct dances and preserve order during dances/to regulate everything pertaining to hunts)

Governor (the people’s representative to civil government/unlike the Cacique, the governor is concerned totally with secular affairs)

Lieutenant Governor (to serve in the governor’s absence)

Alguacil (to maintain law and order within the pueblo)

Mayor Domos (irrigation ditch superintendents/along with War Captain and Cacique are the guardians and coordinators of religion)
9. Carlsbad Caverns and Guadalupe Mountains National Parks Ethnographic Assessment

Interview Consent Agreement

It is my understanding that this interview is being conducted as a part of a National Park Service commissioned assessment of the traditional relationships of contemporary Tigua Indians to the resources of Carlsbad Caverns National Park and Guadalupe Mountains National Park. The results of this interview will be used to advise the Park Service of the traditional cultural and natural resources in the parks that are used and valued by the Tigua.

I hereby donate the results of this interview to the Carlsbad and Guadalupe Parks Ethnographic Assessment Contractor, Adolph M. Greenberg, for the sole above mentioned use. I understand that the Contractor may not use descriptions of the specific uses and locations of sacred resources in scientific publications or presentations, or otherwise make the information public in any way without explicit permission from the National Park Service and the Tigua Tribal Council. Where deemed appropriate by me and/or the interviewer, confidentiality of this material or portions of this material will be maintained.

Stipulations: interview and tape recordings (initial)

____ I desire that all results of the interview including tape recordings be donated to the study.

or

____ I desire that the written results only of the interview be donated to the study.

Stipulations: Anonymity (initial)

____ I desire that my name be used in reports that result from this interview.

or

____ I desire that my name not be used in reports that result from this interview.

Comments: ________________________________________________________________

__________________________________________________________________________

__________________________________________________________________________

__________________________________________________________________________

Signature of interviewee: ______________________________________________________
Address of interviewee: ______________________________________________________

Signature of interviewer: _____________________________________________________

Date of Agreement: __________________________________________________________
Major Themes to be Explored in Ethnographic Interviews:

Date:

Name:

Address:

Location of Interview:

Life History Profile:

Meaning of Guadalupe and Carlsbad Area:

Specific areas visited, when, what routes:

Reason for visit:

Frequency:

Areas of special importance:
11. SELECTED INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS

Interview with Consultant (G) June 6, 1993 (translation by Consultant (A)

GREENBERG: You're talking about...I guess the last thing we talked about was the Guadalupes

A: Yeah...Even now he was telling me that....the police and I guess Texas Rangers were.....

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH) Si....

A: The rangers used to hassle them a lot because..... they didn't let 'em pick up any wood or herbs and you know xxxx used to be hassled all the time.

GREENBERG: That's in the Guadalupes? That's when they went up to that area.

A: Yeah. (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH) No....

A: He said when they used to go out to the salinas, or what they call the salt flats....xxxx, they used to be careful when to go and you know, uh, hide away from farmers or the ranchers that owned the area that it was impossible to uh, thats why they waited for uh, at night when it was full moon so they could see and the light would be over so they could see what they were doing.

GREENBERG: So they did that primarily because they didn't want to be

A: Caught.

GREENBERG: Caught. If they weren't gonna be caught they would go during the day without any...

A: Yeah. Even....(Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: See they used to go in the daytime when it's....

GREENBERG: Ask him some more about the ceremonial purpose since it's the strongest case we can make I suppose is the uh... Can you explore that a litte bit more?

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: I asked him about when they used to go out about the (ahuelos) to go do ceremonials. It was really hard for them.

GREENBERG: To do the ceremonials because....
A: Yeah, because they were in fear that they'd get caught, number one. Number two, they'd get caught for trespassing or...

GREENBERG: Did they do ceremonials up there? In the... the ahuelos are the

A: The abuelos it means the

GREENBERG: Ancestors?

A: Ancestors, the old ancestors that were there, you know.

GREENBERG: Up at the salt... at the

A: Guadalupes... (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: When they went up there to get wood or herbs or whatever; when the finish, they give thanks to the good spirits or to the abuelos for protect them from being caught or

GREENBERG: Do they give thanks for the materials that they collected?

A: Yeah (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: I'm talking about tradition. (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH) briefly

A: See, our tradition that you take tobacco to the good spirits that live there for what he's gonna give you. Remember how I was talking awhile back that we take something in return, you know.

GREENBERG: Everytime they went to....

A: Yeah, that's why .....

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: Their belief, firm belief on on grandfathers and ancestors of the mountains of either Hueco or Guadalupes when he say something, you have to follow it and there's not too much... remember before we were talking about the xxxx indians?

GREENBERG: Yeah

A: They don't know the proper ceremonies. Said there's real strong feelings on that. Said xxxx Hueco or xxxx anything else before I do my praying.
GREENBERG: There are not only prayers of thanks for not being caught, but thanks for being able to collect the things from the area.

A: Uh huh

GREENBERG: Now, would you ask him how important was the area...I know that you got herbs....I mean can you give me some idea of how important....You've already alluded to that, that area was to them in terms of being able to carry out the ceremonies back here at the pueblo. Can you....can you?

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said that real critical was because .... that the grandfathers of the mountains; you were taking something from him. That's why it was really important and that's why it was real critical and it was really personal as far as ceremonies.

GREENBERG: And that includes the Guadalupes xxxx ?

A: Yeah, the Guadalupes was really uh because like he says, there's some herbs that don't grow here so you have to go out there for getting..... (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

Several interchanges en espanol

A: He talked about (xxxx) how important it is to the house, he burn it like xxxx did awhile ago and it gets the bad out of the house. It cleans and also is medicine for your health.

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

GREENBERG: Alright, obviously without divulging something that's important or or or that the tribe does not want to divulge, could you tell me something about the ceremonies..... I'm trying..you know what I'm trying to ....

A: Yeah, you're trying not to put him in a spot...

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said that all those herbs that are found over at the Guadalupes are real medicine, real strong and.... I think see he's holding back, really telling us specifics. OK But it is important, I know he's feeling as if he wants to say, but the indian customs will never tell you

A: (Question - Spanish)
G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

Several exchanges using the word importante

A: Spanish......and say he starts picking up xxxx some of the medicines (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: If there was nobody there it was OK for me to go over there.

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said, if somebody there, he said I'm...

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said the people there are real, real hard people.

GREENBERG: Who are the hard people did he say?

Overlapping exchanges

A: He said the people that run the parks and patrol the parks.

Overlapping exchanges

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said is more beautiful mountain than any mountain.

GREENBERG: Do they look at the mountain itself as being sacred?
A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: Everything there.

Overlapping exchanges

A: He's talking about that mountain is the only place that he find...... (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said there is a mountain close to New Mexico that's got everything there.
GREENBERG: Alright
A: Let me ask him a question.
GREENBERG: Sure
A: (Question - Spanish)
G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)
A: He said it's hard for me to say this because if were to give us permission I wouldn't be afraid, but if I don't have permission I be afraid.
GREENBERG: From the park uh....
A: From the park service.
GREENBERG: Alright
A: From the Guadalupes.
GREENBERG: Alright
A: Next I was gonna ask him if he remembers any stories of the old caciques when they used to go out there?
GREENBERG: Good, that would be good.
A: (Question - Spanish)
G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)
A: He said it was very far. When they went out there it was a sacrifice to go out there.
GREENBERG: But they went out there because it was...
G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)
A: Those days there were no cars. They went out on horses.
G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)
A: xxxx means there were buggies, you know.
G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)
A: He said it took two or three days just to get there.
GREENBERG: It was that important just to go?

A: Yes.

GREENBERG: The caciques went too?

A: Yeah (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He say whenever they went out there whatever game they got they came back and xxxx their own people, to the pueblo.

GREENBERG: To give the food to the....

A: To the pueblo, to the people.

GREENBERG: To distribute to...

A: Yeah

GREENBERG: Would he say that the Guadalupes and the resources in the Guadalupes, that the people are, define as resources in the Guadalupes, the herbs, the gypsum sand, the salt sand, the salt and the animals were important to tribal wellbeing?

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said that the wood there in the Guadalupes is really good for medicine.

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: The mesquite that grows around the Guadalupes is real medicine. It is a good cure for cancer. (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: Good, good wood.

GREENBERG: Alright I'm getting, I'm trying to ...so much about Hueco Tanks .... a revelation. I'm hearing a lot about the Guadalupes that uh Can you tell me... Is maybe the reason people aren't talking about Guadalupe is because it has a lot of power and/or is it because they just realized that they haven't been able to go there?

A: (Question - Spanish)
G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said because we don't want to talk about that because it's important.

GREENBERG: Can he tell me about I know that we talked about certain sites in there Joe....What about shelters or caves that might be important...petroglyphs uh...Pictographs...

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said they used to go at night and there is lots of places....

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: Now he talks about Carlsbad.

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH) laughs

GREENBERG: What does Carlsbad mean?

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: He said it's very rich but not the sense in money; when he said xxxx it means rich by culture, by belief and strong.

GREENBERG: The Carlsbad area is important. What...How does the Carlsbad Cavern area compare to the Guadalupes?

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

A: OK, Thats good point. He said the people from this area and the Guadalupe range and Carlsbad, they found a cross, made of gold, or whatever, very rich. Very, very rich, a gold cross, so how now you tie that to us. Talking about that cross, that Spanish or.... people. Even in Hueco Tanks or places that a cross is symbolic there...

GREENBERG: There was a guy that came through the western side of the Guadalupes named Manuel Torres. Does that name ring a bell?

A: Manuel Torres (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH) No.....

GREENBERG: Any crosses that appear in petroglyphs or pictographs, is that important to the people?

A: Oh yeah, it is because, I cannot put it....it is a symbolic it is a sign, you know uh....
GREENBERG: Not only Christian.....

A: But it was what we call the inner circle of the cross, to symbolic the four corners of the earth.

GREENBERG: Joe, what about the pictograph at Hueco that's so important to the tribe; the circle with the star. The circle, is it possible to have him discuss that or some aspect of that?

A: (Question - Spanish)

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH)

Several exchanges

A: Talking about caves and the Comanches and Apaches used to just put a big xxxx on the front of a cave.

GREENBERG: Ah!

G: (ANSWERS IN SPANISH) laughs and answers

A: xxxx cover the caves up and in all those caves they're finding you know big xxxx and big caves there.

GREENBERG: Yeah. Um...
Interview with Consultant (E), June 7, 1993
Administrative center at Ysleta del Sur

GREENBERG: ...preliminary stuff

E: I'm 62 years old.

GREENBERG: Work in the pueblo?

E: I live right outside the pueblo about 5 miles from here.

GREENBERG: Tell me about your life history with the tribe.

E: I started acting and learning about the pueblo when I was very small. I can remember going back to when I was 8, maybe 9 years old. That I sit around with my dad and he'd tell me stories. Later on he used to chant quite a bit and I liked the idea of me becoming also a chanter.

This goes way back when I was small and the stories that he used to tell me about my grandfather, my great-grandfather; how they used to live around and go to Hueco Tanks and live out there for a number of days. They used to make possible to live under some of those dwellings that are in the area of Hueco Tanks. But this started long time ago, like I said some 50 odd years ago.

He also oriented me on the traditional part of the pueblo, how for many years this has been taken place. This fiesta that we are preparing for now has been going for something like 314 years so I imagine that my dad dying (he passed away 5 years ago at the age of 85.) He did have a lot of information that, I used to just sit with him and talk about it. Actually he was trying to teach me everything he knew about the pueblo.

I remember sometime back that; he didn't have a drum yet but he used to chant with a guitar. He used to get an old guitar and he used to chant with. He used to play by... That's when I was very young. Like I said, all this information that I have I got out of him, I used to sit down with him especially on weekends. We used to go to bullfights, theater and most evenings I used to just go visit with him and just go talk.

This came about because my mom and dad divorced when I was 5 years old. I guess that helped me a lot because I used to go visit him every day and...

GREENBERG: Where did he live, in the pueblo?

E: No, he lived right outside the pueblo. He never did live in the pueblo. But I guess that gave me more of an opportunity to be with him and to share this information because we used to look forward to meeting every weekend especially. In the afternoons after school I used to go to his house and spend a lot of time with him. We're real good friends.

GREENBERG: What did he do for a living.


E: I remember my dad, long time, before there was any steady work, he used to go out and hunt rabbits and sell them to the market. He also used to go out to the river and he used to fish, illegally I guess. He used little pieces of dynamite and throw them in the river (laugh)

GREENBERG: laugh, my father...

E: But he used to get nice looking fish out of the river at the time. There was no work at the time and he used to take them out there and sell them. But he used to make a living selling wood, gather wood and sell it. And later on he got a job with a Texas highway department. He worked for a number of years for the highway department. He used to be a painter. He used to make those signs for the road. He used to work right there in the yard on Clark, right there in El Paso. And I remember going with him on Saturdays. He taught me how to use a saw, band saw, how to count letters, how to make stencils...

GREENBERG: The works....

E: The works you know. And I also remember, it was during the war, we had a victory garden in back of the highway department. We had a lot of watermelons back there and we used to go hunt rabbits, because at that time it was desert right there. And we used to hunt rabbits right there under the watermelons, with a sling shot. Used to be a real good shooter with a sling shot. I used to have a lot of fun with him.

After he left the highway department, he became a bus driver. He became a bus driver for the Ysleta School District. And he was a bus driver for something like twenty years. He retired from driving a bus. That was his last job. But I remember he worked for the highway department and then he worked for the pueblo when it was under the State of Texas. He worked here for awhile.

GREENBERG: Was his name also ?? ??

E: Yes.

GREENBERG: He had a number of leadership positions also in the pueblo.

E: He was the first governor for the pueblo. Hot the first one. But when they became recognized. I believe he was governor for six years, for about five or six years. And he stayed here for a number of years. And at the time I was working for the ...... Hospital. I was a dietician up there. Yeah, and he said he was going to retire. They would be an opening. He said "Why don't you go work for the pueblo?" and I said, If I'm gonna be with the pueblo go ahead and leave that job. I came to work here. It was in 1975.

GREENBERG: Would you describe him as very traditional. I mean in the sense of very much committed to his Tigua identity.

E: I think so. I know so because when I was young, very small, about seven years, he used to tell me, "Never forget that you are an indian. One of these days you are gonna grow up but don't forget because there's a lot of indian people out there in Isleda that don't like to be reminded that there are indian people because" --- around here in Isleda most of the indian people used to shy away from the word indian because of the surrounding neighbors. They disliked, they discriminated against the indian people. He used to tell me stories about when he was young going to school. He wore his hair in braids. Other kids used to go and pull his braids, and it miserable for him.
But my father back in 1936 he was the last of one of the abuelos. Now the abuelos are like katchinas....

GREENBERG: Like Katchinas

G: Yeas, like Katchinas.

GREENBERG: He was the last.....

E: He was in the last group to dance the abuelo dance.

GREENBERG: That's no longer done?

E: No. We have the sacred mark of the mask and everything. And he was the last group to dance the abuelo dance.

GREENBERG: When was that?

E: 1936.

GREENBERG: xxxx?

E: Just like everything else, I guess people started uh... Well it was not an easy thing to do. It was done during the winter and.

TELEPHONE INTERRUPTION

E: Going back to the abuelos. After the dancing with the traditional danced they used to go to the river and sometimes, especially that last year, there was ice on the river. Right. They had to jump in there and break the ice with their forehead,

GREENBERG: The dancers had to do that?

E: The abuelas did.

GREENBERG: xxxx?

E: Three.

GREENBERG: Three abuelos did.

E: Jump in the river, break the ice, bathe, come out. By then there used to like fires where they could gather around and warm themselves up.

GREENBERG: What was the meaning of breaking the ice?

E: I really don't know
GREENBERG: Now the abuelos were like protectors...

E: Yes, they used to ... what would you call that... They used to take the uh... lure the evil spirits away from the pueblo. In some of the pueblos up north they still do that. They do it just about every night. The war captain goes out into the pueblo and nobody supposed to look outside their windows. He goes around the pueblo and he does some praying. It's a tradition that's been handed down through the years. And we had the same thing but like I said now-a days we have the Mayerdomos, that are making the(sounds Spanish)... like escochos

During the election when the mayordomos are going to be they volunteered to do this. There are very few that stand up there and say "I want to be next year's Mayordomos" because it takes a lot of work. Last year I was a Mayordomo and I handed it over to Manny. We already have a Mayordomo for next year. During the election we're gonna gather someone for the following year see. But it is something that uh

GREENBERG: They're selected New Year's Eve, is that right? Along with the council? In a midnight meeting?

E: Yes. We don't hold it no more at midnight. That has also changed. One of the reasons it changed because of the people not being there. We want most of the people, as many people as we can to be there do now we make it at 6 o'clock in the afternoon. It used to be at midnight but we used to have very little people and...people that vote for the preceeding council was very small and we didn't think it was fair or the community to be selected officers by very few people so we made it in the afternoon.

GREENBERG: You still have the mask for the abuelo?

E: Yes, the war captain holds the mask and the drum.

GREENBERG: uh huh

E: 1680. But that drum was made long before that because that drum came with us from New Mexico. See they don't have an old drum like ours. They don't have a traditional drum.

GREENBERG: And that drum was made from wood from.... What kind of wood is it?

E: That type of wood

GREENBERG: From the mountain of the apples? I read somewhere but.....

E: I don't remember, but

GREENBERG: It so amazing to see something that's so old

E: I have the old drum too that belongs to the xxxx tribe.
GREENBERG: I saw that in a newspaper article, in December I think. That was interesting. And then I saw that drum also in a picture that (F) has. Did you see that picture (F) has?

E: No
GREENBERG: He has a picture of some dancing Isolda that he wasn't certain.... You should take a look at that sometime. E: Uh huh...

GREENBERG: It's a real old picture. He spotted his grandmother in there.

E: Uh huh. Which drum is he holding?

GREENBERG: It's not the Tigua drum.

E: No. O.K.

GREENBERG: It looks like, it looks more like a xxxx drum. I looked at the newspaper article. It had lacing down the side.

E: Mine has a picture of the moon on one side.

GREENBERG: The Piro, did they come from the north too. Did they come south?

E: I believe I read and I believe that the Piro was here already when the Tigua came over. The Piros, the Manso, and other.....

GREENBERG: Were already in this area. And the Tigua have incorporated some of the Piro.

E: Right, as a matter of fact they became part of the Tigua.

GREENBERG: Were they very similar in costume and so on, do you think?

E: I think so. Because some of the chants that I do are more on the Piro side.

GREENBERG: Is that right?

E: Yes, and if you notice the difference in some of the chants that I do and some of the chants that xxxx do. Because xxxx and xxxx, they learned from my father also. For many years they were separated and they learned from the pueblo. So my chants and his are just a little bit different. But a lot of it is mixed together with the Tigua cause they learned from my father when they were small. They used to live right across my dad, and xxxx and xxxx father used to make them go out there so my Dad could teach them. He used to take them after school. So therefore they learned.

GREENBERG: Any other differences between the groups or similarities that you could remember? The Piro are gone...

E: They're gone. I think my dad was one of the last living Piros that were.....My grandfather was Piro and my grandmother was Tigua so that's where the mixture came in. And many years ago they were brought into the Tigua tribe just adopted and became part of it. And they lived so many years together they just came together.

GREENBERG: Do you think the Tigua were familiar with this area before the revolt?
E: The Tigua, you're talking about, before 1680? Well I don't think so because during the pueblo revolt, happened in 1680 and that's when the Spanish brought the

GREENBERG: yes

E: that's when they brought 'em over here so I don't think before then there was no Tiguas around this area.

GREENBERG: We went out to the petroglyphs at Hueco Tanks and you showed me the basic fundamental key symbols....

E: People of the sun.

GREENBERG: People of the sun. That's an important symbol obviously for the Tigua.

E: Not only a symbol, but it carries a message. That when the last of the Tiguas is left here and he knows there are no more, he is supposed to take that drum back to New Mexico to the area where the Isletas are and bury it over there. Of course it's going to be many years from now, but that's what it means. That we belong to the people of the sun and the symbol of the house, the sun, the little arrow there, it creates the trip, the journey back to the Isleda in Mexico.

GREENBERG: Can you tell me the significance, the meaning of the star?

E: The star....Well I have always, now this is not the...a fact, but I believe that the star is supposed to have been the same as the one on the pictograph that we saw there, people of the sun. I guess that's the same meaning on it. That there's a star. Of course the one on the pictograph has eight points and this one has only five. But I guess that's as close as I can get to the meaning.

GREENBERG: The star is a sun and the sun is a star. And the sun is considered the key......What is grandfather, I read that someplace?

E: Grandfather? OK Most of us we..... The traditional people that are here, we always think about the grandfathers because the grandfathers, the elders are the ones that taught us everything we know. They are the ones that are going to be waiting for us when we go to the great beyond, showing us already the way to get there because they are there already. So we always pray to the grandfathers. When I open up a prayer, I always pray to the grandfathers.

GREENBERG: Is that the same as the people of the sun, but you also pray to the grandfathers. Is that right?

E: I think that could be well stated because, when one dies we always go towards the sun, and that's where all the grandfathers are at. And they'll be waiting for us to show us the way.

GREENBERG: Are the abuelos grandfathers?

E: Yes, of course. That's what abuelos means, grandfathers.

GREENBERG: ...that clears it up for me....
E: That's what Mario calls me, (Tay) is grandfather in Tigua. (Shay) means grandmother.

GREENBERG: Is the grandmother important in all this?

E: Women, grandmothers, and old women within the tribe, play a very important role. They're the ones that bear children. They're the ones that carry a lot of the tradition and teach their children even more than the male does. Even though we've had wise remarks about not letting the women run for office or position. That's something else, we believe that the women have an important role in any tribe because they're the ones that a actually tell the children, raise the children, take them out to functions of the pueblo. And who else does the telling in the family? The woman directs the man. So, they play a very important role.

GREENBERG: ok. One of the things I neglected to ask before, when we went to see the pictographs in the Hueco Tanks area that are important to you. Did your father take you to those places and showed you the....

E: Oh, yes. I remember, long time ago, we'd go out there. He used to take me from one place to another. As a matter of fact there's still a cave there. He used to take me down there and say "Look, your grandfather used to hide in this cave." My grandfather's name is there. Right now, like the day we were up there I couldn't remember, I don't know where it is. I asked Marty, You know that cave where my grandfather's name is at? The next time we go will you take me because I forgot where it was.

Yes, we used to climb and he used to show me the way, the people who used to go and hunt for water. There's entrances to the top that you can climb and actually there's a chamber that you can go and there's always water there.

GREENBERG: Is that right?

E: It's above, where you took the pictures of the symbol? It's above there.

GREENBERG: So you have to walk up?

E: Yes, we used to climb. My dad used to be a real good climber. Even when I was in the service I used to come over and we used to go up there.

GREENBERG: It was very important obviously. Why are those symbols xxxx Hueco Tanks xxxx Is that area sacred for you.

E: By all means. We still go up there and pray frequently. In 1991 my grandchild came from Sacramento and that's where, I went up there and we spent the night up there and I gave him a name up there. It's like, you're given an indian name. That's the way you do it. You go up there and wait for dawn, and when the first sunlight comes up, the first thing you see or you imagine at that time, that's the name that's given to whoever you're going to give a name to.

But maybe three or four weeks ago, three weeks ago, the then governor and myself and the warchief xxxx we went up there. We did a little praying. We took some pictures. The war captain does go very often over there.

GREENBERG: That symbol. Going back to the sun symbol. Is that Tigua or is it Piro....?
E: Oh that's Tigua. That was put there by the Tiguas. It's a sign put there so we could see it and refer back to it as time went by.

GREENBERG: Do you think that pre-dates the move in 1680? Or do you think the Tigua put that there afterwards?

E: It was put there after we got here. And god only knows how. It's been there so long.

GREENBERG: What other symbols, I don't like that word, what other drawings that are important to the Tigua that you can tell me?

E: No, that symbol is the only symbol that I know of that has to do anything with our tradition as far as a message that was left there for us. Other symbols that are there are the picture craft of a battle that took place there. An for many years we thought that it was an Apache picture graph of a that took place with the Apache people, but later on, much later, 1960 let's say, 68 or 69 we came to find out that it was a Kiowa picture graph.

The story that took place, I don't know how far back, but let's say a couple hundred years ago, the battle that took place between the Kiowas and the Tiguas. That came about because of me doing a chant there for the housing authority and this lady from (Anadarko), Oklahoma recognized one of the chants. After discussing it back and forth, she went home and told her grandfather about it and her grandfather being an elderly man remembers that many years ago that same picture graph, after him coming over and seeing it, they had it in (Anadarko) buffalo robe. The same scene.

He said it was the story of a battle and the peace offering and that the Tiguas and the Kiowas at that time had exchanged gifts and in return we had received the round dance. There's only two pueblos that have a round dance, the Taos and the Tiguas.

GREENBERG: Is that right?

E: Yes, the round dance came from the Kiowas. In return we gave them a drum and they gave us the round dance. We became friends then. This was just by accident, we found that out.

GREENBERG: Do you do the round dance still?

E: Oh yes, every year that's the ending. We finish with a round dance. We finish our dances with a round dance where we all get together in a circle and we're dancing.

GREENBERG: What time of the year does that happen?

E: We do it on the 13th

GREENBERG: Oh that's the finish dance, the final.....

E: Yes, that's the final. After we do all....everybody dances then that day when we finish, we do a round dance and then we're finished for the day.
GREENBERG: xxxx, Tigua, Ysleta del Sur....

E: Have a round dance.

GREENBERG: Let's move our questions to xxxx. I know, for instance, that some of the Tigua were guides for the military in battles with the Apache. In fact (F) had some pictures of some of his relatives that were in that. Would you tell me what your father told you about the salinas, the salt flats and places like that. The importance of those things.

E: We go back to the guides and scouts. My great-grandfather (Name) was one of the scouts. My dad and I took several trips when I was young and when I became an adult over to salt flats. He used to tell me stories of when he was younger, before I was born, that they used to go out there and gather salt for their own use. They used salt for consumption and for tanning. There were different....I can't remember, but there was different things that they used to gather that salt for. They used to bring blocks of salt from up there.

We used to walk along the flats there and talk quite a bit and squat down and taste it. It was just something, I never took part in it. I used to go up there but I never did fetching any of the salt like myself. But he did and so did my grandfathers did.

GREENBERG: Do you know how often they went?

E: Well, if I'm correct in the way they used to do things, they could only go twice a year. It used to take 'em maybe a week or so to get up there. It used to be a venture going up there. Two, three days going up there. Three four days coming back.

GREENBERG: Do you know what times of the year they went up there?

E: No, no idea. But it might have to be during the autumn or spring because of the heat and extreme cold. It used to be very cold back then, I guess, colder than now. And they didn't have the protection that people can get now.

GREENBERG: Did he do anything else when he was up there, that you know of, did he pray....

E: My father did, how would you say, very exclusive, because I was very young, and he did used to do some praying.

GREENBERG: At the salt flats.

E: Yeah

GREENBERG: You don't know anything about why it was

E: No, but it had to be something sacred because he never brought me to it. He used to do it all by himself.

GREENBERG: All by himself?

E: Yes, and he'd say, "Wait for me right here, I'll be right back." Of course I'd be out there picking on the
salt, running around and back and.....Mostly hunting for lizards with a sling shot. I was very young at the time.

GREENBERG: How many other people went out there that you know of?

E: Oh, I mean, Like I remember Pablo, Pablo Silvas used to go over there. I don't know if xxxx used to go over there. Cause they used to go with my dad. My dad used to have an old Model A or Model T

GREENBERG: Pe..... is the one who lives next to Joe A?

E: Who?

GREENBERG: G.....

E: Yeah, he's the guy that got his award. They were a lot younger than my dad but he used to take them with him. They used to go up there and gather firewood, maybe salt, something. They used to spend a week, maybe two weeks up there.

GREENBERG: And they would bring back this material to the pueblo?

E: To the pueblo. A lot of that was, you know, they didn't sell it but they used to..
GREENBERG: distribute?

E: Distribute it. Yeah.

GREENBERG: Did they collect the plants up there too, medicinal, and the like that you know of?

E: They always gathered, I even go up there now and get some of those medicinal plants. When we go by there, I haven't made a special trip but when we go by there, I say, I take a family of mine or my inlaws go up to Carlsbad, we stop along the road. We have a medicinal plant we call Ohaseh. It's like a tea, little leaves, and you brew it. It tastes like uh... little hot like it's got (chili)? in it. But it's very soothing for your stomach. And I always have a jar full of it at home, and I'm kind'a running low on it so I'm gonna have to..... The last time I was at Hueco Tanks I looked for some and couldn't find any.

GREENBERG: Before I come to that question, am I pronouncing his name right?

E: xxxx. His real name is.... I don't remember his first name. I just know him by xxxx.

GREENBERG: I don't know. Tell me, the white gypsum sand. What lake did they go to the bottom lake or the upper lake that you know of for the salt?

E: I've only been to the bottom.

GREENBERG: Ok (G) indicated that they often went to the, probably with your father, to the upper lake to get not only the salt but the white sand, the gypsum sand. Did you hear anything about that before?

E: I'm trying to remember what they used that sand for. A lot of people used to use it for whitewash. They
used to go up and bring that for whitewash.

GREENBERG: And also for the pottery

E: Mix it with clay.

GREENBERG: What's the Tigua perception of the Guadalupes. I know the Hueco Tanks have a very special meaning to the Tiguas but what about the Guadalupes?

E: One important ideal thing that we have in mind we would like to have it preserved you know. Keep people from going up there and just destroying it. We feel, I feel that Guadalupe, the salt flats should be left like it was. I don't see that people not going there, but most of the elder people very touchy on the subject, saying that they don't want to see somebody taking truck loads of that, making roads through there, fencing it was just not proper, not kosher. Something that had been there for so many years.

GREENBERG: And the Rio Grande indians always went there anyway?

E: Oh yeah

GREENBERG: Would you say the Guadalupes are as important to you as Hueco Tanks?

E: Hueco tanks I would say is more important than Guadalupe.

GREENBERG: What about some of the shelters and caves at Guadalupe and Carlsbad? Not the big cave at carlsbad. But did your people ever go up in those areas that you know of?

E: Only by hearsay. My dad used to tell me that when they used to go up in there they used those places as shelter from the cold.

GREENBERG: They used the...

E: Some people have.

GREENBERG: That's as far as you remember

E: That's as far as I heard. My father used to tell me that.

GREENBERG: What is your perception of Guadalupe Park and Carlsbad Caverns National park?

E: I just can't comment on that. (laugh)

GREENBERG: You have feelings about how Texas runs the state park at Hueco Tanks....You're not real happy about that?

E: I'm not real happy about the way the State of Texas does a lot of things. (laugh) They don't..... The state of Texas always bragging about how much they preserve history. Yet when it comes to native Americans, they don't give a damn about..... They thought about that in 1968-69 they wanted to get out of the indian business and I wish they did. Sunset committee came over and abolished the Texas state indian commission
and Jim Maddox, the attorney general, issued an opinion JM 17 there was no such thing as indians in the state of Texas.

And a senator in the state made a remark, publicly, he said one time, "I thought we sent all you indians to Oklahoma a long time ago." (laugh) Like that. Not very happy with 'em.

GREENBERG: Anything else you want to add. Anything you can recall about that area? the Guadalupes? Salinas? Anything you can remember.

E: No, not that I can remember right now. I know that the salt flats played an important part for the Tiguas back before my time. I'm 62 years old. Back then was very important for our people to have a place where they can gather salt, medicinal plants. Those were all our traditional grounds that, not only did we hunt on them, gather food, but it was a place of prayer. Sure we had our church here but a lot of us feel more comfortable in the.... do it and we have our own religion. We do go out there and do our praying.

GREENBERG: Wherever...?

E: Yes, wherever, like my father used to say that he's "libere pensadore." He's a free thinker. He doesn't have to be in church to do his praying, he does his praying elsewhere. I guess, our church here, catholicism, was brought to us by the Spanish. But, like I've told a lot of people, we had our own way of praying and the Spanish people bought it because it is our way of getting around the catholic system where we make our fiestas. We actually are doing prayer not only to the corn, to the earth, but to other issues. And we used to............

tape interrupted, end of tape, other side

E: Because of the force they used, we used to go ahead and keep from having a conflict between us and the spanish people, we did it, we used to go to church, we did it, the whole, our ceremonies out there. They didn't know what was going on. We were actually praying to our gods, to our grandfathers in that images, a lot of people did it to San Antonio but back than when we started the whole way of worshipping their saints, which are our saints now, it was done in the way that actually they didn't know. We were the only people that knew what was going on. It's just like burial ceremonies that we have. We don't do them inside the church, we do them outside the church.

GREENBERG: xxx?

E: Of course, hopefully when I pass on it will be done the same.....It will be, because I instructed the war captain to make sure he does it. (laugh) We feel very strong about that.

GREENBERG: Burial outside the church.

E: Yes, I mean, the ceremony, outside the church, yes

GREENBERG: During the ceremonial round of activities that you have. The various dances that go on, there's prayer obviously that's going on during this ceremony important to the Tigua. Would that be a correct statement?
E: Yeah, because it all goes back to thanksgiving that we are here, and we are giving thanks for the things that we are going to receive, and for the things that we have received that year. And a lot of people, you are going to be here for the fiesta?

GREENBERG: Yes

E: You are going to see that a lot of people go up there and pay penance. Their penance to St. Anthony. And it's all prayer. We have other ceremonies throughout the year that are giving thanks to different things that we go ahead and honor them with our dancing and our chants.

GREENBERG: Are those catholic activities, or are those traditional.

E: Like I told you before, we pick these days because a long time ago before..... before.... There's very few people that know that even right now, that these dances were performed because our tradition, our belief, and our prayers. They just happened to fall on those days in the catholic people, the priests and all the Spanish people thought we were devoting this dances and all this prayer to that certain saint. But it was not, it was to our own belief, the grandfathers.

GREENBERG: Alright, sort of a dual purpose.

E: Well our purpose was to do it and to make the other people believe that it was in the honor of somebody else.

GREENBERG: What about... Go ahead. Sorry.

E: Because we were forbidden. We were forbidden to do our own prayer. That's all we've been asking for. A place to live and a place to worship our own way. Since it was taken many years ago, we had to find other means to do it. To satisfy our needs and so for the Spanish not to know we were doing it our way we made it look like we were doing it for them.

GREENBERG: Is that still true today do you think?

E: It's very true because we're still doing it. And uh all the people. Probably the church doesn't know actually know. As a matter of fact very few people... I have talked to some of the people here that why we do this and how it became this way...and now this was handed down from my father you know. He had a very unusual way of saying how we fooled the Spanish even though they thought they were ruling. But we used to go their way but actually we went our way. Under the whiskers we used to say. (Spanish term) We used to fool them and they couldn't see it but we got away with it. We're still doing it even though a lot of people are not aware of the way it happened but that's the way it happened and we're still doing it.

GREENBERG: What's the most important dance that's coming up?

E: Yes this is our feast day. This is our corn dance that is actually geared up many years ago for the fields where we used to go and........ You weren't here for the fourth of June were you? Where we went out for the saints?

GREENBERG: Yeah
E: Yes you were. That was the beginning of the season when the people used to go to bless all the fields... we used to go...

GREENBERG: Oh... Is that what these processions were about basically to go out and...

E: Yes. Go open the irrigating ditches that used to irrigate the whole pueblo. That was the center of it. And that time used to gather there and groups of people used to go in different directions, the four directions so they could start the irrigation of the season. And now it's being done the same way and also we used to gather... what would you call that? Gifts from the surrounding neighbors so we could have food and something to dress up the church with... and that was the beginning of the irrigation season.

GREENBERG: Alright. That was the 13th for the irrigation... June 4th I should say...

E: Yes, was the beginning.

GREENBERG: To go out to the (sekyas) and?

E: To go out to all the (sekyas)

GREENBERG: Water.

E: Right.

GREENBERG: All right. Now it's become the people go out and... instead of going out and blessing they now go out and... well they also...

E: Well you see there's four Saint Anthonys that go with each group. and the people still do the same thing. They wait for the saint to come to their house so they can pray to St. Anthony and most of the neighbors were Spanish and Mexican people and they used to receive the saint from the Indian people. And they used to go on and make gifts and the gifts naturally came to the church and to the surrounding area to help pay for the things we used to do. And we still do that.

GREENBERG: So what is the connection into the irrigation part of that? This was just done at the time as a blessing to ....

E: For a blessing for our crops. That was the beginning. When irrigation first started on the 4th of June that's when they used to go to the Ola confecta. The confectas are those little shutoff....

GREENBERG: Right.

E: That's when they used to go and open them. That day. And they used to go to the different parts of the pueblo on the four sides.

GREENBERG: And also they're blessing the crops?

E: Right, the blessing of the crops. And then we came on the 13th we started our corn dances. The same thing.
GREENBERG: The corn dance starts on the 13th?

E: Right. The (visas) tres visas you know the 1st, 2nd and 3rd visas.

GREENBERG: Are those corn dances?

E: Yeah uh hun...

GREENBERG: I was trying to figure out. Watching closely I was trying to see the woman and the man when they're dancing together. Is that the third?

E: Third philo

GREENBERG: Is that when they're dancing together? That means that they're working together?

E: Working together, dancing, and if you're going to be here on the 13th you'll notice that the arrows that they use are covered with corn stalks. They actually put corn on 'em, or just the leaf. They go very early on the 13th and gather some corn. It sits about this high...and we bring it back and wrap the arrows with corn, or leafs.

GREENBERG: The primero baile. What's that?

E: It's the beginning of the starting part of the blessing. If you notice how they dance like sort of like a circle. It's a journey going out there. And then go back and forth. Just like blessing like going through rows like in a corn field. And then at the end how they do like a cross?

GREENBERG: Right

E: Blessings.

GREENBERG: So all three dances are basic blessings? Would you say that?

E: Blessings, thanking

GREENBERG: Working together?

E: Working together and the unity of the people.

GREENBERG: What about the dance that you don't practice until the...

E: The Segura? That's a big cross also. That's a thanks and a blessing of what is going to take...We close the whole dance. I mean, those tres visas? Like that. The Segura is danced at the last time.

GREENBERG: What dances occur at the church then? Outside the church?

E: All four of them.
GREENBERG: Then you come back over to the Tousla?

E: Then we come back to the Tousla.

GREENBERG: Is the public invited over there?

E: Oh yes. After the last dance at the church the cacique will stand out there and invite the public that's out there to come out here and have lunch with us. Hopefully by next year we'll have a Tousla a dining room built over there because we're starting to do that. Instead of using the restaurant in here we're gonna go over there. We're using the community center before but now this year it's gonna be here, like last year. And we're building our Tousla, we're enlarging it so we can have a kitchen so we can feed the people.

GREENBERG: OK, alright.

E: It's just like in other pueblos, you know.

GREENBERG: What's the difference between the touslas?

E: Uh, the Tousla is just about the same thing as the kiva. There used to be uh, in the kiva, only certain people are allowed in there. The elders, council, people that do the praying. In here we hold our... this is more of a meeting hall and the kiva is more of a praying hall.

GREENBERG: Do you use the kiva any more?

E: Not any more. But we used to, I think there's uh.. It shows signs that we had around three kivas here. Yes. The round kivas like traditionally use.

GREENBERG:

E: And after...many years after the kivas disappeared, uh they used to meet at the cacique's house. Where ever the cacique used to live he used to make the meeting's there.

GREENBERG: A lot of the pueblos did that because the Spanish destroyed a lot of the kivas. They went into different places.

E: They wanted to destroy the way of our belief and our meetings and they didn't want us to have our own little means that uh were only for the better of the... They wanted to destroy our beliefs to start with. They wanted to go into their religion and practice their own religion.

GREENBERG: Your relationship with Isleta del Norte. How is the relationship

E: My personal relationship with them has always been very close. I have lots of friends over there. And um... There's some negative people up there that I believe that um...Well they just don't believe that we're part of them. But if they go back to 1965-67 when we got together with the governors up there...my father and some of the elders over here. There was no doubt in their minds that we're part of the same place.

GREENBERG: Sure
E: When they started comparing the chants and the way our dances were, well they have to come from over there. We just couldn't try to xxxx

GREENBERG: Sure. Can you speak tigua?

E: No I can't.

GREENBERG: Is there anybody who can?

E: There's some people that uh come up with some phrases and words.

GREENBERG: Yeah?

E: I used to now if I was to sit with my father and he used to speak to me I would be able to answer some of the.... I'd know what he was talking about. But once I get away from him ...Like xxxx here, he speaks quite a bit of it and he does a lot of talking here with the guys and all that.

GREENBERG: Is that right? Did he work up there?

E: He went to school up there. He went to school at St. Mary's or some school that a lot of Indian people...

GREENBERG: So he picked it up?

E: He picked it up.

GREENBERG: Is there an attempt down here to relearn the language of the people or...

E: Yes, there's a preschool that um the kids are being taught some of the language.

GREENBERG: Are there any tapes, language tapes.

E: I don't know. I don't know where xxxx picks it up. Maybe her mother helps her.

GREENBERG: Is she teaching ? xxxx?

E: Her maiden name is Lopez. I don't know if she has a married name.

GREENBERG: I met a guy from uh xxxx. He's an artist.

E: What's his name?

GREENBERG: xxxx. He's got a studio now in xxxx now. But he knows some people down here and I can't remember the names but he told me to look them up... (something about the language)

E: We had several people come from Isleta that were here and they taught some of the people here silversmithing and they did some of the weaving and started to teach some of the language. They were here for maybe two or three years and they went back to Isleta. Our first superintendent was from Isleta. Larry
Wanchell. He was here for maybe about three or four years.

GREENBERG: He was the tribe's administrator?
E: Yes.

GREENBERG: Alright. Who else should I talk to? ... I should talk to the cacique....
E: Yes.

GREENBERG: Who else?
E: (D) has a lot of information that he could share with you.

GREENBERG: Yeah, I'm going to talk to (D) and I want to talk to (C).
E: Yes, (C) can share a lot of information.

GREENBERG: His mother...
E: Probably. Yea you should talk to her.

GREENBERG: Who else?
E: You should also talk to (AA).

GREENBERG: (AA)? Who is.......
E: She is a cousin of mine.

GREENBERG: Where does she live?
E: Back of the Tusla?

GREENBERG: Yeah, right over there. OK.

E: Back right ....opening there. In the house right next to the canal.

GREENBERG: OK. Anybody else that you can think of?
E: (demurs)

GREENBERG: One other question I should've asked. Are people still going out collecting salt periodically? That you know of?

E: Maybe. I know that (D)'s father used to go out there, he just passed away here last year I believe. And he used to take them with him. Xxxx goes up there. I don’t know but I’m for certain, I can’t tell you.
Interview with Consultant (A) June 20, 1993

The audio cuts in with no introduction

A: I think so. Hueco Tanks which is the Tigua people, not just a place where you go and climb rocks and piddle around. It’s more like a sacred place to us. It’s lotta xxxx on it. You know, going back in the old days, it’s something that we inherit by our grandfathers. Our grandfathers used to use that area, a place not just to have a picnic but more like a place were they used to go out and camp and do their praying, you know, to the indian religion. (there are a few tape glitches in this last sentence)

So they went up there to clean theirselves out and also to pray for, not just for themselves but for the people of the pueblo as far as, you know, some of the xxxx are connected one way or another to our people. The mass that you see there is symbolic to, what we call our, (abuelos) Be xxxx tries to be like a Katchina doll, you know, that they have lot of pride in those people because the abuelos was a real special person that used to go and help other people who were in needs of when they were sick or they were happy ....or the kids look at them as something real traditional ways personal heart.

Was something there that was hard to explain to them what they were doing but it the indian religion and the legends I mean goes many years back, you know. In going back to some of those caves, some of those drawings you know, symbolic that they went there to be in touch, not by theirself but to mother nature. And you know mother nature provides lot of energy for the indian people. I mean you know we pick plants from the area but also we turn them back. I mean we don't take uh, just because we take a stake or whatever just to make something but it means to us a way of praying and the ways of doing things. It's not just that we want a stick to make a cane or whatever but it's, to us it's important. Every little plant on the area or rock, we use it for a purpose. We use, like some of the petroglyphs are down with the (amalgre). The amalgre means like very strong religion, it goes way back, very special.

GREENBERG: So the amagre is of special importance to you, and that piece of amagre that we saw at Guadalupe is something that you find importance in as well.

A: Yeah, I told em it is symbolic, the blood or hearts. And that's why it's very hardly, deeply..

GREENBERG: Felt.

A: Felt. Because the blood is going through the body and you know we cannot survive without...you know.

GREENBERG: When you go to any place else. When you go to areas besides Hueco Tanks. We've established that people periodically go the Guadalupes to collect plants for some ceremonies, do you always bless that site? Is that something, do you consider those things sacred as well.

A: Of course. We have to bless it in a way because we're taking something from mother earth and we've got to leave something for them. You know we don't just take it and say, "This is mine now." We do our thing, we return something for them, in exchange you know for we taken. It's the same way when we go deer hunting we take ourselves something to leave there for our grandfather that lives on the mountains. We got a saying that the grandfather lives on the mountains. Not just particular that area, but He's all over. He can become anything. That's why our respect is for any kind of animal. I mean, might be a bird that's around you that we know who it is. We look at him and he's, you know, he's let us know that he's around. If we do
something that we shouldn't be doing, he'll punish us one way or another.

GREENBERG: Can you tell me, what kinds of things do you leave? Is that something you can talk about?

A: It's uh, you know, we always carry our pouch, you know. We xxxx our grandfather, you know. We bless them with what we got. The corn. It could be corn or mesquite flour or other items that he likes. You know, its' not just...we do it on a term that we do that. (glitch in tape) something in a cage, you know, we're just saying that, you know, people or xxxx of different areas that we go to. That they don't know that we left something there. I think so...

GREENBERG: You think that the park people whether state or federal don't understand that.

A: No. I don't think they understand that we take a piece of earth, we leave something. You know, it could...uh...it's proof of things that we live, you know, we take something but we leave something for the purpose of our lives, everyday lives.

GREENBERG: How do you feel about the way that Hueco Tanks is being administered now.

A: How do I feel about it? I okm't think so, it's uh, ...some of those people there, since they stay at (ofero); I mean I understand what they see us coming but they don't understand what we do. It's very hard to explain to them that what we do is... it's...you know the way we feel about it it's...when we go out there we take something but it's good for Mother Earth. Not just you know just go out there and climb all over the rocks and look at the animals. But the animals to us it means, means give us a way of thinking. A way of our lives that we talk to the grandfathers in one way...another. You know, I think so it is a chain, but some of those people and that we have to put in on a piece of paper. What are we gonna do? I xxxx so that's right. It's like for me to ask him, say you go to church and you tell me what you gonna pray for on a piece of paper.

The indian way is go there and just pray. I mean we don't have to uh... Pretty soon the way I feel is like a big dictator saying like trying to keep that right from us to go in and pray and saying oh yeah we gonna bless this we gonna do that. I mean the indian way is just when they xxxx to pray to mother nature or to (waymos) is just do it. We already went to church.

I feel strong that some of those people they go mountain climbing, they destroyed our area by putting all that chemical, what you call that chemical, it's the chalk you know. It's gonna ruin it you know. Because, I'm not a scientist or whatever but, you know some chemicals will ruin other.... you know you get two chemicals mixed together that doesn't agree, it's gonna effect the rock or some of the stuff that's in there.

GREENBERG: When we went to (site in park) what were your feelings there when you first saw it? I mean you said that you identified some things that you knew because of things you'd been taught before from the grandfathers. Could you tell me a little bit about that or....

A: Yeah, I think so. Lets start from the beginning when we got there. I think the park service didn't know what to expect from us. I could feel the vibrations of the people there that uh... to see it there are, there are a lot of questions going in their minds. Are they doing the wrong thing or, or, or...What are we doing, what are they here for? I think so that, I think so they ...after that....They start to get more aware of the things of what we were doing there. I think so they got the message that we weren't there to criticize the park service for what they were doing. I think they felt we went in good heart, in good faith to identify some of our
drawings. Uh... I think there were...some of us hold back. And one of the guys in the park was holding back, you know, to do our thing. I mean, you know we don't not that we don't want to share it but that's what we're taught... when you go out there you do yourself and you put aside to...you know.

GREENBERG: When you went out there did you feel a lot of ....You said to me that you felt a lot of energy....

A: OH! Is uh you know...As I was walking I was talking to one of the rangers as uh...I was telling him "We're getting close to it." And he looked at me and said, "How do you know?" And I said well, I could feel the energy just going into my soul and my heart. There was something there that uh there was people there.... you touch the rock and you can see the... It was like a joy thing to watch what...you know here you are you know taking what you make out of it. But it was, like I felt like I was just being born again you know uh.... being real close and then xxxx you know I can (sensitive). Not because we go out of a (book) or you know we read on it.

But you know like I said before you know and I said you know I can match this to the other area. Tie this xxxx to different areas or people. Not just our tribe but many tribes that used the area the same way we do. By putting the marks that we were here too. It doesn't just belong to the Tiguas. It belongs to all (neighbor) Americans that used to come in to get more acquainted with nature.

You know some of the herbs are seen there. I saw 5 different herbs that xxxx locally. How did they got there? There was a bush there that only grows...you see it where's a lot of water in the river. It was there. How did it got there? And then not with a native american that carry... that took some from here and replant it there. Not thinking that it was gonna grow, but he left something there and it bursts out of the ground you know.

I feel that our prayers were answered by being there because if you notice we were there it was real clear, hot, I mean no clouds on the ..... sky. And when we come, we did our praying and whatever we get a blessing. We got a sprinkle of rain. That was good sign, we went in good faith and mother nature and the weather respond to us...said here's our blessing. I think overall I feel more comfortable after they saw what we were doing that some of the parks people were more at ease to us that we weren't going to go destroy. I think that in the beginning they thought we were gonna go destroy some of the stuff. No. Some of the shrines, like words in the bibles. Any kind of bible, to us, it's got a meaning, and not just that, the theory that people gonna go and do that, it's xxxx

GREENBERG: You mentioned another cave. The other cave that you spotted, you want to talk about that a little bit.

A: Yeah, I, I, I felt that it was one place that....that besides that there is another big cave around there that was just a cave of..... hiding some of our people or people of the native (neighbor?) americans that went. Because you saw different colors there of paint....uh.... to study the behavior of mother nature, the sun, the moon, the winds.

(You can hear a bird singing in the background on the tape here)
You see all the triangles. You know how the wind just do different areas. I think so thats what the meaning is. I mean I'm not a expert on indian art but I can tell you what that's what they were talking about. I mean it shows some of their drawings that there's another nother cave. You know, because that cave is more like a
place of maybe study the behavior of mother earth, what you call now today, you call astronomy. But there was, so it means there's another cave connected to that one. And as we were coming out, I saw it when we're coming in on the turn, I saw the entrance, but coming back I saw that it's twice as big...uh...maybe that's what we call the mother cave. I show it to the superintendent. I said, "You see that?" He said, "Yeah" and I look at the geographic of the canyon and I said you could probably get back there with horses or whatever they use these days to climb up there. But there is definitely another cave close to it.

GREENBERG: What do you think should be done with that area? How do you feel about management or protection of that area? Do you think it should be opened up more or less? I mean to all people at that point.

A: Well, uh, what do you mean by opening up to people, I mean, we don't want, you don't want to open it up to kids and go in and ruin it. You know, you want to people, the curious (tourists) are hungry to learn about the native american how they ///(glitch on tape) their things. You know, I think, should be, definite it should be protected more.

GREENBERG: How do you feel about the access to native americans to that area?

A: I think it is...I'm 100% for that because you get the real native americans are in to practice their own religion. They should be open more to go there and see where our grandfathers, grandfathers of other tribes did. You know, I think so its........ I don't know if you're aware that when the native americans need something for special ce/ tape turned off/

uh we don't mind traveling the distance to get that part that we need for our ceremony. We have to go 300 miles, 400 miles to get the necessarily stuff for our special ceremonies that we really need to do for ourselves, to keep the abuelas happy, to keep mother nature happy. I'm 100% for that.

GREENBERG: What about asking for.... I know with your experience at Hueco Tanks and how you feel about religious freedom and so on...um ... asking permission to go into an area is something you're not real pleased about, is that true?

A: That's true....I mean....If you....It's just like you know... going to church, any kind of religion, to ask your priest, your pastor or your rabbi, say can I have your permission to go kneel down, or to pray. That's the way I feel about it. To have permission to go...it's ....They need to be more educated, to the native american that we just don't go and walk around and destroy.

GREENBERG: How would you feel about notifying the park superintendent whether it's at Guadalupe or at Carlsbad that people were going in there to do something, to perform a ceremony or to visit a site? Do you feel the same way about that or is that something that you're still concerned about?

A: Yes. It's a concern on our religion that we have to ask permission, you know, this is what's uh..... There were no boundaries; there were no fences; there were just open..... You know, indians don't care, you know, in those days, but now it's changed and we have to go a place to open a gate to go to a site, or to get permission to go in there and do our praying, you know. I don't think so that's right. I think it should be more consult with the superintendent of the park. I feel like the native americans, when they go to a park that's been part of their xxxx area, when they see a uniform, must be like when Hitler was in power, you have to tap your knees, or your heels to say, 'I'm part of you.' No, I don't think that works like the indian ways.
I think so that's one of the things that the native american feel uncomfortable that like you know, its I don't care for the tiguas like you know, we have to have federal government with the uniform and follow us all the way around like we gonna do what you can do xxxx what you can do. We're not gonna take big chunk of herbs, I mean we're not gonna take tons or rocks. I mean, we just take a little. We take a little, we give a little back to them, to mother nature, and that's my feeling against xxxx you know for when it comes to practice our religion or our praying stuff that we it is a big no, no.

I think so that's why I think we need to educate some of those people. Say we come in here not to destroy you know, ..... uh, and seeing some of the artifacts.

GREENBERG: How do you feel about that, looking at the artifacts, and they, you know, what was your feelings about that?

A: Well, my feelings on the artifacts that some of those artifacts should be returned back to the sites because they were one way or another tied to burial sites or to ceremonies. When I'm saying artifact, I'm saying like uh, piece of pottery. There were lots on site with the people that pack away their gifts. There was something they can take with them to, to, to the good hunting grounds or whatever you want to call it. To the good spirit; it was left there. It was not just because we wanted to leave a piece of a rock there, you know,

I saw lot of metates, xx grinding stones, what you call it. That were left there because somebody had passed away or died, they were left there. They were their possessions. It's not the park's possession; it's not my possession. It is the indian people possession that they left there. Put it back. The rock that they took from the area, they return it back, they left it there for a purpose. you know. I feel strongly, uh..... seeing some of those baskets or whatever. But it is a possession of the people there. That walked the area, that walked the miles to get to that place.

You know, I think that was to me it was, I felt a vibration like I was .... at one time, or another time...I was there before. You know, maybe by xxxx or maybe by ..... my soul was there, around the area, I mean it was, to me it was an honor for me. I'm maybe being so close to the indian religion that I think, like, I was protected. There was something there that was protecting me from everything, you know, I feel like I had thousands of people protecting me. Why was that? Because we still feel that way. I mean there was something evil, because our grandfathers knew we were reliving what they relive. You know to me it was, I mean I, besides the xxxx and whatever, they didn't bother me. They didn't bother me if I had a xxxx or whatever, there.

GREENBERG: So you felt during the entire visit at Guadalupe and Carlsbad, whether we were indoors A: Yeah    GREENBERG: or outdoors, you were being protected.

A: Yeah.

GREENBERG: a very special uh

A: We just want justice to served for not for us but for the people that had those things to return back and let 'em fly to wherever they're gonna go. To their journey. You know when you take something like that you cutting the person or persons that were there, your cutting their xxxx because you're stopping a process just
like when you take a seed and xxxx the ground. If you cut the water or the you cut soil, you're taking
something from the seed to reborn again. And that's way I feel about it. (seems choked up ) / cut in tape

GREENBERG: Do you want to say anything else?

A: Yeah. (loud buzz in recording, difficult to hear) When we went up to the lake to the xx place, you know
I felt real uncomfortable with the guy telling us, "You cannot pick this thing up." We were not picking it up;
we just wanted to feel the vibration of the people was there. We didn't want to bring it back to us, we just
wanted to feel the piece of pottery to feel the vibration between uh of the people were there, you know. Just
to get the thing that were there. I mean, that travel many days, many nights to get to the area to do, you
know. Not just to pick up sand but to pick up salt, to pick herbs, special wood that we need for special
things, you know. And thats what we just wanted to...and I really uh felt that it was like you know following
off like we were gonna steal something. You know like when you go in a store and security's on your back
like "what are you gonna put in your pockets?" That's the way I felt about it.

I didn't know that the park guy had jumped on our kids on some of the people that just because they were
young, he was giving lot of xxxx as I say "you cannot take this." We were not gonna take it. We just want
to put it in our hands and felt for our people, felt when they were there, sacrifice that were done on that piece
of rock or pottery or herbs or whatever to see, you know, to get in our body, to feel the vibration, I mean, I
think so that was, I mean he didn't necessarily come directly to me to tell me those things. If he did, he
probably been, you know, on top of the mesquite (bins), you know, uh, I guess, just ....We got in the car and
were talking to some of our tribal council members, they said, "Hey, xxxx this guy is xxxx." I think so.
That's why we need to go and educate some our, some of our rangers and the people that work there.

We're not just gonna go there and destroy the whole park. I mean, it's already been destroyed by them. You
know, not giving the accurate information to how the native americans feel. I mean, it's like when they put
on our shoes and we put on their shoes to go tell the visitors, or visitors to go there to just, you know, this is
a national park and we're trying to protect the environment. Why don't they take all those artifacts and put
'em back. That's what they should do. You know, so they, you know, so the people that the native american
suffered sacrifice. Put it back to mother nature. Not keep it in a locked room with temperature controls.
Nature and mother earth will take care of that. She knows how to dispose of it and the people that put it
there and the people that die, you know, to take it with them. Give it back to them. Not keep it there in a
vault. Give it back to them are the things that make me more happy than anything else.

GREENBERG: Do you think that it's important that the park service and native americans talk and develop
a long term relationship, uh......

A: Well, yeah. I believe on that. They need to be educated by, not by a book, not by uh, historians or
archeological guys. Hear the words coming out of native americans from the mouth, not by black and white,
you know I think so that need to work one and one to understand and you would see the difference from the
public. You know, because remember, it doesn't just belong to, to, to them. It's everybody's, you know. You
get mother nature mad she's gonna, she's gonna....You know you she's gonna do something very powerful.
And you see examples of fires that been going in there; why? Ask yourself why. Destroy. Why? Because
our grandfather wants those items there in the vault or where ever brought back to where they were.

GREENBERG: talk into this xxxx....
A: Yeah, you know, to compare, the native americans don't go into cemeteries or graveyards and start digging and see what kind of bones, what the age, or what left there for them. You know, the Jewish or Baptist or whatever, they always leave something that he personally take with him. We don't go and open up and say "Oh, yeah, we want uh...let's see how much money the Jewish or xxxx put in there. It's theirs. Why take it. Don't take it. Leave it there. If they want you to have it, they'll give it to you. Not take it.

How would you feel if I went to your house and said, "Hey, I'm gonna take this. You like it; I like it; I'm gonna take it." Right away you say, "Hey, you're trespassin', I'm gonna call the cops because that's my item, that I work hard for it." Now turn around. How would the people that died, or whatever, you went up there. We are the people that, the native americans still alive, we're trying to give that right to them back, to still maintain their things, you know, why put a skeleton or whatever to be in this place. I mean, to me those people are evil.
January 25, 1995

Mr. Glenn Fuller
Acting Superintendent
United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service
Salinas Pueblos Mission National Monument
P.O. Box 495
Mountainair, NM 87036-0496

Dear Sir,

This letter is in response to the correspondences of October 28, 1994 and later letters concerning traditional cultural properties and plans to remodel and expand the visitor's center at the Salinas Pueblo Mission National Monument. Many tribal members and members of the Tribal Council reviewed the plans to remodel your facility and supported the efforts. The tribe respectfully requests that information concerning our history and ancestry as it relates to the Salinas Pueblo Missions National Monument could be included in future displays or public presentations at the National Monument.

As was discussed in our meeting with you during the fall of 1994, the majority of tribal members are Piro Indians who migrated from the El Paso del Norte Missions, Guadalupe Mission, Senecu del Sur and Socorro del Sur, after being removed from the Salinas area in central New Mexico.

The Tribal Council has requested that the tribe be consulted regarding future developments at Salinas National Monument. Also, if there is any additional information regarding unassociated funerary objects, sacred objects, and human remains, could we please receive a copy of such studies. Also, the tribe is interested in a site visit perhaps by the summer of 1995 if that could be arranged. I will be in contact with you about this and other matters in the following weeks.
Thank-you for your time and generous invitation to the tribe. If there are any questions, please contact our office at (505) 527-1699, P.O. Box 16243, Las Cruces, NM 88004.

sincerely,

[Signature]
Andrew Roybal
Project Coordinator
September 8, 1995

Memorandum

To: Superintendent, Carlsbad Caverns

Through: Chief of I&VS, Carlsbad Caverns

From: American Indian Programs Coordinator, Carlsbad Caverns

Subject: Report on Comanche Consultation

On August 24 representatives from the Comanche Tribe of Oklahoma visited Carlsbad Caverns National Park for on-site consultation with park officials. The issues to be discussed included the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA), the park museum collection, interpretation of Comanche history and culture and other topics of mutual interest. The Comanche delegation consisted of Phyllis Attocknie, Tribal Preservation Officer; Rev. Steve Chibitty, Tribal Business Committee; Tommy Wahnie, traditional elder and medicine man; and Rosalie Attocknie, tribal elder. As the park's representative to American Indians tribes, I met the group and accompanied them throughout their visit to the park.

The Comanche group arrived at the park at approximately 9 a.m. After a brief tour of the Big Room, I accompanied them to the museum storage facility in the Visitors Center. We spent approximately 1-1/2 hours viewing the entire archeology collection. After explaining to them that the human remains in the collection had little collection information and no associated funerary objects, the Comanche group stated that they did not need to see the remains since they could not be identified as Comanche or any other tribe. I provided Phyllis Attocknie with copies of the park's Inventory of Human Remains and Associated Funerary Objects, the Summary of Unassociated Funerary Objects, Sacred Objects and Objects of CulturalPatrimony, and an inventory of archeology objects stored at the Texas Archeological Research Laboratory (TARL) in Austin, Texas. Mrs. Attocknie expressed the desire to view the collections at TARL at a future date.
The Comanche delegation examined each of the archeology cabinet drawers individually. There were several objects that generated specific interest. Rev. Chibitty identified the head of a war club that was listed as a man on the catalog record (CACA-4153). Rosalie Attocknie identified a heating stone that had also been identified as a man on the catalog record (CACA-4224). Mrs. Attocknie explained that this flat, round stone was heated then placed on a part of the body that was hurting, similar to a heat pad. An item listed on the catalog record as a scraper (CACA-4287) was identified by the group as a hand-stone for removing fat and skin from an animal hide.

They also discussed a metal projectile point, identified in the catalog records as an Apache trade point (CACA-2486), saying that it looked somewhat like metal points that they had obtained from French traders. They noted that several of the projectile points appeared to be made of stone native to their homeland in Oklahoma. They asked us to try to identify the stone and to determine where those stones may have originated. They did not specifically request repatriation of any objects at this time.

After lunch, I provided Phyllis Attocknie with copies of several park management documents and other library materials that address American Indian topics. She was interested in how the park interpreted Comanche history and culture and what resources were available for the park staff to learn about Comanche issues. I also provided her with a copy of the draft Ethnographic Overview and Assessment prepared for the park by Dr. Adolph Greenberg.

From 1:30-2:30, the Comanche group met with Park Superintendent Frank Deckert, Chief of Interpretation and Visitors Services Ed Greene, Chief Ranger Gary Vequest, and myself. Phyllis Attocknie spoke for the Comanche delegation stating that her goal in visiting the park and in future contacts was to develop a framework of mutual assistance. She explained that the Comanches can help the park by providing the park with historical and cultural information and that the park can help them by providing access to written resources, maps, lists, and other materials that would assist the Comanche in documenting their ties to the region.

Mrs. Attocknie stated that the Comanche know that they travelled historically through eastern New Mexico and the Guadalupe Mountains for purposes of trade, contacts with the Mescalero Apaches, and for resource gathering. They know this through their own oral traditions and stories. The Comanche desire though, not to simply have the park believe that Comanches were
here because they say so, but to be able to prove to the park through positive documentation that they were here.

To illustrate some of their known ties to the region, Mrs. Attocknie told us that their people came here to collect leaves from sotol stalks which were combined with tobacco and rolled into a corn husk cigarette. This cigarette was smoked during peyote ceremonies and for healing purposes. Sotol is found only in the Chihuahuan Desert. Additionally, there is the root of a plant they did not know the English or scientific names, that they know "came from the mountains to the southwest". They were not sure which mountains, but believed them to be the Guadalupes. This root was chewed, sucked or eaten to relieve the pain of sore throats and colds.

Superintendent Deckert stated that the park would do whatever it could to meet the needs of the Comanche tribe and that a cooperative relationship between the park and the Comanche people would be beneficial to both parties. He suggested that the delegation visit with the staffs at Living Desert State Park and the Carlsbad (city) Museum before they left Carlsbad. Mark Rosacker of Living Desert State Park was able to provide them with the name of root that was used to treat colds since his contacts with the Mescalero Apache indicated that they also had utilized this root. (Mrs. Attocknie did not have the name readily available when I talked with her on August 28.)

After the meeting, Mrs. Attocknie further reviewed park management documents while I accompanied Rev. Chibitty and Mr. Wahnie to the cave entrance to view the pictographs. Following this the entire delegation viewed approximately 30 slides of Painted Grotto and other park pictograph sites. They did not recognize any pictographs as being of Comanche origin.

At 4 p.m., Mrs. Attocknie and the rest of the delegation met with park interpreters. She discussed general Comanche history including their migration to the southwest, traditional cultural practices, and their ties to the area. She also answered several questions from the staff. This session was extremely useful to the interpreters, enabling them to know more about the historical Comanche presence and continued interest in the park and the surrounding region.

The Comanche delegation left the park at approximately 5:30 p.m.

Jeff Denny
JDenny 8/31/95

Approved by EGreene/FDeckert 9/8/95
January 24, 1996

Memorandum

To: Superintendent, Carlsbad Caverns

Through: Chief, Carlsbad Caverns

From: Museum Specialist, Carlsbad Caverns

Subject: Report on consultation with Chiricahua Apache and Kiowa Apache representatives

On January 23 I met with representatives of the Chiricahua Fort Sill Apache Tribe of Apache, Oklahoma, and the (Kiowa) Apache Business Committee of Anadarko, Oklahoma. The representatives of the two tribes were conducting a survey of regional museum collections coordinated by Mel Campbell of Texas Tech University to view, videotape, and potentially identify culturally related materials held in the various museums. While Carlsbad Caverns National Park was not in their initial plans, the group graciously agreed to visit the park to survey the collections after their consultation at the Carlsbad (municipal) Museum and Art Center. Lupe Gooday, Jr. and Michael Darrow represented the Chiricahua Apache tribe; Alonzo Chelepah and Houston Klinekole represented the Kiowa Apache tribe.

The group arrived at the park at approximately 9:30 a.m. After brief introductions we proceeded to the collection storage room. I explained to the representatives that the human remains in storage had been classified as culturally unidentifiable due to the lack of documentation related to their original collection. Both delegations at this point declined to view the human remains. I also explained to them our methods of determining the inclusion of specific artifacts for the NAGPRA Inventory and Summary. I informed them that a copy of the park’s draft General Management Plan had been sent to their respective tribal offices and that we welcomed their comments on that draft.

We spent approximately one hour viewing the unassociated funerary objects and the remainder of the archeology collections. While several questions were posed concerning certain materials, their composition, and related collection information, neither
delegation expressed to me any specific interest in individual artifacts. Mr. Chalepah expressed particular interest in seeing any shell or beadwork, which is minimal in the park's collection. Both delegations agreed that the majority of the park's collection appeared to be prehistoric in nature and most likely did not directly concern them. The viewing was video and audiotaped by two graduate students accompanying Ms. Campbell.

After viewing the collection, I accompanied the group to the entrance of Carlsbad Cavern to view the pictographs, followed by a walking tour of the Cavern. Both groups expressed to me general concern over access to and management of the park's pictograph sites.

Due to the short notice of this consultation I was not able to coordinate a meeting of the delegation with park management. They departed at 1:30 p.m.

Jeff Denny
Memorandum

To: Superintendent, Carlsbad Caverns
Through: Chief of I&VS, Carlsbad Caverns
From: Museum Technician, Carlsbad Caverns

Subject: Report on consultation with Jicarilla, Apache and Mescalero Apache Representatives

On May 14 Representatives of the Jicarilla, Apache and Mescalero Apache tribes visited Carlsbad Caverns National Park for on-site consultations with park officials. Issues discussed included the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA), the park museum collection, interpretation of Native American uses in the area, such as pictographs, plants and culture, Mike Bilbo's site and pictographs survey. Also discussed were other topics of mutual interest. The delegation consisted of Orren Vigil, Jicarilla Apache Tribe; Merton Sandoval, Jicarilla Tribe; Cultural Preservation Officer Jonathan Wells, Jicarilla Apache Elder; Ellyn Bigrope, Mescalero Apache Tribe; Curator Eileen Gaines, Mescalero Apache; Ray Mendez, Mescalero Apache Elder; and Ed Natay, American Indian Program Coordinator.

The Jicarilla and Mescalero group arrived at approximately 9:10 a.m. After brief introductions and consultation with park officials they proceeded to the museum collection storage room in the visitors center. We spent approximately 1 1/2 hours, during which the groups examined each of the archeology cabinet drawers in the collection. An interest was expressed on some of the collection artifacts including CACA #4081 as to what kind of bone, CACA #2233 atlatl, CACA #3429 scraper, CACA #4224 mano. There was discussion on CACA #2486 metal projectile point, Eileen Gaines stated that it was Mescalero identifying it by being metal and it's shape. Jonathon Wells expressed that some of the artifacts were way before their time. The viewing was video taped by Orren Vigil and some photographs were taken by Ellyn Bigrope. I explained to them that the human remains had been removed temporarily from the storage, a request was made to view the remains to see how they were stored.

Time did not permit the viewing of the pictographs at the natural entrance as the group had to be at Guadalupe Mountains to view the collection there.
After viewing the collection Bill Route and I joined the group for lunch at Cavern Supply restaurant. After lunch Orren Vigil and two of the Texas Tech University museum students went to tour the Big Room while the rest of the group visited the gift shop and book store. The group left for Guadalupe Mountains at approximately 2:30 p.m.

There will be a phone contact to those that sent a letter regarding Mike Bilbo’s study.

Celia Gomez

cc:
Chief RM&VP, CCNP
Museum Specialist, CCNP
Mei Campbell
Jicarilla and Mescalero Tribal Presidents
All those in attendance of consultation

CGomez/ac 5/24/96
Approved by EGreene 5/23/96
July 24, 1996

To: Ed Natay, NAGPRA Coordinator, Southwest System Support Office

Through: Rich McCamant, Chief of Interpretation, Guadalupe Mountains National Park
Larry Henderson, Superintendent, Guadalupe Mountains National Park

From: John A. Mitchell, Museum Specialist, Guadalupe Mountains National Park

Subject: NAGPRA Consultation, May 14, 1996, with Jicarilla Apache and Mescalero Apache

It was my intention that the priorities for this consultation meeting be set by the Apache representatives, and not by the NPS or GUMO personnel. It was imperative to me that these representatives feel in control and had the ability to set their own priorities.

The tribal representatives gave us copies of their “General Concerns”, “The Inter-Apache Policy on Repatriation and the Protection of Apache Cultures”, and the “Official Appointment” of Ms. Ellyn Bigrope, Curator for the Mescalero Cultural Center, as the official NAGPRA contact person.

After introductions, a general discussion was held, principally dealing with their general concerns. Primarily, their emphasis was to ensure their continued interest, both on a general and religious basis in the Park. They wanted to ensure that their people have easy access to enter the Guadalupe Mountains for the use of natural resources, i.e., natural food plants, fibers and other materials that were once used by the Mescalero Apache. In addition, they wanted to ensure use of the mountains for ceremonial purposes such as the “Puberty Rite” and other traditional rites once practiced in these mountains.

There was also a concern that official notification occur to the Mescalero Apache Tribe of discoveries of any other cultural objects or human remains. It was emphasized generally by all participants that human remains should not be disturbed unless it was unavoidable.

Richard McCamant, the Chief of Interpretation and Visitor Services, who was representing Larry Henderson, the Superintendent of Guadalupe Mountains National Park, emphasized the seriousness of our commitment to the NAGPRA process and to their general concerns. He emphasized that no obstructions would be placed in the way of their traditional uses of this park for ceremonial or other purposes, noting that in all instances that prior official notification to the park superintendent would be required, and his official approval received on a case-by-case basis.
He emphasized that no problems were foreseen and looked forward to increased cooperation with the Mescalero Apache Tribe.

After our discussion concluded, the representatives were invited to view our collections in the museum storage area. They viewed all artifacts of concern, asking questions as necessary. A special emphasis was placed on a metal arrowhead with serrated edges and noted that it was definitely Mescalero Apache in origin. Aside from this piece, no other artifacts were identified or special concerns noted concerning the care or storage of the artifacts. I did mention prior to their inspection of our museum storage, that all our human remains and funerary objects were located at the Western Archeological Conservation Center in Tucson, Arizona, and access could be arranged if requested. The viewing of the artifacts by their representatives took around forty-five minutes and was called after they were satisfied that they had seen all of concern. They were interested in what the Comanche representatives had identified of interest, if they had requested repatriation, and what those artifacts were. All these artifacts were identified and viewed by their representatives. I have taken the liberty of identifying the artifacts here, and have taken steps to isolate these artifacts pending official notification by their representative. These artifacts are as follows:

- **GUMO 32:347** Bi-face Tips (2) C#1, D#12
- **GUMO 19:271** Stone Chopper C#1, D#11
- **GUMO 51:414** Projectile Point (metal) C#1, D#9
- **GUMO 98:589** Metate C#4, D#3

There were no other artifacts of interest to the representatives, and after viewing all artifacts in cases one and four, the consultations ended.

Additionally, the Apache representatives were taken to the Frijole Ranch complex, and then out to Manzanita Springs. Their opinions were solicited by park personnel concerning the wayside exhibit at Manzanita describing cavalry operations against the Apache here, and how it came across to the visitors. The Apache representatives felt that overall the park’s Native American interpretation was highly effective, and they found nothing disagreeable about the Manzanita wayside.

In general, I believe the consultation went well, and all participants took significant steps toward better understanding and cooperation.

John A. Mitchell
Memorandum

August 22, 1996

To: Superintendent, Carlsbad Caverns NP

From: Curator, Carlsbad Caverns NP

Subject: Report on White Mountain Apache Consultation, August 19, 1996

On Monday, August 19, 1996, three representatives of the White Mountain Apache tribe visited the park as part of an ongoing consultation project to discuss issues surrounding NAGPRA and cultural resource management, to view the park museum collections, and to talk with park interpreters about tribal history and culture. The White Mountain Apache representatives were Cultural Resource Director Ramon Riley and tribal elders Levi DeHose and Levi Henry.

An opening meeting with the Apache delegation, Superintendent Deckert, park division chiefs and resource managers was held at 9:00 in the Superintendent's office. Following introductions, Mr. Riley told us of the current state of affairs on the White Mountain Apache Reservation and of their continuing efforts at cultural preservation. He stated that the goals of their cultural preservation program were to restore Apache lands and natural ecosystems, to restore the Apache language, and to restore the health of the Apache people. NAGPRA plays an important part in all of these efforts.

The White Mountain Apache Tribe has a cultural advisory group of traditional elders that meets monthly to discuss cultural preservation issues. Mr. Riley explained that he may not be able to provide us with immediate answers to many of our questions, but may need to consult with his elders and the advisory committee before responding.

Mr. Riley explained that the Guadalupe Mountains were historically used as a corridor between the White Mountain Apache homelands and the bison hunting areas east of the Pecos River. This corridor was also utilized for the gathering of many important plant resources. He stated that his elders knew the traditional Apache names for many of the mountains between Arizona and the park, but that the Apache names for the Guadalupe Mountains region had been lost to them.
Mr. Riley told the group that mountains and caves were considered sacred places to the Apache. Mountains are holy places, like altars, he explained, and that the Apache people go to the mountains to pray. Similarly, all caves are sacred. Apache creation stories tell that the Apache people came from underground. The Crown Dancers (Mountain Spirit Dancers) also come from caves.

After the meeting, the delegation viewed a portion of the park archaeology collection. Upon their prior request, the human remains had been removed from the collection storage area. They examined the unassociated funerary objects and other possible NAGPRA-related objects. Mr. Riley explained that projectile points had more than simple utilitarian use. Points were also used to heal and protect the holder and were often buried with an individual to provide protection. No immediate claim or interest in specific artifacts was expressed at that time.

The delegation visited the natural entrance of Carlsbad Cavern. Mr. Riley told us that the roasting pit at the amphitheater was "very familiar" to the Apache. He also remarked that many of the plants around the area were "medicine" and that all of them had use and importance to the Apache people. He mentioned as we left the natural entrance that the cave was "a very sacred place".

We examined the pictographs inside the cave entrance and later viewed several slides of the Painted Grotto. Mr. Riley told us that it was hard to know if the drawings at the cavern entrance were Apache in origin. He and his elders noted several possible Apachean pictographs in the slides of Painted Grotto. He said that only experienced medicine men can interpret and know the meanings of the drawings.

When asked how the NPS should interpret these and other pictographs, Mr. Riley told us that Apache drawings were meant for Apaches and not for others. He said that it was fine for the NPS to point out the pictographs as something made by people long ago. Park staff should, however, refrain from trying to interpret the meanings of the drawings. Again, interpretation of pictographs should be left to the traditional medicine men.

When asked about how to best preserve the pictographs, Mr. Riley explained that the pictures were meant to "dissolve", thus no active preservation efforts were necessary. He felt that preservation was best achieved through documentation, preferably sketches rather than photography.

As to human remains, Mr. Riley told us that only "witches" dug up
human remains to be used for bad purposes. Human remains, he said were meant to stay in the ground undisturbed. He and his elders agreed that it would be preferable to return the human remains in the collection (and any remains discovered in the future) to the ground where they came from, or as close to the original site as possible. This reburial should be done with the appropriate ceremonies. Mr. Riley said there are individuals among the White Mountain Apache that are knowledgeable in these ceremonies.

After a brief tour of the Big Room, Mr. Riley met with park interpreters to discuss White Mountain Apache history, culture and their affiliation with the Guadalupe Mountain region. The topics discussed were similar to those already mentioned in this report. They departed the park at 5:00 pm. They visited Guadalupe Mountains NP for a similar consultation on August 20 and departed the area on August 21.
8/22/96

Dr. Greenberg,

I just finished talking with Frank who mentioned that he had just been talking to you. Since I was not able to reach you by phone, I am sending to you copies of the trip reports from this week's consultation with the White Mountain Apache and last year's consultation with the Comanche.

Over the last year we've also had the Jicarilla, Mescalero, Chiricahua (Ft. Sill), and Kiowa Apaches at the park to view the collections. Since the visits by those 4 groups were abbreviated due to time constraints, the trip reports on them don't say too much about affiliation. If you'd like to see those as well, give me a call.

Between now and the end of September we will also be hosting (along with GUMO) the Kiowa Tribe, Zia Pueblo, Zuni Pueblo and the Piro-Manso-Tiwa Indian Tribe. (Tsleta Pueblo cancelled this morning.) I will try to remember to send you copies of those trip reports as they are completed, even if they may be too late to incorporate into Overview and Assessment. I'll ask John Mitchell at GUMO to do the same.

I'll be in the office today (8/22) then gone 'til next Friday (8/30). Feel free to call me or leave a message.

Thanks for all the work so far. The Assessment looks like it'll be a good reference for us as we move ahead with our consultation program. Hope this info helps.

Jeff Denny, Curator, CACA
505-785-2232, ext 457
fax 505-785-2302
email Jeff_Denny@nps.gov
A. Comanche tribe: Comanche Tribal Preservation Officer Phyllis Attocknie contacted Curator Jeff Denny during a NAGPRA conference in Oklahoma City in July, 1995 stating that the Comanche had historically passed through the Guadalupe Mountains for trade, contact with the Mescaleros, and resource collection. Representatives of the Comanche tribe came to both parks in August 1995, met with park managers and viewed park collections. At Carlsbad Caverns, Mrs. Attocknie explained that the Comanche collected sotol stalks which were used in making ceremonial cigarettes. (Sotol is found only in the Chihuahuan Desert). She also said that historically, the Comanches collected a plant (name unknown) found only in the "mountains to the southwest", believed to be the Guadalupes, that was used for healing purposes.

B. Chiricahua Apache: Members of the Chiricahua Ft. Sill Apache Tribe contacted Denny at the Oklahoma City NAGPRA conference in July, 1995, as well as an all-Apache NAGPRA meeting in Mescalero, NM in September, 1995, concerning their traditional affiliations with Guadalupes and the surrounding region. Tribal representatives visited both parks in January, 1996, as part of a NAGPRA grant administered through Texas Tech University to view park collections. Due to time constraints, detailed discussions concerning their traditional affiliations with the area did not take place, though they expressed a desire to continue working with the parks on NAGPRA and cultural resource issues.

C. Kiowa Apache: Also contacted Denny at the Oklahoma City conference, the Mescalero meeting, and visited the parks with the Chiricahua Apache group in January, 1996. The results of these meetings were similar to those stated above for the Chiricahua Apache.

D. Jicarilla Apache: Jicarilla representatives also contacted Denny at the Oklahoma City and Mescalero meetings concerning their traditional affiliations with the region. They visited the two parks to view the collections and meet with park management as part of another Texas Tech grant in May 1996. At Carlsbad Caverns, Tribal elder Jonathon Wells explained some of the Jicarilla attitudes towards the disposition of human remains in park collections. The delegation expressed concern about access to the park for the gathering of plants for traditional ceremonies. They also expressed concern about a proposed pictograph site survey project. They have a strong desire to continue a dialogue with the park about cultural issues.

E. Kiowa tribe: Lawrence Edge, then the NAGPRA representative for the Kiowa tribe, talked with Denny at the Oklahoma City meeting (July 1995) about Kiowa affiliations with the Guadalupe Mountain area. Contact with the tribe was re-established in August 1996. Environmental Director and acting NAGPRA rep Hammond Motah reiterated the Kiowa affiliations with the region and tribal interest in working with both parks and viewing the collections. Tribal representatives will visit the parks in September, 1996.

F. Isleta Pueblo: Through association, Carlsbad Caverns NP felt that if it was consulting with Ysleta del Sur, then contact with Isleta Pueblo would be logical and valuable. Phone contact was established between Denny and Pueblo Governor Alvino Lucero in July, 1996. Governor Lucero indicated a strong Isleta historical affiliation with the Guadalupe Mountains. A visit to both parks from the Governor and other Pueblo representatives is anticipated in September, 1996.
G. **Piro-Manso-Tiwa Indian tribe:** Tribal representatives and representatives from the NPS Intermountain Cultural Resource Center met in Las Cruces in September, 1995. The PMT claimed relationships to the Mogollon cultures and other pre-Columbian tribes known to be in the Carlsbad region. Phone contact between Denny and PMT representatives in July 1996 indicated their interest in meeting with park management to discuss NAGPRA and other cultural issues. They are scheduled to visit the parks in late September, 1996.

H. **Zia Pueblo:** At a NAGPRA meeting in Albuquerque, NM in June 1995, Zia representative Peter Pino said that there was a name for Carlsbad Cavern in the Zia language. He stated that the Zia people had early ties to the region and that they made regular trips to the area until they were restricted from doing so by the Spanish. Contact with the Pueblo was re-established in a phone call from Denny to Celestino Gachupin, the Pueblo's NAGPRA contact in August, 1996. Gachupin explained that the Carlsbad-Guadalupe region was a significant part of Zia history. He explained that different Zia societies held certain locales as significant to that society. The Fire Society among the Zia was associated with the Guadalupes. Gachupin explained that whenever someone from the Fire Society makes a speech, they call upon spirits from the Carlsbad area for assistance. Gachupin and other Zia representatives will visit the two parks in September 1996.

I. **White Mountain Apache tribe:** At both the Oklahoma City and Mescalero meetings, Ramon Riley, Cultural Resource Director for the tribe, spoke of the cultural affiliations of the Western Apache with the Guadalupes. In a follow-up letter from Riley in October, 1995, he listed both Carlsbad Caverns and Guadalupe Mountains NP's as having collections potentially affiliated with the White Mountain Apache tribe. This affiliation was reiterated in a conversation between Denny and Riley in July, 1996. Tribal representatives will visit the parks in August, 1996.

J. **San Carlos Apache tribe:** Seth Pilsk of the San Carlos Apache tribe called Denny in August, 1996, after hearing of the White Mountain Apaches planned visit to the park. He reiterated the Western Apache interest in the Guadalupes and expressed an interest in working with the two parks on cultural issues.

K. **Zuni Pueblo:** In a cultural affiliation statement dated October, 1995, Zuni Pueblo claimed cultural affiliation with a number of pre-historic cultures, including the Jornada Mogollon. Since the Jornada Mogollon is heavily represented in the Guadalupe-SE New Mexico region, Zuni was contacted in July, 1996 about consulting with the parks. Joseph Dishta of the Zuni Heritage and Historic Preservation Office expressed Zuni interest in working with both parks and Pueblo representatives will visit the parks in September, 1996.
September 5, 1996

To: Superintendent, Carlsbad Caverns NP
From: Curator, Carlsbad Caverns NP

Subject: Report on Zuni Pueblo Consultation, August 30, 1996

On Friday, August 30, 1996, three representatives from the Pueblo of Zuni visited the park to discuss issues surrounding NAGPRA and cultural resource management and to view the park’s museum collection. The participation of Zuni Pueblo in the park’s consultation program was prompted by the “Pueblo of Zuni Statement of Cultural Affiliation” (7/11/95) that asserts Zuni ties to the Jornada Mogollon culture which is prevalent in the archaeology of the Guadalupe Mountains regions. The Zuni representatives were Wilton Niiha, Perry Tsadiasi, and Calvert Ondelacy.

An introductory meeting was held with Superintendent Deckert and park division chiefs. The Pueblo representatives explained that they were members of a seven-person cultural advisory team for Zuni Pueblo. A primary purpose of this team is to consult with outside agencies on NAGPRA issues, particularly those issues regarding the disposition of human remains and objects of cultural patrimony. They asked that some of the topics to be discussed during the day remain confidential.

They explained that the Pueblo of Zuni claims cultural affiliation with all areas within New Mexico, Colorado, Utah and Arizona. According to Zuni oral traditions, the Zuni people emerged from the Grand Canyon with three groups migrating into different areas. One group went north into Utah, Colorado, northern New Mexico and northern Arizona; one group went south to Central and South America; and the final group moved into the area of present-day Zuni Pueblo, known to them as the “Middle Place”.

As to their affiliation with the Guadalupe Mountains region, the representatives stated that this region is part of the Zuni people’s aboriginal lands and that there are place names in this region mentioned in traditional Zuni prayers. The area was used for hunting and gathering by ancestral Zuni’s and there are Zuni names for specific locations from the Silver City area east towards the Guadalupes, and from the Santa Fe area south into this region. (They specifically asked that we avoid use of the word “Anasazi” in referring to their ancestors, since it is a Navajo word meaning “enemy ancestors”, not “ancient ones” as commonly perceived.)

Zuni oral traditions speak of caves “down in the south”, with no specific locations mentioned. The Zuni representatives said that
ancestral Zuni's named larger regions for significant features they encountered in those areas. The Zuni name for the Carlsbad Caverns-Guadalupe Mountains area is "Asho:sti an alaluckwa" which translates as "Bat Cave" or "Bat Canyon".

The Zuni position on the disposition of human remains is that human remains cannot be repatriated. In their view, once a person is buried, that individual has already nourished the earth. Taking the individual out of the ground and later reburying them interrupts the continuing journey that the individual has to take.

A Zuni burial ceremony is done only once, they said. The Zuni culture has no ceremony for reburial and they "can't make one up" since those rituals are handed down over many generations. While they would prefer that remains be reburied without ceremony, they rely on the Hopi people to handle repatriation and reburial since the Hopi's have a reburial ceremony that can be used in these situations.

The Zuni's prefer that remains, including inadvertent discoveries and those currently within the collection, be reburied at their original location or as close to that location as possible. In order to prevent future remains from coming into park collections, the Zuni would prefer that the park not approve future excavations that are likely to uncover human remains.

In cases of inadvertent discoveries of human remains, they suggest that the remains be reinterred and the area be covered using natural vegetation where possible, although it would be preferable to move the remains if they were in danger of further disturbance by visitation or future erosion. They stated that they were opposed to any analysis, destructive or not, of human remains.

Following the opening meeting, the Zuni delegation viewed the pictographs at the cavern entrance and slides of the Painted Grotto pictograph site. They then proceeded to the museum storage area to view the collections. They did not indicate immediate interest in any specific objects for the purposes of repatriation under NAGPRA. Several objects did elicit comments from the group.

A wood artifact (CACA 4301) was described as being a reed cigarette that is smoked in traditional ceremonies.

They noticed several shell artifacts and pointed out that these indicate the expanse of trade between this region and coastal areas to the west.

A stone pendant (CACA 3508) they said was of a type of stone found in the Grand Canyon area. This type of material was ground up and used in the rituals of their medicine society.
A circular shell artifact (CACA 3138) was described as being similar to shells used in the jewelry of the Longhorn Kachina in the Zuni Shalako ceremony.

Old projectile points are considered to be the property of the individual that finds the point. These points have significance to the finder and are often worn around their neck for the protection of the individual.

The "official" consultation activities were concluded by 12:00. Following a brief tour of the Big Room, we decided to forego the afternoon 4:00 meeting with park interpreters because of the long wait for that meeting. The Zuni representatives left the park at approximately 2:00 pm.