OPENING THE ROAD TO CHESLER PARK:
HOW AL SCORUP INADVERTENTLY HELPED
CREATE CANYONLANDS NATIONAL PARK

BY CLYDE L. DENIS

In 1927, the soon-to-be-renowned geologist Arthur A. Baker, working on
his doctoral dissertation at Yale University, came to southeast Utah to
study the region’s geological history for the U.S. Geological Survey. He
and his assistants required a reliable way to access its backcountry. For the
Canyonlands area, which had not been previously mapped and charted,
Baker recorded only one note about how to get in: “J. A. Scorup.” Scorup,
head of the Scorup-Sommerville Cattle Company headquartered at Dug-
out Ranch just east of the present-day Needles District of Canyonlands Na-
tional Park, would be able to provide the necessary horses, camping gear,
and general information to make possible this first geological excursion
into the Grabens of the Needles area. The Grabens, a series of long sunken
valleys richly endowed with grasses, was Scorup’s critical winter grazing
area, and he knew it well. As there were no paved or even jeep roads at that
time into the Grabens, horses provided the best means of transportation
(in fact, Baker’s car failed on the rough dirt roads coming to Dugout Ranch
and had to return to Moab for repairs). The trail over Elephant Hill and
into the heart of the Grabens was rocky, difficult, and often precipitous.

Today this access to the Grabens is primarily by jeep and at many locations
remains a treacherous route, one that is prone to wreck even the most
sturdy of four-wheel drive vehicles. How did this horse trail route get con-
verted into this jeep-access road? Was it the result of the uranium mining
boom that followed Vernon J. Pick and Charles A. Steen’s respective dis-
covers of rich veins of pitchblende and ore in the San Rafael Swell and
Lisbon Valley southeast of Moab in 1952, as suggested by many others? A
visit by jeep to Chesler Park and Grabens in June 1949, by Ray and Virginia
Garner for their filming of the movie “The Desert,” suggests otherwise. By
1950, even Kent Frost, the first commercial jeep tour operator in the Nee-
dles area, had given up on his Ford Model A and had acquired an army-like
jeep for taking his wife, Fern, and friends into this region. Although the
Garners, with the aid of their guide Merle Winbourn, and Frost separately
used dynamite and other means to improve the jeep path, neither constructed the road. Rather, Scorup put the jeep road in, not for jeeping but for his cattle operations. Yet, this led to an unintended consequence. Opening the Grabens to jeep travel enabled Frost, Arches National Monument Superintendent Bates E. Wilson, and others to showcase the region. These visits in turn created renewed public and political interest in a federal designation for the area, leading to the eventual establishment of Canyonlands National Park in 1964—something Scorup had been vehemently opposed to since the 1930s, as such a designation would have precluded his cattle grazing.

John Albert Scorup, appropriately called “the Cattleman of the Canyons,” oversaw a vast cattle empire (the largest in area in the country) that ranged from the east side of the La Sal Mountains (Geyser Pasture) and into the northwestern section of Paradox Valley in Colorado, all the way to the San Juan River in the south. With routinely 7,500 to 12,000 cattle, Scorup’s empire encompassed lands that included Dark Canyon and sections that stretched west to the Colorado River; White Canyon had been under Scorup’s control since the late nineteenth century. The nexus of this dominion, purchased in 1918 from the Indian Creek Cattle Company run principally by David L. Goudelock and Harry G. Green, was Dugout Ranch where Scorup had his infrequently used two-room shack of a home, blacksmith, bunkhouses for the cowboys, and principal hay-producing lands. The Grabens sat just twenty miles west of Dugout. It was here and in the adjacent Chesler Park where H. Shisler, Melvin R. Turner, Thomas P. Trout, Goudelock, and other cowboys had wintered their cattle. This region, devoid of year-long water sources, provided ample grasslands if a daily water source were available for the cows. From January to March the winter snows could sustain up to six hundred cattle that Scorup kept in the Grabens. In other seasons, sporadic rains would drain away in the sandy soils. Importantly, springs were too infrequently found and other natural catchments too infrequently filled to sustain a herd. Depending on the year, in late March cowboys from Dugout Ranch would venture up Elephant Hill and into Devils Lane, collect the cattle, and drive them south to Beef Basin and the Abajo Mountains where reliable water sources could be found during the warm seasons.

But this habitual pattern was dependent on the climate. Scorup had created his cattle fiefdom during a historically wet period (1905 until 1930), but the subsequent years of the 1930s began to display the more typical pattern that remains today: many years of drought. The summer droughts from 1942 to 1945 and dry winters from 1930 to 1934 and again in 1945 and 1946 severely impacted the use of the Grabens, as evidenced by the disappearance of winter cowboy inscriptions—only two appear from 1930 to 1945, compared to nine from the preceding non-drought years of 1914 to 1929. By 1946, the climate was forcing Scorup to think creatively about his use of the Grabens.

Scorup’s solution was to construct stock watering tanks in the Grabens. These tanks would allow both more cattle to be brought in and extended seasonal use for the Grabens, possibly
from even October through April. Notably, the cost of this endeavor was minimal, as all that was needed was dozer access from Elephant Hill to the Grabens. The Devils Lane corridor would then allow reservoir construction throughout the Grabens. But in the waning years of Scorup’s cattle empire, “building stock watering tanks . . . is a story of frustration and mostly fatal problems.”

To accomplish the construction of the first eight reservoirs, Scorup hired Emery Hunt from Mexican Hat and Angus Melvin “Puge” Stocks, who ran the farming operations at Dugout Ranch, and he obtained the financial support of William J. Morgan and the Department of Agriculture’s Soil Conservation Service. As Frost later indicated, Hunt came “with his caterpillar tractor in 1947 and 1948 and knocked down some of the bigger ledges on Elephant Hill . . . . It had four or five foot ledges and was just too tough for the stock to get over easily. . . . Emo[t]ry told me he went on over Elephant Hill building roads and reservoirs in Devil’s Kitchen, Devil’s Lane towards the Confluence and Chesler Park and Chesler Canyon.” Because Stocks hated to sleep overnight in the backcountry, he flew back and forth from Dugout Ranch in his T Craft plane.

As to why “some idiot had built that crazy Elephant Hill road” guaranteed to wreck jeeps (even supposedly experienced NPS rangers hang up their vehicles with wheels jutting out over empty space), it was said that when Scorup hired Hunt to push a road over Elephant Hill he “thought he would make a decent road around the hill, the long way. But that catskinner wasn’t about to make a foot longer road than he had to for his flat $200 fee, so he built the shortest trail possible, up and over Elephant Hill, with grades easy for his tractor, but a real challenge even to four-wheel-drive jeeps.”

Unfortunately for Scorup’s plans, by the early 1950s it was evident that almost all of these stock tanks did not hold water. There were multiple causes for this. The dams themselves were earthen. Spillways were put in to allow excess water to flow over the dams during flooding episodes, but neither they nor the reservoirs were lined to prevent seepage or erosion. Moreover, Morgan at that time believed only one dam was built in an area where there was enough clay to hold water. Another reservoir (stock tank 7) was made too small and placed in a location that did not gather sufficient water. Importantly, the dams by Devils Lane were constructed too close to the graben itself. Grabens naturally enlarge width-wise as the brittle plate of sandstone upon which they exist fractures and slips toward the Colorado River. Stock tank 4, according to Morgan’s son, was “constructed directly over the slip plain of this graben. . . . It is no wonder this site did not store water.”
While all of these reservoirs failed, the clear result of this water-storing Sisyphean attempt in the Grabens was construction of the road over and down Elephant Hill, and widening the road at SOB Hill, thereby creating a path that a jeep could roam from Squaw Flat all the way to the South Grabens. This road eventually traversed the difficult Bobbys Hole into Beef Basin, the east side of Elk Ridge, and the length of Cottonwood Creek to Dugout Ranch. These latter extensions facilitated creation of many new reservoirs south of the Grabens and provided relatively easy access for trucks to deliver horses and men from Dugout Ranch to these grassland locations, significantly cutting the time required for cowboys to reach their cattle. And, critically, all of these roads predated the uranium frenzy that commenced in the summer of 1952.

Musselman had come to Utah in 1929 to visit his famous brother Roy, the exemplar of western trapping and hunting, having killed the legendary Big Foot wolf in 1920. Employed by the Scorup outfit to hunt mountain lions and coyotes, Roy kept camps throughout the Needles. Ross Musselman, after what was described as a period of poor health due to an “overworked condition” (he organized and supervised the Y.M.C.A.’s summer camps in New Jersey that served a thousand children a year), on the recommendation of his doctor, came to see his brother. The brothers explored the Needles, and Musselman immediately visualized the economic potential for a guest ranch experience for wealthy eastern youth. Musselman’s first guest ranch trip for young men was launched from Roy’s ranch in Monticello. (Roy came along the first two years as guide.) In 1933 Musselman moved his family to the 4-M ranch.

The standard horse trip Musselman offered was glowingly written up in a two-part article in *The Desert Magazine* in 1949. The youth
(ranging in numbers from 12 to 50 or so and including girls beginning in 1934) departed from Monticello, passed Dugout Ranch, repaired to Squaw Flat for a couple of days, and visited the Confluence Overlook for a day trip through the Grabens. They then explored Salt Creek, rode to the Bears Ears, and sometimes visited Natural Bridges National Monument and Monument Valley. For these 500 mile trips, an average of twenty pack horses and mules carried supplies for a party of forty traveling twenty-five to thirty miles per day—a grueling experience for young men and women unaccustomed to the rigors of backcountry travel and camping. To attract clientele, Musselman spent his winter months back East lecturing on various aspects of Native American culture and the geological and scenic beauties of Utah. In San Juan County Musselman received praise for being “a one man Chamber of Commerce,” stimulating tourism in a county that remained in economic depression following the post-WWI fall in agricultural and cattle prices and the end to dry farming.

But the Musselman-guided horse trips into the Needles would soon pass with the advent of jeep access that Scorup had inadvertently created. There were several reasons for this switch. Most critically, the replacement of horses by jeeps allowed the average tourist with limited time to make routine visits to the Grabens with an increase in both hours available for exploration and distances that could be covered. Horseback trips, almost of necessity, were long, something the typical post-war tourist with two-week vacations could not accommodate. Additionally, riding twenty hours a day in a saddle was not what most tourists desired. Jeep travel could bring one into and out of the Needles for a rich experience in as little as a day. Tug Wilson, Bates Wilson’s son, indicated that jeeps had eliminated the time to “water, feed, and saddle up the pack team, and get them all lined up for the trail, and then reverse that at night.” “With jeeps we cut off several hours of this. Just getting water for the horses . . . was always a challenge.” Camping near water would have been especially limiting in the Grabens. Warm weather visitations by jeep became commonplace and available to anybody with a four-wheel drive vehicle.

One of the first and most influential jeep trips into the Needles area was by Ray and Virginia Garner in June 1949. The importance of this trip was that it immediately induced Bates Wilson to visit the Needles (what Wilson called “the land in-between”). As Tug later indicated, Wilson “liked to learn what he did not know.”

The Garner family arrived at Arches with an important letter from the NPS director just two months after Wilson had become superintendent. “Take good care of these people. They are important,” the letter read. The Garners were established, award-winning documentary film makers visiting the Southwest for the eventual creation of a film called *The Desert*. Importantly, both were experienced in the outdoors, capable pilots, and premier climbers. Ray had made several first ascents, including the north face of the Grand Teton and the volcanic, 6,825-foot tall Agathlan in Monument Valley.
The Garners' excursions and film creations—and Wilson's introduction to Canyonlands—were made possible through funding by the Harmon Foundation, established by the Cleveland businessman William E. Harmon in 1922. It might seem ironic that Harmon, who had become wealthy by creating the concept of and developing subdivision suburban real estate, eventually helped preserve land in the Canyonlands area. On the other hand, the Harmon Foundation's mission was to foster opportunities for disadvantaged students, minorities, and rural communities for the purpose of encouraging and stimulating self-help. Creating films to broaden the country's understanding of these groups, the nation, and the world's key natural and historic areas was integral to this plan. Harmon said, "the gift of land is the gift eternal. Churches will crumble. Libraries and art galleries will turn to dust, endowments become lost, but land will be ever ready to fulfill the purpose to which it is dedicated."

Wilson, with his usual alacrity and good will, quickly arranged for his Arches maintenance man Merle Winbourn to guide the Garners to the Needles area. Winbourn was chosen for several reasons: he owned a small green CJ2A jeep and was already familiar with the Grabens area as a deer hunter and a miner. Furthermore, hiking was an anathema to Winbourn. He would rather drive to a place than walk there. That meant that some road "modifications" might be necessary in remote areas. For these purposes, he always carried sufficient dynamite (useful also for his mining) for removing stubborn sandstone boulders that blocked the path of his egress. The Garners later claimed that the dynamite caps ("we were prepared to blast our way through if necessary"), stowed away under the seats, "presented the real danger"—"needless to say, we tried to bounce easy; an impossibility in the rough country we were entering." Dynamite was also used to awaken the Garners one early morning, as Winbourn, an early riser, had become irritated with their inability to get going before late morning—an example of Merle's "dry sense of humor." All of these factors made Winbourn the perfect guide.

Key to this twelve-day trip into the deep backcountry of the Needles area was replenishing the Garners' supplies. The small jeep driven by Winbourn carried both the Garners and himself, leaving little room for the necessary extra food. Wilson solved this problem by getting Stocks and Charles Di Peso to fly their planes with additional supplies into Chesler Park where they would meet up with the Garners. The Garners initiated their trip, driving from Moab to Dugout Ranch where they spent the night "poring over maps and plans." The next day, according to Garner's account, the party came into the Needles proper and went over Elephant Hill to Devils Lane:

The way became increasingly rougher and we bounced all day, holding on so as not to be thrown out of the doorless jeep. . . . As we progressed the country became more and more spectacular. Topping a high plateau [most likely Elephant Hill] we looked out over the region and knew why it had been called 'impassable to anything [everything] but the winged bird.' The scene was weird and lonely; fascinating in its strangeness. Uncounted canyons wind their way to the Colorado, cutting intricate patterns through the high mesas. . . . To the west the gigantic innumerable 'Needles' pointed rock fingers at the sky.

Wilson, who hosted the Garners upon their return, heard firsthand about the geological beauties and archaeological wonders that the Needles area presented, sparking his interest in the area. Importantly, after seeing photographs taken by the Garners that they had developed in Moab ("great photos," as indicated by Tug, Wilson's son), Wilson wasted no time in quenching his desire to see the land for himself. That fall Stocks flew him over the region that became Canyonlands National Park, further stimulating Bates' interest. Robert Dechert, one of Wilson's wealthy cousins, a lawyer from Philadelphia, soon after inquired of Wilson as to what there was to see in southeast Utah. Dechert, a world traveler, agreed to fund a Musselman-guided horseback excursion into the Needles for that coming March. Wilson, with only a GS-9 rank and making little money as an NPS employee in 1950, was unable to afford Musselman's hugely expensive trip involving horse rentals, the
food, and the salaries of Musselman and two horse wranglers.

Wilson’s first excursion into the Needles is a study of what could go wrong on a horse trip, adversity occurring in a most beautiful place. Musselman took Wilson, Tug, and Dechert, on a ten-day shortened version of Musselman’s usual summer trip. Wilson severely regretted several aspects of it. Musselman had not properly weaned the horses off their winter feed. This resulted in the horses becoming exhausted and essentially useless by the time they had only traversed halfway from Dugout Ranch to Squaw Flat. This cost them three days of travel as they were forced to wait for the horses to feed on real grass and get stronger again. A few days later, Musselman and his wranglers had not properly hobbled the pack horses, allowing them to run wild. This caused an extensive hunt for them, costing more time—surprisingly, a mistake Musselman repeated in other expeditions in 1949 and 1952.

By the time they reached nearly the end of their trip in Upper Salt Creek at Cathedral Butte, they were short two days of provisions because Musselman had not properly fitted the lid to their Dutch oven food, allowing sand to get in. The last twenty-four to thirty-six hours of the trip involved a fifteen-mile tortuous walk in a blizzard down Cottonwood Canyon to Dugout Ranch, as the expected flatbed truck pickup could not reach them at Cathedral Butte because of the storm. Never again, Wilson vowed, would he allow someone else to guide him through this area.

He became an expert on everything about the Needles area with a passion and breadth that certainly fit his large and outgoing personality.

While the Musselman-guided trip started and ended in disaster, Wilson, Tug, and Dechert were still extremely impressed. Musselman had provided the opportunity to see the brilliance and the light of the Needles. As Tug later explained, “That trip really gave my father [Wilson] the on-ground overview that he so desperately was seeking. Going to the Confluence, crossing the grabens…[riding] up Salt Creek and exploring some of the tributaries to that.”

Soon after in 1951, fourteen-year old Tug bought his first jeep, a used 1948 CJ2A with his earnings taking tourists on sightseeing excursions around Arches (Tug Wilson’s Guide Service) and doing electrical work for the Moab Electric Company. Tug, as part of the Jack Mormon Boy Scout troop in Moab, had spent the previous winter with his fellow scouts pouring over aerial photos taken by the Air Force in 1940. Fortunately, the flight had been at daybreak and there were impressive shadows cast across the area. They soon realized that the low angle of incident light would, of course, pass through any arches and create miniature black bounded white circles. With this methodology, they located what later would be named Angel Arch and several other arches. In May 1951, using Tug’s jeep and others lent by Moab residents, Wilson took Tug and the scouts into Salt Creek for what became an annual exploration to see
the ruins and find some of the arches they had identified. Important to their consideration of taking jeeps into the Salt Creek river bed without complete knowledge of its difficulties and terrain was Tug’s astute observation from his 1950 trip with Musselman that “in many ways made for Dad’s [Wilson’s] exploration possible and that was what looked like Jeep tracks in the first part of Salt [Creek] near Cave S[s]pring.”48 Someone else had already been there and they could do it too.49

In addition to the Boy Scout explorations, Wilson did many pro bono trips into the backcountry, and he engaged the archaeologist Alice P. Hunt to investigate archaeological sites in Horse Canyon that, in turn, led to Jack Rudy’s seminal study of other sites in nearby Beef Basin.50 These latter endeavors popularized the importance of the Needles area for studies of ancient Native American use of southeast Utah. These explorations and trips that Tug separately sponsored eventually led to Wilson’s critical realization: “I don’t know exactly what he [Wilson] said but it was along the lines that this ought to be a [National] park.”51

Although these jeep trips to the Grabens via Elephant Hill sound more comfortable than the horse trips that preceded them, that was not always the case. Edgar F. Kleiner, who was experienced with tractors and all manners of farming vehicles (beginning at the age of 12 in the muds of southern Illinois) and who later did seminal studies on the grasslands of the Chesler Park and Grabens area, summed up his thirteen jeep trips that he took in the late 1960s and 1970s:

The backside of Elephant Hill is forward and back switchbacks. On one early trip we were delayed at the top for best of a half day. Some nut thought he could turn [instead of backing down], and in doing so just gently rolled his vehicle over down to the next level. Rangers had ropes galore stabilizing the thing so it didn’t roll any further, then with block and tackle, winches, etc. had to right the thing so a ranger could drive it out. A Canyonlands vehicle must have maximum power while just barely crawling in compound low. One’s life is completely in the hands of the brake and gears. I know this must sound wild but there are a couple of grades up which the incline is so steep all you see is the center of your hood. You just aim straight, keep going and hope for the best.

As to accidents he had experienced, Kleiner said he was pretty lucky:

One trip I blew a tire and bent the rim on the last incline coming out to the top. One close spot is at SOB Hill, the turn midway between the upper and lower graben valleys. It’s a very steep, close S turn and without great care you can jam your vehicle in. If it happens, jack one end up, and pry it over. The only safe way again, is forward, then back, but dangerous because it’s so steep. Brakes won’t hold, just gears and more or less slide down. One trip we hit the oil pan, a fairly good leak. We were on the way in for a week, not too far from camp at Bobby Jo [in Butler Flat]. Put a coffee can under, hammered the thing close as possible, poured the oil back in daily. A dash out for Moab and made it. As I read this over it sounds crazy and you must be saying, this has to be an exaggeration!52

While Wilson was taking his excursions into the basically unknown Needles, jeeping into the Grabens became common once Scorp’s dozer tracks had been put in place. No one more than Kent Frost, the first jeep guide into the Needles, exemplified the efflorescence of relatively easy access to the area. Frost, from Monticello, helped out on his family’s Depression-era farm that grew dry land beans to supplement their diet of deer meat. There he stumbled on Native American artifacts, spurring his interest in the region’s history and geography: “It had special meaning because we were living on the same land that the Indians had occupied a thousand years before.” Frost ended up collecting the knowledge and experience of the Canyonlands region: “I just spent a great deal of my time just wandering around through the country.”53

Beginning in 1940, after listening to years of cowboy tales about the Needles and with few
provisions, Frost said that he “would go hiking out in the country and stay for a week or two [for shelter he had a six feet square canvas].” On one such hike he even ran into Roy Musselman near Elephant Hill who scared Frost nearly “to death” by sneaking behind him and howling like a coyote. Frost later indicated that Roy had been out there so long that “when one pants wore out he just threw another pair right over them, wearing up to three pairs at one time.” Following a stint in the Navy during the war, Frost continued his walking explorations of the Needles area. In May 1949, after marrying his wife, Fern, Frost took her in his Model A Ford all around with his dog that he later said “would ride on that little shelf behind—it was a coupe model—right behind there, with his chin on my shoulder. . . . We started up Elephant Hill, and it powered out, that old car. So, I had Fern and the dog get out and walk up Elephant Hill. I backed up, and took a big run at it and we drove that right up on top of Elephant Hill and down [that is, over to] the west side. So we stopped there and looked around and walked down that where it’s the steepest and decided we couldn’t get our Ford car back up that way. We had to camp on top of Elephant Hill.”

After that failure to get into the Grabens, Frost bought a CJ2A civilian type jeep and used it to explore the Needles country. Ever generous, he and Fern took a lot of friends from 1949 to 1953 into the area for free.

Frost’s commercial jeeping did not begin until he had a fateful conversation with Mary Beckwith on a Cataract Canyon river trip guided by Frost. Since 1938, he had worked for Norman Nevills, running the Green and Colorado rivers from Wyoming to Lake Mead and the Salmon River in Idaho to Lewiston through the “horrible Hell’s Canyon of no return.” On these trips he met a lot of nice people. “They were the same type of people that liked to take jeep trips too,” Frost recalled. “In the fall of 1953 Mary Beckwith and some of the people who I was on the Cataract Canyon river trip with at the time wondered how they could get out into the Needles and see some of that top country. I says, ‘Oh, I have a jeep. I will take you.’ They started talking it up on the river trip. That September we had about nine passengers to go on our first jeep trip [three to four jeeps total were used] out through the Needles.”

Initially “Kent Frost Canyonlands Tours,” Frost secured clients through his previous river contacts, and advertisements in local western magazines such as Western Gateways, Desert Magazine, and Sunset. Frost’s business grew with referrals from repeat clients: “a lot of the people who came with us on our tours were reading our advertisements. And they were the type of people who liked to go out camping in rugged country and explore things.” At $25 a day per person on a camping trip (the price in 1962, much less than that offered by Musselman a decade earlier), the Frost tours saw increased business, necessitating vehicles larger than almost all of the other jeepers who were then coming through. Frost had to do some of his own “reconstructions” of the road to make it easier for his vehicles to navigate the various large steps and inclines. Before the tourist season he used cement to fill in difficult spots, and in Chesler Wash he dug out and reconfigured sections.

Because there were no other area tour guides until after the establishment of the national park, when the National History decided in 1954 to do what became a widely influential piece on the Needles in the future Canyonlands area, it was Frost they asked to guide them around. Frost, with his extensive knowledge of the area, became central (a “jeep herder” as Wilson called him) to the 1959 and 1960 NPS expeditions exploring the feasibility of a national park. In the 1960 trip, NPS park planner Leo Diederich told Wilson that the whole rim-to-rim area of the Needles, the Maze, Indian Creek, Dugout Ranch, and the Island in the Sky—“the entire erosion basin, from the top of the Wingate cliffs to the level of the rivers”—should be part of the park. Diederich was even the first to name it: Canyonlands. Frank Jensen, an invited photographer on these study trips, had this to say about Frost and Wilson: “In the beginning, I found Frost as stoic as a cigar store Indian, the complete opposite of Bates Wilson, whose gregarious ways put us immediately at ease. Later I was to discover in Kent, lurking beneath an impassive façade, something of a practical joker with a very wry sense of humor.” In April 1964, Frost and Fern led a large group, including dignitaries, into Chesler Park. Utah senators Bob Bennett and Frank Moss, Utah governor George Dewey
Clyde, and the Interior secretary Stewart Udall were among those guided by Frost in the early 1960s. Udall and Moss were most critical in helping to marshal national and, especially, congressional support to pass the legislation for Canyonlands’s establishment. Frost, with the aid of his wife Fern, created a rich and varied experience with these tours, garnering support for park status. Even in 1956, just as Wilson was sending his letter to the NPS recommending Canyonlands as a national park, the Frosts guided the prominent businessman, philanthropist, and conservationist Frank Masland on a tour. Masland became an enthusiastic proselytizer for the national park. “We recommended to all of our guests who went out there that it should have park status and if they felt like doing something to write to their congressman about it,” the Frosts recalled. Fern, in the 1962 congressional hearings on the creation of Canyonlands National Park (Kent was out on a hiking trip), testified in favor of a large national park (“the bigger, the better”)—even without the multiple use desired by ranchers.

Over a twenty-year period the Frosts alone took some 250 to 300 trips into the area. In contrast, Musselman in two decades took fifty-five trips. The jeeping experience cost far less than Musselman’s and was open to anyone with a four-wheel drive vehicle even without the Frosts’ guidance. In vast contrast to the touristy drive-through extravaganza of Arches National Monument, the vision advanced by Frost melded with Wilson’s initial and abiding motivation to make Canyonlands a jeep and hiking park. As Tug Wilson later wrote:

I don’t know that my dad [Wilson] actually sat down and formulated a strategy or a vision. I don’t think he was that kind of person, but he had an instinct, and that’s somewhat remarkable in the sense that he had an idea what he thought was good for the land and not good for the land. And good for the land did not mean locking people out. . . . He thought people needed access. But they needed access in a way in which they did not harm or damage the land. He would not be in favor of off-road vehicles tearing things up. And when we used jeeps, the idea was to stay in the track to get to the end of the trail where you couldn’t go any further and [then] hike. The jeep provided access to it. He thought people needed access to enjoy and to see, but not access to the point of destroying what you’re going to see.

The Needles area remains as Wilson described it, a direct result of Scorup’s ill-founded
attempt to bring drought to its knees for an area he wished to retain for cattle use. Scorup's efforts to extend the duration of his cattle use in the Grabens directly contributed to the “discovery,” visitation, and study of the region by tourists, conservationists, local and national legislators, and scientists. The ease by which individuals accessed the region, coupled with the tours presented by Frost and the excursions and investigations by the Wilsons, popularized and substantiated the need for turning this deliriously strange geological region into a national park.

By this time, Scorup had become aged, affecting the local intransigence to the park's formation. He was no longer the man of 1936 who had helped scuttle the Escalante National Monument proposal—a proposal that included the Canyonlands region. At that time, in a rare consonance, he had agreed with his arch-competitor and enemy, Charlie Redd, an entrepreneur and renaissance man who ran a large sheep and cattle outfit near the La Sal Mountains. Both were strongly against the federal government favoring tourism to dull the vacillations of an often boom-bust local economy at the expense of resource use of the area. The government was to be resisted so that these federal domains would be left alone for cattle and sheep interests. Redd commented in 1936 at the local meeting that so discouraged federal efforts to gain support for this proposal that “sometimes we overvalue this tourist business” and “feel there are a great many tourists . . . who feel that . . . livestock afford a nice attraction.” Utah government officials, such as Governor Henry Blood, concurred. Blood in 1940 said, “Some morning we may wake up and find that . . . the Escalante Monument has been created by Presidential proclamation, and then it will be too late to forestall what we in Utah think would be a calamity.”

From 1956 until 1959, the year of his death at age 81, Scorup had become nearly incapacitated and was in and out of hospitals frequently. Because his only direct heirs were six daughters (who all lived elsewhere and who were uninvolved in the company), the inheritance of the supervision of his domain fell to his hired foremen. But as one of his foremen indicated, “Scorup didn’t teach anybody to take over.” He had produced a group of foremen as “great cattle managers” but had “failed to bring on board a younger man” with “the entrepreneurial capabilities needed to be his eventual replacement.” All his life he had ruled his cattle concerns and then his empire single-handedly in a domineering fashion with no lieutenants and advisors primed to assume command upon his death. After his death, no one stepped forward to take control—or to carry on his resistance to national park designation. At the 1962 congressional hearings, no one from Dugout Ranch spoke. Redd’s son, Hardy, gave a speech favoring park designation as a simple recreation area, small in size, with grazing use intact. Critically, Dugout Ranch was extremely valuable, and Scorup’s heirs and others with sizeable shares of the empire seemed more intent on taking their
money from it and moving on than maintaining such a large and complicated business.79

Redd, seizing on this opportunity and just as the legislation to establish Canyonlands wound its way through Congress, made overtures to purchase Scorup’s cattle company after several others failed to buy it (he actually helped run it in the early 1960s during the vacuum that followed Scorup’s demise).80 He finally bought it all in 1965 for $2.1 million. Redd was only interested, however, in a small portion of this large domain: Geyser Pasture close to his lands near La Sal. As to the rest of the holdings, including all of the Dugout Ranch area, Redd intended to sell to other ranching interests. Redd may have seen it as just desserts to have Dugout Ranch possibly eviscerated by losing the Grabens for its winter grazing area.81 Eventually, Robert Redd (another of Charlie’s sons) and his new wife Heidi took over a reduced but manageable cattle company at Dugout.82 Later, in 1997, Heidi, after her divorce from her husband, allowed the Nature Conservancy to purchase Dugout Ranch so as to become a research center, thus preserving this inimitable gateway to Canyonlands for all time, and to remain a functioning cattle ranch at least as long as Heidi lived.83

Scorup’s efforts to maintain the Grabens as a grazing area failed, just as his dams, his health, and “his dream for a multi-generational [Scorup-owned] cattle ranch” had failed.84 Other individuals rose to speak contrariwise of what use the Needles area should be put to. They had come, via jeep and foot, and had experienced with their own bodies a unique creation of geological and prehistoric importance that no one man should control, listened with their own ears to a silence in nature that had vanished in almost all of the rest of the country, and seen with their own eyes a night sky where all the stars and hopes of the universe could become visible again.

Notes

I especially want to thanks James I. Morgan, Tug Wilson, Nancy Leavitt, Chris Goetze, and Peekay Briggs for providing materials critical for this article.


18. Morgan, in particular, “expressed doubts about the location of all these sites except the one in Elephant Canyon . . . Indeed, aerial photographs of the Needles area taken in the early 1950’s show standing water in this reservoir;” Morgan, “Stock Watering Tanks.”
21. Baker, “Geology and oil possibilities.” In 1927 the road from Dugout Ranch extended only halfway up Cottonwood, ending at Goudelock’s ranch.
23. U.S. Department of Energy, Summary History of Domestic Uranium Procurement under U.S. Atomic Energy Commission Contracts: Final Report, by Holger Albrethsen, Jr. and Frank E. McGinley, September 1982. From July 1952 to January 1953 Moab’s population doubled within six months. The earlier Atomic Energy Commission’s circulars beginning in April 11, 1948, guaranteed per-ton pricing on uranium and offered special bonuses. Prior to this the economic dynamics of southeast Utah meant slow growth: from 1940 (1084 people) to 1950 (1274) or from 1950 to 1952 there had been no significant changes in Moab’s population. See Tom H. Watkins, Redrock Chronicles: Saving Wild Utah (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2000); Raye Ringholz, Uranium Frenzy: Saga of the Nuclear West (Logan: Utah State University Press, 2002). It is unlikely that any early, not-yet-rich prospector prior to July 1952 put roads into the area.
26. Edna Pass, “A Twentieth Century Pioneer,” 1–12, A23670, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City. Musselman’s condition has been described as “about [having] had a nervous breakdown,” as the pressure of working for the YMCA “was pretty great.” Carl Mahon, interview with Steve Allen, January 30, 2002. See also Nancy Leavitt, interviews.
27. San Juan Record, August 18, 1932; San Juan Record, August 25, 1932; San Juan Record, July 7, 1937; Marie M. Ogden, “Annual Trek to Musselman Lodge Creates Activity;” San Juan Record, July 28, 1938; Ernie Pyle, “Easterner Lauds San Juan Mountains and Early Pioneers;” San Juan Record, August 3, 1939; Richard, “4-M Ranch Guests Return from Long Trek Over Mts.;” San Juan Record, August 24, 1942; Buckley Jensen, “The Giants of San Juan, Ross W. [sic] Musselman: Promoter, Cowboy Known as Father of Canyonlands.” San Juan Record, July 2, 2008. These lectures involved showing reels of moving pictures and lantern slide shows, passing leaflets out, and engaging in lengthy discussions with the audiences. San Juan Record, August 17, 1933; San Juan Record, August 30, 1934; San Juan Record, January 27, 1938; “Last Frontier in United States Described to Kiwanians,” Courier News (Bridgewater, NJ), May 14, 1950.
30. San Juan Record, February 20, 1936. For economic conditions in the county, see Denis, “Fallout from the Demise of the Large Cattle Companies” and “Departure of Late Nineteenth-Century Cattle Companies.
31. Alan Wilson, interviews. It is no wonder that Frost eventually sold his horse concession for Canyonlands in the late 1960s to Pete Steele while still maintaining his jeep concession. Steele was the son of Percy, Scrup’s wrangler who had envisioned the Baker group in 1927 at Squaw Flat. See Baker, Notebooks.
34. G. E. Myers, “Some Myths about Harmon-Burke and Their Field,” The Historical Times: Newsletter of the Granville, Ohio, Historical Society 10 (Fall 1996): 1–9. The Harmon Foundation supported African American artists and was the first agency to provide loans to students for college attendance in the late 1920s (several decades before the federal government did so). Gary A. Reynolds and Beryl J. Wright, Against the Odds: African American Artists and the Harmon Foundation (Newark, NJ: Newark Museum, 1989); Harmon Foundation, Trends and Procedures in Student Loans (New York: Harmon Foundation, 1932).
35. Alan Wilson, interviews.
37. Alan Wilson, interviews.
38. Di Peso was a noted archaeologist from the Amerind Foundation who had known the Garners since 1937 when they were all part of the Rainbow Bridge-Monument Valley Expedition.
40. Garners. The quote “impassible to everything . . .” is from U.S. Army, Report of the Exploring Expedition...

41. Wilson, interview by Schmiedling; Wilson, “Early Trips in the Needles”; Wilson, “Outline/Notes”; Wilson, interview by Pierson.


43. Wilson, interview by Schmiedling; Wilson, “Early Trips in the Needles”; Wilson, “Outline/Notes”; Wilson, interview by Pierson; Henderson, “19 Days on Utah Trails”; Mark Beeson, interview by the author, 2018; Bob Dunnagan, interviews by the author, 2014 to 2018. At best, this error may have been normal for cattlemen, with even the seasoned foreman of the Scorup TY outfit, Harve Williams, routinely assigning one cowboy at daybreak each day to go round-up the horses. Harve Williams, interview, 1973, Charles Redd Center for Western Studies, Brigham Young University, by Gregory Maynard.

44. Wilson, interview with Schmiedling; Wilson, “Early Trips in the Needles”; Wilson, “Outline/Notes”; Wilson, interview by Pierson. This was another Musselman error in that even today that route is very seldom open until the mid-spring weather has melted all the snow on the numerous north-facing parts of the road (this is irrespective of any blizzard) and dried the impassible mud at other locations. Navtec personnel, interviews by the author, 2016 to 2018.


46. B. Musselman, interview by the author, 2018; M. Beeson, interview. Curiously, Musselman, who supposedly knew the Needles area based on his own explorations, his brother’s experiences, and the information from the Scorup cowboys, had not taken them to see Angel Arch, Horse Canyon, or the rock art jewels of Salt Creek, such as the Four Faces and the All-American Man (all areas that later became premier tourist attractions). While Tug Wilson later considered Musselman unknowledgeable about the Needles District, not an explorer, and only in it for the money, in fact, Musselman knew of these places, except for Angel Arch, and had routinely visited them on previous trips. Every year in the 1940s Musselman’s summer youth trips would stop at different places, and they always would visit the Four Faces and All-American Man. See N. Leavitt, interview; M. Beeson, interview. Why Musselman did not show these highlights in March 1950 is probably a result of a time crunch due to the earlier mishaps in the trip. Musselman’s known hatred of Wilson appeared to have developed later. B. Musselman interview.

47. Alan Wilson, interviews; Wilson, interview by Schmiedling; Wilson, “Early Trips in the Needles”; Wilson, “Outline/Notes”; Wilson, interview by Pierson.

48. Wilson, interview by Schmiedling; Wilson, “Early Trips in the Needles”; Wilson, “Outline/Notes”; Wilson, interview by Pierson. Bates Wilson did not purchase his own jeep until 1961. His low GS rank at Arches and, hence, salary may have been partly due to his lacking even a high school degree. Pierson, “New Park Studies.” Wilson, after failing several classes, had dropped out of the Lawrenceville School in the last semester of his senior year and repaired back to his home in Silver City. Student Records, Lawrenceville School, in author’s personal collection.

49. This “someone else” was at least Raymond Hawks and Lloyd Holyoak of Moab who beginning in 1948 had been driving up Salt Creek in a used 1945 Willys Jeep recovering Native American artifacts for the purpose of saving them from destruction by Scorup’s cowboys and the incessant looting by local pothunters. Holyoak’s collection, in turn, unfortunately, was later stolen, most likely by a neighbor or relative. Lloyd Holyoak, interview by Steve Allen, December 5, 2002; Lloyd Holyoak, interview by Milton Shoemaker, March 14, 2003; Kay Hawks, interview by Clyde L. Denis, 2019; Lloyd Holyoak, interviews by the author, 2018 and 2019.


51. Alan Wilson, interviews.


53. Frosts, interview by Cox and Booker; Frosts, interview by Pierson; Frost, interview by Page; San Juan Record, 2008.

54. Frosts, interview by Cox and Booker; Frosts, interview by Pierson; Frost, interview by Page; San Juan Record, 2008; Frost, interview by author, 2010.

55. Frosts, interview by Pierson.

56. Frosts, interview by Pierson.

57. A. Wilson, interviews, 2009 to 2019. While the concrete ramps are viewed by some as a desecration, even today their remains help jeepers navigate the roads.

58. Joyce Rockwood Muench, “Threading Utah’s Needles,” Natural History (December 1954): 457–63. The other major jeeping guide starting in 1964 was Mitch Williams, who ran Tag-A-Long-Expeditions. Frost felt that Tag-A-Long was just that, following his ground-breaking steps. He complained in his early interviews how there really was insufficient business for two tour companies, which might have engendered some antagonism between Williams and the Frosts. Fern referred to “Mitch the Bitch” routinely (Frost, interview by the author), and Williams was not above stealing the leaflets of his competitors that were at the Moab airport (L. Ottinger, interview by the author, March 2021). On the other hand, Frost “was a big-time womanizer according to NPS female rangers,” even going as far as suggesting to females on each of his jeep trips that they should share his sleeping bag. Frost, interview by the author; L. Ottinger, interview by the author, March 2012; Alan Wilson, interviews.
59. Lloyd M. Pierson, “New Park Studies.” These trips were led by Leslie P. Arinberger and Paul V. Wykert of the Santa Fe Regional Office.

60. Jenson, “First Study Trip.”

61. Frosts, interview by Cox and Booker; Frosts, interview by Pierson.


63. Frosts, interview by Cox and Booker; Frosts, interview by Pierson.

64. Congress, Senate, Subcommittee on Public Lands of the Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, Proposed Canyonlands National Park in in Utah: Hearing before the Subcommittee on Public Lands of the Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, 87th Cong., 2nd sess. on S.2387, March 29 and 30, 1962, 363, testimony of Fern Frost, director, Monticello Chamber of Commerce, 217–19. Although the Frosts were from Monticello and she represented the Monticello Chamber of Commerce, the Frosts’ views were the opposite of almost all Monticelloans and at least about half of the people from Moab who wanted both smaller and separated national parks for Canyonlands with guaranteed multiple use such as cattle grazing, something national parks do not accede to. It should be mentioned that Musselman at the same hearings spoke strongly in favor of multiple use for Canyonlands. In this case, Kent Frost, a native Monticelloan, appeared as if he were from an urban, environmentally progressive community interested solely in preserving the Canyonlands region, while Musselman, the urban easterner, sounded like a local southeast Utahn wanting also to open it up for whatever resource could best provide economic advantage. See Denis, “Closing the Road to Chesler Park.”

65. Frosts, interview by Cox and Booker; Frosts, interview by Pierson; Frost, interview by Page; San Juan Record, 2008.


67. Alan Wilson interviews; Wilson, interview by Schmiedling; Wilson, “Early Trips in the Needles”; Wilson, “Outline/Notes”; Wilson, interview by Pierson.

68. Denis, “Closing the Road to Chesler Park.”


70. Vallentine, Lonesome Trails; M. Beeson, interviews, and H. Greager, interviews by the author, 2014; Hardy Redd, interview, 2010. Redd and Scorup had a long running feud. The antagonism partly involved Scorup’s ownership of Geyser Pasture so valuably adjacent to Redd’s La Sal outfit that ran sheep. Scorup had refused ever to have sheep on his land and was vehemently opposed to their presence. In 1919 and 1923, during the nadir of the livestock industry in southeast Utah, Scorup pulled his money out of the La Sal Livestock Company (run by Redd), which surely left Redd in treacherous straights for many years. When Goudelock and Green were selling the last vestige of their Indian Cattle Creek Cattle Company properties, they refused to sell it to the very eager Charlie Redd because he did not bank at their First National Bank in Moab. They sold these valuable lands instead to Scorup. Other friction involved Redd’s sheep trespasses on Scorup land, and Scorup’s partner Bill Somerville’s arrest for purportedly poisoning Redd’s sheep (Somerville died soon after his arrest, apparently from stress). Thus, Scorup would have “turned over in his grave” had he known that Redd, over the next two years after his purchase of Dugout Ranch in 1965 and before Robert and Heidi took it over, “just as an experiment,” had sheep running at the Dugout. M. Beeson, interview.

71. Denis, “Fallout from the Demise of the Large Cattle Companies.”


73. Minutes of meeting at Price, Utah, June 9, 1936, 12, box 1, fd. 11, State Planning Board Proposed Escalante National Monument records, Series 22028, Utah State Archives, Salt Lake City, Utah.

74. Richardson, “Federal Park Policy in Utah.”

75. Vallentine, Lonesome Trails.

76. Williams, interview by Gregory Maynard.

77. Vallentine, Lonesome Trails.


79. Vallentine, Lonesome Trails.

80. Vallentine.


82. Charlie Redd was also antagonistic to Robert and Heidi’s purchase of Dugout Ranch due to his interest in having all eight of his children be intimately involved in the maintenance and running of his La Sal outfit. After a close family vote the ranch landed in the hands of Robert and Heidi. Luckily for the national park, as stewards of this magnificent entry they later were in position to resist Ralph Lauren’s, Christie Brinkley’s, and others’ efforts to turn Dugout Ranch into a huge subdivision of resort homes with their concomitant welter of paved roads, boutiques, and exurban debris, something even William Harmon would have opposed.

83. Heidi Redd, interviews.

84. Vallentine, Lonesome Trails.